Globalization and the Transformation of Cultures & Humanity:
A Curriculum and Toolkit for the Efflorescence of Ecological Literacy in Legal and Business School Education

Robert Alan Hershey*

"It's noble to be good, and nobler to teach others to be good, and less trouble."
—Mark Twain

"We are the great abbreviators. None of us has the wit to know the whole truth, the time to tell it if we believed we did, or an audience so gullible as to accept it."
—Huxley

"I'm all for progress. It's change I can't stand."
—Mark Twain

* Robert Alan Hershey is a Professor on both the Law and American Indian Studies Faculties and Director of Clinical Education for the Indigenous Peoples Law & Policy Program at the University of Arizona. He received his law degree from the University of Arizona College of Law in 1972. In 1972 and 1973, he worked as Staff Attorney for the Fort Defiance Agency of Dinebeina Nahilna Be Agaditahe (DNA Legal Services) on the Navajo Indian Reservation. Thereafter, as a sole practitioner, Professor Hershey specialized in Indian affairs. From 1983 to 1999, he served as Special Litigation Counsel and Law Enforcement Legal Advisor to the White Mountain Apache Tribe, and, from 1995 to 1997, as Special Counsel to the Pascua Yaqui Tribe. Professor Hershey has also served continuously from 1989-present as Judge Pro Tempore for the Tohono O'odham Judiciary, and he is a past Associate Justice for the Yavapai-Prescott Indian Tribal Court of Appeals. He has been a member of the White Mountain Apache, Hopi, Pascua Yaqui, and Tohono O'odham Tribal Courts. He has taught American Indian Law at the University of Puerto Rico Escuela de Derechos and at the University of Deusto in Bilbao, Spain, and has taught a version of this course in Summer 2005 at the University of Victoria in British Columbia. For the past nineteen years he has taught Indian/Indigenous/Aboriginal law at the University of Arizona James E. Rogers College of Law. His current courses include Indigenous Peoples Law and Policy Clinical Education (which promotes and assists the self-determination of Aboriginal communities in the southwestern United States and worldwide), Advanced Topics in Indian Law, and Globalization, Future Life, and the Transformation of Culture. E-mail correspondence: hershey@law.arizona.edu.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I am deeply grateful for the hard work and dedication of my former and present students who helped make this manuscript possible:

DeAnna Rivera
Amanda Banat
Stacy Butler
Amanda Kucich
Vanessa Picard
Shasta Kilminster
Nicole Ong
Kevin Linoue
Megan Hendricks
Danielle Hiraldo
Pankaj Raval
Ryan Dreveskracht

I want to heap special praise for those that contributed solidly to the crafting of text and footnotes:

Ron Gard
Eric Pavri
Joel Feinman

Lastly, and with sincere admiration, I thank Barbara Lopez, a colleague at the law school, who worked tirelessly to prepare the manuscript for production.
Table of Contents

The Intro

Background to the Syllabus
  - Why Question Globalization?
  - Redefining Progress
  - The Confluence of Population with Food & Water Access, Safety, and Security
  - Population
  - Food and Water: Access, Safety and Security
  - The Environment and Technology: On the Precipice or In the Crevasse?
  - The Collision of Technology, Intellectual Property and Cultural Survival
  - The Industrialization of Digitization
  - Creating the Corporate Utopia: Transnationalism, the W.T.O. and the I.M.F.
  - Globalization and its Significant and Special Impacts on Indigenous Communities
  - Solutions/Conserving Communities
  - The Future

The Course Papers
The Course Syllabus
The Outro
Bibliography
Websites
Magazines
Academic Presses
Organizations & Periodicals
Websites for Technology & the Internet
Websites for Indigenous Peoples
Websites for Industry
Video/Media
Education
THE INTRO

The esoteric quality of legal education has been known to deliver absurd twists of language, confoundedness, and meaninglessness.¹ I have looked for another modifying adjective and have found that the word, “esoteric,” immediately follows “esophoria” in my dictionary, a condition of a squint in which the eyes turn inward toward the nose, and am reminded of the old story about how lawyers squint at gnats and swallow camels to make their point; so I’ll keep the word “esoteric” here. The law systematizes and legitimizes procedures for looking backwards, where constant references to stodgy bastions of precedent dilute and make parsimonious the urgency, the emergency, of social justice. Should we, as law and business school professors, myopically emphasize legal scriptures and procedural complexities in area by area of practice? Should we not be educating, in equal measure and with immediacy, humane social dialogue, the tactics of public civility, and furtherance of egalitarian values?² The place in which each young attorney and MBA student finds himself or herself, and where they will continue to find themselves as they season, and their own satisfaction with that time and space of our

¹ One author suggests that law instruction is part “ideological training for willing service in the hierarchies of the corporate welfare state.” Duncan Kennedy, Legal Education as Training for Hierarchy, in THE POLITICS OF LAW 40 (David Kairys ed., 1998). The law also toys with the imagination. If I had a television, I would have watched the former CBS series, “Century City,” covering the ground of a small Los Angeles law firm in the near future. “In the pilot episode, a widower whose 7-year old son is dying of an incurable liver disease wants to clone his son’s cells to develop a baby who could donate a portion of his liver to save him. Unfortunately, he illegally smuggled the cloned cells into the United States from Singapore, where cloning is legal, and his future embryo was confiscated at customs.” Alessandra Stanley, Law Firm of Tomorrow: Like ‘The Practice,’ but with Engineered Genes, N.Y. TIMES, Mar. 16, 2004, at B1.

² I must confess that when I began writing this tome many years ago, I felt that our system of legal education emphasized – to quote one of my older colleagues – the “making of horse collars” in a rocket-ship age, and I had written thusly in an earlier iteration. But I do find today a dynamic change in the way we have become forward thinkers and questioners of the future. See, e.g., Alberto Bernabe-Riefkohl, Tomorrow’s Law Schools: Globalization and Legal Education, 32 SAN DIEGO L. REV. 137 (1995); Thomas D. Morgan, Educating Lawyers for the Future Legal Profession, 30 OKLA. CITY U. L. REV. 537 (2005). See infra note 61. See also MARJORIE A. SILVER, THE AFFECTIVE ASSISTANCE OF COUNSEL: PRACTICING LAW AS A HEALING PROFESSION (challenging the legal profession’s gladiatorial paradigm).
hypermodern world, remarkably is dependent on how ever fast the world turns and to what extent we instill in them the practice to take moments to answer questions of the soul how values are created in the face of numbing and desensitizing stimulus that has become western culture. This “Globalization” class, then, was designed to be just one example to educators of a blended curriculum in the field of law, economics, sociobiology, human geography, philosophy, ecological literacy and human justice.

I’m lazy in esotery. So, instead, I teach impending doom, resilience, heartbreak, hope, action, paying attention. In the early part of my legal career, after I returned from living and working on the Navajo Indian Reservation, I was wonderfully good at knowing that I did not know much, and I did not pretend to. But, I could always smell the intangible scents of trouble, like Humphrey Bogart in film noir, and my recognitions came to me as strong as newly coated varnish in a dive boat’s kitchen galley mixed with the vapors of morning bacon grease. I like to think that this class is about reaching into infinite space and grabbing odors from the back of minds. I want our young lawyers to wear orange jumpsuits to watch red sunsets, to be alive sensuously, to be urgent, to be called to awareness. In essence, my class explores humanity and

---

5 The word "sociobiology" was coined by John Paul Scott in 1946, at a conference on genetics and social behavior, and became widely used after it was popularized by Edward O. Wilson in his 1975 book, SOCIOBIOLOGY: THE NEW SYNTHESIS.
inhumanity in an accelerated world. It asks, as capitalism approaches universality, what are the legal, social, and community obligations that accompany global participation? Does money equal wealth? How do technological innovations enhance, displace, or devalue human existence and culture? If public morality supposedly resounds in the law, then is morality increasingly bound to perpetual consumption? Should we not rethink the very nature of human progress?

Man’s inhumanity to man was articulated by Robert Burns, in From Man Was Made to Mourn: A Dirge (1785), www.phrases.org.uk/meanings/244100.html. See also Robert A. Williams, Jr., Like a Loaded Weapon (2005).


My cupboard of books from the statuesque parents of historical and contemporary philosophy is, undeniably, sparse, as is my understanding of the “isms” that are created by the conscriptors and shortchangers of masters’ works when it serves their own polemic.

Yet, as a law professor, I have become somewhat saturated in prose, both consciously and inadvertently, from my dialectical engagements, from my glances into the wordy world of erudition, like Bogart in the African Queen, when you tug a boat through marshy swamps, you’re bound to attract some leeches. So, dutifully, I will point to the works of Karl Marx, in particular Capital: A Critique of Political Economy (1867), and The German Ideology (1845). Therein began an important critical rethinking of the apparent idea of progress. Marx saw the commonly promoted idea of progress as an ideological obfuscation concealing the true course of history. Marx’s project involved revealing history’s true dynamics, thereby advancing history toward its ultimate condition of liberation. In contrast to Marx’s replacement of a bourgeois notion of progress with a “true” advancement of
My first series of seminars began in the fall of 1998; they came across like a shotgun blast. The current human condition exploded from the strikes of pellets of planetary atrocities. The classes were bridges into the soul of human unkindness, somewhat lamenting and nostalgic toward a yesteryear that supposed, admittedly idealistically and naively, mankind/womankind/humankind was at some time “kinder before.” Of course, this is a silly utopian notion, probably derived from a painting hung on the wall above my grandmother Frieda’s goofy lumpy couch, which showed happy Romanians—really, happy Romanian maidens—in a thatch-covered wagon drawn by a chestnut mare in the 1600’s, 1700’s or 1800’s—who knows—in front of a thatched-roof cottage with a warm woodstove fire within—I could see the smoke from the chimney stack—surrounded by happy chickens and barnyarders on a happy dirt road with no manure, no mud and no discrimination against Jews and Gypsies. My naiveté is having created for myself utopian iconography to change the natural discordant behavior of humans into healthy floral arrangements of egalitarian kindness. Does the golden age always lie in the past, never in the future?13 What happened at the dawn of humanity that made us so vengeful yet passionate for art and music? My learned-later-in-life knowledge of history countermands, does battle, with my dream that people conduct their lives altruistically.14 “Kinder before?” From where on earth

---


14 The Countermands: Daniel Jonah Goldhagen, Genocide, Eliminationism, and the Ongoing Assault on Humanity (2009); Derrick Jensen, The Culture of Make Believe 2004; Jonathan Glover,
could I have come to such thought? Please indulge me in a very short tale to try for an answer—

*my gestalt*—for it is within my compositional structure that I from somewhere learned to care, be heartbroken by atrocity, be repaired and inspired by showers of illustrious dignity, and be doomed to repeat these emotional fluctuations that inhabit me whenever I teach this class.

I was born and raised in Hollywood and a thousand times skateboarded down the Avenue of the Stars. Bill Williams, the television star who played Kit Carson signed my toy holster in Palm Springs when I was nine (and, no doubt, I have been atoning as an Indigenous human rights attorney ever since. The recalled memory and attendant guilt was too much to bear.) I saw *El Cid* starring Charlton Heston six times in two days at the Carthay Circle Theater and never wondered *why* the million Middle-Eastern fellows all dropped to the ground and parted like the Red Sea in superstitious-fearful-admiration when El Cid, the Spaniard, rode on horseback out from the castle down the long expanse of oceanfront. I mean, he was dead and strapped upright to the saddle, for goodness sake! I knew *zero* about the word *Moor*. It was all about the gleam of the sword, its raised point glistening from under the weight of heaven’s
beams. Ditto for Lawrence of Arabia and Peter O’Toole’s blue eyes. Again, the glisten. I spent my high school English literature class drawing surfboards. I was stampeded at Pacific Ocean Park by a horde of girls screaming insanely when Jan and Dean\textsuperscript{15} came to sign autographs. I saw Kooky park cars for Efrem Zimbalist, Jr. at 77 Sunset Strip. Southern California in the 1950’s and 1960’s was sublime, the middle-class idyll. Perhaps that is why it was also so wickedly delusional.

The sunsets are giant rainbows lasting for an hour. The seasons here make no sense: in the morning it is spring, at noon it is summer, and the desert nights are cold without it ever being winter. It is a kind of suspended eternity in which the year is renewed daily, with the guarantee that it will be like this each day, that every evening will be that rainbow of all the colours of the spectrum in which light, after having reigned all day long in its indivisible form, in the evening fragments into all the nuances of colour that make it up, before it finally disappears. Nuances which are already those of the instant rainbow catching fire in the wind on the crest of the Pacific waves.

This is the invulnerable grace of the climate, privilege of a nature that completes that insane richness that is man’s.

This country is without hope. Even its garbage is clean, its trade lubricated, its traffic pacified. The latent, the lacteal, the lethal – life is so liquid, the signs and messages are so liquid, the bodies and the cars so fluid, the hair so blond, and the soft technologies so luxuriant, that a European dreams of death and murder, of suicide motels, of orgies and cannibalism to counteract the perfection of the ocean, of the light, of that insane ease of life, to counteract the hyperreality of everything here.

Hence the phantasy of a seismic fracture and a crumbling into the Pacific, which would be the end of California and of its criminal and scandalous beauty. For it is unbearable, while one is still alive, to pass beyond the difficulty of being, simply to pass into the fluidity of sky, cliffs, surf, and deserts, into the hypothesis of happiness alone.

But even the seismic challenge is still only a flirtation with death; it still forms part of the natural beauty, as do history or revolutionary theory, whose hyperrealist echoes come here to die with the discreet charm of something from a previous existence. All that remains of a violent and historical demand is this graffiti on the beach, facing out to sea, no longer calling upon the revolutionary

\textsuperscript{15} Of Surf City, Dead Man’s Curve and The Little Old Lady from Pasadena (the terror of Colorado Boulevard) fame.
masses, but speaking to the sky and the open space and the transparent deities of the Pacific.

PLEASE, REVOLUTION!

And yet is it irrelevant that the largest naval base, that of the Pacific 7th Fleet – the very incarnation of American worldwide domination and the greatest firepower in the world – also contributes to this insolent beauty? In the very place where the beautiful magic of Santa Ana blows, the desert wind that crosses over the mountains to stay for four or five days, before scattering the fog, scorching the earth, making the sea sparkle, and crushing those who are used to the mist – the most beautiful thing about the Santa Ana is spending the night on the beach, swimming there as if it were daytime, and tanning, like vampires, under the moonlight.

This country is without hope.

We fanatics of aesthetics and meaning, of culture, of flavour and seduction, we who see only what is profoundly moral as beautiful and for whom only the heroic distinction between nature and culture is exciting, we who are unfailingly attached to the wonders of critical sense and transcendence find it a mental shock and a unique release to discover the fascination of nonsense and of this vertiginous disconnection, as sovereign in the cities as in the deserts. To discover that one can exult in the liquidation of all culture and rejoice in the consecration of indifference.16

I should have known better, learned better, or at least looked for more. My grandparents, whose ancestors remain nameless to me to this day, fled Hungary from centuries of annihilation. My parents never spoke of this and changed their last names to avoid discrimination, yet I managed a secondary education in science and creative writing without having to study, much less feel, the messiness of conquest, racism and world criminalities. Or, perhaps, I just forgot about, maybe even hid from, the painful episodes of humans dominating and brutalizing other humans.17 Everything was blonde; the blacks and the browns were blonde—even the blues were

16 JEAN BAUDRILLARD, AMERICA 121-123 (Verso 1988).
17 I hope that I am now just reflecting from poor memory and that I wasn’t quite such a shallow boy-then-man. Of course, there was sympathetic pain in my youth: The assassinations of John Kennedy, the Reverend Martin Luther King, Jr. and Bobby Kennedy; the Vietnam War; rages of the Watts riots in Los Angeles; the potent violence against red and black people of color; the wayward idealism of the 1960’s; and the genocide and denigration of cultures and species worldwide. JAMES PIETSON, CAMELOT AND THE CULTURAL REVOLUTION: HOW THE ASSASSINATION OF JOHN F. KENNEDY SHATTERED AMERICAN LIBERALISM (2007); GERALD L. POSNER, KILLING
blonde. I felt no hatred and gave none. Somehow, I put together an ignorant idealism believing that people were still unilaterally virtuous and that humanity’s altruism was the natural state.\textsuperscript{18} Then, of course, most of us were awakened, transformed in college times by knowledge that comes from older age, a wearisome awareness of the threats of wars and environmental degradation.\textsuperscript{19} And, I never worried whether water would pass from the faucet when I turned the tap.

We, with our propensity for murder, torture, slavery, rape, cannibalism, pillage, advertising jingles, shag carpets, and golf, how could we be seriously considered as the perfection of a four-billion-year-old grandiose experiment? Perhaps as a race, we have evolved as far as we are capable, yet that by no means suggests that evolution has called it quits. In all likelihood, it has something beyond human on the drawing board. We tend to refer to our most barbaric and crapulous behavior as “inhuman,” whereas, in point of fact, it is exactly human, definitely and quintessentially human, since no other creature habitually indulges in comparable atrocities. This negates neither our occasional virtues nor our aesthetic triumphs, but if a being at least a little bit more than human is not waiting around the bend of time, then evolution has suffered a premature ejaculation.\textsuperscript{20}

Most certainly, I am not uniquely experienced in riding in the emotional chariots of eco-

\textsuperscript{18} The French philosopher, Jean Francois Lyotard, undermined the universalist principles of the Enlightenment, and he argued that we no longer believe in the “meta-narratives” of the progress of history, the knowability of everything by science, and the possibility of absolute freedom. \textit{See} JEAN FRANCOIS LYOTARD, THE POSTMODERN CONDITION: A REPORT ON KNOWLEDGE (1979); JUST GAMING (1979); THE DIFFERENCE (1983).

\textsuperscript{19} See, e.g., ARTHUR CLARK, 2001: A SPACE ODYSSEY (1960); HARPER LEE, TO KILL A MOCKINGBIRD (1960); J.D. SALINGER, CATCHER IN THE RYE (1964); KEN KESEY, ONE FLEW OVER THE CUCKOO’S NEST (1963); ANTHONY BURGESS, CLOCKWORK ORANGE (1962); RACHAEL CARSON, SILENT SPRING (1962); JOSEPH HELLER, Catch 22 (1962); BETTY FRIEDAN, THE FEMININE MYSTIQUE (1963); KURT VONNEGUT, JR., SLAUGHTERHOUSE-FIVE, OR, THE CHILDREN’S CRUSADE: A DUTY-DANCE WITH DEATH (1969); TRUMAN CAPOTE, IN COLD BLOOD: A TRUE ACCOUNT OF A MULTIPLE MURDER AND ITS CONSEQUENCES (1967); MALCOLM X, THE AUTOBIOGRAPHY OF MALCOLM X (1965). \textit{See also} PSYCHO (1960); DR. STRANGELOVE OR: HOW I LEARNED TO STOP WORRYING AND LOVE THE BOMB (1964); BUTCH CASSIDY AND THE SUNDANCE KID (1969); BONNIE AND CLYDE (1967); THE GRADUATE (1967); EASY RIDER (1969); ROSEMARY’S BABY (1968); ALLEN GINSBERG, HOWL (1959); JACK KEROUAC, ON THE ROAD (1997); JACK KEROUAC, VISIONS OF CODY (1972); HUNTER S. THOMPSON, HELL’S ANGELS: A STRANGE AND TERRIBLE SAGA (1999).

\textsuperscript{20} TOM ROBBINS, HALF ASLEEP IN FROG PAJAMAS 326 (1994).
literate life; despondency, positiveness, pessimism, hope, defeat, fear, anger, irrationality, actuation, integrity all sway me. And, of course, ideals have made me heartsick.

There is a thing in me that dreamed of trees,
A quiet house, some green and modest acres
A little way from every troubling town,
A little way from factories, schools, laments,
I would have time, I thought, and time to spare,
With only streams and birds for company,
To build out of my life a few wild stanzas.
And then it came to me, that so was death,
A little way away from everywhere.

There is a thing in me still dreams of trees.
But let it go. Homesick for moderation,
Half the world’s artists shrink or fall away.
If any find solution, let him tell it.
Meanwhile I bend my heart toward lamentation
Where, as the times implore our true involvement,
The blades of every crisis point the way.

I would it were not so, but so it is.
Who ever made music of a mild day?21

My clarity is also my enemy. Like Horas, I weighed hearts against a feather all the while sipping port with clowns. At my age, you would have thought I had to be using a sandalwood staff to support my dreams for us all on this planet. But, for the past two years, I have been carving a different walking stick, one from the timbers of harshness. I have been compelled to whittle, to shave away the moroseness I generate when my eyes see inhumaneness and unkindness abound, and to be uncompelled to be personally responsible to arrest all offending conduct and subsequently judge it. Still, I have had to ask myself, how could I continue to champion and venerate a landscape of legal ecology when all around me, most political and

21 Mary Oliver, A Dream of Trees, www.gratefulnesss.org/poetry/dream_of_trees.htm
consumeristic paths led to hubris and the annihilation of humanity. A bit dramatic, to be sure; but remember, I am from Hollywood.

To answer myself, I embarked on a quest, an adventurous, metaphoric crusade, one promoted by a student who became a friend during the two years we worked together. As a candidate for a joint Juris Doctor degree at the law school and a Doctorate in English, he kept annoying me with his insistence that I could find explanations for the human condition by studying postmodernity and its antecedents. Until that past year, however, my own personal dogma rejected classroom words that began with “neo” or “post.” “Deconstruction,” “normative” and “relativism” were also particularly distasteful. I must confess that I really had not spent an adequate amount of time considering what “modern”/“postmodern”/“modernity”/“postmodernity”/“modernism”/“postmodernism” or the “neos” or the “isms” meant.


23 Ron Gard was this student, a gifted and supremely intelligent foil. He was responsible for a solid portion of the near text and footnotes on modernism and postmodernism.

24 I am attracted to Theory Trading Cards, the brainchild of Professor David Gauntlett of Bournemouth University in Great Britain. He “wryly merges theory and pop-culture on his website, www.theory.org.uk.” See Patricia Leigh Brown, Go Fish (or, Deconstruct This), N.Y. TIMES, Mar. 21, 2004, at sec. 4, p. 2. See also, Arif Dirlik, Whither History? Encounters with Historicism, Postmodernism, Postcolonialism, FUTURES, Feb. 2002.; HANS BERTENS, THE IDEA OF THE POSTMODERN (1995); CHARLES JENCKS, WHAT IS POST-MODERNISM? (1996); ANTHONY GIDDENS, THE CONSEQUENCES OF MODERNITY (1991). Contrary to my own dogma, I came across this excellent distillation of why utilizing the term “postmodern” is ultimately a very useful thing. It comes from Edward Soja (department of human geography, UCLA); and, as you can see from the passage, he too was initially quite opposed to, even hostile toward, the term “postmodern”. But he comes around…

In the late 1960’s, however, with the onset of a crisis-induced fourth modernization, this long-lasting modern critical tradition began to change. Both Western Marxism and critical social science appeared to explode into more heterogeneous fragments, losing much of their separate cohesiveness and centralities. And as we approach another fin de siecle, alternative modern movements have appeared to compete for control over the perils and possibilities emerging in a restructured contemporary world. Although they remain controversial and confusing terms, filled with disparate and often disparaging connotation, postmodernity, postmodernization and postmodernism now seem to be appropriate ways of describing this contemporary cultural, political and theoretical restructuring; and of highlighting the assertion of space that is complexly intertwined with it.

Initially suspicious of too hasty a ‘rush to the post’, I once toyed with the idea of creating a new journal called Antipost to do battle not only with postmodernism but also with the multiplying array of other post-prefixed ‘isms’, from postindustrialism to poststructuralism. I am now, as is obvious from my titular commitment, more comfortable with the epithetic label postmodern and
labels attempt to simplify that which cannot or should not be so simple. They categorize. Once labeled, ideas usually still need an explanatory qualifier—an “in other words”—because an agreement of definition requires an understanding of the socio-ethnological-educational

its intentional announcement of possibly epochal transition in both critical thought and material life. I continue to see the present period primarily as another deep and broad restructuring of modernity rather than as a complete break and replacement of all progressive, post-Enlightenment thought, as some who call themselves postmodernist (but are probably better described as anti-modernists) proclaim. I also understand the suspicious antagonism of the modern left to the presently dominant neo-conservative and obfuscating whimsy of most postmodernist movements. But I am convinced that too many opportunities are missed by dismissing postmodernism as irrevocably reactionary.

SOJA, supra note 6, at 4-5.

Utilizing the term allows us to recognize and explore important changes that make the contemporary environment qualitatively different than a previous one. This holds true even if the term, in its overall incarnation, embodies ambiguity, contradiction, overblown and extreme claims (and thereby forces us to qualify it incessantly when we use it). In certain respects, when we use a term, we might be outright wrong, but in other respects the use of the term highlights the change in conditions that inarguably have taken place. Compare Michael Hardt & Antonio Negri, Empire (Harvard Univ. Press 2000), and Michael Hardt & Antonio Negri, Multitude: War and Democracy in the Age of Empire, (Penguin 2004) with SOJA, supra note 6, and Giddens, supra note 24. See also Peter Roberts, Rereading Lyotard: Knowledge, Commodification and Higher Education, Electronic Journal of Sociology (1998).

The criticism of postmodernism as ultimately meaningless rhetorical gymnastics was demonstrated in the Sokal Affair, where Alan Sokal, a physicist, proposed and delivered for publication an article purportedly about interpreting physics and mathematics in terms of postmodern theory, which he had deliberately written in a completely nonsensical fashion, including several in-jokes mocking postmodernism. It was nevertheless published by Social Text, a “cultural studies” journal active in the field of postmodernism, as a serious postmodernist work. Sokal arranged for the simultaneous publication of another article describing the former as a successful experiment to see whether a postmodernist journal would publish any nonsensical article with big words that flattered the editors’ political views, triggering an academic scandal. Sokal later published a book with Jean Bricmont called Intellectual Impostures, which expands upon his criticism of postmodernism.

* * * *

The linguist Noam Chomsky has suggested that postmodernism is meaningless because it adds nothing to analytical or empirical knowledge. He asks why postmodernist intellectuals won’t respond as “people in physics, math, biology, linguistics, and other fields are happy to do when someone asks them, seriously, what are the principles of their theories, on what evidence are they based, what do they explain that wasn’t already obvious, etc.? These are fair requests for anyone to make. If they can’t be met, then I’d suggest recourse to Hume’s advice in similar circumstances: to the flames.


Still, why do we need even to explain our “condition”? Maybe, all the “isms” are merely attempts at describing our aspirations to civility via iconographic sounds. The myth of transcendence. In the end, though, how does a jolly nihilism or postcolonial chatter feed a hungry people?
background of each perceiver to the conversation. As I grappled with these mouthfuls, however, I began to unburden myself from the arrogated responsibility of saving an unsaveable planet. I had been so full of sheer folly and wrapped myself in a buffalo coat of stress believing that inhumanity had been reconstituted anew and could be eradicated by the force of my will. What I needed was a concise refresher lesson in the history of cruelty. Let me, then, tell you of my journey and gather here some thoughts on the twentieth century with particular attention to Modernism and Postmodernism.

The end of the nineteenth century in America was a time of perceived increasing unification, in spite of the many tumultuous social and political rifts present within American society. Though such things as waves of immigration and reconstruction following the Civil War created powerful tensions and social strife,25 nonetheless there were many cultural forces that had developed throughout the nineteenth century that were coming together by the end of that century to produce palpable notions of national unity.

Consider the following technological innovations:

- In 1862, Lincoln signed the Pacific Railway Act, authorizing the building of the first transcontinental railroad. The golden spike was driven in 1869.
- The telegraph appeared in America in the 1840s and began to be used for dispatching trains in the 1850s. In 1881, the Postal Telegraph entered the market. Until 1877, all rapid, long-distance communication depended on the telegraph.
- The first telephone line was installed in 1877, and by 1880 there were nearly 48,000 telephones in the U.S. (Transcontinental service would not appear until 1915.)
- Standardized time zones, driven by the railroads’ need to make schedules uniform, were implemented in 1883 in the United States. Within one year, 85% of all cities having a population over 10,000, about 200 cities, were using standard time.
- The first automobiles manufactured in the U.S. appeared in the 1880s. In 1901, Olds produced 425 cars and was the leading manufacturer from 1901-1904. Ford installed the first conveyor belt assembly line around 1913-1914. (A single

Model T was assembled in 93 minutes in assembly line production. The Model T was originally introduced in 1908.)

What sits behind this array of technological development is a fundamental transformation of American culture. What is just as important as the introduction of these individual inventions is the development of social institutions and the establishment of social normative interactions. Chief among these are the U.S. corporation and new formations of capital and social practices surrounding capital. As Alan Trachtenberg writes in *The Incorporation of America: Culture and Society in the Gilded Age*:

> My purpose in this book can be described as an effort to find appropriate words and names for the powers which transformed American life in the three decades following the Civil War…. I am concerned chiefly with effects of the corporate system on culture, on values and outlooks, on the “way of life.” …I mean not only the expansion of an industrial capitalist system across the continent, not only tightening systems of transport and communication, the spread of a market economy into all regions ***, but also and even predominantly, the remaking of cultural perceptions this processed entailed. By “the incorporation of American” I mean, then, the emergence of a changed, more tightly structured society with new hierarchies of control, and also changed conceptions of that society, of America itself.²⁶

One can recognize within the social thinking of this period, a perceived notion of social unity and triumph carrying forward as an extension and culmination of the Enlightenment Project—late sixteenth and seventeenth century thinking initiated by figures such as Rene Descartes²⁷---rational thought later coupled with scientific practices that promised to produce a flawless human societal condition through secular human mental capabilities and understanding. Charles Darwin and Karl Marx, figures often noted as two of the most important thinkers of the nineteenth century, both fit within such thinking, with systems that promised to explain

---


rationally and scientifically the “big picture,” and thereby allow us to engineer desirable societal conditions.\(^{28}\)

The Modern period is usually approximated as 1914-1945. I am not going to treat “Modernity” (that is, the philosophical concept) head on. Instead, I am going to sketch a number of themes arising out of literary Modernism and allow those themes to render, through their iconography, the cultural condition of the period.\(^{29}\)

Without question, the culturally transformative event of World War I is the watershed moment initiating and forever marking the Modern period. It is noted that the United States did not experience WWI with the same degree of psychological trauma that the United Kingdom and Europe did. Nonetheless, its impact remains great, and the transformations in world interconnectivity deeply penetrated the U.S. gestalt. In literature, the work of the High Modernists\(^ {30}\) ruled this period, and theirs was the dominant material taught until that hold began

\(^{28}\) Professor Marc Loth describes the period which lasted from the end of the seventeenth century to the end of the nineteenth century as the “epoch of modernism… characterized by what John Dewey has named ‘the quest for certainty.’” Marc A. Loth, Limits of Private Law: Enriching Legal Dogmatics, 35 Hofstra L. Rev. 1725, 1736-1739 (2007).

\(^{29}\) Modernism and Postmodernism are so often confusing because they simultaneously refer to different conceptual frameworks. In general, people use these terms when referring to one of the three following categories: (1) a historical period exhibiting a cultural condition; (2) a philosophy; and (3) an artistic movement or description. It is useful to employ parallel technology in order to make clear which of these three you are referring to:
1. Modern (or the Modern period) and Postmodern (or the Postmodern period) to refer to the historical period exhibiting a particular cultural condition;
2. Modernity and Postmodernity to refer to a given philosophy;
3. Modernism and Postmodernism to refer to an artistic movement or description.
This doesn’t solve all problems because the terminology isn’t perfect. In category 1, for example, people will use Postmodern to talk about the historical period that corresponds to it (roughly 1965 to the present), but rarely will people use Modern to talk about the period corresponding to that term. They are far more likely to say something like “the Modernist period” or simply “Modernism”. This may be because of the standard usage in history of “modern history”, referring to everything from the Enlightenment forward. Even more common is a collapsing of the terminology in categories 2 and 3 above. People often use Modernism or Postmodernism when referring to the philosophy that corresponds to these terms. The problem with that is the confusion it creates in separating the philosophical ideas from the particular artistic practices the terms now historically refer to.
I propose, and here will use, the above terminology so that I can more clearly indicate when I am referring to a historical period, when I am referring to a philosophy, and when I am referring to particular artistic practices. There is often overlap, and each category is of course influenced by the others because they exist simultaneously within a cultural milieu, but they are distinguishable and it is useful to think of them individually.

to be broken in the late 1960’s.\footnote{It, of course, took some time for alternative works to enter the canon more fully. This includes American domestic modernist writers, regional movements such as the Harlem Renaissance, and other alternative U.S. cultural artistic movements. Even today, however, there remain vestiges of the tradition proclaiming the High Modernists are the “truly important” authors to study.} The High Modernists were predominantly American expatriates living abroad after the war and strongly marked by the war experience.

Their work rendered a world shattered. The hoped for unity promised by the advancements of the nineteenth century was destroyed, ironically, by the very means by which the advancements had been achieved. Technological and mechanical means, innovation, new materials, communication, and social uniformity produced not a utopia, but a dystopic world of destruction and brutality on a scale never before experienced.\footnote{Throughout history, technology has created massive problems and unforeseen consequences. One such example is the connection between the railroad system and the near extinction of the American bison. \textit{See} Dean Lueck, \textit{The Extermination and Conservation of the American Bison}, 31 J.LEGAL STUD. 609, 639-644 (2002).} Marx had written of alienation as a condition experienced by workers in a modern system of capitalism.\footnote{\textsc{Karl Marx, The Communist Manifesto.}} This resulted from a capitalist system that functioned to organize labor, organize markets, specialize the tasks of manufacturing, assign individual unskilled tasks to each individual, and then siphon off as much of the worker-created surplus value as possible in order to benefit the owner capitalist.

WWI in many respects revealed, universalized, and made far more brutal this same mechanized process. What it made devastatingly clear was that the cause served and ends produced ultimately failed as noble endeavors. “Noblesse Oblige,” the “obligation of nobility” felt by many well-bred English subjects to defend England and carry high English ideals into the world, crumbled when confronted with the realities of WWI. Soldiers went into battle expecting the sort of tactics that had been employed in earlier conflicts. What they experienced was the first true modern warfare, mechanized destruction on a mass industrial scale.
A great deal of literature was written attempting to convey this experience. Among the most noted is Ezra Pound’s poem, “Hugh Selwyn Mauberley,” published in 1920. The intensity of personal disillusionment is strongly captured in the final stanzas:

There died a myriad,
and of the best, among them,
for an old bitch gone in the teeth,
for a botched civilization,

charm, smiling at the good mouth,
quick eyes gone under earth’s lid,

for two gross of broken statues,
for a few thousand battered books.

The perceived pointlessness of WWI is evident, but so, too, is the loss of faith in the British Empire and Western ideals. Pound’s England is a “bitch gone in the teeth;” the British Empire is a “botched civilization” that finally produces not enlightenment, but merely “two gross of broken statues” and “a few thousand battered books.”

This loss of faith in Western ideals is underscored earlier in the poem:

These fought, in any case,
and some believing, pro domo, in any case ….

Some quick to arm,
some for adventure,
some for fear of weakness,
some from fear of censure,
some for love of slaughter, in imagination,
learning later …

Some in fear, learning love of slaughter;
died some pro patria, non dulce non et décor …

Walked eye-deep in hell
believing in old men’s lies, then unbelieving
came home, home to a lie,
home to many deceits,
home to old lies and new infamy;
Pound tells us that some died “pro patria” (“for country”), but it was “non dulce et décor” (“not sweet and right”). This is a direct invocation of Wilfred Owen’s famous WWI anti-war poem “Dulce et Decorum Est.” Vehemently contesting the deep-seeded tradition of noblesse oblige, Owen’s poem includes the following lines:

If you could hear, at every jolt, the blood
come gurgling from the froth-corrupted lungs,
obscene as cancer, bitter as the cud
of vile, incurable sores on innocent tongues, --
my friend, you would not tell with such high zest
to children ardent for some desperate glory,
the old Lie: Dulce et decorum est
Pro patria mori.

Dying for one’s country, Owen found, like so many of his generation, is not sweet and right. Through horrifying imagery, Owen reveals the zestful imparting of such thinking for what it truly is: “an old Lie.”

In conjunction with WWI and events happening at the beginning of the twentieth century, it is also important to recognize that the Modern period followed on and coincided with the long colonial phase of Britain’s history. Matthew Arnold published his famous poem “Dover Beach” in 1867 and *Culture and Anarchy* in 1868, both already indicating deep concerns about the condition of modern British culture and its ability to stave off anarchy. Likewise, Joseph Conrad’s *The Heart of Darkness*, published in 1902, focused on “the lie” that had to be told to conceal the true condition of contemporary Western culture. When Marlowe, the narrator of *Heart of Darkness*, returns to England after having seen the state of inhuman anarchy that Colonel Kurtz fell into in the Congo, he is forced to confront Kurtz’s betrothed. Faced with her innocence and purity, the narrator feels he has no choice but to lie to her of Kurtz’s last words. Rather than admit that Kurtz’s last words were of the inevitability of succumbing to the abyss—
“The horror! The horror!”—the narrator tells Kurtz’s betrothed that his last words were of his love for her.

This literary incident is widely recognized as representative of the imperial position of England touting its colonial oversight as *enlightening* to colonial entities (“bringing light to the dark places of the earth”) rather than as inherently corrupting the parties on both sides of the colonial equation. The “lie” in effect stands for the modern notion that modern forces will supposedly produce societal well being, when in fact those forces will ultimately produce only new and more intensive forms of subjugation and domination.

The motif of Western culture shattered and fragmented in the Modern period is present and recurrent in cultural representations throughout this time. This motif is reflected in Ernest Hemingway’s “stoic code” that calls on the individual to quietly and gracefully bear up under the Godless condition of the modern world. It is also reflected in Gertrude Stein’s “eternal present” (“a rose is a rose is a rose is a rose”) that suggests we are always moment-to-moment individually composing anew the world as we know it. Likely the greatest statement, and certainly one of the most influential, of existing in a culture of fragmentation is found in T.S. Eliot’s poem “The Waste Land.”

Published in 1922 (the same year as James Joyce’s *Ulysses*), “The Waste Land” contains numerous elements underscoring the theme of cultural fragmentation. Eliot employs numerous languages of Western culture (and even some Eastern ones) to demonstrate the inability of the individual in Modern times to comprehend the cultural references one unavoidably encounters. Similarly, depictions of different class positions, from the refined aristocracy to the coarse working class, portray the multivalent structure of Modern society. Though the voices of these classes are interwoven throughout this poem, they produce a discordant effect indicative of the
experience of Modern living. Equally powerful as these elements, however, is the very theme of the poem.

The poem throughout portrays a quest for regeneration – a renewal of cultural forces allowing a rebirth and advancement of Western culture, but no regenerative forces can be found:

- “April is the cruelest month” (an ironical statement speaking of spring),
- “a heap of broken images,”
- “the dead tree gives no shelter…and the dry stone no sound of water,”
- “The wind / Crosses the brown land, unheard,” “Here is no water, only rock / Rock and no water and the sandy road.” “If there were the sound of water only… / Drip drop dripp drop drop drop drop / But there is no water”

Rain finally does come (“In a flash of lighten. Then a damp gust / Bringing rain”), but even this long hoped for action is inadequate to renew life. One of the last narrative voices conveys the final condition:

I sat upon the shore
Fishing, with the arid plain behind me
Shall I at least set my lands in order?
London Bridge is falling down falling down falling down

The thunder speaks, calling finally only for sympathy and control, all that seemingly can be had within the condition of the Modern world.

Parallel to this movement in the poem is a quest for the Holy Grail, the cup from which Christ drank at the last supper. Symbolically in Judeo-Christian culture, the Grail again supposes regeneration, a renewal through Christ and through God’s greater plan. Just as nature fails to deliver a solution to the condition of a failed and fragmented culture, so too spirituality is impotent to bring salvation: “I have heard the key / Turn in the door once and turn once only /
We think of the key, each in his prison / Thinking of the key, each confirms his prison,” and finally the narrative voice finds himself “Fishing, with the arid plain behind him.” If indeed this is an attempt to spiritually fish for the souls of men, the attempt fails on this dry unregenerative plain.

Eliot’s poem, along with the other poems and authors I’ve discussed, effectively conveys a dominant cultural motif emergent at this time. The Modern period was one of great disillusionment, a period rife with a sense that Western culture, rather than achieving the promised ideals of enlightenment, was instead falling into chaos and anarchy—and in many ways this was occurring as a result of the very means that were supposed to produce the cultural enlightenment. It is important to recognize, however, that for such a disillusionment to occur, there first had to be a true belief that the ideals of Western culture were superior, that Western ideals could produce enlightenment. As Eliot writes in the last lines of “the Waste Land,” “These fragments I have shored against my ruin.” Western culture is problematic, fragmented, and perhaps producing dystopia rater than utopia, but nonetheless one should presumably cling to it against all encroachments. This is the dichotomy that lies at the heart of much Modern thought: however fragmented and impotent the Modern condition might have revealed Western enlightenment ideals to be, Western culture still contains within it fragments “the best that has been thought and said in the world” (to invoke Arnold’s famous phrase from Culture and Anarchy). This belief ultimately is a key point that divides Modernity from Postmodernity.

Arguably, postmodernism reached its peak in the 1960s and 1970s.34 An often-entertained question is whether Postmodernity is an extension of Modernity or a decided break

34 “As with all stylistic eras, no definite dates exist for the rise and fall of postmodernism’s popularity. 1941, the year in which the Irish novelist James Joyce and British novelist Virginia Woolf both died, is sometimes used as a rough boundary for postmodernism’s start.” http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Postmodern_literature. The prefix ‘post’, however, does not necessarily imply a new era. Rather, it could also indicate a
from it. Postmodernity is its own philosophical beast, though it understandably presents some elements that are common to both or at least closely related. I will touch on some Postmodernist literary representations shortly, but since I have established a Modernist cultural groundwork, I believe it will be more effective to proceed here by offering some of the philosophical thinking that articulates the Postmodern cultural condition/period.

Most obvious, I believe, is that throughout the concepts articulated in Modernity, there is a striving for “mastery” or control. In contrast, the Postmodernity seems fairly free of such striving and seems not only to recognize, but also to embrace the “freeplay” it finds at the heart of knowledge construction. It is easy to see, however, why the idea of “freeplay” taken to its extreme unnerves people. At its extreme, it seems to say that all knowledge construction is a decentered and relativistic “game.” This becomes a central problem. Western liberal reaction against modernism in the wake of the Second World War (with its disrespect for human rights, just confirmed in the Geneva Convention, through the atomic bombings of Hiroshima and Nagasaki, the Holocaust, the bombing of Dresden, the fire-bombing of Tokyo, and Japanese-American internment). It could also imply a reaction to significant post-war events: the beginning of the Cold War, the civil rights movement in the United States, postcolonialism (Postcolonial literature), and the rise of the personal computer (Cyberpunk fiction and Hypertext fiction).

Some further argue that the beginning of postmodern literature could be marked by significant publications or literary events. For example, some mark the beginning of postmodernism with the first performance of *Waiting for Godot* in 1953, the first publication of *Howl* in 1956 or of *Naked Lunch* in 1959. For others, the beginning is marked by moments in critical theory: Jacques Derrida’s “Structure, Sign, and Play” lecture in 1966 or as late as Ihab Hassan’s usage in the *The Dismemberment of Orpheus* in 1971. Id.

35 KEITH TESTER, LIFE AND TIMES OF POST-MODERNITY (1993). It is not uncommon to see this question linguistically signaled through written queries such as: “Post-Modernity or Postmodernity?”

36 A pedigree was first given to postmodernism in the early 1970s by the literary critic Ihab Hassan in his book, *The Dismemberment of Orpheus: Toward a Postmodern Literature* (1971). This book is somewhat confusing to read, itself being one of the first critical works to adopt a postmodern mode. What it most gets noted for is the binary list it established distinguishing Postmodernity from Modernity. This list is not without its problems, of course, and it should not be taken too much as orthodoxy. It’s important to remember that it was created fairly early in the postmodern paradigm. A lot of thinking and writing on the subject has occurred since then. It’s useful generally, however, because many of the binary observations it made were fairly accurate, and it really helped many people crystallize in their thinking the kinds of divisions that can be found between Modernist and Postmodernist thinking and practices. Actually, this binary list wasn’t added until the 1982 edition, though the argument was fully developed in the earlier edition of the book. The list, and it’s not being added until the later edition of the book, tends to reinforce the argument that the way we think about Modernity now has to some extent been defined in retrospect in opposition to Postmodernity in order to help with the defining of Postmodernism.

37 In fact, Jean Francois Lyotard, another philosopher most associated with theorizing postmodernity (see
enlightenment thinking said, essentially, through pure rational thought and good practices (e.g., science), all problems eventually can be solved. The Modern crisis began to reveal, through sudden and shocking experiences (e.g., WWI), that this doesn’t seem to be the case. Postmodernity came along and said that of course it’s not the case and it never was. Such thinking and objectives were delusional in the first place. There never was any objective, pure thought. All construction of knowledge is always already bound up with power relations, and therefore contains within it and reflects those power relations.38

Lyotard, supra note 18) authored another book entitled JUST GAMING. The linguistic aspect of postmodernity and the decentralized nature of knowledge, is most often associated with the philosopher Ludwig Wittgenstein. David Gruender, Wittgenstein on Explanation and Description, 59 J. Phil. 523 (1962). And in instances of domination and subjugation, making knowledge a game allows the reader to disengage and allows the subjugated to resist. At the same time, however, in its less extreme strains, this freeplay creates a powerful tool for negotiation by those who were dominated and subjugated under Modernist conceptualizing. See also Chris Rouek & Bryan S. Turner, The Politics of Jean-Francois Lyotard (2002).

38  Foucault questioned whether rational knowledge represents progress in directing human life. See FOUCAULT, supra note 10. Postcolonial theory is key here. Gayatri Spivak wrote a now very famous essay entitled Can the Subaltern Speak?, in which she explored the very division I point to, though it’s cast in somewhat different terms. Postcolonial thought doesn’t really question the notion of competing constructions of knowledge and the ability of power relations to prevent some knowledges ever from appearing. It does, however, wrestle with the problem of whether strongly dominated subjects will be able to manifest their positions. I’m similarly going to sidestep the question of relativism because I think it’s a non-issue. More often than not, it’s those in positions of power that want to decry relativism because it threatens their domination. Theorists who work seriously with relativistic concepts, on the other hand, don’t tend to throw around relativism wildly. Instead, they tend to work very close to the ground, building counternarratives and demonstrating how those narratives have been foreclosed through social and cultural structures. See, e.g., Homi Bhabha, The Location of Culture 171 (1994) (“To reconstitute the discourse of cultural difference demands not simply a change of cultural contents and symbols…. It requires a radical revision of the social temporality in which emergent histories may be written, the rearticulation of the ‘sign’ in which cultural identities may be inscribed.”). This “rearticulation” is bringing rise to the voice(s) of those who previously have been closed out of any place in the cultural discourse, which is to say that they have been given no role in the constitution of knowledge formation. It is not to say that all things are equal, but that everyone should be given a voice as part of the social collective, especially those that have historically been precluded from such a position.

Carrying his point a step further, Bhabha argues that the marginalized are in fact uniquely and beneficially positioned to formulate important alternative discourses. He writes:

[It] is from those who have suffered the sentence of history…that we learn our most enduring lessons for living and thinking. There is even a growing conviction that the affective experience of social marginality…transforms our critical strategies. It forces us to confront the concept of culture outside objets d’art or beyond the canonization of the “idea” of aesthetics, to engage with culture as an uneven, incomplete production of meaning and value, often composed of incommensurable demands and practices, produced in the act of social survival.

Id. at 172.
Postmodernism totally accepts fragmentation, ephemerality, discontinuity, and the chaotic, and it “swims, even wallows, in the fragmentary...currents of change as if that’s all there is.”39

America is the original version of modernity. We [Europe] are the dubbed or subtitled version. America ducks the question of origins; it cultivates no origin or mythical authenticity; it has no past and no founding truth. Having known no primitive accumulation of time, it lives in a perpetual present. Having seen no slow, centuries-long accumulation of a principle of truth, it lives in perpetual simulation, in a perpetual present of signs. It has no ancestral territory. The Indians’ territory is today marked off in reservations, the equivalent of the galleries in which America stocks its Rembrandts and Renoirs. But this is of no importance – America has no identity problem. In the future, power will belong to those peoples with no origins and no authenticity who know how to exploit that situation to the full. Look at Japan, which to a certain extent has pulled off this trick better than the U.S. itself, managing, in what seems to us an unintelligible paradox, to transform the power of territoriality and feudalism into that of deterritoriality and weightlessness. Japan is already a satellite of the planet Earth. But America was already in its day a satellite of the planet Europe. Whether we like it or not, the future has shifted towards artificial satellites.

America is neither dream nor reality. It is a hyperreality. It is a hyperreality because it is a utopia which has behaved from the very beginning as though it were already achieved. Everything here is real and pragmatic, and yet it is all the stuff of dreams, too. It may be that the truth of America can only be seen by a European, since he alone will discover here the perfect simulacrum – that of the immanance and material transcription of all values. The Americans, for their part, have no sense of simulation. They are themselves simulation in its most developed state, but they have no language in which to describe it, since they themselves are the model. As a result, they are the ideal material for an analysis of all the possible variants of the modern world. No more and no less in fact than were primitive societies in their day. The same mythical and analytic excitement that made us look towards those earlier societies today impels us to look in the direction of America. With the same passion and the same prejudices.

In reality, you do not, as I had hoped, get any distance on Europe from here. You do not acquire a fresh angle on it. When you turn around, it has quite simply disappeared. The point is that there is really no need to adopt a critical stance on Europe from here. That is something you can do in Europe. And what is there to criticize which has not been criticized a thousand times before? What you have to do is enter the fiction of America, enter America as fiction. It is, indeed, on this

fictive basis that it dominates the world. Even if every detail of America were insignificant, America is something that is beyond us all . . .

America is a giant hologram, in the sense that information concerning the whole is contained in each of its elements. Take the tiniest little place in the desert, any old street in a Midwest town, a parking lot, a Californian house, a Burger King or a Studebaker, and you have the whole of the U.S. – South, North, East, or West. Holographic also in that it has the coherent light of the laser, the homogeneity of the single elements scanned by the same beams. From the visual and plastic viewpoints, too: things seem to be made of a more unreal substance; they seem to turn and move in a void as if by a special lighting effect, a fine membrane you pass through without noticing it. This is obviously true of the desert. It is also the case with Las Vegas and advertising, and even the activities of the people, public relations, and everyday electronics all stand out with the plasticity and simplicity of a beam of light. The hologram is akin to the world of phantasy. It is a three-dimensional dream and you can enter it as you would a dream. Everything depends on the existence of the ray of light bearing the objects. If it is interrupted, all the effects are dispersed, and reality along with it. You do indeed get the impression that America is made up of a fantastic switching between similar elements, and that everything is only held together by a thread of light, a laser beam, scanning out American reality before our eyes. In America, the spectral does not refer to phantoms or to dancing ghosts, but to the spectrum into which light disperses.

On the aromatic hillsides of Santa Barbara, the villas are all like funeral homes. Between the gardenias and the eucalyptus trees, among the profusion of plant genuses and the monotony of the human species, lies the tragedy of a utopian dream made reality. In the very heartland of wealth and liberation, you always hear the same question: ‘What are you doing after the orgy?’ What do you do when everything is available – sex, flowers, the stereotypes of life and death? This is America’s problem and, through America, it has become the whole world’s problem.

All dwellings have something of the grave about them, but here the fake serenity is complete. The unspeakable house plants, lurking everywhere like the obsessive fear of death, the picture windows looking like Snow White’s glass coffin, the clumps of pale, dwarf flowers stretched out in patches like sclerosis, the proliferation of technical gadgetry inside the house, beneath it, around it, like drips in an intensive care ward, the TV, stereo, and video which provide communication with the beyond, the car (or cars) that connect one up to that great shoppers’ funeral parlour, the supermarket, and, lastly, the wife and children, as glowing symptoms of success. . . everything here testifies to death having found its ideal home.

The microwave, the waste disposal, the orgasmic elasticity of the carpets: this soft, resort-style civilization irresistibly evokes the end of the world. All their
activities here have a surreptitious end-of-the-world feel to them: these Californian scholars with monomaniacal passions for things French or Marxist, the various sects obsessively concerned with chastity or crime, these joggers sleepwalking in the mist like shadows that have escaped from Plato’s cave, the very real mental defectives or Mongols let out of the psychiatric hospitals (this letting loose of the mad into the city seems a sure sign of the end of the world, the loosing of the seals of the Apocalypse), these obese individuals who have escaped from the hormone laboratories of their own bodies, and these drilling platforms – ‘oil sanctuaries’ – keeping watch in the night, like grand casinos, or extraterrestrial spacecraft.

Ravishing hyperrealism
Ecstatic asceticism
Multi-process tracking shot
Interactive multi-dimensionality
Mind-blowing

*Western Digital*
*Body Building Incorporated*
*Mileage unlimited*
*Channel Zero*

Seedy bar in Santa Barbara. The billiard player’s red braces. Foucault, Sartre, and Orson Welles all standing together at the counter, talking to each other, strangely convincing, strikingly like the originals. ‘Cocktail scenery.’ The smell of violence, the stale odour of beer. ‘Hustling is prohibited.’

Sex, beach, and mountains. Sex and beach, beach and mountains. Mountains and sex. A few concepts. Sex and concepts. ‘Just a life.’

Everything is destined to reappear as simulation. Landscapes as photography, women as the sexual scenario, thoughts as writing, terrorism as fashion and the media, events as television. Things seem only to exist by virtue of this strange destiny. You wonder whether the world itself isn’t just here to serve as advertising copy in some other world.

When the only physical beauty is created by plastic surgery, the only urban beauty by landscape surgery, the only opinion by opinion poll surgery. . .and now, with genetic engineering, along comes plastic surgery for the whole human species.

This is a culture which sets up specialized institutes so that people’s bodies can come together and touch, and, at the same time, invents pans in which the water does not touch the bottom of the pan, which is made of a substance so homogenous, dry, and artificial that not a single drop sticks to it, just like those bodies intertwined in ‘feeling’ and therapeutic love, which do not touch – not
even for a moment. This is called interface or interaction. It has replaced face-to-face contact and action. It is also called communication, because these things really do communicate: the miracle is that the pan bottom communicates its heat to the water without touching it, in a sort of remote boiling process, in the same way as one body communicates its fluid, its erotic potential, to another without that other ever being seduced or even disturbed, by a sort of molecular capillary action. The code of separation has worked so well that they have even managed to separate the water from the pan and to make the pan transmit its heat as a message, or to make one body transmit its desire to the other as a message, as a fluid to be decoded. This is called information and it has wormed its way into everything, like a phobic, maniacal leitmotiv, which affects sexual relations as well as kitchen implements.  

Obviously, I have been searching for my own fragmented free fall, my free-for-all-free-fall. My own Timbuktu.

A town made of pastry dough and starlight. A mirage you can walk around in—if you can stand the heat. Solitary, sealed, and shuttered, it wears a mask beneath a mask behind a veil. Timbuktu. A dehydrated Venice, crumbling into a plexus of dust canals. Conceived when the sphinx lay down with the goldbug at a campsite half as old as time. The Sahara crackles in every bite of its bread, the ashes of dead books blow through the streets; the lost wisdom of a dozen races is buried under its drifts, never to be jiggled by the archaeologist’s spade. Timbuktu. A city only an adventurer would risk, only a romantic would forgive, only a nomad would find inviting, only a camel could love.

Kiss me, Snow White, and wake me from my own pragmatism. I know that many readers have known that the world has always been a cruel place, but please bear with me a smidgen longer. You’re in the weather the whether you’re in. Umberto Eco makes us read one hundred pages of William Baskerville’s daily life in an Italian abbey before his fourteenth century crime caper becomes a ripper. Professor Eco also explains his idea of postmodernism as a kind of double-coding:

I think of the postmodern attitude as that of a man who loves a very cultivated woman and knows that he cannot say to her, “I love you madly,” because he knows that she knows (and that she knows he knows) that these words have already been written by Barbara Cartland. Still there is a solution. He can say, “As Barbara Cartland would put it, I love you madly.” At this point, having avoided false innocence, having said clearly it is no longer possible to talk innocently, he will
Tao, the I Ching, the Bagavad-Gita, or the battle for God. Instead, I want to contemplate Nicholson Baker’s dazzling reappraisal of everyday rituals and objects on a one-story escalator ride and his new shoelaces.

As soon as my gaze fell to my shoes, however, I was reminded of something that should have struck me the instant the shoelace had first snapped. The day before, as I had been getting ready for work, my other shoelace, the right one, had snapped, too, as I was yanking it tight to tie it, under very similar circumstances. I repaired it with a knot, just as I was planning to do now with the left. I was surprised – more than surprised – to think that after almost two years my right and left shoelaces could fail less than two days apart. Apparently my shoe-tying routine was so unvarying and robotic that over those hundreds of mornings I had inflicted identical levels of wear on both laces. The near simultaneity was very exciting – it made the variables of private life seem suddenly grasppable and law-abiding.

I moistened the splayed threads of the snapped-off piece and twirled them gently into a damp, unwholesome minaret. Breathing steadily and softly through my nose, I was able to guide the saliva-sharpened leader thread through the eyelet without too much trouble. And then I grew uncertain. In order for the shoelaces to have worn to the breaking point on almost the same day, they would have had to be tied almost exactly the same number of times. But when Dave, Sue, and Steve passed my office door, I had been in the middle of tying one shoe – one shoe only. And in the course of a normal day it wasn’t at all unusual for one shoe to come untied independent of the other. In the morning, of course, you always tied both shoes, but random midday comings-undone would have to have constituted a significant proportion of the total wear on both of these broken laces, I felt – possibly thirty percent. And how could I be positive that this thirty percent was equally distributed – that right and left shoes had come randomly undone over the last two years with the same frequency?

I tried to call up some sample memories of shoe-tying to determine whether one shoe tended to come untied more often than another. Wheat I found was that I did not retain a single specific engram of tying a shoe, or a pair of shoes, that dated

nevertheless say what he wanted to say to the woman: that he loves her in an age of lost innocence.


Even though it would be my want. See, e.g., Joseph Campbell, Myths of Light: Eastern Metaphors of the Eternal (2003).
from any later than when I was four or five years old, the age at which I had first learned the skill. Over twenty years of empirical data were lost forever, a complete blank. But I suppose this is often true of moments of life that are remembered as major advances; the discovery is the crucial thing, not its repeated later applications. As it happened, the first three major advances in my life – and I will list all the advances here –

1. shoe-tying
2. pulling up on Xs
3. steadying hand against sneaker when tying
4. brushing tongue as well as teeth
5. putting on deodorant after I was fully dressed
6. discovering that sweeping was fun
7. ordering a rubber stamp with my address on it to make bill-paying more efficient
8. deciding that brain cells ought to die

-- have to do with shoe-tying, but I don’t think that this fact is very unusual. Shoes are the first adult machines we are given to master. Being taught to tie them was not like watching some adult fill the dishwasher and then being asked in a kind voice if you would like to clamp the dishwasher door shut and advance the selector knob (with its uncomfortable grinding sound) to Wash. That was artificial, whereas you knew that adults wanted you to learn how to tie your shoes; it was no fun for them to kneel. I made several attempts to learn the skill, but it was not until my mother placed a lamp on the floor so that I could clearly see the dark laces of a pair of new dress shoes that I really mastered it; she explained again how to form the introductory platform knot, which began high in the air as a frail, heart-shaped loop, and shrunk as you pulled the plastic lace-tips down to a short twisted kernel three-eighths of an inch long, and she showed me how to progress from that base to the main cotyledonary string figure, which was, as it turned out, not a true knot but an illusion, a trick that you performed on the lace-string by bending segments of it back on themselves and tightening other temporary bends around them: it looked like a knot and functioned like a knot, but the whole thing was really an amazing independent pyramid scheme, which much later I connected with a couplet of Pope’s:

Man, like the gen’rous vine, supported lives;  
The strength he gains is from th’embrace he gives.45

Perhaps, I too would have wished upon myself the escapism of a Vagabond Wordsmith, free to fly past the didactical storm clouds and into the ceruleum blue Poetic Sky. I assume that

is why I have been given to re-reading *Naked Lunch*;\(^{46}\) the great postmodern war novels *Catch-22,\(^{47}\) *Slaughterhouse Five,\(^{48}\) and *Gravity’s Rainbow;\(^{49}\) *White Noise;\(^{50}\) *Gain;\(^{51}\) *The Painted Bird;\(^{52}\) and what is considered to be one of the principal works of the Beat Generation, *Howl.*\(^{53}\)

> Who scribbled all night rocking and rolling over lofty incantations
> Which in the yellow morning were stanzas of gibberish,
> ***
> Who cut their wrists three times successively unsuccessfuilly, gave up
> and were forced to open antique stores where they thought
> they were growing old and cried,
> ***
> Who dreamt and made incarnate gaps in Time & Space through
> images juxtaposed, and trapped the archangels of the Soul
> between 2 visual images and joined the elemental verbs
> and set the non and dash of consciousness together jumping
> with sensation of Pater Omnipoteus Aeterna Deus.
> ***
> and rose reincarnate in the ghostly clothes of jazz in the goldhorn
> shadow of the band and blew the suffering of America’s
> naked mind for love into an eli eli lamma lamma sabacthami
> saxophone cry that shivered the cities down to the last radio
> with the absolute heart of the poem of life butchered out of their
> own bodies good enough to eat a thousand years.\(^{54}\)

We cannot deny postmodernism its range. Dick Hebdige, in his “Hiding in the Light,”

commends:

When it becomes possible for people to describe as ‘postmodern’ the décor of a room, the design of a building, the diegesis of a film, the construction of a record, or a ‘scratch’ video, a television commercial, or an arts documentary, or the ‘intertextual’ relations between them, the layout of a page in a fashion magazine or critical journal, an anti-teleological tendency within epistemology, the attack on the ‘metaphysics of presence’ a general attenuation of feeling, the collective chagrin and morbid projections of a post-War generation of baby boomers confronting disillusioned middle-age, the ‘predicament of reflexitivity, a group of

\(^{46}\) WILLIAM S. BURROUGHS, *NAKED LUNCH* (1961)
\(^{50}\) DON DELILLO, *WHITE NOISE* (1985).
\(^{53}\) ALLEN GINSBERG, *HOWL AND OTHER POEMS* (1956).
\(^{54}\) *Id.* at 13-16.
rhetorical tropes, a proliferation of surfaces, a new phase in commodity fetishism, a fascination for images, codes and styles, a process of cultural, political or existential fragmentation and/or crisis, the ‘de-centring’ of the subject, an ‘incredulity towards metanarratives’, the replacement of unitary power axes by a plurality of power/discourse formations, the ‘implosion of meaning’, the collapse of cultural hierarchies, the dread engendered by the threat of nuclear self-destruction, the decline of the university, the functioning and effects of the new miniaturised technologies, broad societal and economic shifts into a ‘media’, ‘consumer’ or ‘multinational’ phase, a sense (depending on who you read) of ‘placelessness’ or the abandonment of ‘placelessness’ (critical regionalism) or (even) a generalised substitution of spatial for temporal coordinates: when it becomes possible to describe all these things as ‘postmodern’ (or more simply using a current abbreviation as ‘post’ or ‘very post’) then it’s clear we are in the presence of a buzzword.  

And the novelists speak to us without the fixation of time, yet with temporal sensitivity, in pastiche, of technoculture and hyperreality, paranoia, temporal distortion, racism, colonialism, underground conspiracies, synchronicity, entropy, preterition, rampant consumerism, capitalism predominantly concerned now with the production of signs, images, and sign systems rather than with the commodities themselves, radical medicalization, media saturation, novelty intellectualism, the disintegration and re-integration of the family, of escape fantasies, and the potentially positive virtues of human violence, as in Blade Runner. They can make nonsense of cruelty or give it the proportionately of horror it deserves. They can make no sense of no sense with nonsense. Authors can make us desire to live a thousand cultural lives. They can erase straight lines and make crisp marks across the fates of educators. Yet, can we forget about so much headspin and take the advice of the plucked parrot in Tom Robbins’ Fierce Invalids Home From Hot Climates? The defeathered macaw admonishes us, “People of zee wurl, relax.”

57 Tom Robbins, Fierce Invalids Home From Hot Climates (2000). Robbins also guides us with
But when we look at a photograph memorializing West African refugees or starving children be speckled by flies on their lips in Sebastian Salgado’s famed photographs, can we relax? Can we rejoice in witnessing the sharp orange cirrus clouds lolling a Sonoran Desert sunrise while at the same time agonize over the incessant rape of women and children in the eastern Congo. Can postmodernism help get us through the night?

Or, must we “retrace our steps:”

Then an Israeli Sophocrat named ben-Yeshu wrote a book, *A Critique of Utopias*, that greatly impressed his colleagues in Southern Europe, America and Africa. From a detailed and learned analysis of some seventy *Utopias*, including Plato’s *Timaeus* and *Republic*, Bacon’s *New Atlantis*, Campanella’s *Civitas Solis*, Fenelon’s *Voyage en Solente*, Cabot’s *Voyage en Icarie*, Lytton’s *Coming Race*, Morris’s *News from Nowhere*, Butler’s *Erewhon*, Huxley’s *Brave New World*, and various works of the twenty-first to the twenty-fourth centuries, he traced the history of man’s increasing discontent with civilization as it developed and came to a practical conclusion: that ‘we must retrace our steps, or perish.’

He recommended ‘anthropological enclaves’, the setting aside of small territories in Lithuania, North Wales (which had escaped the devastation of South Wales and England), Anatolia, the Catalan Pyrenees, Finland and Libya, and the reerection there, as far as possible, of social and physical conditions as they had existed in prehistoric and early historical times. These enclaves were to represent successive stages of the development of civilization, from a Palaeolithic enclave in Libya to a Late Iron Age one in the Pyrenees; and were to be sealed off from the rest of the world for three generations, though kept under continuous observation by field-workers directly responsible to the Anthropological Council. Ben-Yeshu’s theory was that ‘these experiments will supply the necessary data as to when and why the freight train of civilization leapt the rails.’

Honestly, I am not very good at this head play, this paronomasia. Did I film the wind or capture the winded? My upbringing geared me more toward a scientific life, and a

---

*Erleichtda* (lighten up) in *TOM ROBBINS, JITTERBUG PERFUME* (1984).

58 *ROBERT GRAVES, SEVEN DAYS IN NEW CRETE* (1949).

59 There are others so much more qualified. Modernity recognized the fragmentation of Western culture and its impotency to unify. Postmodernity moved past the lamentation, recognizing that the vision of unity was a false one from the start, that it was built into the structures of Western liberal enlightenment thinking, and reinforced through deep components of that structure such as capitalism and science. See *CHARLES JENCKS, WHAT IS POST-MODERNISM?* (1996); *HANS BERTENS, THE IDEA OF THE POSTMODERN* (1995). And, in this order, *DAVID HARVEY, SPACES OF HOPE* (2000); *DAVID HARVEY, THE CONDITION OF POSTMODERNITY* (1989); *MIKE FEATHERSTONE, CONSUMER CULTURE AND POSTMODERNISM* (1991); *DAVID LYON, POSTMODERNITY* (2d ed. 1999); *PETER GAY,*
shortcoming in the vocabulary of history and philosophy I regretfully acknowledge. My own neglect raises the fear that our current educational system, with an emphasis on structure, scientific reductionism—science fixation—will mean fewer and fewer will study, let alone spend the time to recall the brutalities of the past. These last few years, I have read to saturation the panoramic accounts of historic and contemporary barbarism. Why? Not to be obsessively cynical, for sure. But because I had to stomp on my naiveté. Let me now search for those embers of dignity still left in the world from which to keep the fires lit in my heart.

** * **

For me, reality is an agreement, and I am continuously enthralled by how many of my students long to study, in law and business school, those authors and adventurers that are conscientiously trying to add egalitarian kindness to the fabric of human-to-human relations. This paper, an example of my classroom experience, is meant to challenge those educators that have always thought to incorporate their personal ideals and healing talents onto the framework of legal and business education. The years turned and the Syllabus responded to and included the works of brilliant, thoughtful humanists, futurists, ecologists, economists, naturists,

---


62 The Syllabus begins on Page ahead. The Tool Kit follows.
scholars, cultural theorists, literary theorists, historians, and political illusionists. The energies of the writers and filmmakers are dynamic, responding to the magnificent drama of breath, what we call life on earth. I have been fascinated and frustrated, at times unhappily, with rearranging a galactic overabundance of information. Like Benjamin DeCasseres (“My studies in speculative philosophy, metaphysics, and science are all summed up in the image of a mouse running in and out of every hole in the Cosmos hunting for the Absolute Cheese.”), I scour the pantheons and catalogue an upside-down world. Better I should have forever been contented by my comic book mentor in the 60s, Mr. Natural. When asked what was the meaning of life, this wizened bon vivant replied, in two separate majestic epiphanies of good taste, “twas ever thus” and “don’t mean shit.”

I fear the following quote:

This data glut has turned us all into the Jorge Luis Borges fictional character Funes the Memorius whose brain is fantastically receptive but utterly unselective. He can recall every leaf of tree he saw 30 years ago, but lets important things slide right through his consciousness. We don’t know what to do with vast amounts of useless information we ingest. We can’t sweat it out or excrete it or trash it. It stays in perfectly stored somewhere taking up space forever. The result is a kind of low-level tension as if we are perpetually preparing for an exam that never comes. As if we’ve been sent out to gather branches in the woods, we pick up everything and put down nothing until we buckle under the weight of the impossible load.\(^63\)

I fear more Kalle Lasn’s description of our contemporary society:

Post-modernism is arguably the most depressing philosophy ever to spring from the western mind. It is difficult to talk about post-modernism because nobody really understands it. It’s allusive to the point of being impossible to articulate. But what this philosophy basically says is that we’ve reached an end-point in human history. That the modernist tradition of progress and ceaseless extension of the frontiers of innovation are now dead. Originality is dead. The avant-garde artistic tradition is dead. All religions and utopian visions are dead and resistance to the status quo is impossible because revolution too is now dead. Like it or not, we humans are stuck in a permanent crisis of meaning, a dark room

from which we can never escape.64

I rarely fear Tom Robbins:

Sarah Bernhardt was such a powerfully popular, awe-inspiring actress that when she toured in North America her performances invariably sold out, even though she spoke hardly a word of English. Whatever play she did, Shakespeare, Moliere, Marlowe, or whatever, she did in French, a language few nineteenth-century Americans could comprehend. Theatergoers were provided with librettos so that they might follow the action in English. Well, on at least a couple of occasions, ushers passed out the wrong libretto, a text for an entirely different drama than the one that was being staged. Yet, from all reports, not once did a single soul in those capacity crowds ever comment or complain. Furthermore, no critic ever mentioned the discrepancy in his or her review.

***

We modern human beings are looking at life, trying to make some sense of it, observing a ‘reality’ that often seems to be unfolding in a foreign tongue—only we’ve all been issued the wrong librettos. For a text, we’re given the Bible. Or the Talmud or the Koran. We’re given Time magazine and Reader’s Digest, daily papers, and the six o’clock news; we’re given schoolbooks, sitcoms, and revisionist histories; we’re given psychological counseling, cults, workshops, advertisements, sales pitches, and authoritative pronouncements by pundits, sold-out scientists, political activists, and heads of state. Unfortunately, none of these translations bears more than a faint resemblance to what is transpiring in the true theater of existence, and most of them are dangerously misleading. We’re attempting to comprehend the spiraling intricacies of a magnificently complex tragicomedy with librettos that describe barroom melodramas or kindergarten skits. And when’s the last time you heard anybody bitch about it to the management?65

My collection of authors is, of course, by no means complete. Other educators have filled their own resource coffers with their favorite visionaries and have, no doubt, designed curriculum to sustain their own comment on the world. Still an infant, the syllabus searches for a continued sharing of wisdom and resources that can be passed along to a bevy of like-minded

64  Kalle Lasn & Bruce Grierson, A Malignant Sadness, ADBUSTERS #30, June/July 2000. See also Clive Thompson, Global Mourning: How the Next Victim of Climate Change Will Be Our Minds, WIRED, January 2008, at p. 70.

65  TOM ROBBINS, HALF ASLEEP IN FROG PAJAMAS 97-98 (1994).
educators. The class is a small stream trying to find its way into the big river. I encourage teachers to use this Syllabus as a table upon which can be placed your own favored advocates.

**The Syllabus**

*Why Question Globalization?*

The word, *globalization*, is spoken everywhere and is emblematic. To some it means worldwide economic homogenization. To others it connotes prosperity under the guise of “free trade.” Is globalization meant to imply the structure of an international corporate marketplace, the rise of religious evangelicalism around the globe, a sanction of academic elite speaking professionally in English, transformations in culture that are promoted by western values, or all of the above? Is it the global standardization of economic accounting to measure and declare what is considered wealth, success, and growth? Is a global legal order coming? Is globalization a symbol of injustice, inequality, poverty, and unfair hegemonic trade rules? Does it mean slavery or selling your kidney to avoid starvation? Does it mean trading your child for a

---


69 See DAVID HARVEY, A BRIEF HISTORY OF NEOLIBERALISM (2005). Devised by David Ricardo in 1817, the principle of comparative advantage has been championed, until recently, as the most significant tool in the economist’s toolbox. See Clive Crook, Beyond Belief, THE ATLANTIC, October 2007, at p. 44.

70 See E. Benjamin Skinner, A World Enslaved, FOREIGN POLICY 62, March/April 2008. Devised by David Ricardo in 1817, the principle of comparative advantage has been championed, until recently, as the most significant tool in the economists’ toolbox. See Clive Crook, Beyond Belief, THE ATLANTIC, October 2007, p. 44. Andrew Cockburn, 21st Century Slaves, National Geographic 2, September 2003. See also Albinos Being Slain for Body
television? The string of questions, ascriptions, labels and logos is endless.\textsuperscript{71} And the answer to whether it is working depends on who is asked and, in my world, whose dignity is respected by the machinations of globalization.\textsuperscript{72}


As a Professor of Indigenous Law and Policy, I have studied the genocide of Indigenous peoples and have explored the long, historical polemic and legal sophistry of colonization. A number of authors argue that economic globalization is still imperial hegemony by empires with only a change in name. Goldsmith, \textit{ supra} note 71. Should our measurements of “success” or “failure” not be measured by currently accepted economic indicators, but rather by the degree to which we respect the dignity of all peoples and all species in residence on this planet? \textit{See William McDonough, Architects, The Hanover Principles: Design For Sustainability} (1992). In the
considering the impact Globalization has on every other person in the world.\textsuperscript{73} We often fail to question where the various products we consume originate, and mistakenly believe that our daily consumptive habits constitute little more than a drop in a large bucket of world problems.\textsuperscript{74} We...
are the Great Pretenders.75 “What needs explaining is our equanimity in the face of staggering developments. How can we go about our business when things [global warming, cloning, genetic engineering, artificial intelligence, robotics] are happening? How can we just read the article, shake our heads, turn the page?”76 Reality is indistinguishable from fabrication as we are flooded with sheer quantities of information.77

I venture to say few people place in their comprehension that the amount of land that supports human life is minute in comparison to the Earth as a whole. To drive this point in the classroom, I produce an apple—*Malus Domestica*78, which aptly functions as a metaphor for the

---


66 Zengotita, *supra* note 63.

67 The Marxist Frankfurt school in Germany, for example, criticized mass culture as integrating all peoples into the status quo and intensifying capitalism. The school’s work was particularly influential from the 1930s until the 1950s and set the stage for British Cultural Studies. Douglas Kellner, *The Frankfurt School and British Cultural Studies: The Missed Articulation* (2006), available at [http://www.gseis.ucla.edu/faculty/kellner/essays/frankfurtschoolbritishculturalstudies.pdf](http://www.gseis.ucla.edu/faculty/kellner/essays/frankfurtschoolbritishculturalstudies.pdf).

68 The wild apple is *Malus Sieversii*. The Latin word for “evil” is malum, and the plural in Latin for both apple and evil is “mala.” Language constructs power and vice versa.
Earth. After cutting the red fruit into four equal slices, I ask my students to recognize that three of the four quarters represent the ocean. Aside from our insatiable desire to pillage natural oceanic life and technologically ascend to being “marine pastoralists” on fish farms, we do not yet grow plant crops on the surface of seawater. I offer these three segments of “genus Malus of ocean” to the students. It helps them to digest my polemic. Of the remaining quarter, one half of it represents the inhospitable places on earth that do not support human life, such as the polar areas, deserts, swamps, or very high and rocky mountains. Cut away and discard. The remaining eighth is cut again into quarters, and three of the four pieces represent places where humans cannot grow food as they are locations on the earth that are too rocky, steep, have poor soils, or are highways and cities. The remaining piece is a tiny 1/32 of the apple; the peel is the entire amount of worldly topsoil upon which all of the food for all of humankind grows.

Because of erosion and overfarming, over 25 billion tons of topsoil are diminishing each year. Disproportionately, it takes anywhere from five hundred to one thousand years to replace 1” of topsoil.

Inhabiting a world of its own, to the side of this geophysical reality, the words “free trade” have taken on a moral undertone akin to “democracy” and “freedom.” Yet the connections and consequences of the deregulated and unrestricted movements of goods, money,

---

79 This exercise comes from ZERO POPULATION GROWTH, INC., A WORLD OF SIX BILLION WALL CHART AND ACTIVITY GUIDE: THOUGHT PROVOKING ACTIVITIES ON POPULATION, RESOURCES, AND OUR ENVIRONMENT (2000).
82 Id.
and services must be exposed to a light different from the glare of its faith-based creedo.\(^4\)

Granted, most of us can afford a cup of coffee every day, but at what costs?

The buzzing world would not go away. Without opening my eyes, I hit the clock radio. My brain managed to hold one coherent thought: caffeine.

**Beans.** I staggered into the kitchen to brew a cup of coffee. It took 100 beans—about one-sixtieth of the beans that grew on the coffee tree that year. The tree was on a small mountain farm in the Antioquia region of Colombia. The region was cleared of most of its native cloud forests at the turn of the century: the fertile valley bottoms by cattle ranchers and the less productive hillsides by poor farmers who planted coffee and fruit trees. Colombia’s forests make it a biological superpower: though the country covers less than 1 percent of the Earth’s land surface, it is home to 18 percent of the world’s plant species and more types of birds than any other nation.

Dense, manicured rows of *Coffea Arabica* trees covered the farm, growing under the strong tropical sun. For most of this century, coffee grew on this farm in the shade of taller fruit and hardwood trees, whose canopies harbored numerous birds, from keel-billed toucans to Canada warblers. In the 1980s, farm owners sawed down most of the shade trees and planted high-yielding varieties of coffee. This change increased their harvests. It also increased soil erosion and decimated birds, including wintering songbirds that breed near my home. Biologists report finding just 5 percent as many bird species in these new, sunny coffee fields as in the traditional shaded coffee plantations they replaced.

With the habitats of birds and other insect eaters removed, pests proliferated and coffee growers stepped up their pesticide use. Farmworkers wearing shorts, T-shirts, and sloshing backpacks sprayed my tree with several doses of pesticides synthesized in Germany’s Rhine River Valley. Some of the chemicals entered the farmworkers’ lungs; others washed or wafted away, only to be absorbed by plants and animals.

Workers earning less than a dollar a day picked my coffee berries by hand and fed them into a diesel-powered crusher, which removed the beans from the pulpy berries that encased them. The pulp was dumped into the Cauca River. The beans, dried under the sun, traveled to New Orleans on a ship in a 132-pound bag. For each pound of beans, about two pounds of pulp had been dumped into the river. As the pulp decomposed, it consumed oxygen needed by fish in the river.

---

\(^4\) The aphorism “a rising tide lifts all boats” has become associated with the idea that general economic improvements will benefit everyone in the economy, and therefore governments should focus on free market policies that will improve the economy. The rapid economic growth in America during the 1960s seemed to support this view, but recently economists have questioned an uncompromising belief in this dogma. See, e.g., James R. Hines, Jr. et al, *Another Look at Whether a Rising Tide Lifts All Boats in The Roaring Nineties: Can Full Employment Be Sustained?* (2001), available at [http://www.econ.ucdavis.edu/faculty/hoynes/publications/HHK-Final.pdf](http://www.econ.ucdavis.edu/faculty/hoynes/publications/HHK-Final.pdf).
The freighter that carried my coffee was made in Japan and fueled by Venezuelan oil. The shipyard built the freighter out of Korean steel. The Korean steel mill used iron mined on aboriginal lands in the Hamersley Range of western Australia.

At New Orleans, the beans were roasted for 13 minutes at 400°F. The roaster burned natural gas pumped from the ground in Texas. The beans were packaged in four-layer bags constructed of polyethylene, nylon, aluminum foil, and polyester. They were trucked to a Seattle warehouse in an 18-wheeler, which got six miles per gallon of diesel. A smaller truck then took the roasted beans to my neighborhood grocery store.

Bag I carried the beans out of the store in a sealed, wax-lined paper bag and a large brown paper sack, both made at unbleached kraft paper mills in Oregon. (Sometimes I bring my own canvas grocery bag, but this time I forgot.) I brought them home in my car; it burned one-fifth of a gallon of gasoline during the five-mile round-trip to the market.

Grinder In the kitchen, I measured the beans in a disposable plastic scoop molded in New Jersey and spooned them into a grinder. The grinder was assembled in China from imported steel, aluminum, copper, and plastic parts. It was powered by electricity generated at Ross Dam on the Skagit River in the Washington Cascades.

I dumped the ground coffee in a gold-plated mesh filter made in Switzerland of German Steel and Russian gold. I put the filter into a plastic-and-steel drip coffeemaker.

Water I poured eight ounces of tap water into the appliance. The water came by pipe from a processing plant. Originally it came from the Chester Morse Reservoir on the Cedar River on the west slope of the Cascades. An element heated the water to more than 200°F. The hot water seeped through the ground coffee and dissolved some of its oils and solids. The brew trickled into a glass carafe; I poured it into a mug with a “Made in Taiwan” sticker hidden underneath. Later, I washed the mug, using much more water than I drank from it.

Sugar I measured out two teaspoons of sugar. It came from cane fields—former sawgrass marshes—south of Lake Okeechobee in Florida. Water that used to flow across these marshes and into the Everglades is now drained into canals and sent directly to the ocean. Or else it irrigates the fields, where it picks up nutrients and pesticides. Populations of all vertebrates—from turtles to storks—have fallen 75 to 95 percent in Everglades National Park. In November 1996, Florida voters rejected a plan to tax sugar growers to help pay for efforts to restore the Everglades.

Cream I stirred in one ounce of cream. The cream came from a grain-fed dairy cow in the Skagit Valley north of Seattle. The cow liked to wade into a stream to drink and to graze on streamside grasses and willows. As a result, the water got warmer and muddier, making life difficult for the coho salmon and steelhead trout living in the stream.

44
**Wastes**  The cow’s manure was rich in nitrogen and phosphorus. The soils of the cow pasture were unable to absorb all the manure, so it washed into the stream when it rained. The infusion of nutrients fertilized algae; decaying manure and algae absorbed oxygen from the water, making life still more difficult for fish.

Two hours after I finished my morning cup, my body had metabolized the coffee. Most of the water and some nutrients passed into the Seattle sewer system. They were carried by Cedar River water and mixed with other organic and inorganic wastes. They traveled under the streets of the city to Seattle’s West Point sewage treatment plant on the shores of Puget Sound, next to Discovery Park.

There the solids were filtered, concentrated, digested, and sterilized with screens, settling tanks, bacteria, and chlorine. An engineer deemed the sewage sludge clean enough for agriculture, and a trucker hauled it to pulpwood tree farms for use as fertilizer and soil conditioner. An underwater pipe carried the treated liquids a mile into Puget Sound. The flushing of the tides would eventually carry the liquids into the Pacific Ocean.85

Individuals do have planetary impacts on a daily basis as the coffee story proves. But they also have a great deal of difficulty paying attention to the ramifications of our abundant choices each day. During the course of this class, the consequences of individual consumption will become more transparent and surprising, and to some, “free trade” may cause more questions than answers.

*Redefining Progress*

When the now infamous Exxon-Valdez oil tanker crashed in the 1980s, causing unspeakable human and environmental damage, the incident registered as a positive addition to the world economy.86 Framing the oil spill in such a light requires the following logic: after the crash, untold dollar amounts were spent on the clean-up. Jobs were created. Local traders who may have been reliant on the flora and fauna contaminated by the spill were forced to exchange

---


monies for goods and therefore joined the monetary market economy. In sum, unexpected expenses called for unexpected spending. That spending resulted in economic growth. And, therefore, economists looked upon the Exxon-Valdez tragedy as a remarkable catalyst that inspired a boom in the world’s financial markets.

These morbid calculations are the gruesome colors economists use to paint the latest, twenty-first century portrait of “progress.” As the definition of “progress” becomes increasingly synonymous with monetary exchange—hence wealth—those who have cultivated that narrow standard have a vested interest in making it appear effective. Two methods for maintaining this illusion that monetary wealth is the best marker are creative Gross Domestic Product (GDP) calculations and state-sanctioned, consumption-inducing tax incentives. Put simply, as money surfaces from savings accounts and enters the market, an economy’s GDP rises. In a free market—the kind created by international free trade agreements such as GATT.

---


88 To be fair, some wealthy entrepreneurs, Andrew Carnegie, for one, advocated that the new upper class of the self-made rich had a responsibility of philanthropy, to distribute fortunes to be put to good use, not to be wasted on frivolous expenditure. Andrew Carnegie, Wealth (“The Gospel of Wealth”), NORTH AMERICAN REVIEW, June, 1889, at p. 653.

89 THE PEOPLE BOMB: WHEN WILL OVERPOPULATION EXPLODE? (Turner /CNN Special Reports 1992). But see Ted Halstead & Clifford Cobb, The Need for New Measurements of Progress, in MANDER 197; FRANK ACKERMAN & LISA HEINZERLING, PRICELESS (2005). This system for measuring our values is, in essence, fixed or rigged, and it presupposes that our insatiable [design] for consumption should only be measured by “cheapness.” See also WILLIAM GREIDER, THE SOUL OF CAPITALISM (2003); PAUL HAWKEN, AMORY LOVINS, & HUNTER LEVINS, NATURAL CAPITALISM (2000); Kevin Phillips, Numbers Racket: Why the Economy Is Worse Than We Know, HARPER’S MAGAZINE 43, May 2008.


and NAFTA\(^{92}\)---that constant input of cash flow is prized\(^{93}\) and indicates incalculable achievement regardless of the character of the incident that spurred that so-called progress.\(^{94}\)

Destructive occurrences like the Exxon-Valdez crash, therefore, generate the absolute need for a more critical analysis of GDP calculations.\(^{95}\) Simply examining what economists include in these calculations falls short of thorough inquiry; it is equally, if not more important to look at what aspects of daily life economists exclude from the calculations. All of the realities of peoples’ days not marked by the passing of monies from the one set of hands to another are not computed into (or out of) the GDP. Work involving parental child care in the home or on the savannah, or walking ten miles while head-balancing a 15-pound bucket of water gathered from a communal well, according to the GDP analysts, is not included in the calculation of the nation’s economic growth.\(^{96}\) Similarly, the work of cultures and societies that privilege local, sustainable development in which foods grown communally or individually are harvested for local consumption is also an untallied contributor to economic gain\(^{97}\) because none of these

\footnotesize
\begin{itemize}
  \item \(^{92}\) NORTH AMERICAN FREE TRADE AGREEMENT 1993, Dec. 17, 1992, 32 I.L.M. 605; HR Doc. No. 103-159; 103 Cong. 1\(^{st}\) Sess. (1993) [hereinafter NAFTA].
  \item \(^{94}\) The study of political economy has long recognized capitalism’s ongoing need to expand, to seek out new sources of surplus profit as compensation for the inherent falling rate of profit that occurs within an established economy. For a cogent analysis of the political policies of economic growth that the United States has pursued since World War II, see ROBERT M. COLLINS, MORE: THE POLITICS OF ECONOMIC GROWTH IN POSTWAR AMERICA (2000).
  \item \(^{97}\) Norberg-Hodge, \textit{supra} note 71, at 38-41 (relying on field work she conducted in a Ladakh village on the Tibetan Plateau).
\end{itemize}
situations results in the exchange of—usually foreign—monies. We are also being asked to quantify the “existence value” of nature, thereby turning all aspects of life into a numerical equation.

Within this narrow framework, all monetary flow into the cash economy adds (and adds and adds) to economic growth. Economists, in settling on this marker of progress, have decided to exclude any factors that might subtract from GDP calculations. While analysts may concede that GDP calculations stall once in a while due to recessions in general economic growth, no non-monetary factors exist to subtract from the GDP. As a result, social problems such as poverty, the denigration of public healthcare systems, meager educational standards, ethnic violence and environmental degradation fail to reduce the final number produced by GDP analysis. Progress has succumbed to the connotation of what can be bargained for cheapest.

---


100 See Neela Banerjee, The Nation: There’s No Accounting: The Economy’s Apples and Oranges. (In 1937, Simon Kuznets, who was later awarded the Nobel Prize for creating many of the techniques which we use today to measure economics, advocated the measuring of environmental degradation. Until it became politically controversial and was discarded, The Bureau of Economic Analysis did so measure this degradation in its first assessments.)


104 See Rebecca Solnit, Winged Mercury and the Golden Calf, Orion 14 (September/October 2006); Michael Shnayerson, A Funny Thing Happened on the Way to the Throne, Vanity Fair, May 2007, at 182 (calling for the labeling on the product itself of the environmental costs of getting that product to market.) See also Robert Repetto, Accounting for Environmental Assets, Scientific Amer., June 1992, at 94-100.
Compulsory addition accounting is aggravated by state-sanctioned tax incentives that encourage over-consumption.\textsuperscript{105} For example, in her article \textit{Consumerism, Advertising, and the Role of Tax Policy}, Professor Mona Hymel argues that, as advertising leads to increased American consumerism, “existing federal tax laws encourage advertising through preferential tax treatment that, in essence, subsidizes advertisers.”\textsuperscript{106} In a broader scope, the Organisation For Economic Co-Operation and Development (OECD) has extensively explored the multi-faceted relationships between environmental taxes and trade.\textsuperscript{107}

There has always been significant fear that Western-centric global machinations, whether hegemonic by virtue of military or economic forces, would transform the world into a uni-perfect, Western-dominated, homogenized, global culture.\textsuperscript{108} Certainly, in the wake of its path to differing continents, cultures, and peoples, the concept of Western progress has altered several


aspects of daily life: education, family and gender roles, wealth and even health, the nation-state itself, and the very meaning of what is “human.”

Proselytization of capitalism—itself a religious orthodoxy—has left its mark and with it, its lexical buzzwords: progress, efficiency, competitiveness, productivity. Yet, for example, if the Protestant work ethic resoundingly makes American workers outpace their European counterparts, how have we come to call or value “productivity” as the elimination of humans by technology from the self-esteem of work? Is speed appropriate to democratic deliberation?

---

109 See generally Maude Barlow & Heather-jane Robertson, Homogenization of Education, in MANDER.
110 Norberg-Hodge, supra note 71, at 42. .
111 Norberg-Hodge, supra note 71, at 35 (discussing how village citizens now consider themselves ‘poor’ when, prior to Western imposition, they always had ‘enough’).
112 See generally Martin Khor, Global Economy and the Third World, in MANDER 47-59.
113 See generally Richard Falk, World Prisms: The Future of Sovereign States and International Order, HARV. INT’L REV., Summer 1999. Once established, our PBWiKi will invite educators from the world at large to provide instruction materials from their culturally nuanced portfolios.
114 See Carl Elliot, Humanity, 2.0, WILSON Q., Autumn 2003, at 13 (“Transhumanists believe that human nature’s a phase we’ll outgrow, like adolescence. Someday, we’ll be full-fledged adult post-humans, with physical and intellectual powers of which we can now only dream.” What are the economic consequences of becoming a robot?). Though their arguments are situated on quite different grounds from one another, a cadre of theorists within the humanities have for some time argued that conditions common to globalization have already created a post-human condition. See MICHAEL FOUCAULT, THE ORDER OF THINGS: AN ARCHAEOLOGY OF THE HUMAN SCIENCES (1966); KATHERINE M. HAYLES, HOW WE BECAME POSTHUMAN: VIRTUAL BODIES IN CYBERNETICS, LITERATURE, AND INFORMATICS (1999); and DONNA HARAWAY, SIMIANS, CYBORGS, AND WOMEN: THE REINVENTION OF NATURE (1991).
115 The clash of continents regarding the orthodoxy of capitalism – between the United States and Europe – is aptly explored by Stephen Thed, in Europe’s Philosophy of Failure, FOREIGN POLICY, January/February 2008, p. 54 (the author contends that European schoolchildren are taught that capitalism and entrepreneurship are savage, unhealthy, and immoral concepts).

Neil Postman often makes the point that when a new technology is introduced into a culture, that culture is forever and permanently changed through and through. The change is not additive but ecological. It permeates like a thimble full of red dye dropped into a barrel of water. Every molecule in that barrel of water is transformed.
The four horsemen of my apocalypse are called Efficiency, Convenience, Profitability, and Security, and in their names, crimes against poetry, pleasurable, sociability, and the very largeness of the world are daily, hourly, constantly carried out. These marauding horsemen are deployed by technophiles, advertisers, and profiteers to assault the nameless pleasures and meanings that knit together our lives and expand our horizons.

I’m listening to a man on the radio describe how great it is that there are websites where musicians who have never met or conversed or had any contact at all can lay down tracks together to make songs. While the experiment sounds interesting, the assumption sounds scary—that the complex personal, creative, and cultural collaborations of music-making could be unnecessary and you just need the digital conjunction of some skill sets. The speaker seems to believe that the sole goal is the production of songs, sundered from the production of social ties and social pleasure. But music has always been an occasion for people to get together—in rehearsals, nightclubs, parties, festivals, park band-shells, parades, and other social spaces. It is often the soundtrack to bodies in conjunction, whether marching or making love.  

Our understanding the distinction between price and cost is critical to sustaining a healthy quality of life. An alternative to GDP accounting is the Genuine Progress Indicator (GPI).

Although cash generated is still an important component of progress measurement, the GPI adds a cost factor to the GDP measurement. It evaluates such factors as resource depletion, pollution, long-term environmental damage, non-market transactions and income distribution. The assertion behind this proposal is that if other methods of accounting do not factor in less tangible costs such as these, the national and international well-being will inevitably decline as those factors are increasingly ignored. Indeed, national well-beings have declined, despite an increased GDP.

though that fact may not be immediately evident. Similarly, if you drop the internet or the telephone or TV into an existing culture, you don’t end up with an internet plus that old culture, you end up with an utterly new culture. See Neil Postman, Technopoly: The Surrender of Culture to Technology (1993). See also Neil Postman, Building a Bridge to the 18th Century (1999).

118 Benjamin R. Barber, Uncertainty of Digital Politics, HARV. INT’L REV., Spring 2001 (A world where everything is for sale is not a world hospitable for democracy). See also Satish Kumar, .
119 Rebecca Solnit, A Fistful of Time, ORION 14 (September/October 2007).
Thus, we should no longer concede to such erroneous systems of accounting progress. Progress should be defined broadly to account for the total well-being of every human, not simply those who have greatest access to the global markets.\textsuperscript{122} Even measuring simple things, like general discontent with the construction of a high rise blocking a community’s view of nature, should be factored-in as a way of providing a counter-balance.\textsuperscript{123} Isn’t progress really the triumph of laughter over dogma?\textsuperscript{124}

\begin{quotation}
\end{quotation}
The Confluence of Population with Food & Water Access, Safety, and Security

Currently, the world’s population is at 6,769,189,967 people. The industrialized world constitutes only one-fifth—or twenty percent—of that number, yet it uses 80% of the earth’s energy. Humans consume forty percent of the earth’s primary productivity. Obviously, as population increases, the amount of available resources that are demanded diminishes. This imbalance results in a scramble for solutions, and the widening chasm

125 U.S. Census Bureau, WorldPOPClock, www.census.gov/cgi-bin/ipc/popclockw (last visited March 26, 2009) (registering as 6,769,189,967 at 17:32 GMT). The world population increased from 3 billion in 1959 to 6 billion by 1999, a doubling that occurred over 40 years. The world population is projected to grow to 9 billion by 2042, an increase of 50 percent that will require 41 years. Population projections must necessarily be coupled with demographic trends. See Elizabeth Leahy and Sean Peoples, Projecting Population, www.worldwatch.org/node/6067; www.os-connect.com/pop/p2ai.htm; www.wamu.org/programs/dr/09/04/22.php (Diane Rehm Show).
126 The term developed country, or advanced country, is used to categorize countries with developed economies in which the tertiary and quaternary sectors of industry dominate.
127 Government of Canada, G8 Website, www.g8.gc.ca/members-en.asp (last visited Feb. 6, 2004) (offering population statistics on the G8 nations, totaling 1,229,300,000 people); see also Sea Island Summit 2004 Official Website, www.g8usa.gov/c10476.htm (stating that, “[t]he G8 Summit brings together the leaders of the world’s major industrial democracies: Canada, France, Germany, Italy, Japan, Russia, the united Kingdom, and the United States[…]and the] European Union[…]”). Using the numbers from the U.S. Census bureau and Canada’s G8 information, the world’s industrialized nations comprise one-fifth of the earth’s population.
129 See Richard Manning, The Oil We Eat: Following the Food Chain Back to Iraq, HARPER’S MAG., Feb. 2004, at 37 (the planet’s “primary productivity” is the name for the total amount of plant mass created by the earth in a given year, what Manning calls the “total budget for life.” The current rate of species extinction is 1,000 times greater than that which existed before humans dominated the earth).
between the number of people and the amount of non-renewable resources manifests itself in state-sanctioned population control mechanisms, a perceived scarcity of food, rapid reductions in potable water, and state tax incentives that aggravate each of these outcomes.

Population

In some fashion, all world nations—and the families within them—are reconceiving their reproduction choices, for there are many historical, ancestral, and cultural understandings of what constitutes a family. Some societies have, in the past, successfully sustained themselves by honoring the conception of multitudes of children per family. Households of great size obviously engendered both a sense of collective inter-dependence and burden. Why have
industrialized societies curtailed large families?137 Today, populations are fluid, and national decisions respecting optimal population sizes are confused, burdened, and influenced by migration,138 identity politics, religious ideology, and real or imagined—or politically reimagined—measures of resource sufficiency.139 It is hard to fathom world population pressures being ameliorated by fanfare, grace, and the authority of international accord.140

numbers of children within each family structure. In turn, the burdens to feed each member is exacerbated. Whether couples and communities faced with burgeoning populations in the face of compelling obstacles to nutrition, clean water, and sanitation will choose smaller family units is as much a function of personal choice as it is societal traditions, the empowerment – or lack thereof – of women to chose their family’s size, disease, the pressures of religion toward contraception, and state interference to name but a few.


As free-market economics spread across the globe, and with them, their philosophy of fierce individualism, independence and interdependence increasingly come into conflict. Some contend the industrialized world has conned a masquerade of self-centered and brutal fifteenth century colonialism in an effort to maximize its wealth at the continued expense of less-industrialized nations.141

One strategy used in the renewed colonial agenda is numerical population control. With little to no regard for local family planning traditions, international agencies (which are funded and sustained by industrialized nations) create universal education programs to teach people

140 See Garrett Hardin, The Tragedy of Commons, 162 SCIENCE 1243-1248 (1968), available at http://dieoff.org/pages95.htm. I begin with Garrett Hardin not out of complete obeisance, but because he is regarded as western media’s iconic flashpoint. Like us all, he has sympathizers and detractors. See, e.g., Gregg Easterbrook, The Tragedy of Garrett Hardin, WALL ST. J., Oct. 21, 2003, at A26 (Op. Ed. Obituary). Though hardly without controversy in his views on government-imposed population control, his commentary on how people behave relative to our commons is highly instructive. (“He spoke wisely of the need to temper materialism. ‘The maximum is not the optimum’ was Hardin’s best aphorism. He insisted that future generations make a legitimate claim on us today.” Id.) What glares at me is the fact that the United States has not debated nor declared a policy on an ultimate numerical population in relation to sustaining its current levels of consumption. Perhaps, the absence of such national thinking comes from a perspective of empire, manifest destiny, and a choice to ignore natural limits. That has been the idea of America fondly recalled and practiced. See FREDERICK JACKSON TURNER, THE FRONTIER IN AMERICAN HISTORY (1920); RICHARD SLOTKIN, REGENERATION THROUGH VIOLENCE: The Mythology of the American Frontier (2000); RICHARD DRINNON: THE METAPHYSICS OF INDIAN HATING AND EMPIRE BUILDING (1997). Rather, the dialogue here gravitates to abortion, contraception, and immigration. See also Betsy Hartmann, Population Control in the New World Order, 2 DEV. IN PRAC. 210 (1992); Population Reference Bureau, www.prb.org. The turbidity of international trade wars over subsidies and claimed unfair trade practices is exemplificative. See generally Paul Hawken, N30: Skeleton Woman in Seattle, THE SUN, Apr. 2000.; Elizabeth Becker, U.S. Subsidizes Companies to Buy Subsidized Cotton, N.Y. TIMES, Nov. 4, 2003, at C1, 2; Editorial, Welfare Reform for Farmers, N.Y. TIMES, Nov. 10, 2003, at A22 (Harvesting Poverty Series, www.nytimes.com/harvestingpoverty). See also the discordant behavior of nations over the Kyoto Protocol on Climate Change, Andy Stone & Brian Wingfield, Don’t Expect Much From the Next Kyoto, www.forbes.com/2009/04/10/Kyoto-Copenhagen-climate-change-business-washington-energy.html.

141 Obviously, this statement has been the subject of great debate and rancor. Compare Goldsmith, supra note 71; LIFE AND DEBT (2001); with JOSEPH STIGLITZ, GLOBALIZATION AND ITS DISCONTENTS (2002); JAGDISH N. BHAGWATI, IN DEFENSE OF GLOBALIZATION (2007); ZYGMUNT BAUMAN, GLOBALIZATION: THE HUMAN CONSEQUENCES (2000). There is a growing awareness that the modern global agenda has not simply been about progress. Instead, colonial rule has given way to post-colonial relations, often raising the contention that the developed world has encroached on the less developed world for its own benefit. See DAVID BACON, supra note 127; KENNETH E. BAUZON, DEVELOPMENT AND DEMOCRATIZATION IN THE THIRD WORLD: MYTHS, HOPES, AND REALITIES 42 (1992).
about twentieth century contraception methods. "Sadly, the agencies’ programs and solutions are near-Swiftian in their implementation. Whereas Jonathon Swift satirically proposed turning poor Irish children into delicacies for the wealthy as a way to solve Ireland’s 18th century urban population problem, the solutions that the international agencies in the 21st century currently use are implemented without satire.

A tragic consequence of an emphasis on numerical population control is infanticide. Although this phenomenon is associated most often with cultures outside the so-called Western world, the fervor to have a baby of a certain sex, a certain phenotype, a certain intelligence, etc. is becoming less of a cultural issue and more of a class issue. Given the strides in human

---

genome research, for example, couples who can afford to make these family-planning decisions may one day be able to do so without the taboo associated with “infanticide.”\textsuperscript{148} As scientific findings and moralistic definitions fuel the debate over what constitutes human life, the topic of infanticide will fall farther and farther from the human rights discussion table into the trough that serves up so much political debate. In the meantime, however, the issue of infanticide as a desperate family-planning tool, aimed disproportionately at female babies,\textsuperscript{149} receives greater attention than its underlying cause: international and domestic pressure on and by certain states to keep their numerical population down.\textsuperscript{150}

Rising longevity and falling fertility have also contributed to a new demographic time bomb. For example, though China has decreased its increase in population through a pronounced policy of one-child per family—most characteristically a male child—the median age of its people will soar in the next 35 years.\textsuperscript{151} Biotechnology’s quickening race to find a


\textsuperscript{149} Gendercide Watch, Case Study: Female Infanticide, available at http://www.gendercide.org/case_infanticide.html, (last visited Mar. 5, 2004) (arguing, “in all cases, specifically female infanticide reflects the low status accorded to women in most parts of the world; it is arguably the most brutal and destructive manifestation of the anti-female bias that pervades ‘patriarchal’ societies”).

\textsuperscript{150} The dogma and doctrines of religious orthodoxies play a vital, compounding and confounding role in the formulation of state sanctioned population control. See, e.g., Matthew Connelly, Fatal Misconception: The Struggle to Control World Population (2008); Rosemary Radford Ruether, Comments from a Christian Perspective on Religion and Population Policy, www.religiousconsultation.org/ruether.htm.

\textsuperscript{151} See Joseph Kahn, The Most Populous Nation Faces a Population Crisis, N.Y. Times, May 30, 2004, at sec. 4, p. 5 (“China’s aging will lop multiple percentage points off its [economic] growth rate, [its] growing surplus of men will produce severe social stress, creating an army of bachelors that some believe could be more welcomed to commit crimes or even wage wars….’’); see also Sharon LaFraniere, Chinese Bias for Baby Boys Creates a Gap of 32 Million, NY Times, April 11, 2009 at Sec. A, p. 5; Louisa Lim, China Demographic Crisis: Too Many Boys, Elderly, www.npr.org/templates/story/story.php?storyID=89572563; Tyrene White, China’s Longest Campaign: Birth Planning in the People’s Republic, 1949-2005; Valerie M. Hudson & Andrea M. Den Boer, Bare Branches: The Security Implications of Asia’s Surplus Male Population (2005). Once again, these demographic conclusions are overshadowed by contemporary economic measurements of progress, discussed above. The recent erosion of population controls and migrations from the countryside caused by economic forces has led China to experiment with abolishing the legal distinctions between urban residents and peasants. Access to housing
genetic formula manipulable for sustained life will undoubtedly and haphazardly change the experience of old age. In Europe, where births have decreased from 2.38 to 1.45 children per woman over the past thirty years, nations have had to “import” population to perform certain functions of labor. In India, there was momentum to craft a national bill limiting members of Parliament and State legislatures to two children thereby provoking critical complaints of social engineering in a democracy and discrimination toward members of lower castes. As divergent and factioned are our burgeoning peoples of the world, we will all, in differing manners, feel the accelerated pressure to sustain, or even maintain, a quality of life in which food and water are not only given, or access to a right, but for most on this planet, are luxuries.

Food and Water: Access, Safety and Security

The urgency for some societies to deaccelerate birthings is coupled with and aggravated by yet another aspect of the industrialized nations’ colonial agenda: control over the world’s resources, specifically its food supply. I ask you, “What is your relationship to food?”

---


156 For a powerful formulation arguing that colonial rule continues to be carried out in the contemporary era, albeit under very different circumstances and with very different implications for individual nation-states of all sizes, see Michael Hardt and Antonio Negri, EMPIRE (2000). For a more optimistic statement of potential positive outcomes for such a situation, see their follow-up work, MULTITUDE: WAR AND DEMOCRACY IN THE AGE OF EMPIRE (2004).

157 See generally Special Report, The End of Plenty: The Global Food Crisis, NAT’L GEOGRAPHIC 26,
For most of you, I suspect your answer is not the same as my honored author-friend, Gary

Nabhan:

Eating is perhaps the most direct way we acknowledge or deny the sacredness of the earth. It has been a year now since I began my modest attempt to focus on the foods of my local landscape, and I have decided that it has been more like an extended meditation than a diet or an experiment. I have brewed and chewed over my relationship to desert soils and salty waters, to


ancient traditions and modern trade networks, and to other lives: those of my human, plant, and animal neighbors.

Today, I will eat the last of last year’s squash for dinner, but this winter squash is too big to core as my grandfather once demonstrated to me. I will layer between its steamed slices onions and native spices, then sauté them in sunflower oil. And as I take the first mouthful, I will close my eyes and see if it tastes of home. Because I have farmed squash, studied them, painted them, and even hand-pollinated them, their taste reminds me of a long vine of connections.¹⁵⁹

Is your relationship closer to a two-week-old refrigerated unwashed pot of Coney Island clam chowder?

Red and brown, white and fungus blues,
Penicillin, streptomycin, green goddess dew,
Filled with spice and chewy balls,
Erythacin, achromycin, canned mandarin orange
Terramycin, perimycin, and seasoning salt,
Sauce agar-spread colonies all grown for you.
Pneumonia, arthritis, fever, or dandruff,
Tetani, welchii, diptheriae, more?
Per se or not, it’s still a risk,
So with toweled hands I hold the casket,
And run outside to find a basket.
And trichinosis hides in ham,
Then what is there inside a clam?

Or, how many of us have made a meal “at the end of the shortest food chain of all. What I had in mind was a dinner prepared entirely from ingredients I had hunted, gathered and grown myself.”¹⁶⁰

My wager in undertaking this experiment is that hunting and gathering (and growing) would perforce teach me about the ecology and ethics of eating that I could not get in a supermarket or fast-food chain or even on a farm. Some very basic things: about the ties between us and the species (and natural systems) we depend upon; about how we decide what in nature is good to eat and what is not; and about how the human body fits into the food chain, not only as an eater but as a hunter and, yes, a killer of other creatures. For one of the things I was

hoping to accomplish by rejoining, however briefly, this shortest and oldest of food chains was to take some more direct, conscious responsibility for the killing of the animals I eat. Otherwise, I felt, I really shouldn’t be eating them. While I’d already slaughtered a handful of chickens in Virginia [on Polyface Farm], the experience had disconcerted me and left the hardest questions untouched. Killing doomed domesticated animals on the assembly line, where you have to keep pace with the expectations of others, is an excellent way to remain only semi-conscious about what it is you’re really doing. By contrast the hunter, at least as I imagined him, is alone in the woods with his conscience.161

161 Id. at 280-281. Pollan writes:

Anthropologists marvel at just how much cultural energy goes into managing the food problem. But as students of human nature have long suspected, the food problem is closely tied to…well, to several other big existential problems. Leon Kass, the ethicist, wrote a fascinating book called The Hungry Soul: Eating and the Perfection of Our Nature, in which he teases out the many philosophical implications of human eating. In a chapter on omnivorousness, Kass quotes at length from philosopher Jean-Jacques Rousseau, who in his Second Discourse draws a connection between our freedom from instinct in eating and the larger problem of free will. Rousseau is after somewhat bigger game in this passage, but along the way he offers as good a statement of the omnivore’s dilemma as you’re likely to find:

…nature does everything in the operations of a beast, whereas man contributes to his operations by being a free agent. The former chooses or rejects by instinct and the latter by an act of freedom, so that a beast cannot deviate from the rule that is prescribed to it even when it would be advantageous to do so, and a man deviates from it often to his detriment. Thus a pigeon would die of hunger near a basin filled with the best meats, and a cat upon heaps of fruit or grain, although each could well nourish itself on the food it disdains if it made up its mind to try some. Thus dissolve men abandon themselves to the excesses which cause them fever and death, because the mind depraves the senses and because the will still speaks when nature is silent.

Guided by no natural instinct, the prodigious and open-ended human appetite is liable to get us into all sorts of trouble, well beyond the stomachache. For if nature is silent, what’s to stop the human omnivore from eating anything -- including, most alarmingly, other human omnivores? A potential for savagery lurks in a creature capable of eating anything. If nature won’t draw a line around human appetite, then human culture must step in, as indeed it has done, bringing the omnivore’s eating habits under the government of all the various taboos (foremost, the one against cannibalism), customs, rituals, table manners, and culinary conventions found in every culture. There is a short and direct path from the omnivore’s dilemma to the astounding number of ethical rules with which people have sought to regulate eating for as long as they have been living in groups.

‘Without virtue’ to govern his appetites, Aristotle wrote, man of all the animals ‘is most unholy and savage, and worst in regard to sex and eating.’ Paul Rozin has suggested, only partly in jest, that Freud would have done well to build his psychology around our appetite for food rather than our appetite for sex. Both are fundamental biological drives necessary to our survival as a species, and both must be carefully channeled and socialized for the good of society. (‘You can’t just grab any tasty-looking morsel’, he points out.) But food is more important than sex, Rozin contends. Sex we can live without (at least as individuals), and it occurs with far less frequency than eating. Since we also do rather more of our eating in public, there has been a more elaborate cultural transformation of our relationship to food than there is to sex.

Michael Pollan, The Anxiety of Eating: An Excerpt from The Omnivore’s Dilemma, reprinted in THE SUN, May 2006, at 13, 16-17.]
Certainly, our connections to food stem from personal cost-benefit judgments; yet our choices have lost their profoundness. For most in society, it involves the unthinking acceptance of commercialization, long-haul transportation, and mass scale production. Did this begin as a conscious compromise of our attention to the integrity of what we place into our bodies, or was the choice superimposed upon us by those corporations that advocate large economics of scale and advertisers of sugar, antibiotic, and preservative laden products?162 When did we lose the slow food meal?163 How come we don’t all shop in organic supermarkets, but if someone wants pesticide-laden food, that person must go to a small specialty shop and pay more?164 Why, as lawyers, do we conjure up food hate laws,165 ease guidelines on pig sanitation (right to farm


164 Suggested by my colleague, Mona Hymel. The argument by agribusiness giants that petroleum contaminants are required to generate large-scale quantities of food to feed an ever increasing population merely begs the question of why our societies have accepted centralized control over food production, distribution, and safety. The same can, and will, be said concerning the commodification of water or other mandatory necessities for life (e.g., medicines). But see, Andrew Martin, Is a Food Revolution Now in Season?, NY TIMES, March 22, 2009, at sec. Bu, p. 1 (discussing the new political climate in Washington embracing local food production).

laws), shrink the definition of foreseeable harm, or attempt to enact laws limiting liability for the unintended consequences of genetically engineered food? In a global economy, will farmers and countries be able to choose what they eat, what they produce, what type of agricultural methods they employ, or whether they continue to farm at all? Will climate change inform those choices? Working under the assumption that numerical overpopulation results in a shortage of food for an ever-increasing number of mouths, agribusinesses offer a reduced-cost, heightened-risk alternative to naturally-grown foods. Some agribusiness proponents argue that genetically-modified (GM) foods and the monocropping methods used to manufacture them will help feed the world’s undernourished population. While it can be true that these foods may be priced lower than naturally-grown foods, there are concerns about the long-term effects of consuming genetically modified foods.

---


foods, records of the health implication of GM foods are spotty at best. What is well documented, however, is the impact such agribusinesses have had on landscape and culture.

---


---


---


---

Norberg-Hodge, supra note 71, at 45; see generally BRIAN TOKAR (ED.), GENE TRADERS & BIOTECHNOLOGY, WORLD TRADE AND THE GLOBALIZATION OF HUNGER (2004); Donald L. Bartlett and James B. Steele, Monsanto’s Harvest of Fear, VANITY FAIR 156, May, 2008; Ellen Ruppel Shell, New World Syndrome, ATLANTIC MONTHLY, June 2001; Shiva, supra note 157; Schlosser, supra note 162; Michael Pollan, The Futures of Food: The Industry Has Found a Way to Co-opt the Threat from Organics and ‘Slow Food.’ Remember the Meal in a Pill?, N.Y. TIMES MAG., May 4, 2003, at sec. 6, p. 63; Matt Lee and Ted Lee, The Next Big Flavor: Searching For the Taste of Tomorrow, id. at 66; Amanda Hesser, Vintage Cuts, id. at 72; Danylo Hawaleshka with Brian Bethune and Sue Ferguson, Tainted Food, www.macleans.ca/shared/print.jsp?content=20040126 73971 73971 (Kraft to develop nanoparticles that can change food color, flavor, and nutrient value to suit a person’s health or palate); Gary Ruskin, The Fast Food Trap: How Commercialism Creates Overweight Children, MOTHERING MAG., Nov./Dec. 2003; Kate Zernike, Is Obesity the Responsibility of the Body Politic?, N.Y. TIMES, Nov. 9, 2003, at sec. 4, p. 3; Carl Hulse, Vote in House Bars Some Suits Citing Obesity, N.Y. TIMES, Mar. 11, 2004, at A1.
As GM food businesses purchase lands rich in biodiversity with the intention of growing one crop for export purposes, the communities living on or near that land lose the balanced diet that comes from eating fresh, diverse foods grown locally. Losing that connection to local food contexts diminishes a community’s connection to their land and, often, to their very understanding of themselves as people.

On a daily basis we are all confronted with demystifying the claims of competing food advocates in the face of often hidden, or worse, ignored, worldwide starvation and economic disparity. Or, we should be. We argue the scientific certainty of safety of bioengineered

---


---

175 Daniel Imhoff, Community Supported Agriculture: Farming with a Face on It, in MANDER 426-28; Nabhan, supra note 159. But see James E. McWilliams, Free-Range Trichinosis, NY TIMES, April 10, 2009, at Sec. A, p. 19.

176 Norberg-Hodge, supra note 71, at 45; Ellen Ruppel Shell, New World Syndrome, in ATLANTIC MONTHLY, June 2001; Shiva, supra note 157; see also DeAnna M. Rivera, ‘Comfort Food’ in the Global Kitchen: It Just Ain’t Like Mom’s Anymore... RED INK: A NATIVE AMERICAN STUDENT PUBLICATION 120 (9.2/10.1 of 2002) (noting Indigenous peoples’ unique connection to community lands and their particular issues with globalized food markets); Brad Stone & Matt Richtel, Eater, Meet Your Farmers, And Say Hello, NY TIMES, March 28, 2009, at Sec. B, p. 1.

177 Shouldn’t the citizens of each city or municipality demand that its elected leadership calculate and report the number of days the on-hand food supply for the community will last? See generally PAUL ROBERTS, THE END OF FOOD (2008).
crops, which transport themselves in processed packaging under long-haul conditions. We make cost-benefit judgments over how much control we, individually, choose to make in what we put into our bodies – what we consider, or not, nourishment. But we do know that certain events are happening.¹⁷⁸

A handful of companies control large percentages of the world’s seeds and they often systematize schemes for claiming patents to them—patents on life¹⁷⁹—in contravention of plant-breeders rights.¹⁸⁰ When Monsanto, the world’s largest agricultural-biotechnology company, purchased Seminis, the world’s largest vegetable seed company, it acquired the rights to 3,500 fruit and vegetable seed varieties, including 75 percent of the tomato seeds and 85 percent of pepper seeds commercially available.¹⁸¹ Just two companies, Cargill and Archer Daniels Midland, control seventy-five percent of the market in transportation of grain.¹⁸² Food advertisements are domineering.¹⁸³ Cultures are being steamrolled into reformation of food practices and are being launched away from bioregional sustainable farming and into the waters of export-dominated food production.¹⁸⁴

¹⁷⁸ American society’s limited but slowly growing awareness of food production conditions and food content has even led to the emergence of exposes on these topics that, within their market niches, have become quite popular. See, e.g., SCHLOSSER, supra note 162; The Real Cost of Cheap Food, supra note 157; POLLAN, supra note 160; Food, Inc., www.foodincmovie.com; GREG CRITSER, FAT LAND: HOW AMERICANS BECAME THE FATTEST PEOPLE IN THE WORLD (2003); and MORGAN SPURLOCK, SUPER SIZE ME (Hart Sharp Video, 2005).


¹⁸⁰ “Plant breeders” is a term used to describe the person or entity who breeds a new variety of plant and can claim title in that new plant variety. See generally Plant Breeders’ Rights, www.en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Plant_breeders’_right; JACK R. KLOPPENBURG, SEEDS AND SOVEREIGNTY: THE USE AND CONTROL OF PLANT GENETIC RESOURCES (1988).


So, how we acknowledge the given role food has within each culture is necessarily dependent upon how we value it. Not an earth-shaking statement in itself. But how we come to terms with the price of food in relation to its ultimate cultural cost means examining just what viewpoint is being globalized. If it is maximum profits for transnational corporations, then that is one value. If it is competition for control over world food production, that is another. If it means increasing participation, locally, in the decision-making over what we eat, that is still another.185

I have focused thus far on food, but another life-sustaining resource—water—is rapidly being diverted away from communities in less-industrialized nations. In the essay, “Blue Gold: The Global Water Crisis and the Commodification of the World’s Water Supply,” Maude Barlow suggests that the industrialized nations are perpetuating a growing social inequity in the distribution of clean water, increasingly harming those communities that are most severely in need of potable water.186 Barlow goes on to describe the fissures created in communities, within nations, and across continents because of commercial water privatization, appropriation, and exportation187 and argues that access to water is a basic human right.188 She queries: Who owns...
water? Should anyone? Should it be privatized? What rights do transnational corporations have to buy water systems? Should it be traded as a commodity in the open market? What laws do we need to protect water? What is the role of the government? How do those in water rich countries share with those in water poor countries? Who is the custodian for nature’s lifeblood? How do ordinary citizens become involved in this process?

The globalization course syllabus, then, is an attempt to wade through the puddles of cynicism and map the legal-cultural intersections of population, food, and now increasingly the multinational dynamism of water.

---


**Id.** Barlow has articulated ten principles for the protection of water:

1. Water belongs to the earth and all species.
2. Water should be left where it is whenever possible.
3. Water must be conserved for all time.
4. Polluted water must be reclaimed.
5. Water is best protected in national watersheds.
6. Water is a public trust to be guarded at all levels of government.
7. An adequate supply of clean water is a basic human right.
8. The best advocates for water are local communities and citizens.
9. The public must participate as an equal partner with the government to protect water.
10. Economic globalization policies are not water sustainable.

*See also* Marc Clayton, *Is Water Becoming 'The New Oil'? Population, Pollution and Climate Put the Squeeze on Potable Supplies and Private Companies Smell a Profit. Others Ask, Should Water be a Human Right?*, [www.commondreams.org/archive/2008/05/30/9305/print](http://www.commondreams.org/archive/2008/05/30/9305/print).

**189** A recent book, critical to these questions, is *ROBERT GLENNON, UNQUENCHABLE: AMERICA’S WATER CRISIS AND WHAT TO DO ABOUT IT* (2009).

**190** See Right to Water, [www.righttowater.ca](http://www.righttowater.ca).
The Environment and Technology: On the Precipice or In the Crevasse?

*Environmentalists make terrible neighbors, but they make great ancestors.*

- David Brower

*The Universe is a communion of subjects, not a collection of objects.*

- Thomas Berry

We humans behave as though we are apart from, not a part of, our environment, that nature is an entity to be conquered, diminished, and calculated.191

The modern self is a discrete and separate subject in a universe that is other. It is the economic man of Adam Smith; it is the skin-encapsulated ego of Alan Watts; it is the embodied soul of religion; it is the selfish gene of biology. It underlies the converging crises of our time, which are all permutations of the theme of separation – separation from nature, from community, from lost parts of ourselves. It is at the heart of all the usual culprits blamed for the ongoing destruction of ecology and polity, such as human greed and capitalism.192

The human condition may, indeed, be predisposed to challenge, but it is equally absorbed in self-deception, arrogance, and the capacity for false choices. How else do we create economies of toxicity, then establish cost-benefit arithmetic formulas for totaling the diminishment of life?193

---


We design things to be “thrown away” when, really, there is no away. The prominent architect, William McDonough, states succinctly that our labyrinthine regulatory schemes for measuring, monitoring, and sanctioning industrial interactions with the environment are just signals of design failure. And David Orr, a pioneer in environmental literacy in higher education and Chair of Environmental Studies at Oberlin College, writes:

---


196 William McDonough, supra note 74; McDonough Braungart Design Chemistry, LLC, The Next Industrial Revolution, www.cradletocradle.com/c2c_nir.htm:

The Next Industrial Revolution

The Next Industrial Revolution is the emerging transformation of human industry from a system that takes, makes, and wastes to one that celebrates natural, economic, and cultural abundance.

The First Industrial Revolution

The industrial framework that dominates our lives now is fairly primitive. It is conceived around a one-way manufacturing flow – what is known as a “cradle to grave” lifecycle. This cradle to grave flow relies on brute force (including fossil fuels and large amounts of powerful chemicals). It seeks universal design solutions (“one size fits all”), overwhelming and ignoring natural and cultural diversity. And it produces massive amounts of waste – something that in nature does not even exist.

Consider looking at the industrial revolution of the 19th century and its aftermath as a kind of retroactive design assignment, focusing on some of its unintended, questionable effects. The assignment might sound like this: Design a system of production that

- Puts billions of pounds of toxic material into the air, water, and soil every year
- Produces some materials so dangerous they will require constant vigilance by future generations
- Results in gigantic amounts of waste
- Puts valuable materials in holes all over the planet, where they can never be retrieved
- Requires thousands of complex regulations to keep people and natural systems from being poisoned too quickly
- Measures productivity by how few people are working?
- Creates prosperity by digging up or cutting down natural resources and then burying or burning them
- Erodes the diversity of species and cultural practices

Does this seem like good design assignment?

Even though none of these things happened intentionally, we find this “design assignment” to be a limited and depressing one for industries to perpetuate – and it is obviously resulting in a much less enjoyable world.
Each of us Americans, on average, has 190 potentially toxic organochlorine compounds in our fatty tissue and body fluids, and several hundred other chemicals that maybe harmful to our health. *** [T]he privacy of the body has been violated without our knowledge or permission, and with little accountability by those responsible. The ubiquity of pollution means that responsibility is difficult to ascertain. Still more difficult to determine is which of hundreds or thousands of chemicals, mixing in ways beyond our comprehension, caused exactly what pathologies in our bodies. We know that some of these substances, singly or in combination, undermine health, reproductive potential, intelligence, ability to concentrate, and emotional stability – hence the capacity to pursue and experience life, liberty, and happiness. In some cases the effects will manifest far into the future, placing perpetrators beyond the reach of the law and leaving their victims without remedy. What then is the meaning of the constitutional guarantees in the Fifth and Fourteenth Amendments that we cannot be deprived of life, liberty, or property without “due process of law?” Do these include property of the body?¹⁹⁷

Many have agonized over the environment for decades.¹⁹⁸ But even Thomas Jefferson, recognized for his concerns over intergenerational debt, could not have imagined the magnitude of the forthcoming intergenerational ecological debt that is most assuredly our legacy.¹⁹⁹ The

---

**A New Design Assignment**

We are proposing a new design assignment where people and industries set out to create the following:

- Buildings that, like trees, are net energy exporters, produce more energy than they consume, accrue and store solar energy, and purify their own waste water and release it slowly in a purer form.
- Factory effluent water that is cleaner than the influent.
- Products that, when their useful life is over, do not become useless waste, but can be tossed onto the ground to decompose and become food for plants and animals, rebuilding soil; or, alternately, return to industrial cycles to supply high quality raw materials for new products.
- Billions, even trillions of dollars worth of materials accrued for human and natural purposes each year.
- A world of abundance, not one of limits, pollution, and waste.

Welcome to the Next Industrial Revolution.

¹⁹⁹ See *State of the Planet* [blog from the Earth Institute], www.blogs.ei.columbia.edu; Michael Klesius,
writings in this Section of the course examine globalization’s multiple forms—economic, political, cultural, scientific, and legal—at their intersections with the environment and technology.

As discussed earlier, one of the primary assumptions serving pro-globalization advocates is that monetary economic growth equals development equals progress.200 A domino effect is catalyzed: people and land are put to use. Within the current development model, large businesses and the industrialized nations that subsidize them determine for all others what “use” looks like.201 Then, the nationalistic ideology, presumptively technocratic, born in one industrialized nation spreads to and across several others bringing with it consequences that were either unimagined or actively disguised:202 extinction of plants and animals,203 transmission of...
diseases, climate change, fresh water under pressure, devastation of marine life, language loss, pollution, deforestation, introduction of foreign species, and sprawl.


Global warming has also led to a number of lawsuits. See, e.g., David Kravets, Federal Judge OK’s Global Warming Lawsuit, ASSOCIATED PRESS, Aug. 25, 2005 (Friends of the Earth v. Watson); Richard Black, Inuit sue US over Climate Policy, www.bbc.co.uk/hi/sci/tech/4511556.stm; Stephen Faris, Conspiracy Theory, THE ATLANTIC 32, June 2008.] 


See also Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change, www.ipcc.ch/

Some see the term “global warming” as fostering images of complex scientific dispute and economic sacrifice and, therefore, advocate the use of a different vocabulary of words. See John M. Broder, Struggling to Save the Planet, With a Thesaurus, NY TIMES, May 2, 2009 at Sec. A, p. 1.


PAUL MOLYNEAX, SWIMMING IN CIRCLES: AQUACULTURE AND THE END OF WILD OCEANS (2007);


Trash (generally) [Elisabeth Rosenthal, New Rules Lead Europe to Dump Trash Abroad, NY TIMES, September 27, 2009.]

210 DERRICK JENSEN AND GEORGE DRAFFAN, STRANGELY LIKE WAR: THE GLOBAL ASSAULT ON FORESTS (2004); Alex Shoumatoff, The Gasing Forest, VANITY FAIR 272, May 2007; Michael McCarthy, Nature Laid
And when the multi-national businesses have finished their work, often, according to Wolfgang Sachs, the people and land are left behind, too spent to yield anything fruitful for generations.213

David Quammen writes:

[O]ur Planet of Weeds will indeed be a crummier place, a lonelier and uglier place, and a particularly wretched place for the 2 billion people comprising [the] absolute poor. What will increase most dramatically as time proceeds, I suspect, won’t be generalized misery or futuristic modes of consumption but the gulf between two global classes experiencing those extremes. Progressive failure of ecosystem functions? Yes, but human resourcefulness *** will probably find stopgap technological remedies, to be available for a price. So the world’s privileged class -- that’s your class and my class -- will probably still manage to
maintain themselves inside [a] stretch limo, drinking bottled water and breathing bottled air and eating reasonably healthy food that has become incredibly precious, while the potholes on the road outside grow ever deeper. Eventually the limo will look more like a lunar rover. Ragtag mobs of desperate souls will cling to its bumpers, like groupies on Elvis’ final Cadillac. The absolute poor will suffer their lack of ecological privilege in the form of lowered life expectancy, bad health, absence of education, corrosive want, and anger. Maybe in time they’ll find ways to gather themselves in localized revolt against the affluent class. Not likely, though, as long as affluence buys guns. In any case, well before that they will have burned the last stick of Bornean dipterocarp for firewood and roasted the last lemur, the last grizzly bear, the last elephant left unprotected outside a zoo.214

But, to stem the tide of these massive environmental—and therefore human—degradations, industrialized nations and the international monetary agencies that they run must broaden their narrow notion of growth.215 In his article, “Growth Has Reached Its Limit,” Robert Goodland looks to a report by a Dutch ecological economist who asserts that what the world needs least as a mechanism for reaching ecological sustainability is an increase in national income.216 Instead, what the report suggests is that in place of the current push for quantitative growth, nations should be looking toward strategies for qualitative growth.217 Similarly, David Morris asserts, it is time to re-examine the validity of the doctrine of free trade and what we consider “external” consequences of that trade.218 Under the present model of development, environmental degradation is considered something external to economic growth, something that

214 Quammen, supra note [203] at page 69.
216 Robert Goodland, Growth Has Reached Its Limit, in MANDER 215. The Korean writer, Ko Un, says that we will never ameliorate the political and economic strains between cultures until we adopt a posture of minimum ownership.
   Will we be a people characterized by consumerism and self-gratification or will we make the well-being of all life the organizing principle of our culture. This is the defining question of our time. ….--- M. G. H. Gilliam, ORION, July/August 2007
See also BARRY LOPEZ, ED., THE FUTURE OF NATURE: WRITINGS ON A HUMAN ECOLOGY (2007).
218 David Morris, Free Trade: The Great Destroyer, in MANDER 226.
need not be counted in the total evaluation of successful growth. Yet Morris challenges pro-
globalization advocates to answer the question, “external to what?”

How do we integrate into our complex politics, and into domestic and international
jurisprudence, the rights of species, the rights of ecosystems, and how do we discern the
interests of nonhuman entities? Some will, of course, argue that we have already, that there are
numerous laws in existence that address the family of the environment. But,

[o]ur individual and collective failure to comprehend and act on the
connectedness of things is pervasive and systemic…. Responses intended to
solve one problem become the causes of later problems because governments
commonly deal with the coefficients of problems, not with the system that created
the problem in the first place. The Clean Air Act of 1970, for example, required
scrubbing power-plant emissions, but the substances so removed were deposited
on land, becoming a land-use problem. The effect, to this and other cases, has
been a kind of shell game in which problems are simply moved from air, to water,
to land, and back again. *** Environmental laws seldom prevent or solve
environmental problems. At best they render problems somewhat more
manageable while providing ample opportunity for legal wrangling over the
permissible rates by which the citizenry is poisoned and the land degraded.

Similarly, William McDonough relates the parable that if you are traveling north to
Canada at 100 miles per hour, but you really want to go south to Mexico, it doesn’t much help to
slow to 80 or even 20 mph. We are pretending again. We are forgetting that the environment

---

219 See citations, supra notes 87, 120.
221 See David Orr, Law of the Land, ORION 18, January/February 2004; Kari Volkmann-Carlsen, The
Emancipated Earth, UTNE 74, May-June 2009; Mary O’Brien, Standing Up For This World, ORION 56,
September/October 2004; Cormac Cullinan, If Nations Had Rights: What Would We Need to Give Up?, ORION 26,
222 See, e.g., Endangered Species Act, 16 U.S.C. § 1531 et seq. (1973); National Environmental Policy Act,
et seq. (1977); Resource Conservation and Recovery Act, 42 U.S.C. § 6901 (1976); N.A.F.T.A.’s (environmental
provisions); (pollution trading laws); United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change (UNFCCC), Kyoto
Protocol, Dec. 11, 1997 (the United States has signed, but not yet ratified); Biodiversity Convention; (Int’l Envir.
223 Orr, supra note [221], at 21-22.
224 Talk by William McDonough at Bioneers 2000, Designing the Next Industrial Revolution (Oct. 2000),
is not apart from us. Our sense of interdependence—on each other as persons, as communities, and on our local environment—has been waning for generations. That recognizable interdependence is being replaced by a notion that Thomas Berry calls “Economism,” a system in which humans believe, among other things, that the earth must change for our economic purposes. But, “instead of checking the DOW every hour on the hour [should we not] be checking the oxygen balance.”\(^225\) Does not climate change force us to reevaluate not only our physical spaces,\(^226\) but our mental spaces as well? Should planetary warming be shaking us with fever, undercutting our abstractions and getting us back to animal breathing life and the awe of gravity?\(^227\) Should we get beyond hope?\(^228\) What is the future of environmentalism?\(^229\) Trade has occurred for millennia within prismatic colorations, spectral shades from civility to cruelty.\(^230\) The vagaries of trade also have much to do with geographic location and technological force.\(^231\) When technology is thought of as triumphant, there exists a human tendency to arrogate it, to make it hegemonic.

---

\(^{225}\) Bill McKibben, *Planet Protectors*, ORION 16, July/August 2007. Brooke Williams from Moose, Wyoming wrote a letter to Orion quoting Studs Terkel: “Most people have work that is too small for their spirits.” ORION 13, July/August 2007.


\(^{228}\) Derrick Jensen, *Beyond Hope: Removing a Major Stumbling Block to Acting on Behalf of the Earth*, ORION 14, May/June 2006.


Technological innovations are always offered, promoted, and accepted in the best light before any serious discussion is embraced as to the consequences of their introduction to the structures and health of human societies. Why did we not reason beforehand that sprawl and polluted cities would be an outcome of the automobile? Why have we chosen to sit before radiation screens (televisions and computers) for several hours each day to the delight of commercial advertisers? Why are we not debating criminal sanctions for the creation of knowledge-based weapons of mass destruction? Are values always determined by a cost-benefit analysis? Why have we even coined an economic term for undisturbed nature: \( \text{existence value} \)?

---

232 Jerry Mander, *In the Absence of the Sacred: The Failure of Technology and the Survival of the Indian Nations* (1991); Neil Postman, *Staying Sane in a Technological Society: Six Questions in Search of An Answer*, Lapis, Issue 7. Technology, often, eclipses the law. While last year we were debating how to include the Indigenous perspective into the frames of compensation for Indigenous knowledge, or whether royalties or monetary payments were even appropriate, this year we must acknowledge that computer anonymity and information sharing has surpassed even the colonizers' own language and TRIPS schemes. Technology has now come to define dynamics of power between fast and slow societies. See Jeremy Rifkin, *Time Wars*, (1987).


234 Jerry Mander, *Four Arguments for the Elimination of Television* (1977-78). In 1900, the word “television” was coined by Constantin Perskyi, a Russian scientist, at the Paris World’s Fair. In 1948, television sales nearly quintupled in the United States after the 1947 Dodgers-Yankees World Series. Of course, we could broaden the inquiry surrounding the television and computers to include the commercial interests of “media culture,” or “mass media,” and their effects on society. See, e.g., Ben H. Bagdikian, *The Media Monopoly* (1983, revised through 2000). See also Aletha C. Huston, et al., *Big World, Small Screen: The Role of Television in American Society* (1992).


238 Edward O. Wilson, *Is Humanity Suicidal?*, N.Y. Times Mag., May 30, 1993 at 6. See also Paul Sheppard, *Nature and Madness* (Univ. Georgia Press 1982). Jean Baudrillard’s later work, such as America (1989) and ILLUSION OF THE END (1995), carries his post-Marxist critique finally to a nihilistic conclusion, suggesting not only that contemporary society has erased time and history, but that humanity itself, as a concept, is suicidal. The emerging field of ecopsychology—and Glenn Albrecht in particular—uses the phrase “solastalgia” to describe a hitherto unrecognized psychological condition, pain experienced when one recognizes that the place one loves and resides is under assault. See Daniel B. Smith, “Is There an Ecological Unconscious?”, N.Y. Times Mag.,
The technologies of globalization often come to us from widespread commercial pursuit, usually accompanied by advertising benefits to health and lifestyle, and without ethical ballast. They are introduced into societies as rosy-cheeked sweethearts and become pervasive, difficult to dislodge, before there exists any process to articulate and evaluate the totality of effects they cause. We are barraged with high-tech headlines about biofuels, cloning, artificial intelligence, computers, and globalization. The False Promise of Biofuels, Special Report from International Forum on Globalization and the Institute for Policy Studies, by Jack Santa Barbara, September 2007. Lee M. Silver, REMAKING EDEN: HOW GENETIC ENGINEERING AND ClONING WILL TRANSFORM THE AMERICAN FAMILY (1998); Gary Rosen, What Would a Clone Say?: A Humanist Case Against Therapeutic Cloning, NY TIMES Mag., November 27, 2005; Brian Alexander, Free to Clone: Does the First Amendment Protect Scientific Research?, NY TIMES MAG., September 26, 2004.
intelligence, spyware, synthetic biology, geoengineering, robotics, nanotechnology, biotechnology, biopharmaceuticals, genetic therapy, designing children’s birth traits, downloading our consciousness into computers, becoming transhuman, all heralding the “dawn of a coming utopia of health and wealth, and yes, perhaps even immortality itself.” This techno-utopian vision—what I call science fixation—is becoming an omnipresent reality for our societies.

E. F. Schumacher writes, in The Slenderest Knowledge:

---


249 See text infra.


251 David Smith, 2050 - And Immortality Is Within Our Grasp, www.observer.guardian.co.uk/uk_news/story/0,6903,1489635,00.html.
With the rise of materialistic Scientism the soul disappeared from the description of man—how could it exist when it could be neither weighed nor measured?—except as one of the many strange attributes of complex arrangements of atoms and molecules. Why not accept the so-called “soul” as an *epiphenomenon* of matter, just as, say, magnetism has been accepted as such? The Universe was seen simply as an accidental collocation of atoms. If the great Cosmos is seen as *nothing but* a chaos of particles without purpose or meaning, so man must be seen as *nothing but* a chaos of particles without purpose and meaning—a sensitive chaos perhaps, capable of suffering pain, anguish and despair, but a chaos all the same—a rather unfortunate cosmic accident of no consequence whatever.

I am not arguing for Chicken Little or dreaming the dream of a Luddite here. But should we not be asking questions beforehand designed to provide an insight into the ways in which technology insinuates, or will intrude, itself into our cultures? Neil Postman\(^{252}\) proposes six:

1. What is the problem to which this technology is a solution? Postman argues that technology should not be created if it is not solving a relevant problem.
2. Whose problem is it? The people who will benefit from the technology should be the people who pay for it.
3. What new problems will be created by solving an old one? We should think in an open eyed way about the consequences of technology before we create it.
4. What people and institutions will most seriously be harmed? If the groups supposedly benefiting from the technology are actually being harmed by it, that technology is not a good idea.
5. What changes in language are being enforced by new technologies and what is being gained and lost by such changes? When we attach a word with a social meaning to a new technology, that technology often changes the meaning of the word and unthreads part of the social fabric.
6. What sorts of people and institutions acquire special economical and political power because of the technological change? The transformation of technology into a product always realigns economic and political power.

Will Postman’s questions find Salamancan\(^{253}\) forums outside of corporate and military laboratories when those technologies sought to be treated involve life-altering regimes?\(^{254}\)


\(^{253}\) Columbus’ request for financing to sail to the New World was referred by the monarchs to the scholars at Salamanca in order to debate the significance and potential success of the prospective voyage.

the convergence of computational genetic engineering, nanotechnology, and robotics (GNR) lead to dangerous mechanical plagues? We are now replicating and evolving processes that have thus far been confined to the natural world, and they are now to become part of the realms of human endeavors and destined for widespread knowledge and commercial uses. We are aggressively pursuing the promises of new technologies within the now unchallenged system of global capitalism and its manifold financial incentives and competitive pressures.

Bill Joy, the co-founder of Sun Microsystems, in a sobering article, entitled “Why the Future Doesn’t Need Us,” asks:

outside of power politics, in alternative forums, such as the International Forum on Globalization, Foundation on Economic Trends, The International Center for Technology Assessment, etc. See e.g., Nancy D. Campbell, Suspect Technologies: Scrutinizing the Intersection of Science, Technology, and Policy, 30 SCI., TECH., & HUMAN VALUES 374 (2005); Hildy Teegen, et al., The Importance of Nongovernmental Organizations (NGOs) in Global Governance and Value Creation: An International Business Research Agenda, 35 J. INT’L. BUS. STUDIES 463 (2004). See also LEE M. SILVER, CHALLENGING NATURE: THE CLASH OF SCIENCE AND SPIRITUALITY AT THE NEW FRONTIERS OF LIFE (2006); David Rejeski, A Very, Very Small Opportunity: How Science and Security Can Avoid a Collision Over Nanotechnology, ORION 11, July/August 2007; Institute for Ethics and Emerging Technologies (IEET) (www.ieet.org); Jacques Ellul Society, www.deepecology.org/jacques.html; JACQUES ELLUL, THE TECHNOLOGICAL SOCIETY (1964); International Center for Technology Assessment (www.icta.org); Foresight and Governance Project (Woodrow Wilson Center) (www.wilsoncenter.org/index.cfm?fuseaction=topics.home&topic_id=1414; Association of Professional Futurists (www.profuturists.com); GeneWatch (www.gene-watch.org); Foresight Institute (www.foresight.org); Clock of the Long Now (www.longnow.org). I do not see any major comings together of governmental and scientific communities to debate whether something should be prevented from exploration other than, perhaps, human cloning or stem cell research. I think this is really more of a parochial or religious issue in the United States than it is one involving the consequences of genetic manipulation of naturally occurring systems of life. I leave the question of just what is “natural” for another time.

257 Proponents of knowledge-based wealth celebrate technology’s gains and foresee a richer world. See ALVIN TOFFLER & HEIDI TOFFLER, REVOLUTIONARY WEALTH (Alfred A. Knopf 2006). Laws may encourage the development of new technologies, as well. For example, patents enjoy limited immunity from antitrust laws. See, e.g., HERBERT HOVENKAMP, et al., IP AND ANTITRUST (2002). One field vigorously exploring such questions, albeit through fictional forms, is the recently developed genre of cyberpunk literature. As the generally recognized foundation text, see WILLIAMS GIBSON, NEUROMANCER (REMEMBERING TOMORROW) (1984). As precursors, see VERNOR VINGE, TRUE NAMES (1981); JOHN SHIRLEY, CITY COME A-WALKIN’ (1980); and the novels of Philip K. Dick. The field has since become heavily populated with authors and titles. As a genre, it is often credited with predicting many technological innovations and cultural conditions that followed after the fictional speculations. (“Cyberspace”, for example, was coined by Gibson in NEUROMANCER.)
258 WIRED, April, 2000. Accord, An Interview with Bill Joy, WILD DUCK REV. 36, Winter 2000. See also
In our time how much danger do we face not just from nuclear weapons but from all of these technologies? How high are the extinction risks? What are the moral implications here? If we must move beyond the earth this quickly in order for the species to survive, who accepts responsibility for the fate of those (most of us after all) who are left behind?

The only realistic alternative he sees is relinquishment, to limit development of the technologies that are too dangerous by quashing our search for certain kinds of knowledge. This is an extraordinary assertion for students to debate. The human desire to learn, to understand, to create, to profit, to exploit, to dream, being stalled when some organization, some international component organization, some nation-state, tells you to brake your quest for knowledge. Who would be in control? Who could?259 What way could we even regulate or verify the closing of a mind given our strong claims to property, privacy, and freedom of action?260


259 How and when should judges make profoundly normative judgments about the social allocation of risk and who should bear the burden of scientific uncertainty or controversy. . . . Lucinda M. Finley, *Guarding the Gate to the Courthouse: How Trial Judges Are Using Their Evidentiary Screening Role to Remake Tort Causation Rules*, 49 DePaul L. Rev. 335-336 (1999).

What Joy proposes we do to assure the perpetuation of our human species is a labyrinthic challenge. Whether it can be answered in front of an environmental catastrophe remains to be seen. Satish Kumar, the eloquent philosopher and educator who is the Director of Programme of Schumacher College in England, and also the editor of Resurgence magazine, once related to me a story that his mother told him when he was a young man. She said that “when God created time, he made a lot of it.” Her point, obviously, was to grasp that humans were always in such a hurry.261 All our technologically-driven processes seem to be designed, from my senses, around


University and federal scientists have just reconstructed the 1918 influenza virus that killed fifty million people worldwide. The United States Department of Health and Human Services published the full genome of this virus on the Internet in the GenBank database. It is argued that to disseminate the genome -- as such a weapon of mass destruction -- was “extremely foolish”. See Ray Kurzweil and Bill Joy, Recipe for Destruction, N.Y. TIMES, Oct. 17, 2005. The authors press for international argreements to limit such publications. How odd it was to read of this resurrection of a near-century-old virus and the ethical debate surrounding the human passion for research after just studying H. G. Wells’ telescopic prognostications, written in 1901, of the attributes of the future ethical men of science and industry in the 20th Century. H. G. Wells, ANTICIPATIONS OF THE REACTIONS OF MECHANICAL AND SCIENTIFIC PROGRESS UPON HUMAN LIFE AND THOUGHT (Harper & Bros. 1902). He also said that the “twenty-three million” people who died of the influenza would probably have died soon, anyway, for they were “old people, weak people, feeble children who had to die somehow.” H. G. Wells, THE CONQUEST OF TIME (Watts & Co. 1942).

261 See generally SATISH KUMAR, SPIRITUAL COMPASS: THE THREE QUALITIES OF LIFE (2007); SATISH
what can basically be accomplished next, and about how we can be remunerated for our inventions immediately.\textsuperscript{262} We are striving to make the future the past in the present.

In English, there is a quaint expression, “making good time,” a colloquialism that if taken literally implies that time is something that can be crafted or manufactured, and either poorly so or else expertly, a notion every bit as fanciful and illogical as naming a star “sitting trouser”---until one becomes acquainted with quantum physics, whereupon one learns that time, as measured by clocks on earth, is, indeed, a contrivance, a thing we have conveniently made up. Moreover, the “better” time we make, which is to say, the faster we go, the less time there is, so that “by the time” we reach the speed of light, there is no time at all, indicating, perhaps, that the only good time is a dead time. Something else to ponder is that if higher science has justified the figure of speech, “making good time,” might not it someday validate the name, “sitting trouser,” as well?\textsuperscript{263}

I once heard -- the best place I can recall from where is the ether (yet my wife reminds me that it was she who advised) -- that during the Italian Renaissance (and I am sure, to not be accused of being [Italian-peninsula] centric, in other cultures as well), some peoples’ jobs were to grow and tend the trees that would be used as the scaffoldings for the construction of churches to be built over the course of the next two or three centuries. Whether these arborists were content or not, I cannot say, and I don’t mean to infuse a sense of romanticism, either. But can we imagine, today, our work being \textit{complete in the incompletion}? That we will not see, let alone enjoy, the fruits of our labor, especially when generally all our economic markers of wealth are based upon completed transactions or upon speculation in future market events.\textsuperscript{264} In our rush


\textsuperscript{263} TOM ROBBINS, \textit{HALF ASLEEP IN FROG PAJAMAS} 283 (1994).

\textsuperscript{264} I, of course, can appear to be cynical and envision a 15\textsuperscript{th} Century stock market that speculates on whether the trees will be tall enough to harvest in 10, 20 or 30 years; but, I wouldn’t be cynical, because I can now invest in the weather forecasts to purchase snow insurance. Allweather Insurance Agency,
for “progress/productivity/efficiency”, where do we place a precaution on the pace of what we call “development”?265

If we have made the ultimate compromise by surrendering to industrial market forces the decision-making over what we put into our bodies as food, will we not also be inclined or predisposed to compromise anything else in life? Is this not the inherent failure of cost-benefit analysis, that there are no absolutes or moral imperatives?266

* * *


Just who are the watchdogs with foresight?


[See Appendix ______.]

266 [See citations, supra note 193.]
It is tempting at this point in the Syllabus to feast with the students upon creative
solutions for ecological sustainability. There exist many large knapsacks full of champion
ideas. But I prefer to defer the jellyroll and keep the students at the edge of the moraine a bit
longer…well, really some weeks longer. There are still more ecological and cultural phenomena
to be connected within our globalized world.

267 See generally, infra text & footnotes 564-601; Appendices . I have often thought about extending the
class into a second semester which would consist entirely of good news and Roy Rogers’ and Dale Evans’ renditions
of “Happy Trails to You.” I am hoping my colleague, Professor Marc Miller, continues his fine course,
Sustainability and Environmental Policy, which he added to our law school curricula in recent years.
Biocolonization

Property law has evolved most completely by virtue of startling new technologies. Property law has evolved most completely by virtue of startling new technologies. From plants to people to what we call “information,” the horizon line that once upon a time restrained our awareness of the end of landscapes of physical and ephemeral things has been expanded. Science and engineering have made us jump quickly into new legal and ethical understandings of just what it is we call property and what its attendant rights to ownership are in a globalized, free-market economy. We are now genetically manipulating animals for research; human cells and genes have been patented; the meat we eat may contain genes from humans; the plants we eat may contain genes from fish; in Third World countries, kidneys, eyes and skin are sold in a flourishing market for body parts. If humans are to colonize biology -- biocolonization -- what questions are we supposed to ask and then answer? Should we alter the genetic structure of the entire living kingdom in the name of utility or profit? Is there a limit to the number of types of human genes that should be allowed to be engineered into other animals? Should the generic integrity of the biotic community be preserved? Is there something sacred about life or should life forms, including the human body and its parts, be viewed simply

---

as commodities in the new biotech marketplace? Is the genetic makeup of all living things the common heritage of all or can it be appropriated by corporations and governments?\footnote{See Antonio Regaldo, The Great Gene Grab, TECHNOLOGY REVIEW, Sept./Oct. 2000.}

In trade-related intellectual property agreements (TRIPS),\footnote{Agreement on Trade-Related Aspects of Intellectual Property Rights, http://www.wto.org/english/tratop_e/trips_e/t_agm0_ehtm; see Vandana Shiva, North-South Conflicts in Intellectual Property Rights, 12 PEACE REVIEW 501 (2000).} can we ask/demand other cultures to answer these aforementioned questions in the same way that a western mind would answer them? Is there an assumption that the local use of a naturally occurring biological substance does not create wealth but waste, and that wealth is created only when corporations commercialize the resources used by local communities?\footnote{See Vandana Shiva and Radha Holla-Bhar, Piracy by Patent: The Case of the Neem Tree, in MANDER 147. See also Captain Hook Awards for Biopiracy, www.captainhookawards.org.} When a transnational corporation goes bioprospecting\footnote{“Bioprospecting involves searching for, collecting, and deriving genetic material from samples of biodiversity that can be used in commercialized pharmaceutical, agricultural, industrial, or chemical processing end products.” Bioprospecting – Fact Sheet, http://hawaii.gov/lrb/rpts06/bioconfs.html.} in indigenous communities for plants or for the DNA from these plants and the DNA from the indigenous peoples living there,\footnote{Pacific Island’s Rpt., Nov. 2000; CORI HAYDEN, WHEN NATURE GOES PUBLIC: THE MAKING AND UNMAKING OF BIOPROSPECTING IN MEXICO (2003); Shane Greene, Indigenous People Incorporated? Culture as Politics, Culture as Property, in Pharmaceutical Bioprospecting, 45 CURRENT ANTHROPOLOGY 211 (2004).} what are the prospectors’ obligations to those societies including understanding how knowledge is constructed, valued and held, the successful negotiation of the panoply of issues surrounding informed consent, and the appropriateness of and/or manner of compensation?\footnote{See Paul Heald, The Rhetoric of Biopiracy, 11 CARDOZO J. INT'L & COMP. LAW 519 (2003); Charles R. McManis, Intellectual Property, Genetic Resources and Traditional Knowledge Protection: Thinking Globally, Acting Locally, 11 CARDOZO J. INT'L & COMP. L. 547 (2003); Graeme Austin, Re-Treating Intellectual Property? The WAI 262 Proceeding and the Heuristics of Intellectual Property Law, 11 CARDOZO J. INT'L & COMP. L. 333 (2003). ; Kerry ten Kato & Sarah Laird, The Commercial Use of Biodiversity: Access to Genetic Resources and Benefit Sharing, Earth Scan Pub. (1999); Darrell Posey, Intellectual Property Rights and Just Compensation for Indigenous Knowledge, 6 ANTHROPOLOGY TODAY 13 (1990); Michael Halwood, Indigenous and Local Knowledge in International Law: A Preface to Sui Generis Intellectual Property Protection, 44 McGill L. J. 953 (1999); Kuel-Jung Ni, Legal Aspects of Prior Informed Consent on Access To Genetic Resources: An Analysis of Global Lawmaking and Local Implementation Toward an Optimal Normative Construction, 42 VAND. J. TRANNSAT’L L. 227 (2009); Steven M. Rubin and Stanwood C. Fish, Biodiversity Bioprospecting: Using Innovative Contractual Provisions to Foster Ethnobotanical Knowledge, Technology, and Conservation, 5 COLO. J. INT’L ENV’T’L L & POL’Y 23 (1994). See also additional references, infra note 550.} Can we respect the finality of an indigenous community’s rejection of an offer to privatize their human heritage? Do indigenous
cultures have the power to say “no”? Who constitutes the decision-making authority within indigenous societies?

Genetic Rights

The marriage of genes and computers has propelled us into the biotech century. Genetic engineering is really a double misnomer. It moves genes but it’s not about genetics. Its engineering implies an understanding of the causal mechanisms that link actions to effects. But nobody understands the mechanisms by which genes, interacting with each other and the environment, express traits. And transgenic manipulation inserts foreign genes into random locations, for example in a plant’s DNA, to see what happens. That’s not engineering; it’s the industrialization of life by people with a narrow conceptualization of it. Will the laboratory replace nature? Issues of control, piracy of the necessary genes from nature, genetic pollution, genetic discrimination and commercial eugenics are all disturbing. In a society that is

---


284 Id.

285 What happens if you are doing genetic screening prior to birth and it shows a potential that the child will develop a genetic defect and will require medical care in the future? What if your insurance company agrees to pay for an abortion but not for the medical care for the life of the child as the expense was preventable by terminating the pregnancy? See Eric Rakowski, Who Should Pay for Bad Genes?, 90 CAL. L. REV. 1345 (2002). Could your child sue you for bringing her/him into the world destined to be debilitated, infirm and in pain? P.L. 10-233, 122 STAT. 881 (Genetic Information Non-Discrimination Act of 2008).
beginning to consider life as perfectible by engineering standards, the real casualty of all this is a loss of empathy; how empathetic are we likely to be to any child growing up that does not conform to the homogenized standards our companies and engineers have set up? We are changing the criteria for what it means to be normal by advancing technologies for genetic selection and altering the natural course of evolution in a radically accelerated timeframe.  

Bill McKibben describes a dangerous world in which genetic engineering could potentially make it possible for people to enhance their children’s intelligence, height, looks and even athletic ability. The danger lies not only in a future in which all human beings may be

---


genetically programmed to possess certain abilities, but also in the fact that it will become a vicious, never-ending cycle. Those parents with a child of IQ of 150 may be satisfied in the beginning, but ultimately disappointed and unhappy because the next batch of children could be manipulated to have an IQ of 170. What types of laws will we need to create to prevent discrimination from the “enhanced” human toward the “normal” human? Should there be an end to gene patents? Should genetic materials be made part of the commons and placed into collective patent banks? We must be asking, as well, what extraordinary advantages have resulted from the privatization of genetic patents? “How much cultural shift would it take to persuade people to snort a line or two of transgenic bacteria to ward off the flu? *** If the arsenal for disease prevention continues emptying, the decision will become more focused: how do you weigh the fears of knowingly disrupting our own natural habitat with transgenics versus the fear of taking no action in the face of new epidemics?”

64, November 20, 2005.

289 See LEE SILVER, REMAKING EDEN (1998).
The Industrialization of Digitization

Information is a verb, not a noun, something that happens in the field of intersection between minds. Information is an action which occupies time rather than as a state of being which occupies physical space. It is experienced rather than possessed. What about our system of copyright makes accommodation for expressions that do not at some point in time become fixed or for cultural expressions that lack a specific author or inventor? Will copyrights fade

294 Barlow, supra note 269, available at http://www.virtualschool.edu/mon/ElectronicFrontier/WineWithoutBottles.html (last viewed June 24, 2009). A decade ago, in Selling Wine Without Bottles, Barlow considered issues related to the free exchange of ideas in the digital age. For Barlow, “free information” is synonymous with the democratizing potential of the internet and with freedom of expression. Barlow contends that information is by definition something that gains value through circulation, and digital technology presents an opportunity for unleashing or increasing the power of information because the means for sharing, copying, and receiving information are available to more people than ever before. It seems almost quaint to make an argument for what many of us have come to take for granted. But threats to the free exchange of information via digital means are increasing in number, sophistication, and power. Without a forceful response from the rest of us, digital information may swiftly become very expensive, highly mediated, and available only under very specific terms (think Google helping China censor the internet in that country, think a “pay-to-play” format for all internet activities, think the relegation of political minorities to the outskirts of the internet.) The term “free information” is taken from the quote “information wants to be free” by Stewart Brand. STEWART BRAND, THE MEDIA LAB: INVENTING THE FUTURE AT M.I.T. 202 (1987).

295 I would be way out of my league to attempt, in this course or any other for that matter, to explain how contemporary copyright dilemmas and challenges are treated within our present and prospective legal systems. And I shall not do so now. Please tune in to Professor Lawrence Lessig for his great wisdom. LAWRENCE LESSIG, FREE CULTURES (2004); LAWRENCE LESSIG, THE FUTURE OF IDEAS (2001); and LAWRENCE LESSIG, CODE AND OTHER LAWS OF CYBERSPACE (1999); http://www.lessig.org. See also The Center for Internet and Society, www.cyberlaw.stanford.edu; Madhavi Sunder, IP3, 59 STAN. L. REV. 257 (2006); Laurence R. Helfer and Graeme W. Austin, Human Rights and Intellectual Property: Analysis and Sources, in PAUL L. C. TORREMANS (ED.) INTELLECTUAL PROPERTY AND HUMAN RIGHTS (forthcoming). I am chiefly concerned at this point in the semester to highlight some of the sociological and, hence, cultural manifestations of this relatively new, though highly accelerated, technology. Barlow argues that ethics are more important than rules, so that information economics in the absence of objects will be based more upon relationships than on possession. See also JEREMY RIFKIN, THE AGE OF ACCESS: THE NEW CULTURE OF HYPERCAPITALISM WHERE ALL OF LIFE IS A PAID-FOR EXPERIENCE (2001).


in importance as we create new definitions of “ownership” and “information”? How are we to keep ubiquitous electronic information from being freely exchanged and combinable? What


Descriptions for the majority of these websites can be found in Appendix [        ].

296 “…more than ever before, our copyright policy is our information policy. As technology has transformed the nature of copyright so that it now applies to everybody’s everyday behavior, it has become more important, not less, that our copyright rules embody a deal that the public would assent to.” JESSICA LITMAN, DIGITAL COPYRIGHT: PROTECTING INTELLECTUAL PROPERTY ON THE INTERNET (2001). From the standpoint of society the major goal of copyright is to smooth diversity’s path by giving creators special rights to exploit their work. If copyright becomes meaningless, will it still be possible to make work for small, specialized audiences, or will an awful shrinking homogeneity set upon our futures? See generally John Perry Barlow, supra note 269; Charles Mann, Who Will Own Your Next Good Idea, ATLANTIC MONTHLY, Sept. 1998; Esther Dyson, Intellectual Value, WIRED, Jul. 1995; Kevin Kelly, What Will Happen to Books?, N.Y. TIMES MAG., May 14, 2006, at Section 6, Page 43; Randall Stross, Will Books Be Napsterized?, NY TIMES, October 4, 2009;Tim Arango, Rights Clash on YouTube, and Videos Disappear, NY TIMES, March 23, 2009, Sec. B, p. 1. LAWRENCE LESSIG, CODE AND OTHER LAWS OF CYBERSPACE 333 (1999).

297 For information on cryptography, see DOUGLAS ROBERT STINSON, CRYPTOGRAPHY: THEORY AND PRACTICE (2006). There was a parallel economy developing, getting ideas into the marketplace faster than competitors who base their protection on the fear of litigation. See, e.g., YIJUN TIAN, RE-THINKING INTELLECTUAL PROPERTY: THE POLITICAL ECONOMY OF COPYRIGHT PROTECTION IN THE DIGITAL ERA (2008); Get Bit Torren, www.bittorrent.com. Many countries are moving down the path towards liberating, rather than restricting, access and use of digital information. Among the more liberal international copyright initiatives, France has advanced plans to legalize P2P (http://news.com/2100-1025_3-6034897.html), Australia is considering legislation that expands “fair use” of copyrighted material (http://www.efa.org.au/Issues/IP) and the widespread adoption of Creative Commons licenses (www.creativecommons.org) for public-sector information (http://www.guardian.co.uk/technology/2008/feb/14/freeourdata.intellectualproperty), the United Kingdom is holding hearings on the detrimental impacts of DRM on public libraries (http://news.bbc.co.uk/go/pr/fr/-/2/hitech/technology/4675280.stm, 2006/02/03 09:57:30), and even South Korea has implemented policy that allows individuals to download for personal use (http://times.hankooki.com/1page/nation/200601/
Digital Technology

Digital Technology is clearly one of the most significant developments of the last 30 years. The rapid ascension of the Internet has transformed society around the world, and has had a profound impact on our lives, culture, language, commerce, science and government. It has changed how we talk, how we view the world, even how we think and what we consider “real.” German ornithologists have found some birds that are singing the songs of cell phone ringtones. As they are drawn to the increasing amounts of food and green space in modern cities, the birds simply adapt to their environment. In the “evolutionary playground” we find birds imitating human sounds, now imitating digital sounds. As we think about the ways that we humans adapt to our changing environment and the more subtle impacts of technology, I like to remember those birds chirping a Nokia corporate jingle, or better still, Sketches of Spain by Miles Davis. To what extent are we transformed by digital technology, in what subtle ways do we adapt to our world and redefine our natural condition. It’s easy to identify carpal tunnel syndrome, or the impact of video games on a youthful sense of reality, but we almost remember the less evident side-effects. The birds . . .


See Text, infra at _____.

98
The Internet is a disruptive technology: rapidly developed, widely embraced, and having a profound impact on countless aspects of life:

Disruptive technologies are those innovations that have a dramatic impact on how the whole of society works, plays, and learns. The discovery and exploration of electricity in 1873 is an example. Still, it was nearly forty-six years before electricity saw mass use in the United States (with “mass use” commonly defined as 25 percent of the population using an innovation). The gas automobile, equally as disruptive, took fifty-five years to reach mass use. Mobile phones burst on the technology scene more recently but have quickly become a staple of American life. Even with high costs and poor service as initial barriers to entry, mobile phones took only thirteen years to become a mass-use innovation. The modern Web, however, wins the rate-of-adoption race by achieving mass use in only four years. . . . this rate of adoption still tells us something about the usefulness and accessibility of the Web, about how quickly we manage to adopt change in today’s world, and about how ready we are for the convergence of our media experiences.  

One result of researching the Internet (and digital technology more generally), intensively and over the course of the past year, is my realization that it’s all about “control.” Who controls What, and How and Why do they control it? The struggle for mastery is sometimes between governments and private entities, but lately it seems the tension is most pronounced between commercial forces working in cooperation with, or at least supported by government (via favorable regulatory legislation, for example) and citizen groups and non-profits that value things other than the usual commercial imperatives.

One other theme that is inescapable is the “language of liberty” that permeates these technology discussions. One cannot help but note that in the discourse around all things Internet, the competing sides both use language that resonates with expressions of fundamental

democratic ideals. Access should be free; networks and code should be open; there is a need for an intellectual commons; technology companies are providing services that will lead to democratic societies; and the Internet has the potential to fulfill our nation’s constitution in the form of a digital democracy. Granted this language is hyperbolic, yet it also offers reasons to be hopeful. It is hyperbolic in that many of the promises are yet to be realized; hopeful in that these democratic ideals are alive and well and motivating many concerned citizens to become involved in shaping their digital destiny. In fact, it is difficult to describe many of the virtues of the Internet and other digital technologies without resorting to such language. It is almost as if this technology is inherently democratic and fosters idealism. It is a decentralized structure of servers and routers and pipelines that is truly more than the sum of its parts. It was created in large part by people cooperating, taking chances, and experimenting outside of corporate settings, and many of the individuals who were drawn to the technology in its infancy were activists and progressives.  

Digital Democracy

The promise of the Internet to change democratic politics was one of the most-widely heralded forecasts in the early days of the Internet age. Digital Democracy is essentially about using the Internet to educate and inform people, to grow an informed citizenry that can then become more engaged in local and national politics. But more than that, it is about realizing the potential of the technology to develop new manners of political involvement. The topic

302 But see Benjamin R. Barber, The Uncertainty of Digital Politics: Democracy’s Uneasy Relationship With Information Technology, HARV. INT’L. REV. 42 (Spring 2001).
remains in the forefront of both civic-spirited online initiatives and the more mainstream media. In short, the idea was that the voice of the people could be expressed widely and conveniently, and that the processes of popular decision-making could therefore expand to include the many, with the Internet helping close the gap between citizens and their representatives. Unfortunately, political theorists and proponents of digital democracy became disillusioned when faced with some of the same problems that plague civic participation in the real world—uninformed people tended to congregate around their existing biases and didn’t really want to engage in civil discussions with people who didn’t share their beliefs. The Internet revealed some other basic truths: people prefer porn and commerce to politics and populism.

303 A recent book by Barry Hague titled *Digital Democracy: Discourse and Decision Making in the Information Age* addresses these questions: “Is direct democracy in the age of remote communication possible? Examining the impact of information and communication technologies (ICTs) and their consequences for political institutions, *Digital Democracy* offers a critical assessment of the concept of an emergent electronic democracy.”

Access & Digital Divide

The Digital Divide is the gap that separates the technological haves from the have-nots. It has typically been construed as the disparate educational, commercial, and communication-based experiences/opportunities available to those with Internet access and computers versus those without. But that is not the only relevant aspect; as broadband technology becomes more the norm, the digital divide grows to include online inequities between those Internet users who can afford access to premium services and those who cannot. It is already happening: sponsored content becomes favored over unfettered speech, and products of conglomerate culture, rather than the cross-fertilization of ideas, holds sway.” So access to technology such as computers is one way of thinking about it—but the next user phase, Internet use, is increasingly important and can be thought of as the Internet Divide.304

Policy & the Future of the Internet – Freedom to Connect, Social Software, and Open Access

There is a battle taking place now for control of internet governance, and the winning approach will determine to what extent information is free in the future. When John Perry Barlow wrote Selling Wine Without Bottles305 10 years ago, contemplating the “nature of information” was a way to ask questions about the evolving meaning and value and control of information; might it reveal how it could remain free in the digital age? Today, however, the question of how to ensure free information on the Internet is best answered by asking a different

304 Solid majorities in the U.S., Canada and Western Europe are internet savvy, but in Pakistan and Indonesia, fewer than 10% say they go online as do only 15% of Russians and 14% of Indians. About a third in Poland, Turkey and China say they access the internet. Unsurprisingly, in all societies, education level and income are the predominant determinants of those who use technology, with those who have higher education levels and larger incomes more likely both to use computers and to access the internet.

305 Barlow, supra note 269.
question: who is responsible for the governing standards and functions of the network itself?

When Barlow asked how IP law might evolve to deal with digital information, he recognized, presciently, that “the “terrain” itself—the architecture of the net—may come to serve many of the purposes which could only be maintained in the past by legal imposition. 306 IP law, the architecture of the net, and the future of free information all merge in internet governance.

The complete history and various complexities of internet governance far exceed the scope of this discussion. But some basic facts are helpful: The Internet Corporation for Assigned Names and Numbers, (ICANN) was created in 1998 to manage the assignment of domain names and IP addresses. 307 In most of its official statements and proposals regarding internet governance, the European Union has consistently criticized ICANN as a unilateral body controlling matters of global import without a foundation in global forums and not subject to outside review. The criticism of ICANN is pervasive, not so much for what it does but for its awkward position as a U.S. created and pseudo-private entity. American administrative law experts have criticized ICANN for similar reasons. 308

Commercial interests also seek to control the internet in ways that discourage democratizing the web. A recent article in the Nation presents the current state of commercial strategies for re-defining the way we all will access and use the Internet. It is an alarming picture for anyone who values the potential of the Internet as a tool for something other than commercial transactions and one-way information exchange.

---

306 Id.
307 Id. ICANN recently announced that it will allow Internet addresses to be displayed with non-Latin characters. See http://www.pcadvisor.co.uk/news/index.cfm?newsid=3205201.
The nation's largest telephone and cable companies are crafting an alarming set of strategies that would transform the free, open and nondiscriminatory Internet of today to a privately run and branded service that would charge a fee for virtually everything we do online . . . Verizon, Comcast, Bell South and other communications giants are developing strategies that would track and store information on our every move in cyberspace in a vast data-collection and marketing system, the scope of which could rival the National Security Agency.\(^309\)

Under this scheme, entities with the most money would get preferred treatment, and those without such financial leverage would have a much more difficult time participating.

Furthermore, the cost to use the Internet would increase substantially under a corporate “pay-to-play” scenario.

To make this pay-to-play vision a reality, phone and cable lobbyists are now engaged in a political campaign to further weaken the nation's communications policy laws. They want the federal government to permit them to operate Internet and other digital communications services as private networks, free of policy safeguards or governmental oversight. Indeed, both the Congress and the Federal Communications Commission (FCC) are considering proposals that will have far-reaching impact on the Internet's future. Ten years after passage of the ill-advised Telecommunications Act of 1996, telephone and cable companies are using the same political snake oil to convince compromised or clueless lawmakers to subvert the Internet into a turbo-charged digital retail machine.\(^310\)

**Network Neutrality**

To combat efforts by large corporations to essentially take control of the flow of information on the Internet, public-interest groups and some new media companies are advocating federal policies that require “network neutrality.”

Without proactive intervention, the values and issues that we care about—civil rights, economic justice, the environment and fair elections—will be further threatened by this push for corporate control. Imagine how the next presidential election would unfold if major political advertisers could make strategic payments to Comcast so that ads from Democratic and Republican candidates were more visible and user-friendly than ads of third-party candidates with less funds. Consider what would happen if an online advertisement promoting nuclear power prominently popped up on a cable broadband page, while a competing message

---


\(^{310}\) Id.
from an environmental group was relegated to the margins. It is possible that all forms of civic and noncommercial online programming would be pushed to the end of a commercial digital queue.

But such ‘neutrality safeguards’ are inadequate to address more fundamental changes the Bells and cable monopolies are seeking in their quest to monetize the Internet. If we permit the Internet to become a medium designed primarily to serve the interests of marketing and personal consumption, rather than global civic-related communications, we will face the political consequences for decades to come. Unless we push back, the "brandwashing" of America will permeate not only our information infrastructure but global society and culture as well.\(^{311}\)

Net Neutrality is about the impact of communication and information technology on politics and civic engagement, society and innovation. Is the Internet properly viewed as a “common carrier?” Who is responsible for ensuring that the infrastructure is properly developed and maintained? Perhaps the market is the best solution: profit-driven initiatives may be an answer for ensuring that adequate resources are directed towards infrastructure maintenance, research and development. Net Neutrality also conceives that internet service providers should not be allowed to discriminate between data from one source versus data from another.\(^{312}\)

\(^{311}\) Id.

\(^{312}\) For example, without Net Neutrality, Yahoo data could be delivered faster than Google data because Yahoo pays a premium to the service provider. In this scenario, the absence of enforced NN leads to a world where the best service goes to the one who can afford to pay the premium. Similarly, data could be relegated to a lower level of service based on political motivations. If a search engine such as Google received funds from the Democrats, a Google search for “presidential debate” might return a list of sites that have a bias (explicit or covert) in favor of the Democratic party or candidates. A recent example of network discrimination occurred when certain broadband providers blocked Vonage voice data transmissions, because Vonage was competing with the phone company that controlled the phone lines there. One major advocacy group is the Annenberg Center for Network Neutrality, who recently released a set of principles that they believe must guide future development of the public Internet markets for broadband access. To read the detailed descriptions, go to http://www.netneutrality2008.org/Resources_files/Aronson.doc. See also Common Cause, Keep the Internet Free and Open! Network Neutrality Fact Sheet, http://www.commoncause.org/site/pp.asp?c=dkLNK1MQ1wG&b=1234951 (last visited Apr. 23, 2008); Common Cause, Think the Internet Will Always be Open? (link is broken); Consumers Union, Importance of the Internet: Public Support for Net Neutrality, Jan. 18, 2006, http://www.consumersunion.org/pub/press_releases/003060.html; Free Press, “Dead End for the Internet?” (link is broken); Free Press, “Internet Freedom Under Fire: Act Now” (link is broken); Larry Lessig, Lessig Blog; MobuzzTV on Net Neutrality; H.R. 4780 [109th]: Global Online Freedom Act of 2006, www.govtrack.us/congress/bill.xpd?tab=main&bill=h109-4780 (for subsequent history, see Analysis of The Global Online Freedom Act of 2008 [H.R. 275] at The Center For Democracy & Technology, www.cdt.org/international/censorship/20080505gofa.pdf); Dixon, supra note 285.
The “Freedom to Connect” movement emphasizes the idea that the “need to communicate is primary, like the need to breathe, eat, sleep, reproduce, socialize and learn.”\textsuperscript{313} The Freedom to Connect, they argue, “belongs with Freedom of Speech, Press, Religion and Assembly. Each of these freedoms is related to the others and depends on the others, but stands distinct. Freedom to Connect, too, depends on the other four but carries its own meaning. Unlike the others, it does not yet have a body of law and practice surrounding it. There is no Digital Bill of Rights. Freedom to Connect is the place to start.”\textsuperscript{314}

FTC includes such concepts as Network Neutrality and the “Infrastructure of Democracy.” The movement places primary importance on the openness of the Internet, being both the main reason for its success so far, as well as the most critical value as we move forward. It emphasizes the role of the individual in this policy debate. Essentially, it strives to incorporate the social software techniques of user participation in tackling the larger policy questions. The Center for Democracy and Technology, for example, calls for the internet to be “open, innovative, and free.”\textsuperscript{315} The Center argues that government agencies should use the internet to provide more information from the public.\textsuperscript{316} Thus, the organization calls on lawmakers to prevent efforts to limit the information available to the public and to ensure that such information can be equally accessed by users of all major platforms.\textsuperscript{317}

The “Technology Liberation Front” blog\textsuperscript{318} includes a fairly comprehensive list of high tech public policy issues: First Amendment & free speech concerns; regulation of e-commerce

\textsuperscript{314} Id.
\textsuperscript{316} Id.
\textsuperscript{317} Id.
markets and online services; privacy regulation; SPAM; spectrum management policy and wireless issues; broadcast television and radio regulation; media ownership / concentration concerns; traditional telecom regulatory policy; broadband Internet deployment policy; cable regulation; VoIP issues; network regulation and open access mandates; Internet taxation; online gambling; cyber-surveillance issues; and the role of the Federal Communications Commission and other regulatory agencies in the Information Age. Add to that the obvious issues of copyright law and internet governance.

In *Code*, Lawrence Lessig dismisses the argument that the Internet is uncontrollable (or that those trying to control it must be stopped from doing so). Such a completely hands-off approach, he argues, is not only incorrect but undesirable. His argument is basically that cyberspace is based on code and it is the control of that code—the design of the Internet’s “architecture”—that we need to focus on. Controlling individuals is far more difficult and less likely to succeed; control the code—create the right architecture—and the behavior will follow. The code is where the law is implemented, where the Internet’s promise may be realized or foreclosed. Someone is always making decisions about implementing code, and that will continue to be the case. To assume that all code will be developed in concert with any single set of ideals or values is to deny the variety of values among a diverse population. Lessig acknowledges that commerce influences cyberspace and that this leads to regulations of all sorts. What freedoms do we want to guarantee in cyberspace? “In this realm, code is the most significant form of law, and it is up to lawyers, politicians and citizens to decide what values code embodies.”

---

319 *Id.*
320 LAWRENCE LESSIG, CODE VERSION 2.0 (2006).
Information Commons

Lawrence Lessig and many others argue for the need to preserve an *information commons*. The concept of the information commons emphasizes some of those principles that also apply to the natural commons: preservation, thoughtful progress, etc. In light of the growing trend to propertize information and to extend the definitions of what can be owned and protected, there is an increasing need to architect cyberspace in ways that preserve an information commons. The idea of an online commons is especially timely now. There is a very real sense that the Internet as we know it is under attack, and that pending legislation and commercial activities will unalterably change the Internet for the worst unless citizens act forcefully and quickly to preserve the public interest.


322 The Internet Archive www.archive.org, is a 501(c)(3) non-profit that was founded to build an ‘Internet library,’ with the purpose of offering permanent access for researchers, historians, and scholars to historical collections that exist in digital format. Founded in 1996 and located in the Presidio of San Francisco, the Archive has been receiving data donations from Alexa Internet and others. In late 1999, the organization started to grow to include more well-rounded collections. Now the Internet Archive includes texts, audio, moving images, and software as well as archived web pages.

There are many interesting examples of this potential on the internet. One is the Global Voice Project, www.globalvoicesonline.org, with the mission to compile some of the most interesting voices and conversations from around the world, provide a forum for an international exchange of ideas, and even help train citizen journalists.

A growing number of bloggers around the world are emerging as “bridge bloggers:” people who are talking about their country or region to a global audience using various forms of participatory media such as podcasts, photo sharing sites, and videoblogs. See, e.g., www.droppingknowledge.org; www.gaia.com.
Official Organization and a Democratic Internet

Numerous “official” organizations are focused on the issues of internet governance. The UN-sponsored World Summit on the Information Society is one.\(^{323}\) Since 2003, a “working group on internet governance” (WGIG) has been creating a sluice-full of proposals.\(^{324}\) In The Democratic Republic of Cyberspace, Bill Thompson points out some flaws in the approach being taken by WGIG. He worries that “the future development of the network [will be] open to capture by two very powerful interests – private corporations and national governments – to the exclusion of civil society.”\(^{325}\) Invoking some of Lawrence Lessig’s ideas about software, he notes that “Lessig’s dictum that ‘code is law’ cuts both ways, and a clear but largely unexplored implication is that our political decisions must be implemented in software if they are to have any effect.”\(^{326}\) He continues that “we should aim to govern the internet in accordance with its own principles: those of distributed responsibility, disintermediation and peer review.”\(^{327}\) Similar concerns have been raised by the EU. Thompson describes the elements necessary to achieve this approach to governance. They are some of the same elements that comprise what is referred to as Social Architecture on the Internet, and EU proposals also emphasize these ideas.

The Social Architecture movement overlaps somewhat with what has been touted as “Web 2.0.”\(^{328}\) Common themes include the idea that the Internet embodies some of the best democratic principles: equal representation, equal access, and participation by all members of a

---

323 [http://www.itu.int/wsis/index.html](http://www.itu.int/wsis/index.html)
324 [http://www.wgig.org](http://www.wgig.org)
326 *Id.*
327 *Id.*
community; that recent technological developments can ensure that ideas are expressed without fear of reprisal or censorship; and that tools of internet commerce can be employed in the political arena as well, such as the peer review process that facilitates transactions, on Ebay, for example. There is a widespread understanding of the unique requirement within internet governance that certain democratic exchanges are fundamental to the character of the Internet itself and must also be part of its governance. Principles and tools from social architecture can help to achieve this end. If such elements become part of internet governance, information will be more free than not.

Web 2.0 has influenced the way IT companies view the digital divide. Investor Group Against Digital Divide (IGADD) was founded by Craig Warren Smith as a way to bridge the free-market approach to the digital divide with government calls for subsidies to close the gap. Mr. Smith met with Tim O’Reilly of Web 2.0 as well as industry executives like Bill Gates, and researchers in the U.S. and Indonesia in order to develop a plan to close the digital divide, beginning in Indonesia. The nongovernmental organization solicits the support of academics, investors, corporations and volunteers to provide greater broadband access, and while the organization encourages the democratizing potential of increased internet access, it also hopes to provide the private sector with larger markets. Thus, it remains to be seen whether IT companies, working with nongovernmental organizations, can close the digital divide in a way that encourages a digital democracy.

330 Id.
Where is the Internet Headed?

Of course, one of the hallmarks of the digital era is rapid change, and perhaps the evolution of the web has lead to some solutions: tools that have developed in the last few years point the way to more successful endeavors in digital democracy. Wikis, for example, build communities of regular users over time, lending stability and credence to the interactive features. People build reputations, sustain conversations over time, and collaborate, which leads to accuracy and cumulative knowledge. Furthermore, the nature of the often chaotic, honest, populist experience of interactive internet chat rooms or bulletin boards lends itself not so much to disciplined, tolerant, evolutionary exchange of ideas; on the other hand, they do lend well to activities like motivating gatherings and polling opinions. Weblogs and social software are making it easier than ever for people to connect and organize themselves without the blessing of some centralized authority figure. However, thus far, digital democracy is much like non-digital democracy: a world full of contrary views that are expressed in noisy, divergent ways, where it is difficult to make important decisions in a timely manner. Moreover the advent of the internet


332 Here is some recent data on the “blogosphere” – over 35.3 million personal web logs (blogs) are currently tracked & monitored by an organization called Technorati:

- The blogosphere is doubling in size every 6 months
- It is now over 60 times bigger than it was 3 years ago
- On average, a new weblog is created every second of every day
- 19.4 million bloggers (55%) are still posting 3 months after their blogs are created
- Technorati tracks about 1.2 Million new blog posts each day, about 50,000 per hour
creates new problems beyond the issue of governance, such as the structures of e-commerce, crime, and networking site fatigue. Twitter and Tweets?

Digitalization and the Environment

Among the many problems associated with the rapid and widespread ascent of digitalization in our era, the issue of environmental damage is profound. A recent article entitled “Where Computers Go to Die -- and Kill” by Elizabeth Grossman provides a detailed accounting of the complex and urgent issues attached to the information revolution and discarded hardware. In short, “more than 50 percent of our recycled computers are shipped overseas, where their toxic components are polluting poor communities. Meanwhile, U.S. laws are messy, and industry and Congress are resisting efforts to stem ‘the effluent of the affluent.’” Grossman describes the intricacies and impacts of what one interviewee called the “persistent failure by the U.S. federal government to stop the dumping of millions of used computers, TVs, cellphones and other electronics in the world's developing regions, including those in China, India, Malaysia, the Philippines, Vietnam, Eastern Europe and Africa.”


338 Id.

339 Id. This article is must-reading for anyone seeking to understand the nexus between technology, globalization, market-forces, international politics (treaties, etc), and the environment. See also Nancy Weil, E-Waste Dumping Victimizes Developing Nation, Study Says, PCWORLD.COM (Oct. 31, 2005), available at http://www.pcreview.com/article/123285/ewaste_dumping_victimizes_developing_nations_study_says.html.
Significant complaints aside, the Internet most assuredly can help in the move towards a more environmentally sustainable world. It can improve our capability to understand the science of environmental degradation and communicate that knowledge to public and private decision makers. The Internet can also improve environmental policy by increasing international equity and participation in the policy development processes. Finally, it can help decrease resource waste and associated pollution by improving the efficiency of economic activity. The exploitation of these fundamental opportunities is not predestined, however, and will require an ongoing elaboration of the Internet's role in global environmental sustainability.340

[Over a billion computers are now in use worldwide -- over 200 million in the United States, which has the world's highest per capita concentration of PCs. The average life span of an American computer is about three to five years, and some 30 million become obsolete here each year. According to the International Association of Electronics Recyclers, approximately 3 billion pieces of consumer electronics will be scrapped by 2010. Overall, high-tech electronics are the fastest-growing part of the municipal waste stream both in the U.S. and Europe.

The EPA estimates that only about 10 percent of all obsolete consumer electronics are recycled. The rest are stored somewhere, passed on to second users, or simply tossed in the trash. The EPA's most recent estimate is that over 2 million tons of e-waste end up in U.S. landfills each year. As Jim Fisher of Salon reported in 2000, a toxic stew from discarded computers leaches into groundwater surrounding landfills.

The U.S. may be one of the world's biggest consumers of high-tech electronics, but unlike the European Union or Japan, the U.S. has no national system for handling e-waste. Unless a state or local government prohibits it, it's currently legal to dump up to 220 pounds a month of e-waste, including CRTs and circuit boards, into local landfills. Several dozen states have introduced e-waste bills, and a handful of U.S. states -- California, Maine, Maryland, Massachusetts, Minnesota, Washington -- have recently passed substantive e-waste bills, some of which bar CRTs from their landfills. E-waste bills have also been introduced in the House and Senate, but neither would create a national collection system.

The export of e-waste has been discussed in Congress but no legislation to regulate this trade has yet been introduced.] Id.

See also Guan Hua Xing, et. al., Environmental Impact and Human Exposure to PCBs in Guiyu, an Electronic waste Recycling Site in China, 35 ENVTL. INT’L. 76 (2009)

340 Grossman, supra note 337. See also DEANNA J. RICHARDS, ET AL., INFORMATION SYSTEMS AND THE ENVIRONMENT (2001). We have yet to consider the Internet’s increasing thirst for electricity and that demand’s compounded effects on the environment.
Conclusion

What are the humanitarian costs of the global evolution into a worldwide information economy? Just as “environmentalism was a belated response to the industrial revolution, the Yale Access to Knowledge (A2K) Initiative aims to build an intellectual framework that will protect access to knowledge both as the basis for sustainable human development and to safeguard human rights.”

Here is how they frame the debate.

Multinational corporations, elite policymakers, and other proponents of expansive intellectual property regimes argue that increasing intellectual property rights and corporate control over knowledge best serve society’s interests. Yet ample evidence suggests that the reverse is true: increasingly, widespread access to knowledge and preservation of a healthy knowledge commons are the real basis of sustainable human development. Despite a growing body of evidence suggesting that maximizing intellectual property monopolies, disabling communication infrastructures, and restricting the development of essential technology with digital rights management schemes are harmful and misguided, these outmoded approaches continue to dictate global legal norms and shape national legal infrastructures. Not surprisingly, incumbent property owners desire to maintain their preeminence and resist sharing the intellectual property which they view as the source of their power. The goal of the A2K Initiative is to counterbalance the distorting force of these tendencies by supporting the adoption and development of effective access to knowledge policies.

The Impact of Digital Technology on Indigenous Peoples

If indigenously founded Internet resources and technologies are any indication of Indigenous peoples’ willingness to embrace the technological era, the answer is that many Indigenous communities see telecommunication and computer technologies as a way to improve, rather than hinder, self-sufficiency, preservation of culture, real sovereignty, and general

---

342 Id.
economic conditions. As noted in one 1999 Benton Foundation study, “[a]mong the tools recognized by tribes as essential to their future growth are telecommunications and information technology, and tribes are looking for opportunities to acquire the level of technological infrastructure that will ensure their place on the Information Superhighway.”

Currently, Indigenous peoples are utilizing tools such as video conferencing technology, digitization of documents, and radio broadcast over the Internet. The majority of these technologies are used to preserve and promote Indigenous culture, tradition, history, and human rights advocacy. Further, “[t]he Internet is used by [I]ndigenous groups for e-mailing, chat rooms, radio stations, video-conferencing, and simple information-gathering by looking at Web sites.” Today, there are multiple organizations dedicated to the utilization of technology in Indigenous communities, such as educational programs promoting and addressing the technology needs of Indigenous peoples.

World Summit on the Information Society

In December of 2003, more than 11,000 people from over 175 Native Nations assembled in Geneva, Switzerland to discuss “bridging the divide” between developed and developing nations. The United Nations and the International Telecommunication Union assembled the World Summit on the Information Society (WSIS) with Indigenous people’s particular needs in mind – seeking to gain equitable access to technologies while retaining “rights, cultural

345 Id. See Christine Zuni Cruz, Shadow War Scholarship, Indigenous Legal Tradition, and Modern Law in Indian Country, 47 WASHBURN LAW JOURNAL 631 (2008).
346 Id.
347 Id.
identities, traditional territories, [and] resources.”349 Indigenous peoples themselves, it was articulated, are best at deciding how and when they access and use new technologies.350

In March of 2004, the Aboriginal Canada Portal and Connectivity Working Group hosted another conference in Canada, where Indigenous peoples from around the world discussed and shared work they were already doing to make themselves a part of the information society. This included “online applications for improving public health and governance, the role of new technology in Indigenous media and the arts, and the influence the digital revolution has on culture, gender, and the U.N. Millennium Development Goals.”351

Finally, in November of 2005, the Phase II of the WSIS was held in Tunis, Tunisia. The purpose of the event was to continue the dialogue initiated in Phase I of the WSIS, and to “review actions to date in relation to international Indigenous connectivity, to share regional experiences regarding the same, including best practices and challenges, to explore the viability of, and issues regarding, an International Indigenous Portal, and to allow participants the opportunity to craft an International Indigenous e-strategy in the post-WSIS environment . . .”352

Phase II of the WSIS concluded by issuing six recommendations: 1) An Indigenous-led initiative; 2) analysis of existing sites and portals;353 3) thematic focus of an international Indigenous portal; 4) information and communications (ICT) development and broader

349 Id.
350 Id. “Some American Indian tribes, for example, refuse to put information about their cultures online because they believe that traditional knowledge should be passed on in specific ways to specific peoples . . .” Id. at 14.
351 Id.
353 A “portal” is defined as “a web presence or other services that promote universal connectivity and offer a broad array of information and resources.” Id. at 2.
development issues; 5) cooperation between Indigenous portal initiatives; 6) international
Indigenous portal architecture and content.354

Indigenous Cultures and the Internet

The current era has been termed the “age of information,” and this term generally carries
a positive connotation. In Native societies, however, a dichotomy exists between those who
embrace the Internet as a tool to protect, maintain, and promote cultural diversity, and those who
believe that the Internet serves only to endorse capitalist ideals and sanction products of the
modern industrial society.355 This dichotomy provokes the question, is the Internet friend or foe
of Indigenous peoples?

Dr. Sharon Bohn Gmelch and Reuel Daniels356 argue that “the Internet provides
Indigenous peoples with opportunities that simply did not exist before,” which empowers Native
communities to compete economically on the global level, but on their own terms.357 First,
Gmelch and Daniels argue that the Internet provides opportunities for Indigenous economic
development by creating a global market for businesses and products; making possible the
participation of Indigenous communities in the global economy – on their own terms; and
enhancing long-term economic viability. PEOPLink serves as an ideal illustration.358 Working
through local nonprofit organizations, PEOPLink provides “over 100,000 [I]ndigenous artisans
in 20 countries with Internet training and web space,” allowing people in remote villages

354 Id. at 3-4.
355 See EarthWatch Institute, Diversity in the Age of Globalization,
http://www.wadsworth.com/anthropology_d/special_features/ext/earthwatch/rt.html [hereinafter EarthWatch] (last
visited May 11, 2009).
356 “Dr. Sharon Bohn Gmelch is a former Earthwatch scientist and professor of anthropology at Union
College. She has conducted cultural research in Ireland, Newfoundland, Barbados, and Alaska . . . Reuel Daniels,
an anthropology major at Union College, wrote her senior thesis on the impact of the Internet on [I]ndigenous
peoples.” Id.
357 Id.
May 12, 2009).
spanning the globe to trade and sell their crafts internationally. Likewise, “[s]earch engines like www.lycos.com permit people living in urban centers from Germany to Japan to learn of village-run rainforest lodges and native-led botanical tours.” Second, the Internet promotes Indigenous self-determination and cultural diversity by contributing to the sense of organization and autonomous self-governance, even to those communities within repressive regimes, often through online bulletin boards, mass e-mailings, and general websites. The Internet allows these communities “to share strategies, and mobilizes a world community of advocates and activists, who[se] exert political and economic pressure and lend other aid.” Finally, websites and other web-based media create spaces where Indigenous peoples’ art, language, culture, histories, and traditions can be shared, learned, promoted, and distributed. “No longer does such knowledge reside only in the minds of elders or in dusty tomes in distant libraries.”

Similarly, Dr. John Afele argues that Native peoples “should aim to digitize the oral cultures of [I]ndigenous groups, who are the majority after all, and identify complementary knowledge from global resources.” Assuming that Indigenous peoples can actively assert dominance over the reflection of their own knowledge, in a primarily western-dominated medium, Dr. Afele asserts that “there is ample room for all cultures to be represented on the Internet.” Realizing the untapped potential that these areas present, technology-based corporations are increasingly expanding into Indigenous communities. Accordingly, “there are

---


360 EarthWatch, supra note 355.

361 Id.

362 Id.

363 Id.

364 “Dr. John Afele, originally from Ghana, is director of the International Program for Africa at the University of Guelph, Ontario . . . and director of Village Telecom in Ghana.” Id.

365 Id.

366 Id.
no longer technological barriers to deployment of information technology anywhere in the world today; it is political will and imagination of institutions that will determine how much a culture benefits from the Internet.”367 Dr. Afele argues that it is up to Indigenous peoples themselves to assert dominance in this area, and realize the exceptional ways in which this media can be tailored to local situations.

Robyn Kamira,368 on the other hand, argues that the Internet serves only to reinforce negative stereotypes that have plagued Indigenous communities since their first encounters with what has now become the dominant voice in society.369 According to Kamira, “[g]overnment databases collect abundant data about [Indigenous peoples] with no predetermined purpose, and publish it with little regard for context or benefit to [those people]. Instead, [Indigenous peoples] are subjected to research findings from these databanks that continue to reinforce the most negative stereotypes.”370 As such, because colonizers are the ones with the resources to be in control of this information, the Internet, for the most part, is only a modern tool for further colonization. And, there is always the risk that others, who have no stake in Indigenous peoples integrity or survival, will circulate stories, histories, cultures, and traditions devoid of respect for the principles underlying the veracity of those principles. Although there may be reason to believe otherwise, history has shown that the stories of “[I]ndigenous peoples worldwide . . . have been told and manipulated by others, only to be reduced to fantasy, novelty, myth, and untruth. [Indigenous] knowledge was validated, discarded, or modified to suit a strategy of colonization, conquering both geography and knowledge systems.”371

367 Id.
368 See id.
369 Id.
370 Id.
371 Id.
Which view is correct? Assuming that the Internet does present a threat to the value of Indigenous peoples’ culture and tradition, is there a way to prevent the devaluation indicated by Kamira? Or, does the benefit conferred to Indigenous communities, as indicated by Gmelch, Daniels, and Alefe, outweigh the harm that the dispersion of sensitive information may cause? Are the values even commensurable? If they are, what values should be assigned where? Indigenous communities vary vastly around the world, culturally, physically, religiously, linguistically, and economically. Is there one resolution to this quandary? Can there be? Shouldn’t it be left up to Indigenous communities, themselves, to decide whether to become caught up in this “age of information”?

*Websites for Indigenous Cultures and the Internet*

What follows is a general review of internet electronic media tools contemporarily used.

1) **American Indian Resources**: [http://www.sdhistory.org/arc/arc_ind.htm](http://www.sdhistory.org/arc/arc_ind.htm). A general list of resources from the South Dakota State Archives.

2) **The Aniu Museum**: [http://www.ainu-museum.or.jp/english/english.html](http://www.ainu-museum.or.jp/english/english.html). This website features background about Japan’s indigenous Aniu population. Illustrated essays discuss traditional diet, maintenance of sustenance, agriculture, clothing, housing, religion, marriage, and family life.

3) **Aniu of Japan**: [http://ankn.uaf.edu/IEW/ainu.html](http://ankn.uaf.edu/IEW/ainu.html). A small collection of annotated links to resources about the Aniu culture. Part of a series on world indigenous cultures from the Alaska Native Knowledge Network, University of Alaska Fairbanks.

4) **Aniu: A Spirit of Northern People**: [http://www.mnh.si.edu/artic/features/ainu](http://www.mnh.si.edu/artic/features/ainu). A website featuring images, text, and audio covering topics such as spiritual traditions, trade, homes, arts, language, and other aspects of Ainu culture.


8) First Nations Development Institute: [http://www.firstnations.org](http://www.firstnations.org). “Founded in 1980, First Nations Development Institute is a national American Indian-led 501(c)(3) non-profit organization. Through a three-pronged strategy of educating grassroots practitioners, advocating systemic change, and capitalizing Indian communities, First Nations Development Institute is working to restore Native control and culturally-compatible stewardship of the assets they own – be they land, human potential, cultural heritage, or natural resources – and to establish new assets for ensuring the long-term vitality of Native communities.”


10) Indigenous Australia: [http://www.dreamtime.net.au](http://www.dreamtime.net.au). This site includes links to information regarding storytelling, cultures, and histories of Australian indigenous peoples. Features timelines, audio, and video about cultural heritage, spirituality, family, land, and social justice.

A library of over 500 documents relating to indigenous peoples throughout the world, including Native American tribes, the Maori, Australian Aborigines, the Sami, and others.

12) **Indigenous Peoples Issues and Resources**: [http://indigenouspeoplesissues.com](http://indigenouspeoplesissues.com). Links to “information, news, articles, and resources for those concerned about, and for, indigenous peoples around the world.”

13) **Indigenous Peoples Ligature**: [http://www.indigenouspeople.net/ipl_final.html](http://www.indigenouspeople.net/ipl_final.html). An archive of cultural material by the indigenous peoples of the world, ranging from literature and music to prayers and history. Contains a listing of tribes, chiefs, and the complete texts of key documents, such as tribal constitutions.

14) **International Indian Treaty Council (IITC)**: [http://www.treatycouncil.org](http://www.treatycouncil.org). A site featuring news, action alerts, treaties and related documents, and materials such as prisoners, racism, and human rights. The organization is dedicated to promoting indigenous “sovereignty and self-determination . . . and the recognition and protection of indigenous rights, treaties, traditional cultures, and sacred lands.”

15) **Iowa State University – American Indian Resources on the Web**: [http://www.lib.iastate.edu/collections/eresourc/ai.html](http://www.lib.iastate.edu/collections/eresourc/ai.html). Links to indexes and abstracts, general resources, and electronic journals.

16) **Island of the Spirits**: [http://www.pbs.org/wgbh/nova/hokkaido](http://www.pbs.org/wgbh/nova/hokkaido). Website of the 1999 PBS Nova documentary on the Aniu indigenous peoples of Japan. Features cover the origins of the Ainu, Aniu legends and beliefs (about animals such as the crane, the bear, and the flying squirrel), and animal migration.
17) **Minneapolis American Indian Resource Center’s Resource and Referral Center:**

[http://www.airr.net/non/default.asp](http://www.airr.net/non/default.asp). A website designed to help Native people and social service workers find Native cultural and social services. “The system currently lists over 230 organizations designed to assist Native people and the list continues to be updated and expanded.”

18) **National NAIDOC:** [http://www.naidoc.org.au](http://www.naidoc.org.au). General information on the National Aborigines and Islanders Day. The holiday is actually held throughout Australia during the first full week of July to “celebrate the history, culture, and achievements of Aboriginal and Torres Straight Islander People.”

19) **Native American Resources:** [http://www.cowboy.net/native](http://www.cowboy.net/native). A list of internet resources available. Includes links to locally hosted URLs, Native American organizations, tribal homepages, Indian education and learning resources, government resources, and native art and culture.

20) **Native Maps:** [http://www.kstrom.net/isk/maps/mapmenu.html](http://www.kstrom.net/isk/maps/mapmenu.html). GIS maps that "window" Native information about Pre-contact Native North America. Active State maps for reservations in MN, WI, MI, CA, AK, ND, SD, NY, AZ (linked-to AZ is historical background of Navajo-Hopi Black Mountain land dispute and page of links on this dispute), NM, WA, OR; Canada treaty maps; Canadian Bands-by-provinces, contact info; Material culture maps; Pre-contact housing information.

21) **Native Web:** [http://www.nativeweb.org](http://www.nativeweb.org). “Information from and about indigenous nations, peoples, and organizations around the world.” Includes an annotated directory of related websites, job listings, and a discussion forum.
22) **Northwest Regional Educational Laboratory: Indian Education Resources:**


23) **Oklahoma Department of Libraries: American Indian Resources:**


24) **Oregon State University, American Indian Initiatives:**

   [http://oregonstate.edu/dept/indian/indian_resources.html](http://oregonstate.edu/dept/indian/indian_resources.html). Links to American Indian information, American Indian organizations, and news and events throughout Indian Country.

25) **Traditional Knowledge Digital Library**

   [http://www.tkdl.res.in](http://www.tkdl.res.in). Thousands of years’ worth of traditional Indian remedies, medicines, cures, and practices have been put on the public domain and, it is hoped, out of the reach of western biotech companies.

26) **Virtual Library – American Indians:** [http://www.hanksville.org/Naresources](http://www.hanksville.org/Naresources). Website providing “information resources to the Native American community . . . The information is organized, insofar as possible, to make it useful to the Native American community and the education community.”

28) The World Wide Web Virtual Library: Indigenous Studies:

http://cwis.org/wwwvl/indig-vl.html. A virtual library site directing visitors to sites about native peoples of Africa, Asia, the Middle East, Central and South America, Europe, North America, Melanesia, Polynesia, and Micronesia.

29) University of Arizona, James E. Rogers College of Law: ArizonaNativeNet:

http://www.arizonanativenet.com/. ArizonaNativeNet is a virtual university outreach and distance learning telecommunications center devoted to the higher educational needs of Native Nations in Arizona, the United States and the world through the utilization of the worldwide web and knowledge-based and technical resources and expertise. It is a vital resource for Native Nations seeking to strengthen their nation-building efforts through telecommunications-based higher education, leadership and management training, and distance learning programs.

30) University of New Mexico School of Law: Indian Law Resources:

http://lawschool.unm.edu/indian/resources. “This resources page provides links to many established Indian law organizations and institutions, as well as links to various on-line Indian law research materials.”

31) University of Wisconsin American Indian Resources on the Web:


32) The U.S. Gen Web Project: Native American Resources:

http://www.rootsweb.ancestry.com/~usgwnar. General resource list. Includes mailing lists, general resources, state/county projects, and state resources.
Can you recall the imagery of the earth from the orbiting rockets in the 1960’s—earth as a blue marble—and how supposedly that was going to be such a unifying image that it would give rise to a new conceptual paradigm? And then that never happened. Remember Arthur Jensen’s Corporate Cosmology speech in Paddy Chayefsky’s film, Network?372 (Jensen is the head of a television network and brings Howard Beale, that channel’s anchorman, into his boardroom to speak to him after Beale has said things on the air that threaten the sale of the network to a Saudi company.) Here is Jensen’s speech:

You have meddled with the primal forces of nature, Mr. Beale, and I won’t have it, is that clear?! You think you have merely stopped a business deal -- that is not the case! The Arabs have taken billions of dollars out of this country, and now they must put it back. It is ebb and flow, tidal gravity, it is ecological balance! You are an old man who thinks in terms of nations and peoples! There are no Russians. There are no Arabs! There are no third worlds! There is no West! There is only one holistic system of systems, one vast and immense, interwoven, interacting, multi-variate, multi-national dominion of dollars! Petro-dollars, electro-dollars, multi-dollars!, Reichmarks, rubles, rin, pounds and shekels! It is the international system of currency that determines the totality of life on this planet! That is the natural order of things today! That is the atomic, subatomic and galactic structure of things today! And you have meddled with the primal forces of nature, and you will atone! Am I getting through to you, Mr. Beale? (pause) You get up on your little twenty-one inch screen, and howl about America and democracy. There is no America. There is no democracy. There is only IBM and ITT and AT&T and Dupont, Dow, Union Carbide and Exxon. Those are the nations of the world today. What do you think the Russians talk about in their councils of state -- Karl Marx? They pull out their linear programming charts, statistical decision theories and minimax solutions and compute the price-cost probabilities of their transactions and investments just like we do. We no longer live in a world of nations and ideologies, Mr. Beale. The world is a college of corporations, inexorably determined by the immutable by-laws of business. The world is a business, Mr. Beale! It has been since man crawled out of the slime, and our children, Mr. Beale, will live to see that perfect world in which there is no war and famine, oppression and brutality -- one vast and ecumenical holding company, for whom all men will work to serve a

372 NETWORK (1976).
common profit, in which all men will hold a share of stock, all necessities provided, all anxieties tranquilized, all boredom amused.

In a nutshell, this is the reason that the iconography of the globe, “the blue marble”, doesn’t function as a unifying paradigm: globalization, happening at exactly the same time that the global image arrived, overtakes and subsumes it. Iconography doesn’t exist apart from culture, it arises out of it. Before the “blue marble” could ever become an operable icon, the cultural experience was transformed by international economics. The transnational corporation was a much stronger—which is to say, more fundamental—force than the image produced by the space shots. Sure, it’s pretty, but it doesn’t stand a chance against corporate cosmology.\(^{373}\)

We cannot begin to understand globalization, or the philosophical -isms that have accompanied it, without first understanding the Corporation. The Corporation is both the rudder and the engine of the global economy. It is still true that most business organizations, both in the United States and in other countries, are not corporations but some form of small sole proprietorship or partnership.\(^{374}\) However neither the family farmer, the single motel owner, nor the restaurateur sits at the NAFTA and GATT negotiating tables. More so than any other form of business organization, it is corporations that influence, if not dictate, international trade policy, prices, and labor standards.\(^{375}\) In the United States and Western Europe in particular it is


\(^{374}\) Based on tax filings, as of 2001 there were 18,328,000 sole proprietorships in the U.S., 5,136,000 corporations, and 2,132,000 “unincorporated associations.” U.S. Census Bureau, Statistical Abstract of the United States 483 (2004).

\(^{375}\) For a brief overview of Transnational economic activity in the globalizing economy, and for an encapsulation of the evolution of predominantly nation-based companies into the pattern of multinational corporations we now observe, see Cynthia A. Williams, Corporate Social Responsibility in an Era of Economic Globalization, 35 U.C. Davis L. Rev. 705 (2002) and Linda A. Mabry, Multinational Corporations and U.S. Technology Policy: Rethinking the Concept of Corporate Nationality, 87 Geo. L.J. 563, 568-576 (1999).

Fifty-one of the top 100 economies in the world are corporations; the top 200 corporations’ combined sales are bigger than the combined economies of all countries minus the biggest nine; that is, they surpass the economies of 182 countries. See Sarah Anderson & John Cavanagh, “Top 200: The Rise of Global Corporate Power, Global Policy Forum, www.globalpolicy.org/socecon/tnes/top200.htm. It is estimated that transnational corporations spend well over one-half as much money in advertising as the nations of the world combined spend on public
corporations that pump oil, grow food, and build homes. But while it is the Corporation that feeds us, clothes us, and warms us, it is also the Corporation that bribes governments, promotes fear, spies, operates sweatshops, and pollutes our water and air.

Corporations no longer limit themselves to simply selling things. Achieving success in the global economy now demands that corporations sell ideas and commodify meaning in addition to products, a demand which companies (and consumers) readily comply with. The Nike “swoosh” symbol is now the most popular tattoo in North America; if we buy its product, we are inspired and inspirational. Diesel jeans are a way to live. Benetton is diversity, promising political and cultural tolerance; McDonalds is hip, and drinking Coke is an act of rebellion. Yet, could we argue as well that the only inspiration Nike produces is to encourage exploiting inexpensive overseas labor, or that the only cultural tolerance Benetton produces is a homogenized ideal of style borne out of painstaking cultural appropriation. The corporate search for brand meaning had been incredibly lucrative, but also “an enormously predatory process, and a transformative process in our culture.” It has penetrated into the halls of public education, with corporations providing teachers with free curriculum lauding the coal industry.

education. The structural adjustment programs (SAPs) (these tools to recolonize, promote large scale deregulation, enforce social spending cuts, lower corporate tax rates, expand the export of natural resources and agricultural products, devalue currency and remove restrictions on foreign investment) all inure to the benefit of transnational corporations. The systems of corporate role are global finance, global industrial production, global product distribution, resource control, banking, insurance and education. See Tony Clarke, Mechanisms of Corporate Rule, in THE CASE AGAINST THE GLOBAL ECONOMY AND FOR A TURN TOWARD THE LOCAL (J. Mander & E. Goldsmith, Edu. 1996). See also PANOS MOURDOUKOUTAS, THE GLOBAL CORPORATION: THE DECOLONIZATION OF INTERNATIONAL BUSINESS (1999).

376 In some parts of the world, it is the oil companies that assume the neglected or corrupted responsibilities of government. See Brian Ellsworth, The Oil Company As Social Workers, NY TIMES, March 11, 2004, Sec. W. p.p., 1, 7. Sometimes the outcome of this usurpation can be violent. See “Ken Saro-Wiwa and 8 Ojoni People Executed: Blood on Shell’s Hands,” www.archive.greenpeace.org/comms/ken/murder.html; “Standing Before History: Remembering Ken Saro-Wiwa,” PEN World Voices Festival, www.pen.org/viewmedia.php/prmMID/3240/prmID/1831.


379 Id.
bioengineered foods, and timber logging. When activists have attempted to protest this process, corporations have insisted that their free-speech rights protect their efforts and allow them to engage in a wide range of questionable practices.

Corporations have also done a great deal of good. Millions of lives have been saved by drugs manufactured by pharmaceutical companies. Telecommunications giants have facilitated a revolution in human interaction. Construction firms have built dams, bridges, roads, and canals that have fostered economic development and a higher standard of living for many. But the Corporation needs no further help in spreading the message of its benevolence. Its self-promotion spills out of every newspaper, radio, and television on the planet, twenty-four hours a day, seven days a week. Again, it is not the critics of the Corporation that set trade policy, or tax rates. Therefore, while we should acknowledge the good corporations have done, we should not be shy about confronting their more ignoble attributes. They can fend for themselves.

It is also true that corporations come in all shapes and sizes, and that their behavior runs the gamut from pure profit engines to concerned, ecologically conscious organizations that measure success by factors other than the bottom line. But in analyzing the causes and effects of globalization we reach the unfortunate conclusion that corporate selflessness and the prioritization of social justice and environmental benevolence are exceptions to, rather than the

---

381 See Kasky v. Nike, Inc., 27 Cal. 4th 939, 45 P.3d 243 (Cal.2002). Nike responded to allegations that false statements made by corporate officers regarding the company’s overseas employment practices—specifically worker maltreatment—qualified as protected speech under the 1st amendment and were thus immune from California’s unfair competition and false advertising laws. The United States Supreme Court dismissed its previously-granted Writ of Certiorari as improvidently granted. Nike, Inc. v. Kasky, 123 S.Ct. 2554, 156 L.Ed.2d 580 (2003).
rule of, corporate behavior. Far too often corporations have asserted themselves, and more particularly their bottom lines, at the expense of larger society. This predilection was laid bare by former U.S. Supreme Court Justice Lewis F. Powell, in a memorandum he wrote to the U.S. Chamber of Commerce in 1971. In 6,000 words, Powell stated that the executive officers in charge of the “American System” must combat rising popular demands for change by giving less regard to a corporation’s public and social responsibilities, and more concern to “protecting and preserving the system itself,” a goal accomplished through the aggressive pursuit and consolidation of political power.

When analyzing a phenomenon as variable and controversial as corporate behavior, it is important to qualify our terms, and to think succinctly. With this in mind, it is helpful to discard, or at least to tamper down, the use of Aristotelian universality. We are educated and accustomed to think of the world in terms of absolutes: democracy is good, dictatorship is bad. While handy and easy to employ, such logic all too often blurs necessary and proper distinctions that should be made when discussing any matter, especially one as prone to misunderstanding as the

---

383 In his article, *The Rules of Corporate Behavior*, Jerry Mander dispels the notion that corporations are neutral structures whose harms to people and the environment are caused by the greed and heartlessness of the leaders within the corporation. Instead, corporations are compelled to operate by a set of rules regardless of the personal feelings of those working within the corporation. It is these rules that produce the harmful effects of a corporate-led global economy. The number one rule of the corporation is profit, followed by growth. Other rules shaping corporate actions include competition and aggression, amorality, hierarchy, quantification, linearity, segmentation, dehumanization, exploitation, ephemerality, mobility, opposition to nature and homogenization. Jerry Mander, *The Rules of Corporate Behavior, in The Case Against the Global Economy and for a Turn Toward the Local* (Jerry Mander & Edward Goldsmith, eds., 1996). See also Joel Bakan, *The Corporation: The Pathological Pursuit of Profit and Power* (Free Press, 2004); Lawrence E. Mitchell, *Corporate Irresponsibility: America’s Newest Export* (2001); David A. Westbrook, *Between Citizen and State: An Introduction to the Corporation* (2007); Dirk Matten, et al., *Behind the Mask: Revealing the True Face of Corporate Citizenship*, 45 J. BUS. ETHICS 109 (2003); S. James Anaya, *Indigenous Peoples in International Law* (2004).


385 Id.

Corporation. Our educational and cultural mediums ceaselessly churn out the following syllogism:

Economic growth is good.
Corporations are necessary to promote economic growth.
Therefore corporations are good.

This presumption—more accurately this series of presumptions—forces us to accept a theory of corporate behavior that is absolute and unswerving. It ignores the reality that words stand for ideas, and that the idea of the Corporation is colored with emotional and historical bias. In order to escape from such bias, to be able to approach the subject with an open mind, a first item of business should be to re-order our thinking. We should reject the “dictatorship of the “is,” and embrace the openness of relativity. Reforming society’s presumptions to more closely mirror reality,

Economic growth can be good.
Corporations can be necessary to promote economic growth.
Therefore corporations can be good.

The advantage of such a reordering is that our corporate flaws become more apparent. If economic growth can be good, perhaps it can also be bad. And if the Corporation can be necessary to such growth, and to economic plenty and freedom in general, then it can also serve as a roadblock to such goals. This should be our true starting point—a recognition of how universality colors our subject with prejudice, and a solution to the obfuscation such biases causes. In analyzing where the Corporation fits into globalization, this new perspective more accurately considers what the Corporation means and does.

387 See Margaret M. Bryant, Understanding English, in 18 American Speech 288 (1943).
388 For an analysis of the ramifications of Aristotelian universality and a proposed solution to its problems see Alfred Korzybski, Science and Sanity (New York: Institute of General Semantics 1933).
According to its most exuberant supporters, the Corporation means greatness, liberty, and plenty. “The limited liability corporation is the greatest single discovery of modern times,” proclaimed Nicholas Murray Butler. “Even steam and electricity would be reduced to comparative impotence without it.” The Corporation is hailed for having played a decisive role in the ideological battles of the 20th century, battles won so handily by capitalism and its corporate sibling that some voices were even heard to proclaim that the end of history itself was upon us, an end whose portents were “liberal democracy in the political sphere combined with easy access to VCRs and stereos in the economic.” Central to such contentions is the belief that the Corporation, and the neo-liberal economic policies that have gone hand-in-hand with its current success, are organic, seemingly inevitable outgrowths of human progress and economic evolution. The modern-day Corporation is popularly conceived as having its roots in Roman and medieval corporate bodies, such as towns and universities, as well as in merchant and tradesman guilds. The purpose of such assertions is to provide the Corporation with the popular legitimacy a distinguished historical lineage often confers.

Something that has worked for a long time is good.
The Corporation has worked for centuries.
Therefore the Corporation is good.

Unfortunately for this syllogism, it may contain a flawed reading of history. The Corporation, with all of its current legal characteristics, has not been working unchanged for a

---

391 See JOHN MICKLETHWAIT & ADRIAN WOOLDRIDGE, THE COMPANY: A SHORT HISTORY OF A REVOLUTIONARY IDEA (New York: Modern Library 2003), for a clear example of such ideological commitment. Micklethwait and Woolridge claim that the company is the “basic” unit of modern society. It is significant to note how easily such a universality can percolate through elite consensus: both men are senior editors and writers for The Economist magazine. See also DAVID HARVEY, A BRIEF HISTORY OF NEOLIBERALISM (2007).
392 Id.
long time. The trade guilds and burial societies known to ancient Roman law did not exist under the theory of collective personality that corporations benefit from today.\textsuperscript{393} When the idea of collectivity began to evolve in Medieval corporate bodies such as towns, its purpose was to unify individuals within an existing group, in contrast to the Corporation of today which is a purely fictional entity separate and apart from its constituent members.\textsuperscript{394} Corporate members of these centuries past did not enjoy limited liability—arguably the single greatest factor that has allowed modern corporations to flourish—but were instead subject to joint and several liability.\textsuperscript{395}

When the true progenitors of the modern Corporation emerged in the seventeenth century as the “chartered company,” they acted as accomplices to imperialist conquest. Acting under a charter sanctioned by the Dutch monarch, the Vereenigde Oost-Indische Compagnie (VOC), or Dutch East India Company, defeated Portuguese forces and established itself in the Moluccan Islands in order to profit off the European demand for spices. Investors in the VOC were issued paper certificates as proof of share ownership, were able to trade their shares on the original Amsterdam stock exchange, and were explicitly granted limited liability in the company’s royal charter.\textsuperscript{396} However, the ambitions and influence of the VOC on modern commerce paled in comparison to its more famous imperial rival, the English East India Company.

Labeled by both contemporaries and historians as “the grandest society of merchants in the universe,” the East India Company would come to symbolize the dazzlingly rich potential of the Corporation, as well as new methods of business that could be tragically brutal and

\textsuperscript{393} Corporations, in 3 Dictionary of the Middle Ages 606 (Joseph R. Strayer ed., 1982).
\textsuperscript{394} Gerald E. Frug, The City as a Legal Concept, 93 Harv. L. Rev. 1059, 1089 (1980).
\textsuperscript{395} H. Ke Chin Wang, The Corporate Concept (Or Fiction Theory) In the Year Book Period, 58 Law Q. Rev. 498, 507 (1942).
\textsuperscript{396} For a good overview of the history of the chartered company as a tool and enabler of early European imperialism, see Om Prakash, European Commercial Enterprise in Pre-Colonial India (Cambridge Univ. Press, 1998).
exploitive. On December 31, 1600, the English monarchy granted the company a fifteen-year monopoly over trade to and from the East Indies and Africa. By 1611 shareholders in the East India Company were earning an almost 150 percent return on their investment. Subsequent stock offerings demonstrated just how lucrative the Company had become; its first stock offering in 1613-1616 raised £418,000, and its second offering in 1617-1622 raised £1.6 million. However, as can be seen with modern-day corporations, such tremendous profits came at a terrible environmental, cultural, and human cost. Not surprisingly, it was history’s foremost critic of the capitalist system who cast his scathing eye towards the Company’s practices in India, and sought to publicize their horrific brutality.

The profound hypocrisy and inherent barbarism of bourgeois civilization lies unveiled before our eyes, turning from its home, where it assumes respectable forms, to the colonies, where it goes naked. Did they not, in India...resort to atrocious extortion, when simple corruption could not keep pace with their rapacity? While they prated in Europe about the inviolable sanctity of the national debt, did they not confiscate in India the dividends of the rajahs, who had invested their private savings in the Company's own funds? While they combated the French revolution under the pretext of defending "our holy religion," did they not forbid, at the same time, Christianity to be propagated in India, and did they not, in order to make money out of the pilgrims streaming to the temples of Orissa and Bengal, take up the trade in the murder and prostitution perpetrated in the temple of the Juggernaut? These are the men of Property, Order, Family, and Religion.

It is important to note that the British East India Company did not only attract the ire of revolutionaries and socialists. Adam Smith, the patron saint of laisser-faire capitalism, saw in the Company the most extreme abuses of the corporate form. His main thesis on the subject posited that the Company had failed as an efficient economic producer because 1) it had moved away from its original incarnation as a trading organization, and refocused its activities on the transfer of wealth within India, and 2) Company servants simultaneously began to focus their business

398 Id. at 113.
efforts on this lucrative transfer of wealth, and ignore more traditional commercial activities in favor of what began to resemble outright extortion. ⁴⁰⁰ Some scholars have claimed that Smith’s critique of these practices does not expose his disdain for the joint-stock form, but rather his concern over the negative effects of monopoly as practiced by the era-specific imperial trade organizations. ⁴⁰¹ However, recent events in corporate America may suggest that such exploitive behavior, based on a corporation forfeiting actual trade in favor of wealth transfer, is not a mere historical curiosity. ⁴⁰² But more importantly for Adam Smith, the East India Company did demonstrate inherent flaws in the corporate form. The division between owners and managers in a joint-stock company, and the limited legal liability this division was based on, guaranteed that stockholders would be apathetic about a company’s activities as long as the company continued to be profitable. Just as worrisome, the laws of agency upon which the corporate form was based allowed for boards of directors to be so autonomous from and unconstrained by stockholder wishes that directors became negligent and ultimately self-interested in the management of the corporation. It is worth quoting Smith’s argument at length, in order to get a feel for just what he thought about the Corporation in its eighteenth-century form.

The trade of a joint stock company is always managed by a court of directors. This court, indeed, is frequently subject, in many respects, to the control of a general court of proprietors. But the greater part of those proprietors seldom pretend to understand anything of the business of the company, and when the spirit of faction happens not to prevail among them, give themselves no trouble about it, but receive contentedly such half-yearly or yearly dividend as the directors think proper to make to them. This total exemption from trouble and from risk, beyond a limited sum, encourages many people to become adventurers in joint stock companies, who would, upon no account, hazard their fortunes in any private copartnery…directors of such companies, however, being the

---

⁴⁰¹ Id.
⁴⁰² The fall of the Enron corporation stemmed largely from the company’s attempt to create new energy trading markets, and its strategy of trading paper wealth in order to maintain the appearance of profitability. For a thorough analysis of Enron’s missteps and ultimate destruction, see Kurt Eichenwald, *Conspiracy of Fools* (Broadway Books, 2005).
managers rather of other people's money than of their own, it cannot well be expected that they should watch over it with the same anxious vigilance with which the partners in a private copartnery frequently watch over their own. Like the stewards of a rich man, they are apt to consider attention to small matters as not for their master's honour, and very easily give themselves a dispensation from having it. Negligence and profusion, therefore, must always prevail, more or less, in the management of the affairs of such a company. It is upon this account that joint stock companies for foreign trade have seldom been able to maintain the competition against private adventurers. They have, accordingly, very seldom succeeded without an exclusive privilege, and frequently have not succeeded with one.403

Contemporary economists and historians have placed this criticism in its proper context by noting that Smith’s concerns applied only to joint-stock companies, which were monopoly firms chartered for a specific purpose. They claim that at the time of Smith’s writing such companies did make sense, given the enormous risks of trading with the other side of the world. Furthermore, they state that the more conservative and popular form of doing business, the general partnership, proved inefficient in the newly industrializing world because unlimited liability hampered a partnership’s ability to raise large amounts of capital.404 With such limitations encumbering older forms of business, they argue it was both necessary and proper for the Corporation to emerge as the business form that could most practically and efficiently greet and exploit the revolutionary changes of industrialization and global trade. Such arguments continue to employ universalist presumptions.

Efficiency is good
Corporations are the most efficient method of business organization
Therefore corporations are good

This presumption is loaded with ambiguities. Such supposedly normative values as “efficiency” and “good” are frequently left undefined. All too often their expression adopts the absolute legitimacy of the perfect form, when these values are in fact relative to time and place.

404 Id. at 45.
What is considered “efficient” on Wall Street may be a rapid exploitation of oil resources in the Niger Delta, with profit maximization hinging in part on the conscious ignorance of the effect such exploitation may have on the environment and local Indigenous cultures. For the Ogoni people of the Delta, destruction of their traditional landholdings and cultural milieu is decidedly inefficient for their “good,” which is contingent on their continuation and flourishing as a people. Yet despite their one-sidedness, these propositions (reflecting, at least until lately, western capitalist ideology) have dominated the history of the Corporation for the last 200 years.

By the beginning of the nineteenth century, government policy on both sides of the Atlantic began to change, reflecting the growing popularity of the proposition that corporations were riding the economic wave of the future. In 1819, the U.S. Supreme Court granted corporations a plethora of rights they had not previously recognized or enjoyed. Corporate charters were deemed “inviolable,” and not subject to arbitrary amendment or abolition by state governments. The Corporation as a whole was labeled an “artificial person,” possessing both individuality and immortality.

Near the same time, British legislation was similarly freeing the Corporation from the shackles of historical restrictions. In 1844 Parliament passed the Joint Stock Companies Act, which allowed companies to incorporate without a royal charter or an additional act of Parliament. Ten years later, England enshrined into law the preeminent hallmark of modern corporate law—limited liability. Acting in response to increasing pressure from newly emerging capital interests, Parliament passed the hallmark Limited Liability Act in 1855, which established

---

405 I would also throw the idea that corporations themselves act as nation-states. In Nigeria, where oil production in the Delta regions is far away from the capitol, Lagos, the firm is often looked upon to provide general governmental responsibilities such as health care, clean water, sanitation. IKE OKONTA & ORONTO DOUGLAS, WHERE VULTURES FEAST: SHELL, HUMAN RIGHTS, AND THE OIL IN THE NIGER DELTA (2003).
the principle that any corporation could enjoy limited legal liability on both contract and tort claims simply by registering as a “limited” company with the appropriate government agency.\footnote{Limited Liability Act, 18 & 19 Vict., ch. 133 (1855) (Eng.), cited in Paul G. Mahoney, \textit{Contract or Concession? An Essay on the History of Corporate Law}, 34 Ga. L. Rev. 873, 892 (2000).}

This revolutionary switch from unlimited to limited liability prompted a writer for the English periodical \textit{Economist} to write in 1855 that “never, perhaps, was a change so vehemently and generally demanded, of which the importance was so much overrated.”\footnote{Quoted in Graeme G. Acheson and John D. Turner, \textit{The Impact of Limited Liability on Ownership and Control: Irish Banking, 1877-1914}, School of Management and Economics, Queen’s University of Belfast, available at \url{http://www.ehs.org.uk/ehs/conference2004/assets/AchesonTurnerPaper.pdf}.} The glaring inaccuracy of the second part of this judgment was recognized by the same magazine more than seventy-five years later, when it claimed that, “The economic historian of the future … may be inclined to assign to the nameless inventor of the principle of limited liability, as applied to trading corporations, a place of honour with Watt and Stephenson, and other pioneers of the Industrial Revolution.”\footnote{ECONOMIST, Dec. 18, 1926, at 1053, as quoted in Mahoney, \textit{supra} note 25, at 875.}

By the end of the nineteenth century the forces of limited liability, state and national deregulation, and vastly increasing capital markets had colluded to give birth to the Corporation in its modern-day form: as a legally immortal organization enjoying every-greater state and national deregulation.\footnote{For an excellent graphical depiction of the differences between the “Classic Corporation” (before 1860) and the “Modern Corporation” (after 1900), see Ted Nace, \textit{Gangs of America: The Rise of Corporate Power and the Disabling of Democracy} 71 (San Francisco, Berrett-Koehler Publishers, Inc. 2003).} In the infamous \textit{Santa Clara County v. Southern Pacific Railroad} decision, the then-Chief Justice of the United States Supreme Court declared that corporations were recognized legal persons, protected by the equal protection clause of the fourteenth amendment.\footnote{\textit{Santa Clara County v. Southern Pacific Railroad}, 118 U.S. 394 (1886).} This and latter rulings made clear that corporations were now free and clear of the legal shackles of personal liability and accountability. Beginning with New Jersey and Delaware, U.S. states engaged in a race to the bottom in their attempts to create more and more

\footnotetext[3]{ECONOMIST, Dec. 18, 1926, at 1053, as quoted in Mahoney, \textit{supra} note 25, at 875.}
\footnotetext[4]{For an excellent graphical depiction of the differences between the “Classic Corporation” (before 1860) and the “Modern Corporation” (after 1900), see Ted Nace, \textit{Gangs of America: The Rise of Corporate Power and the Disabling of Democracy} 71 (San Francisco, Berrett-Koehler Publishers, Inc. 2003).}
\footnotetext[5]{\textit{Santa Clara County v. Southern Pacific Railroad}, 118 U.S. 394 (1886).}
liberal and, therefore, more lucrative incorporation regulations. The decline of restrictions on mergers and acquisitions encouraged a wave of corporate consolidation: from 1898 to 1904, 1,800 U.S. corporations were consolidated into 157. The modern corporate era had begun.

**Corporate Criminality**

In his landmark and controversial study of the organization of American society, the sociologist C. Wright Mills cast his analytical gaze on what he labeled “the Corporate Rich,” who caused him to reflect that, “[t]o be truly rich is to possess the means of realizing in big ways one’s little whims and fantasies and sicknesses.” British and American legal reforms of the nineteenth century had allowed the company to evolve into the far more wealthy and powerful Corporation, whose new-found privileges and riches would make the corporate history of the twentieth century a story of both legal prosperity and illegal excess.

In the wake of Enron, WorldCom, and a host of other scandals, the modern-day corporations’ propensity to illegality has been popularly recognized and increasingly condemned. In a recently published and exceptionally detailed study, Lawrence Salinger chronicled in 1000 pages the history, scope, and continuing problem of corporate criminality. Some legal scholars have accounted for this illegality by positing that corporations which adhere to the strict letter of regulatory and statutory law are at a “competitive disadvantage” when compared to the businesses which choose, with varying degrees of frequency, to operate outside

---

414 Id.
of the law.\textsuperscript{418} This remains true despite the plethora of legal recourses that already exists to address corporate malfeasance, including most states’ statutory ability to suspend or repeal corporate charters.\textsuperscript{419} Such preexisting regulatory schemes all too often fail to deter corporate criminality because corporate executives make a rational decision to skirt the law due to a low likelihood of criminal or civil sanction, versus a high potential for increased revenue and/or cost-savings.\textsuperscript{420} One potential solution is the proposed “Corporate Death Penalty Act” (CDPA), which would mandate the involuntary dissolution of any corporate entity that commits three or more illicit acts.\textsuperscript{421} While such measures have been labeled draconian, advocates of this reform claim it is necessary in light of increasing government hostility and/or inability to pursue meaningful prosecution of corporate criminality.\textsuperscript{422} Yet measures that may help deter corporate wrongdoing such as the CDPA could only operate effectively in a climate of transparency and disclosure. Unfortunately, recent geo-political events have allowed corporations to erect ever-higher and more opaque walls around their finances and operations.\textsuperscript{423}

\textsuperscript{418} Mary Kreiner Ramirez, The Science Fiction of Corporate Criminal Liability: Containing the Machine through the Corporate Death Penalty, 47 ARIZ. L. REV. 933, 942 (2005).
\textsuperscript{419} 19 AM. JUR. 2D Corporations §§ 2391-2417 (2004). \textit{See also} Press Release, Humboldt County, CA Passes Measure Limiting Corporate Political Power, \url{http://www.jp.org/press/pr_2006_06_08.shtml}.
\textsuperscript{420} Ramirez, supra note 418, at 962-963.
\textsuperscript{421} Id. at 973. \textit{See also} Special Report, Stand Up To Corporate Power, YES MAGAZINE, Fall 2007.
\textsuperscript{422} The Corporate Crime Reporter’s 2005 report, entitled “Crime without Conviction,” profiles thirty-four cases in which prosecutors have been confronted with evidence of corporate wrongdoing, yet have chosen to enter into either non-prosecution or deferred prosecution agreements with potential criminal companies. \textit{See Corporate Crime Reporter}, Crime Without Conviction: The Rise of Deferred and Non Prosecution Agreements, Dec. 28, 2005, \url{http://www.corporatecrimereporter.com/deferredreport.htm}.
\textsuperscript{423} The non-profit group Common Cause issued a report in 2003 detailing how dozens of companies successfully lobbied Congress to insert provisions in the Homeland Security Act that deny the public information about health, safety, and environmental problems that may occur at any corporate facilities labeled “critical infrastructure” sites. \textit{See Common Cause}, Agenda For Secrecy, Mar. 14, 2003, \url{http://foi.missouri.edu/terrorismfoi/agendaforsecrecy.pdf}.
“Free” Trade

One of the infamous Millian “fantasies” realized by the corporate elite in the last decades has been the phenomenon of international free trade. As originally conceived by Adam Smith and David Ricardo, free trade was envisioned as the primary economic method of ensuring widespread global prosperity. Smith believed that tariffs and quotas on goods acted as an impediment to world trade, while Ricardo argued that if countries were allowed to engage in unfettered trade in those goods they most excelled at producing, all trading partners would benefit in the end.

After World War II, the economic philosophies of Smith and Ricardo were advanced by the victorious Allied powers as a means of creating “a dynamic world economy in which the peoples of every nation will be able to realize their potentialities in peace, and enjoy increasingly the fruits of material progress on an earth infinitely blessed with natural riches.” To this end the Bretton Woods conference of 1944 created the World Bank, the International Monetary Fund (IMF), and the General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade (GATT) as institutional means of advancing “economic globalization”—erasing economic borders to allow free flow of goods and money. However, operating under the rubric of “neoliberalism,” these policies and institutions have been criticized as masking exploitive practices of richer nations at the expense of the poorer.

---

427 Id.
Promoted as “the mechanism to allow global trading that would see all nations prospering and developing fairly and equitably,” neo-liberalism has often epitomized the growth of corporate power and excess.\textsuperscript{428} This has largely been due to the neoliberal preference for privatization, deregulation, and floating interest rates at the expense of social spending and government oversight. These policies, pushed by IMF and World Bank lending practices as the “Washington Consensus,” have often served the bottom line of trans-national corporations far more than the interests of individual and communities.\textsuperscript{429} In his widely publicized—and occasionally demonized—critiques of the Washington Consensus, Joseph Stiglitz, Chief Economist and Senior Vice-President of the World Bank from 1997-2000, has stated that,

> The (Washington) consensus policies often assumed the worst about the nature and capability of governments and made that one size fit all. That resulted in a strong bias against basing policy advice on an analysis of what [economic] interventions are appropriate in what contexts or to build the institutions or capacity of states to intervene effectively.\textsuperscript{430}

In this brief overview, Stiglitz demonstrates how a political assumption—that governments are generally poor at running their own economies—leads to political decisions to encourage public ownership societies to privatize and deregulate, which often precipitate economic crises, such as the 1994 Mexican crash\textsuperscript{431} and the 2001 Argentine crash.\textsuperscript{432}

\textsuperscript{428} For an excellent, highly detailed source that addresses neoliberalism among other contemporary issues, see http://www.globalissues.org/. See also Kenneth F. Scheve and Matthew F. Slaughter, \emph{A New Deal for Globalization}, Foreign Affairs 34, July/August 2007.

\textsuperscript{429} For an overview on the practices of trans-national corporations, and the social, environmental, and economic disturbances they often cause, see http://www.corpwatch.org.


\textsuperscript{432} Greg Palast uses internally generated IMF and World Bank documents to demonstrate how the policies of these institutions inexorably led to 2001 crash. The neoliberal program enacted in Argentine consisted of four main steps: 1) Capital-market liberalization, 2) privatization, 3) market-based pricing, and 4) free trade. By the end of 2001, when all of these steps had been implemented, the Argentine middle class was joining the poor in rooting through the garbage for food. See Greg Palast, \emph{The Road to Ruin: The World Bank/IMF Takeover in Four Easy Steps}, HARPER'S MAG., Mar. 2003, at 48-51.
These historical examples reinforce one of Stiglitz’s prime hypotheses: there is no theoretical or historical proof that applying neoliberal policies of economic globalization will lead to efficient outcomes. This conclusion has been echoed by other leading economic thinkers such as Richard Freeman, who has consistently argued that there is no empirical evidence that proves trade liberalization causes economic growth. These observations have been embraced in both the developing world, which has experienced first-hand the negative impact of neoliberal policies, and the developed western nations. France’s rejection of the European Union’s draft Constitution was interpreted as a sign that much of Europe was hesitant to adopt globalization as a blueprint for the future. As one analyst wrote,

Whether in the form of populist rhetoric, anti-globalization street protests, or the destruction of genetically modified corn fields, this activity gives the impression of a continent determined to resist the integration of global markets and cultures.

Other critics on the European left have offered more strident observations. In 2004 the European United Left Group issued a “Collective Understanding of Globalization” that described an alternative view of globalization as experienced by both European and African peoples. This “understanding” castigated globalization as a process almost wholly driven by the demands of corporate capital, and one that is “inherently unequal and produces unequal benefits.”

---

433 Stiglitz, supra note 430, at 4.
Additional criticism has been levied against globalization over how the policies of international organizations can clash with international human rights. The UN High Commissioner for Human Rights has gone on record stating that WTO rules conflict with international human rights treaty provisions regarding individual and community rights to clean food, water, health, and self-determination. Indeed, the UN’s concern over the issue led it to implement a “Global Compact” program in 1999, in an attempt to encourage transnational corporations to voluntarily embrace human rights, fair labor standards, clean environmental policy, and anti-corruption practices.

Despite the increased frequency and credibility of voices criticizing neoliberalism, the push toward globalization has continued on with a great deal of forward momentum. This often-myopic drive has been inspired and directed by multi-national corporations, whose agenda has centered less around tariff reduction and more on the imposition of “a complex set of non-trade rules covering investment, property rights, and domestic sovereignty that will profoundly limit the policy choices of those countries where the factories are built, the capital invested.” The highly lauded and intensely vilified North American Free Trade Agreement (NAFTA) contains provisions that, under the label of “free trade,” operate to threaten the sovereignty of signatory nations at the expense of foreign investors. The “proportional sharing” provision contained in chapter six of the agreement grants signatory nations the right to share in other country’s natural

---

439 See http://www.unglobalcompact.org/. See also S. James Anaya, supra note 120.
resources in perpetuity. This allows, for example, foreign water corporations to exploit Canada’s abundant freshwater supplies regardless of domestic Canadian concerns for conservation.\footnote{NAFTA at Ten Series, \textit{Undermining Sovereignty and Democracy: The Ten Year Track Record of the North American Free Trade Agreement}, PUB. CITIZEN, Jan. 2004, at 4.} Although the Mexican government did not agree to these provisions in regard to its domestic oil production, Article 27 of the Mexican Constitution was amended to allow foreign energy companies unprecedented access to crucial subsidiary industries, such as contract labor and pipeline construction and support.\footnote{\textit{Id.}}

The story of NAFTA is but one example of how the corporate backers of globalization have promoted the erosion of national sovereignty at the expense of multinational corporate power. In his excellent study of globalization and the current scope of corporate power, David Korten demonstrates how international financiers generally see the power of the Corporation as properly supplanting many of the roles formerly played by national and local governments.\footnote{DAVID KORTEN, \textit{WHEN CORPORATIONS RULE THE WORLD} 127 (1995).} He cites the comments of Kenichi Ohmae, managing director of the consulting firm McKinsey & Company Japan, in order to demonstrate the extent of the new multinational corporate elites’ hunger for more prestige and power.

Multinational companies are truly the servants of demanding consumers around the world…When governments are slow to grasp the fact that their role has changed from protecting their natural resource base from outside economic threats to ensuring that their people have the widest range of choice among the best and cheapest goods and services from around the world—when, that is, governments still think and act like the saber-rattling mercantilist ruling powers of centuries past—they discourage investment and impoverish their people. Worse, they commit their people to isolation from an emerging world economy, which, in turn effectively dooms them to a downward spiral of frustrated hopes and industrial stagnation.\footnote{\textit{Id.} at 129-130.}
Yet when governments follow Ohmae’s prescription, and abdicate their responsibilities to protect and defend their citizens in favor of economic development, the results have often been far from impressive. In the eighties and nineties, the government of Mexico aggressively courted multinational corporations in an effort to encourage them to build manufacturing facilities for exporting goods. These facilities, popularly known as *Maquiladoras*, were successful at improving the profit margin of their corporate parents, but largely unsuccessful at providing a better life for their underpaid employees. This failure of globalization to raise the standard of living for its most directly affected participants has been attributed to the Mexican government’s refusal to promulgate legal and educational reforms to accompany the changing economy and better prepare its citizens for its new economic and political realities.

The problems created by *Maquiladoras* are but one example of globalization’s impact on national politics. In her study of corporate social responsibility, law professor Cynthia Williams describes how globalization “undermines the practical ability of nation-states to regulate the totality of activities of transnational companies in a dispassionate, objective fashion.” This occurs both through corporations’ abilities to “shop around” to different countries in an effort to do business in whatever nation has the most favorable and least restrictive regulatory structure, and because corporations are increasingly able to influence what laws governments pass and enforce in the first place. Williams shows how this is especially true in the areas of environmental and labor regulation (or deregulation as the case may be), when countries that

---


449 Id.
contemplate strict standards and controls may suffer from this decision by missing out on a corporate presence that will seek a more libertarian environment in which to do business.  

A darker picture of multinational corporations’ intent to interfere with the sovereignty and democratic operation of national governments was lately painted by former economist John Perkins. Perkins writes about his work for MAIN, a pseudonym for a large U.S. energy and consulting corporation that pursued investment projects around the globe. He describes how, during his first days in training, he was told by a superior that

[t]here were two primary objectives of my work. First, I was to justify huge international loans that would funnel money back to MAIN and other U.S. companies (such as Bechtel, Halliburton, Stone & Webster, and Brown & Root) through massive engineering and construction projects. Second, I would work to bankrupt the countries that received these loans (after they had paid MAIN and the other U.S. contractors, of course) so that they would be forever beholden to their creditors, and so they would present easy targets when we needed favors, including military bases, UN votes, or access to oil and other natural resources. It was these nefarious motivations that caused Perkins to label himself and others engaged in similar schemes as “EHMs:” economic hit men.

Beyond the Balance Sheet

Perkins’ experiences make clear that there is as aspect to Corporationism that has been historically ignored, or even perceived as unmentionable. Corporations unquestionably pursue their business models with an eye toward increasing the bottom line. But somewhere along the path to profit corporate behavior ceases to be strictly economic, and begins to encroach on other more sociological, and even metaphysical spheres of human interaction.

---

450 Id. at 727-735.
452 Id. at 15.
453 Perkins continues on to chronicle what happened to elected officials who refused to acquiesce to such corporate pressure—Perkins claims that Ecuadorian President Jaime Roldós and Panamanian President Omar Torrijos were both assassinated for refusing to allow multinational corporations to profit at the expense of their nations’ sovereignty.
In his unpublished philosophical discourse on globalization, Ron Gard makes an excellent study of the numerous aspects of “material cultural spaces” that corporations occupy, thereby affecting individuals’ lives in ways that transcend traditional economic theory.\textsuperscript{454} He cites Althusser and Marx for the proposition that accurate conceptions of economic production cannot be separated from the social relationships that underlie all human actions.\textsuperscript{455} While laws and regulations lead to relative systemic stability at any one point, significant shifts in patterns of accumulation (such as the agricultural revolution, the industrial revolution, and globalization) radically alter both cultural and individual identity.\textsuperscript{456} While such a conclusion may be facially obvious, Gard is careful to demonstrate how important it is to recognize that economic organization in general, and the Corporation in particular, affect not just the “superstructure” of society, but can and have fundamentally altered individual identities and even bodies. Gard recognizes this as, “[t]he near constitutive role corporations have come to play in the formulation of individual identity within contemporary hyper-commodified social conditions.”\textsuperscript{457}

Corporationism’s “near constitutive role” has not only affected the individual and their social space, but has also cast a shadow over society’s communal spaces. Garrett Hardin’s seminal 1968 article, \textit{The Tragedy of the Commons}, examined the impact of individualism and the pursuit of self-interest on natural resources that humanity has long held to be the fair property of all.\textsuperscript{458} In 2004, the Program on Corporations, Law & Democracy\textsuperscript{459} redefined the commons most relevant to today’s world as, “We the People’s promised authority to govern, the power to

\begin{itemize}
\item\textsuperscript{455} Id. at 24.
\item\textsuperscript{456} Id. at 29.
\item\textsuperscript{457} Id. at 68.
\item\textsuperscript{458} Hardin, \textit{supra} note 140.
\item\textsuperscript{459} See \url{http://www.poclad.org/}.
\end{itemize}
make decisions about matters affecting nature and society.”460 Seen in this light, corporations have further revolutionized social space through the “theft of our right to self-governance,” which has and continues to allow the corporate agenda to trump both ecological and sociological concerns.461 Aided by Supreme Court doctrine and the global trade regime inaugurated by Bretton Woods,

[t]he corporation has once again become, as in colonial times, not only a commercial or economic institution but a governing institution. The few who wield the constitutional rights of the giant corporation, along with their complicit public officials, decide policies on investment, production, technology and work; foreign and military policy; policies on energy, agriculture, pharmaceuticals, and the environment, including natural resources like water, minerals and forests; policies on social issues like welfare, health care, transportation, education and more.462

A quick, cursory examination of the track record of modern life is enough to reveal the often-depressing totality of the corporation’s influence over individual space, physical communal space, and humanity’s political and philosophical inheritances. Corpwatch.org’s list of issues involving corporate power is divided into thirty-two entries, which run the gamut from war profiteering to the prison industry to human rights.463 It is not an exaggeration to state that corporations now hold sway over tremendously important matters of life and death. Union Carbide’s employment of untested technologies and unproven designs in their chemical plant in Bhopal, India led to the gassing death of thousands in 1984.464 Unocal’s partnership with the dictatorial State Law and Order Restoration Council of Burma allowed it to profit from the rape,
intimidation, forced relocation, and slave labor of the Burmese people. Numerous grassroots organizations seek to hold corporations responsible for such abuses, and even entire communities try to exert what pressure they can to mitigate and alleviate the more detrimental effects of 21st century corporationism. However, despite the best efforts of the dedicated and well-meaning, one must appreciate the full scope of the problem to be confronted.

The “-ism” of Our Time

This discussion began by presenting a different, non-Aristotelian interpretation of the Corporation, and its history and functioning. Despite what many in the western—and ever-more commonly eastern—world are led to believe, corporationism exists entirely in a relative value matrix. Corporations do good, but they also do bad. Corporations can help people, and can assist millions in making their lives more comfortable, but they can also wreck tremendous destruction upon the earth and all of its inhabitants. While politicians and interest groups struggle to interpret such behavior as proof of the rightness of this or that philosophy, many have failed to recognize a stunningly simple axiom; capitalism, it all of its pain and glory, is and has been for hundreds of years, the dominant ethos of the industrialized world. Accordingly,

[i]t should go without saying that it is capitalism that most defines our national character, not Christianity or the Enlightenment…As Henry Osborne Havemeyer, president of the sugar trust, acknowledged in 1899, ‘Business is not a philanthropy…I do not care two cents for your ethics. I don’t know enough of them to apply them…And as a business proposition it is right to get all out of a business that you possibly can…’ Capitalism has not believed and does not believe in the Authority of Christ’s spiritual vision nor does it feel constrained by

468 William Finnegan, The Economics of Empire, HARPER’S MAG., May 2003, at 41.
Kant’s Enlightenment ethic, which argued that human beings should be treated as ends, not means. It can’t even be said to believe in utilitarianism’s calculating approach to benefit: ‘the greatest good for the greatest number.’ Such a precept causes good capitalists a sort of painful suspicion that they might be distracted from the immediate goal of maximizing profit.469

It is supremely important to remember this history in any discussion of globalization and the corporation. When one looks at the excesses, and when activists lament the destruction of Indigenous land and culture in favor of oil exploration, when protestors rage against free trade policies that destroy subsistence agriculture,470 it is not the corporations, or even corporationism, that is to blame. Such tragedies are, quite simply, the nature of a beast created over two hundred years ago.471 Money, wage work, and private property rights accreted to form the system that is paving over the world. Corporations and globalization are only the latest facets of the self-interested orientation of world affairs. Thus in homage to historical and intellectual honesty, contemporary perception should be reformulated:

Globalization both creates and destroys
Globalization is but the latest manifestation of the Capitalist impulse
Therefore it is Capitalism that both creates and destroys

The refusal to adopt this relativist interpretation has been a barrier to a more nuanced and complete understanding of the current global economic order. Many fear that such truthful interpretation of the capitalist impulse must, by default, lead to the adoption of a creaking and rickety Marxist ideology. But the creation of the aggregate identity of the proletariat still did not relieve society from the burden of money, of production, of those economic activities that have alienated people down through the ages, regardless of the political orientation of their particular national system. Profit maximization, whether measured by market share or the domino effect,

470 See Paul Hawken, Remembering the Battle of Seattle, ODE 58, June 2007.
still reigns supreme. What is missing, and what many resent most about globalization—even if they do not realize it—is the spiritual.

The tyranny and totality of the Corporation is forcing more and more of us to confront the fundamentally uncomfortable question of what it means to be a human being. The triumph of capitalism and the latest “end” of economic history is forcing people to belatedly realize that the systems and philosophies that so many have defended with life and limb may not be worth such unquestioning sacrifices. For as Madison Avenue so ironically reminds us, the worst example of universalist logic is that “money is everything.” Globalization, and the increasingly precarious position of individuals in relation to corporationism, is finally forcing the world to consider seriously the relativist contention that, while money is many things, it is not every thing.472

The New Industrial Revolution

The world abounds with criticism; what it sadly and sorely lacks is solutions. Neither NAFTA, the IMF, nor the World Bank are going to go away any time soon.473 On the contrary, ever-expanding transportation and communications technology will ensure that the world will keep getting smaller, and communities from the smallest village to the largest nation will become increasingly dependant on each other.474 This reality demands that progressive activists and educators seek to modify the “anti-globalization” agenda; for in this day and age being anti-globalization is, like Kurt Vonnegut said about writing anti-war novels, as futile as being anti-

Likewise, the transnational corporations that are the constituency of globalization are not likely to change their monopolist, extractive, profit-driven ways. While proposals such as the Corporate Death Penalty Act, and the activities of groups such as the Program on Corporations, Law & Democracy are intriguing, they will probably remain the fancy of academics and activists, and are unlikely to become economic or political reality. This is not to say that change is not needed; it is, and urgently. Methods of production, distribution, and consumption are in need of a revolutionary overhaul if humanity is to close out the twenty-first century with any degree of prosperity and ecological security. However, in order to succeed the needed revolution cannot call for the overthrown of capitalism, corporationism, or globalization, but must instead remake these institutions so that they become instruments of sustainable plenty.

Architect and industrial designer William McDonough has called for a new industrial revolution, to “crank the wheel of industry in a different direction to produce a world of abundance and good design—a delightful, safe world that our children can play in.” In his seminal work *Cradle to Cradle*, McDonough writes that growth and consumption are not

---

476 Ramirez, *supra* note 74.
problems in and of themselves.\footnote{480} In an ironic interpretation of the infamous Gordon Gekko doctrine,\footnote{481} McDonough describes how human greed for new products, for building and consuming is good—greed works. But it need not take the form of the second industrial revolution, of poorly designed factories that pump toxins into our water and air, or poorly-implemented development programs that further impoverish the communities they intend to enrich. This “cradle to grave” product flow ensures ever-worsening pollution, expenditure of non-renewable resources, and expensive and wasteful regulation of human and industrial systems. McDonough pointedly argues that the \textit{necessity of regulations is a signal of design failure}, and as an alternative he advocates perpetual “reuse:” returning consumer products to the environment as “biological nutrients,” or to industry as “technical nutrients” that can be infinitely recycled.\footnote{482}

On the surface this may appear to be a vain attempt to swim up the stream of the “natural” course of ecological and commercial development. But upon closer examination, cycles of extraction, consumption, and waste represent a decidedly unnatural development paradigm. McDonough’s vision, and efforts to comfortably merge consumption and profit with social and environmental sustainability, have followed the path of biomimicry. In short, biomimicry looks to natural systems of production and recycling, and seeks to design processes whereby human activities mimic those found in nature, for example, the production of “a solar cell inspired by a leaf.”\footnote{483} Translated to a dynamic system, biomimicry:

1. Considers waste as a resource.
2. Diversifies and cooperates to fully use the habitat.

\footnote{480} WILLIAM MCDONOUGH & MICHAEL BRAUNGART, CRADLE TO CRADLE: REMAKING THE WAY WE MAKE THINGS (North Point Press 2002).
\footnote{481} WALL STREET (20th Century Fox 1987).
\footnote{482} McDonough, \textit{supra} note 480.
\footnote{483} See \url{http://www.biomimicry.net/}. See JANINE BENYUS, BIOMIMICRY: INNOVATION INSPIRED BY NATURE (1997).
3. Gathers and uses energy efficiently.
4. Optimizes rather than maximizes.
5. Uses materials sparingly.
6. Doesn’t foul our nest.
7. Doesn’t draw down resources.
9. Runs on information.
10. Shops locally.\(^{484}\)

Far from being utopian or even unnatural, such a system represents a closer, more comfortable, less violent, and far more sustainable relationship between humanity and its home. Economies incorporating such principles would herald the creation of a truly integral culture, which has been eloquently described as

…[a] new way of looking at the world. It seeks to integrate all the parts of our lives: inner and outer, masculine and feminine, personal and global, intuitive and rational, and many more. The hallmark of the integral culture is an intention to integrate—to consciously bridge differences, connect people, celebrate diversity, harmonize efforts, and discover higher common ground. With its inclusive and reconciling nature, an integral culture takes a whole-systems approach and offers hope in a world facing deep ecological, social, and spiritual crisis.\(^{485}\)

Lest we dismiss such a vision as a mere fairy tale, consider the extent to which such principles have already been put into action. A German corporation manufactures a paint that mimics the surface of a lotus leaf, allowing buildings coated with it to stay cleaner longer, and resist mold and mildew.\(^{486}\) Aviation experts are examining the small bumps on the flippers of humpback whales, which allow the animals to glide through the water with less drag, and are trying to build them into airplane wings in order to allow for faster and more fuel-efficient flights.\(^{487}\) “Green roofs” cover the corporate campuses of the Gap and Ford Motor Company, naturally manufacturing oxygen and recycling rainwater.\(^{488}\) Seven World Trade Center, an office

\(^{484}\) “Ecosystem Dynamics,” biomimicry.net, http://www.biomimicry.net/eco_dynam.html (link is broken)
\(^{486}\) Douglas Gantenbein, Back to the Drawing Board, PLENTY, Apr.-May 2006, at 64.
\(^{487}\) Id. at 66.
\(^{488}\) McDonough, supra note 480.
building constructed in New York City to replace one destroyed on September 11, 2001, was constructed with stone floors that generate heat in the winter and absorb heat in the summer. An atrium lobby naturally ventilates the building and filters its air, and the roof collects rainwater that reduces sewage otherwise dumped in the city’s sewer system.489

Biomimicry, and William McDonough’s cradle-to-cradle production cycle, are not ventures that seek to overthrow capitalism and globalization, but rather efforts to overhaul it. Such attempts recognize that corporationism, globalization, and the profit impulse will not disappear anytime soon. In order to ameliorate the often destruction and non-sustainable by-products of these systems, we must use the tools they provide us. We must sell our way out of ecologic and demographic crises by marketing green energy, perpetually re-useable newspapers, building sewer systems that cause gardens to grow, and constructing buildings that are incorporated onto the landscape rather than blasted into it.490 We cannot continue to allow the things we use to transform our culture for the worse, but must instead use a new, more integral culture to transform the things we use into products that profitably and sustainably enrich our lives. We can, and we should, embrace the fecundity of the world, and in doing so we need not sacrifice the natural abundance that gives us comfort. The change required may be complex, but it is the antithesis of unnatural, and it will ensure that our economic and political systems truly serve our human needs, rather than having the needs of the systems we create define and destroy their human masters.

---

Globalization and Its Special and Significant Impacts on Indigenous Communities

Many of the themes discussed thus far in the text have particular urgency for the world’s Indigenous peoples. Indigenous systems of collective economic production and distribution do not conform to capitalism’s emphasis on individual accumulation. The two worldviews may indeed be antithetical. Indigenous societies generally view “resources” in a very different way from that of global industry’s commodity-centered calculus. Around the world, a good number of Indigenous groups have over centuries or millennia successfully sustained economies in one particular place and ecosystem. The co-adaptation of people with other elements of their ecological systems has meant that the integrity and functioning of these systems has been sustained even as the communities’ culture developed and changed historically. These economic arrangements should be seen not as separate from, but as one component of, entire cultural

491 This phenomenon is not new, although processes of globalization have increased the scale and frequency of such conflicts of perspective. The contradictions between indigenous and capitalist modes of production, and the tensions generated by their intersection, have deep historical roots in the process of colonization. Anthropologist Eric Wolf’s classic EUROPE AND THE PEOPLE WITHOUT HISTORY (Univ. of Cal. Press, 1982) is one of the most comprehensive works on this theme.

492 Victoria Tauli-Corpuz, an Igorot activist from the Philippines, summarizes the difference when she writes that:

[i]ndustrialized culture regards our values as unscientific obstacles to modernization and thus worthy of ridicule, suppression, and denigration. The industrial world also views our political, social, and land-tenure traditions as dangerous: our collective identities; our communal ownership of forests, waters, and lands; our usufruct system of community sharing, and our consensus decision-making are all antithetical to the capitalist hallmarks of individualism and private property.” Our Right to Remain Separate and Distinct, in PARADIGM WARS: INDIGENOUS PEOPLES’ RESISTANCE TO ECONOMIC GLOBALIZATION 10-11 (hereinafter PARADIGM WARS) (Jerry Mander and Victoria Tauli-Corpuz, eds., 2005).

493 A leader of the Indigenous Network on Economies and Trade, Secwepemc author Arthur Manuel writes:

Mainstream economists tend to value development strategies solely in terms of their wealth generation potential for industry and governments. So resources are viewed in strictly monetary terms. But indigenous peoples consider the value of land and resources in far broader, more integrated terms, including cultural, social, spiritual and environmental values, and their sustainability. Among indigenous peoples, decisions about caring for resources and the environment are usually made as part of a collective process, where the community takes into account a full spectrum of values and benefits other than short-term economic gains.

understandings that include sacred interactions with the world. Indigenous economies can thus be seen to be sustainable to the extent to which the holders of culture interact in a culturally appropriate way with the world around them, including those elements of the world known to modern scientists as “natural resources.” In many areas Indigenous people have sustained communities from time immemorial, and the ecological systems of which they are a component have maintained relative richness and resilience to natural perturbations such as drought or fires. The ecosystems that have been remained predominantly under control and care of Indigenous peoples thus tend to be characterized by high biodiversity, abundant renewable resources, and relatively unexploited nonrenewable resources. The great irony of globalization is that this very sustainability of their economies now makes their territories and knowledge valuable targets as commodities in a globalized economy.

Indigenous people have not passively acceded to the penetration of extractive capitalism into their communities. The following section thus not only reviews how globalization impacts Indigenous people, but also describes how Indigenous communities resist or negotiate in order to defend their territories and cultural integrity.

Economic policy, when set on a global scale, can undermine the political gains that Indigenous peoples may have made within the legal systems of nation states. Victor Menotti of the International Forum on Globalization has written of how World Trade Organization (WTO) authority is diminishing the sovereignty of nation states over their land, water, genetic material, and public services. The General Agreement on Trade in Services (GATS), for example,

---

494 For an attempt to correlate levels of knowledge of a ecosystem with the number of generations that a people have been living in a particular place, and a description of the means by which knowledge of sustainable economic practices becomes incorporated into the sacred practices and beliefs of a community, see F. Berkes, C. Folke, and M. Gadgil, *Traditional Ecological Knowledge: Biodiversity, Resilience, and Sustainability, in BIODIVERSITY CONSERVATION 281-289.* (C.A. Perry, ed.) (Kluwer Academic Publishers, 1995).

495 Victor Menotti, *How the World Trade Organization (WTO) Diminishes Native Sovereignty, in PARADIGM WARS 46-57.* Undeniably, the legal and political systems of the nation-state have also enabled the
favors the privatization of systems (such as those for water distribution) that serve the general public but without an equitable provision of services that is often at odds with maximization of profits.\textsuperscript{496} Structural adjustment programs (SAPs) imposed as a condition of loans from global finance agencies such as the World Bank also often mandate privatization. The effects on Indigenous peoples and other poor people can be devastating. World Bank-mandated SAP privatization of coal mining in the Indian state of Orissa in the 1990s, for example, resulted in contamination of rivers, increased rates of fluoride poisoning, infections, and cancer, displacement of towns, and power rates that increased by 500%.\textsuperscript{497} The World Bank and IMF have also made water privatization a prior condition for granting loans and debt reductions.\textsuperscript{498} Structural adjustment programs also weaken national-level environmental and labor laws that Indigenous communities may have relied on in previous struggles to maintain control over territory and resources.\textsuperscript{499}

Other new international trade rules also negatively impact Indigenous peoples.\textsuperscript{500} For example, Article I of the General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade (GATT) prohibits national governments from restricting imports specifically from any single other WTO member nation.
This article thus makes it impossible for national governments to restrict imports from other WTO countries with questionable human rights, labor, or environmental records and thus disallows a potential safeguard for the rights of Indigenous peoples.\textsuperscript{501}

Article III of GATT, together with its corollary Articles V and XI, requires governments to treat all imported goods “no less favorably” than locally produced goods and bans restrictions on imports. Victor Menotti writes of how this feature of GATT “prevents any government from favoring or protecting it own local industries, or farmers or cultures that might otherwise by overwhelmed by globe-spanning corporations bringing vast amounts of cheap imports that make local or Indigenous economies non-viable”.\textsuperscript{502} Similar “free trade” policies under NAFTA have already been demonstrated to undercut the livelihoods of small-scale Mexican corn farmers, many of whom are Indigenous, who are unable to compete with cheap, mass-produced grain from the US.\textsuperscript{503}

Another set of WTO rules, the Agreement on Agriculture, further weakens the ability of nations to set up barriers to imports and also prohibits the internal support of domestic producers through low-cost credit, price supports, and subsidized seeds and fertilizer. WTO agriculture rules, rather than safeguarding the rights of indigenous producers and small-scale farmers, are thus specifically designed to favor the large-scale production of luxury exports, leading to monocultural production of cash crops and associated environmental problems and ecological vulnerability.\textsuperscript{504} The Agreement on Sanitary and Phyto-Sanitary Measures (SPS) limits the

\begin{footnotes}
\item[501] Menotti, supra note 495, at 495. Chillingly, Menotti notes that under current GATT rules it would thus have been impossible to boycott South African goods during apartheid.
\item[502] Id.
\item[503] Gonzalo Fanjul and Arabella Fraser, Dumping without Borders: How U.S. Agricultural Policies are Destroying the Livelihoods of Mexican Corn Farmers, OXFAM BRIEFING PAPER NO.. 50 (2003).
\item[504] William Robinson deals extensively with this topic of Nontraditional Agricultural Exports (NTAEs) in his magisterial work on how current trends represent a qualitative shift in the interaction of the global and local economies. TRANSNATIONAL CONFLICTS: CENTRAL AMERICA, SOCIAL CHANGE, AND GLOBALIZATION (2003). Victor Menotti shares Robinson’s perspective when he writes:
\end{footnotes}
ability of national governments to regulate or monitor imports of transgenic foods.\textsuperscript{505} Vicente Fox’s ambitious Plan Puebla-Panama is a well-known example of how the transportation infrastructure to facilitate this export-based economy often appropriates Indigenous people’s lands without their consent.\textsuperscript{506}

Many large-scale infrastructure projects, often funded through loans from the World Bank, regional multilateral banks (e.g., the Inter-American Development Bank and Asian Development Bank), and more recently by the U.S. Export-Import Bank and the Japan Bank for International Cooperation (JBIC), represent threats to Indigenous peoples’ autonomy and resources.\textsuperscript{507} The World Bank-funded Polonoroeste highway project through Indigenous lands in the Amazon rain forest, for example, brought colonizers, deforestation, and disease epidemics to the region. Pipeline construction, damming of rivers, and toxic contamination from industrial development are other dangers for indigenous peoples of the Amazon.\textsuperscript{508} In order to promise returns on the investment of the international lending institution, these projects are so large in scale that it would be difficult to account for local needs, even if the desire to do so existed.\textsuperscript{509}

\textsuperscript{505} Menotti, \textit{supra} note 495, at 51.
\textsuperscript{506} Menotti, \textit{supra} note 495 at 52.
\textsuperscript{507} Tauli-Corpuz, \textit{supra} note 497, at 37.
\textsuperscript{508} Janet Lloyd, Atossa Soltani, and Kevin Koenig of Amazon Watch provide specific case studies in their chapter \textit{Infrastructure Development in South American Amazon}, in \textit{PARADIGM WARS} 76-82.
\textsuperscript{509} Regarding dams, indigenous rights organizations have achieved partial progress. In the 1994 Manibeli Declaration more than 2000 civil society organizations called for comprehensive review of all World Bank-funded dam projects. Responding to consistent pressure, in 1998 the World Bank agreed to support the creation of the
A major impact associated with large infrastructure developments such as highways and dams is the resettlement of Indigenous communities that have developed sacred knowledge of, and connections with, specific places. Not only can removal from homelands be traumatic for those moving, but the impacts on the areas receiving the displaced people can also be devastating. From 1976 to 1986, Indonesia’s Suharto government used a $630 million World Bank loan to resettle millions of people in order to relieve population pressure and to provide a labor force for export crops such as cacao, coffee, and palm oil. On the receiving island of Irian Jaya (West Papua), the influx of 300,000 Javanese has been a root cause of decades of ethnic conflict with Melanesians speaking 224 different languages, and the biodiversity of the island has come under threat from large mining operations and cash crop plantations.510

Resource extraction generally, whether for minerals, forest products, or even genetic information and environmental knowledge, underlies many of the negative impacts of

---

globalization on indigenous peoples. The well-known example of Royal Dutch Shell’s actions in the Niger Delta illustrates an oft-repeated pattern. The corporation has been extracting oil from the region for half a century but few if any benefits have come to Indigenous peoples such as the Ogoni and Ijaw. Associated infrastructure construction and pollution from processing operations has heavily contaminated the air, water, and soils of the Delta. In the 1960s, Nigeria was almost self-sufficient agriculturally, but in the 1970s the national economy became dependent on revenue from oil exports that brought great wealth to elite classes in the country. Because of corruption in government, Nigeria began to accumulate a $9 billion external debt. When oil prices dropped, the national government faced the prospect of defaulting, at which point the IMF offered a $5 billion loan tied to a SAP designed to cut funding for social services, privatize government-owned agencies, and encourage further dependence on exportable oil and cash crops. By the early 1990s, Shell’s own armed police forces together with the Nigerian military (who, in the words of one former military officer, were paid by Shell to “sanitize” the people in the area of Shell’s five oil fields) put down indigenous resistance by razing villages and executing opposition leaders.

Extraction of mineral, wildlife, and forest resources from Indigenous peoples’ territories has, of course, a long history intertwined with European colonization. In recent decades,
however, Indigenous groups have faced outside exploitation of another valuable resource: their DNA. For example, because they offered the potential for asthma treatments, blood samples from Indigenous inhabitants of Trista de Cunha in the South Atlantic were sold to a California-based company. The company subsequently sold the samples’ biotechnology rights to the German pharmaceutical company Boehringer Ingelheim for $70 million. Commentators have noted that the Indigenous groups from which genetic material is taken see little if any of the profits made by Western corporations who use that material. In 1994, an international consortium of academic researchers and government institutions organized the Human Genome Diversity Project (HGDP) to collect information on how the human genome varies among populations. The project design required that blood and tissue samples be taken from hundreds of Indigenous communities around the world. Indigenous populations were to be a specific focus of the project because, in the words of HGDP researcher Ken Kidd, “remote populations make perfect laboratories” because their genetic materials are assumed to have mixed less with people outside the community. The project drew vehement criticism from both specific Indigenous communities and from international organizations such as UNESCO, the Rural Advancement Foundation International, and the World Council for Indigenous Peoples. Project critics contended that the HGDP would lead to expropriation of intellectual property from Indigenous communities, violate the human rights and societal norms of many Indigenous

518 Quoted in Paul Salopek, Genes Offer Sampling of Hope and Fear: Cures Possible, But Groups Worry about Exploitation CHI. TRIB, Apr. 28, 1997, at 18.
people, and take advantage of nebulous and culturally inappropriate standards of consent and consultation.519

The original design of the HGDP was scaled back considerably as the outcry over its aims and methods caused funding to dry up by the late 1990s.520 On April 13, 2005, however, the National Geographic Society and IBM jointly announced the launch of the five-year Genographic Project, which expressly aims to complete the unfinished work of the HGDP.521 The Genographic Project aims to collect 100,000 blood samples from indigenous populations around the world and analyze them genetically, creating a collection of blood samples 100 times larger than that of the HGDP.522 Dr. Spencer Wells, a population geneticist at the society who is leading the program, said he hoped to head off charges of exploitation by offering money to the tribes for education and cultural preservation,523 but the Indigenous People’s Council on Biocolonialism has already called the new project “a recurrent nightmare…essentially the same project we defeated years ago”.524 It does seem, however, that opposition to the HGDP

519 For an eloquent critique of the HGDP, see Debra Harry. The Human Genome Diversity Project: Implications for Indigenous Peoples, available at www.hartfordhwp.com/archives/41/024.html 1995. See also Steve Connor, How Accusations of Racism Ended the Plan to Map the Genetic Diversity of Mankind, THE INDEP. (LONDON), Sept. 10, 2001, at 3; Kimbrell, Biocolonization, supra note 71, at 142; Hasian, Jr. & Plec, supra note 516, at 113, 119; and Hamilton, supra note 515, at 620-25. Advocates for indigenous peoples portrayed it as a "vampire project" for extracting valuable medical information from the blood of endangered tribes in return for virtually nothing, while the potential for commercial exploitation of this information (via gene patenting) raised suspicions that Western drug companies would develop and patent lucrative new treatments based on the DNA of the poor and dispossessed. These arguments are well-summarized by journalist Nicholas Wade, Geographic Society is Seeking a Genealogy of Humankind, N.Y. TIMES, Apr. 13, 2005, at A16.

520 Connor, id. at 3-4.

521 For example, Dr. Cavalli-Sforza, project leader of the HGDP, is an advisor to the Genographic Program. Wade, supra note 29, at 16). In another telling statement, the new project leader, Spencer Wells, wrote recently, “We sincerely believe this may be the last generation for many indigenous populations and we are eager to collaborate with them.” Last Chance for Indigenous Gene Research, THE AUSTRALIAN, May 10, 2005, at 39. Regarding the Genographic Program, see also Benjamin Pimentel, DNA Study of Human Migration: National Geographic and IBM Investigate Spread of Prehistoric Peoples around World, S.F. CHRON., Apr. 13, 2005, at A1; and John Vidal, History Repeated, THE OBSERVER, Apr. 20, 2005, at 12.

522 Wade, supra note 29, at 16.

523 Id at 16-17.

524 Quoted in Vidal, 12.
influenced the design of the new project, as genetic information and materials will be less available to expropriate commercially.\textsuperscript{525}

Even apart from their own genetic code, many Indigenous people find that other aspects of their knowledge of the world are valuable to and targeted by external entities. Specific WTO rules such as the Agreement on Trade-related Aspects of Intellectual Property Rights (TRIPs), which permits the patenting of life forms, facilitate un- or undercompensated extraction of this information. Taking advantage of Indigenous knowledge about the uses of plants or animals can greatly reduce research costs for companies that can then file for patents for exclusive control over usage information or genetic materials.\textsuperscript{526} For example, South Africa’s Council for Scientific and Industrial Research (CSIR) researched San peoples’ knowledge of the appetite suppression properties of the Hoodia cactus, secured a patent on a substance within the plant in 1997, and then licensed its development rights to the pharmaceutical company Pfizer via another company, Phytopharm. In 2003, after vigorous objection, the CSIR agreed to share 0.003\% of its net profits with the San, although Pfizer and Phytopharm shares go untouched. As part of the deal, San peoples are prohibited from using their own knowledge of the plant for any commercial development on their own.\textsuperscript{527} Vandana

\textsuperscript{525} Importantly, genetic material from the projects will not be cultured into new cell lines as it was in the HGDP. The material will stay in the form of raw DNA, which degrades over time and is not easily shared. Use by other scientists and appropriation via patenting is thus made more difficult. See Wade, \textit{supra} note 29, at 17. A spokesman for IBM has stated that no medical studies will be conducted and no data commercialized, although it does not appear that such uses are explicitly prohibited. See \textit{Our Family Tree}, NEW SCIENTIST, Apr. 16, 2005, at 6.

\textsuperscript{526} See generally Traditional Knowledge, Genetic Resources and Traditional Cultural Expressions/Folklore, \texttt{www.wipo.int/ik/en}. Article 27.3(b) of TRIPs is crucial in privileging rights of life sciences companies to exclusive use over patented life forms, although the patent-seekers need to demonstrate some modification of the organism. For a more detailed discussion of this article and other mechanisms by which farmers who practice traditional seed saving and sharing are criminalized because the seeds that their communities developed are now “owned” by corporations, see Vandana Shiva, \textit{TRIPs Agreement: From the Commons to Corporate Patents on Life}, in \textit{PARADIGM WARS} 68-71.

\textsuperscript{527} See Debra Harry, \textit{High-Tech Invasion: Biocolonialism}, in \textit{PARADIGM WARS} 62. Harry also discusses the 2006 meetings of Convention on Biological Diversity (CBD) Ad-hoc Open-ended Working Group on Access and Benefit Sharing. While these meetings are likely to better specify (on the nation-state level) how benefits of commercializing genetic resources should be distributed between industrialized and developing countries, the focus
Shiva has noted the irony of a situation where corporations seek patents to exclusively control the marketing and sales of products derived from Indigenous knowledge, but argue against the restriction of research by Indigenous communities who, they say, want to “lock up” this information that should be available to all human beings.\(^\text{528}\)

Another threat to the sovereignty of indigenous peoples comes from what might seem like a benign global movement: nature conservation. Ramachandra Guha has written eloquently of how the concept of wilderness as “untrammeled by man” (an idea developed and codified largely in the United States) has been applied inappropriately in other cultural contexts, notably in India and Africa. Guha argues that American emphasis on wilderness can be “positively harmful when applied to the Third World,” citing an example where the creation of tiger reserves in India (pushed for by American environmental groups) resulted in the physical displacement of several Indigenous communities.\(^\text{529}\) About 5 million people worldwide have been forced to leave their ancestral lands in the name of conservation and land preservation, and these same people are often criminalized as poachers when they return to their own lands to harvest game or plants.\(^\text{530}\) In other cases, people are allowed to remain but their traditional subsistence activities are heavily regulated or outlawed. For example, since the establishment of the Biosphere

\(^{528}\) See Shiva, supra note 526, at 72.

\(^{529}\) See Ramachandra Guha. Radical American Environmentalism and Wilderness Preservation: A Third World Critique, 11 ENVTL. ETHICS 75 (1989). Guha goes on to argue that because environmentalism has become equated with wilderness preservation, environmental problems that impinge far more directly on the lives of the poor -- e.g., lack of fuel and fodder, water shortages, soil erosion, and air and water pollution -- have not been adequately addressed. Finally, he contends that an overemphasis on wilderness protection in the United States has caused the environmental movement to lose sight of the greater problem of overconsumption of resources, essentially reinforcing such consumption by preserving small parcels of undeveloped land without questioning the unsustainable economic and ecological basis of the society as a whole.

Reserve of the Upper Gulf of California, a community of Cucapá Indians who live near the mouth of the Colorado River has struggled to regain the right to legally fish in their traditional waters. Bruce Braun has described how environmental groups have sometimes also played to images of Indigenous peoples as primitive in order to advance their own organization’s agendas. Braun writes, “What qualifies a place as wilderness is its ability to appear to lie outside human history,” and that as a corollary wilderness designation requires that any Indigenous people that inhabit or inhabited the area be portrayed “as a natural culture, at home in the wild.” He further describes how environmental groups have used wilderness designation as a lever to wrest forest resource management away from an indigenous community in British Columbia, writing, “[t]o the extent that the Nuu-chaa-nulth appear properly indigenous, Clayoquot Sound can be situated in a mythical place outside modernity and thus a place that both deserves preservation and requires a modern representative to speak in its name.”

In the most drastic cases, when people are removed from their lands, the absence of an Indigenous population who previously could guard and watch over the lands also opens the newly “protected” area to outside poachers, squatters, cattle ranchers, renegade loggers, and exotic animal hunters, and biodiversity thus tends to decrease without indigenous people. The huge parks and reserves that are created in so-called developing nations often involve a “debt-for-nature swap” that encourages the home country to set aside conservation land in a deal with a large conservation NGO (e.g., WWF, The Nature Conservancy, or Conservation International).

---

531 The Mexican national press has been closely monitoring this situation and the tensions that it has created with mestizo fishermen. A good overview is Julieta Martínez, Peligra Etnia Cucapá en Baja California, El Universal, Apr. 24, 2005, at 1.

532 See Bruce Braun, THE INTEMPERATE RAINFOREST: NATURE, CULTURE AND POWER ON CANADA’S WEST COAST 88, 94 (Univ. of Minn. Press 2002)

533 Dowie, supra note 530, at 110-112. At the end of his essay, Dowie sounds a somewhat positive note, writing that some conservation organizations are learning “from bitter experience that national parks and protected areas surrounded by angry, hungry people [are] doomed to fail.” He quotes one WWF official in Borneo: “It is becoming increasingly evident that conservation objectives can rarely be obtained or sustained by imposing policies that produce negative impacts on indigenous peoples.”
Much of the funding for these NGOs comes not from individuals, but from large foundations, the World Bank, the Global Environmental Fund, USAID, and transnational corporations.\textsuperscript{534}

Ecotourism is sometimes touted as a way to reconcile opposing goals of conservation and development, but sometimes neither set of goals is likely to benefit local people. Jobs created tend to be low-wage positions such as porters and maids, and people are drawn into this wage economy as conservation aspects of the projects curtail their access to use the land or sea. Exposure to the consumer culture of tourists makes some people think of themselves, possibly for the first time, as being “poor,” and indigenous people often find their identities and rituals commoditized and trivialized as attractions for the visitors.\textsuperscript{535}

Although even the most local-seeming of resource extraction projects are tied into the global commodities market (through mineral or timber prices, for example), some environmental pressures that impact indigenous people, such as climate change, are more obviously generated on a global scale. Sheila Watt-Cloutier, Chair of the Inuit Circumpolar Conference, testified in 2004 before the US Senate to review the impacts of global warming on the Inuit, who she termed “the canary in the global coal mine.” Watt-Cloutier warned of melting sea ice, rising sea level, thawing permafrost, relocation of communities, and declining marine wildlife populations. Noting that the Inuit have the highest suicide rate in North America and engage in destructive behaviors related to unemployment and poverty, she argues that what saves many Inuit is a return to the sea ice and traditional subsistence hunting. In her words, “If climate change takes

\textsuperscript{534} Dowie, \textit{supra} note 530, at 108.
\textsuperscript{535} Suzanne York, \textit{Mixed Promises of Ecotourism}, in \textit{PARADIGM WARS}114-119. The essay is overall highly critical of ecotourism as a way to strengthen indigenous communities, but notes that if carefully controlled and designed by local people at all stages of the process, it can bring meaningful benefits to a community. For example, the Toledo Ecotourism Association of Belize and RICANCIE of Ecuador were founded by local indigenous groups and seek to carefully distribute the benefits of such tourism equally among participating villages. See \textit{id.} at 118-19.
that source of wisdom away from us, just as we are coming through our struggle with
modernization, then I profoundly fear for my people.”

Indigenous peoples are also threatened by the global market in Indigenous artifacts,
religious objects, and art styles. Sacred objects are sometimes stolen or surreptitiously purchased
from Indigenous territories, or they pass into the realm of private collection via archaeological
excavation. There have been proposals to reduce export controls in “source” countries as part of
larger trade deregulation, but archaeologist Neil Brodie has argued against deregulation of the
illegal international trade, claiming that the market for and theft of these objects would thus only
increase. Terri-Lynn Williams-Davidson, former Executive Director of Environmental-Aboriginal Guardianship through Law and Education (EAGLE), has discussed impacts of the
loss of these irreplaceable objects, but has also described a growing global industry of imitation
Indigenous art (often mass produced) and the demoralizing effects that the trivialization of
sacred objects has on indigenous people. WTO and NAFTA rules make it difficult for
Indigenous people to appeal to their national governments for import barriers against mass-
produced imitations. Native artistic production becomes less viable and communities are
increasingly pressured to accept proposals to develop or industrialize their territories. Williams-

---

536 Sheila Watt-Cloutier. *Climate Change in the Arctic*, in *PARADIGM WARS* 84-87; Bruce Elliot
Haider Rizvi, *Climatic ‘Life and Death’ Issue for Native Peoples*,
www.commondreams.org/archive/2008/04/24/8491; Alexei Barrionuevo, Amazon’s ‘Forest Peoples’ Seek a Role in
Striking Global Climate Agreements, *NY Times*, April 6, 2008; Wizipan Garriott, *Climate Change: Mitigation
Processes of Indigenous Peoples* (unpublished paper prepared for Victoria Tauli-Corpuz by the Indigenous Peoples
Land & Policy Program, University of Arizona Rogers College of Law) available by request at
hershey@law.arizona.edu; IPCCA: Indigenous Peoples and Climate Change in International Processes,
537 Neil Brodie, *Export Deregulation and the Illicit Trade in Archaeological Material*, in *LEGAL
PERSPECTIVES ON CULTURAL RESOURCES* 85-99. (Jennifer R. Richman and Marion P. Forsyth, eds., 2004. See also
Patty Gerstenblith, *From Steinhardt to Schultz: The McClain Doctrine and the Protection of Archaeological Sites*, in
id. at 100-118.
538 Terri-Lynn Williams-Davidson, *Sacred Objects, Art, and Nature in a Global Economy*, in *PARADIGM
WARS* 98-104.
539 For example, Pueblo artists in New Mexico commonly lament the now-widespread sale of imitation
Pueblo pottery manufactured in China.
Davidson describes how international trade rules (such as the investor-state mechanisms of NAFTA and the “national treatment” clause of the WTO) are specifically written to supercede laws of (or agreements with) “sub-governments” such as Indigenous nations, if such laws or agreements have the effect of inhibiting the intentions of the international trade rules.\footnote{Williams-Davidson, \textit{supra} note 538, at 102-103. \textit{See also} Graeme Austin, \textit{Re-Treating Intellectual Property?: The WAI262 Proceeding and the Heuristics of Intellectual Property Law}, 11 CARDOZO J. INT’L & COMP. LAW 333 (2003).}

\textit{Negotiation and Consultation}

Indigenous peoples face numerous challenges and threats associated with globalization, but it is crucial to note that many do not passively accede to domination by global market forces. Resistance, negotiation, and consultation are common features of Indigenous peoples’ interactions with transnational corporations and international economic policy bodies, but the definition and content of these terms play out very differently for different communities. Much depends on the specific history of communities’ interactions with various governments, corporations, academic institutions, or NGOs, and on the legal framework that conditions relations of power among all of these entities. For example, one can contrast the vulnerability of Huaorani Indigenous communities in Ecuador who sought compensation for oil drilling on their lands\footnote{See William Langewiesche, \textit{Jungle Law}, VANITY FAIR 226, May 2007.} with the relatively stronger position of various First Nations opposed to a major natural gas pipeline proposed to run south from Canada’s Mackenzie Delta.

The Huaorani example suggests that corporations will take advantage of situations in which the absence of the nation-state as intermediary results in direct negotiation of a corporation with an indigenous group. In 2001 AGIP Oil of Italy, in return for the right to build oil wells on Huaorani lands, agreed to compensate six communities with a total of 50 kg of rice
and sugar, a bag of salt, 2 footballs, 15 plates and cups, 34 cans of tuna and sardines, some medicines, a radio, a battery and solar panel, and $3500 to build a school room.542

In contrast, the Deh Cho First Nation and other native groups in Canada have thus far successfully resisted the construction of a $6 billion, 800-mile natural gas pipeline from the Mackenzie River Delta to Alberta. Proponents of the plan argue that it will bring thousands of jobs and necessary infrastructure such as roads and bridges to Indigenous territories, although even pro-pipeline newspaper editorials admit the “evidence from other gas development projects that domestic violence, drug abuse, alcohol abuse, and cultural dislocation can all increase.”543 Various First Nations have used the intermediary mechanisms available to them via provincial and federal governments to mount legal challenges to the consortium of oil companies charged with building the project and to engage in legally mandated consultation processes. For example, in February 2006 the Dene Tha, a 2,500-member indigenous group, sought a judicial stay of all environmental hearings by a review panel until their right to participate in negotiations was recognized.544

Despite the weakened power of the nation-state relative to global commerce bodies such as the WTO, Indigenous peoples in some nations are better able to assert their rights than Indigenous groups in others. For example, according to anthropologist Susan Crate, native peoples in northern Canada have been able to apply their experience at negotiating the terms of the pipeline project to drive a harder bargain with the backers of a diamond mine in the
Northwest Territories, ensuring guarantees of employment for local workers and active participation in the environmental impact assessment process. Crate compares this experience with that of the Viliui Sakha, an indigenous group in northern Russia, who were not consulted or involved when the former USSR established diamond mines and collective farms to serve outside workers in their traditional homelands. In several Viliui Sakha towns, Crate has documented serious health problems and environmental degradation caused by mining operations and waste runoff.545

National and state laws can indeed still offer some protection for Indigenous communities actively resisting extractive industries of transnational corporations. Another anthropologist, Carol MacLennan, has documented how the Mole Potowatomi Ojibwa stopped an Exxon-sponsored copper and nickel mine in their traditional territory in Michigan’s Upper Peninsula. The local Ojibwa government allied with environmental groups such as Trout Unlimited to stop the mine not through the permitting and EIS process, but by successfully lobbying for a new Michigan state law to put a moratorium on sulfide mining. The new law employed the precautionary principle, placing the burden of proof on mining companies to show a commitment to safe practices and a history of safe practices in other mines.546


546 Carol MacLennan, Mining and Environmental Justice on the South Shore of Lake Superior, Presentation at Society for Applied Anthropology annual meetings, Vancouver, British Columbia (Mar. 30, 2006). For historical context, see Alice McCombs’ 1995 article on other successful Ojibwa efforts to block American and Canadian mining corporations from establishing operations in their territories, <www.native-net.org/archive/nl/9511/0362.html>
to protect operations at the Grasberg gold and copper mine on the island of Papua in Indonesia.\textsuperscript{547} Rock tailings from the operation, the largest gold mine in the world, have choked downstream rivers and estuaries with acid-leaching debris, but close relations between the company and the repressive Suharto dictatorship stifled potential protest for decades. The \textit{Times} reporters uncovered a history of hidden payments to Indonesian military officers from 1998 to 2004 after years of company espionage of environmental groups and Amungme and Komoro tribal leaders’ communications failed to prevent 1996 riots in which local protestors destroyed equipment, shutting down the mine and its mill for three days. The $20 million in payments included more than $200,000 in 2003 to the Indonesian police Mobile Brigade, a paramilitary force cited by the U.S. State Department “for numerous serious human rights violations, including extrajudicial killings, torture, rape, and arbitrary detention.”

It is worth noting that the Indonesian government was not a monolithic entity in these dealings. Even while officials at all levels of the Indonesian military were accepting bribes from Freeport-McMoRan to quash opposition to the mine, the Indonesian government’s environment minister, Sonny Keraf was pressuring other agencies to hold the company accountable for its destruction of rivers, forests, and fish. Although Freeport-McMoRan avoided paying any compensation, another large transnational gold mining corporation, Newmont, settled a civil lawsuit in an Indonesian court in February 2006 by agreeing to pay $30 million for environmental and social programs to mitigate the impacts of its pollution of Indonesia’s Buyat Bay. The trial was a rare case of a major American corporation facing criminal charges in a developing country where it is a major foreign investor.\textsuperscript{548}

\textsuperscript{547} The best overview of the situation can be found in Jane Perlez and Raymond Bonner, \textit{Below a Mountain of Wealth, a River of Waste}, N.Y. TIMES, Dec. 27, 2005, at A1. See also a Reuters report published in the \textit{Times}: \textit{After Clashes, Indonesian Troops Guard Gold Mine}, N.Y. TIMES, Feb. 25, 2006, at A7.

\textsuperscript{548} On the Newmont case, see two articles by Jane Perlez in the N.Y. TIMES: \textit{Gold Mining Company to Pay
A commonly legislated solution to conflicts between Indigenous groups and other parties (be they extractive corporations, government agencies, or even universities) is mandatory consultation, but there is often fundamental disagreement about what constitutes adequate consultation. Industry and government initiatives to consult with Indigenous communities often result from economic and legal necessity, involve tight timelines, and tend to be issue-specific; in contrast, Indigenous representatives often express a desire to establish longer-term partnerships that address specific issues but within broader historical contexts. More important than whether native populations are “consulted” is the nature of the process, important questions being: Who controls the timetable and terms of consultation? How are participants in the process identified and notified? Do Indigenous people have the authority and resources to set the boundaries of the discussions? Is the interaction informational in nature (“We are going to do this, so get ready for it”) or do Indigenous peoples have the right to accept or reject proposed actions? Finally, are recommendations of Indigenous groups taken seriously and/or acted upon?

Indonesia $30 Million, Feb. 17, 2006, at A4; and Indonesian Says Waste from Mine Tainted Fish, Feb. 4, 2006, at A5.


Thomas Griffiths’ descriptions of World Bank initiatives to increase “participation” by native peoples are instructive.\textsuperscript{551} In 1991, the World Bank adopted revisions to an earlier directive on Indigenous peoples known as Operational Directive 4.20 (OD4.20). Indigenous leaders criticized the World Bank at the time because the policy was not developed in consultation with Indigenous peoples, and criticized the new policy for not meeting international standards on the rights of Indigenous peoples, not specifying that securing Indigenous land and resource rights be an essential precondition for project appraisal and approval, not expressly prohibiting forced relocation, and not recognizing the Indigenous right to free prior and informed consent (FPIC) to any developments proposed on their lands and territories. After lengthy internal consultations among Bank staff and governments, the World Bank released its first draft of a revised Indigenous Peoples Policy to the public in 2001 as “OP4.10”. Public consultations from July 2001 to February 2002 involved 25 meetings of over 1000 “stakeholders” in total. However, Indigenous peoples who engaged with the process complained that crucial documents were not provided ahead of time for meetings, translation was inadequate, and time schedules were too tight to permit for adequate and meaningful responses by Indigenous representatives.\textsuperscript{552}

In a “Collective Statement on Multilateral Development Banks and Indigenous Peoples’ Rights” the Fourth Session of the UN Permanent Forum on Indigenous Issues objected to the World Bank’s use of the phrase “Free Prior Informed Consultation” rather than “Free Prior Informed Consent” even though Indigenous representatives had explicitly rejected that language

\textsuperscript{551} The following account is drawn from Tom Griffiths, \textit{INDIGENOUS PEOPLES AND THE WORLD BANK: EXPERIENCES WITH PARTICIPATION 4-11} (Forest Peoples Programme, 2005), \textit{available at} www.forestpeoples.org/documents/ifi_igo/wb_ips_and_particip_jul05_eng.pdf.

\textsuperscript{552} On page 7 of his report, Griffiths quotes an unnamed indigenous representative to a roundtable called by the World Bank in response to these critiques: “It is not a question of how many consultation meetings the Bank has carried out. It is a question of whether or not indigenous peoples who took part in those meetings feel that they have enjoyed proper participation and to what extent they consider that their concerns are being addressed in the revised policy.” For other indigenous representatives’ responses to this October 2002 meeting at Bank headquarters, see www.forestpeoples.org/documents/ifi_igo/wb_ip_round_table_summary_oct_02_eng.pdf.
during participation in the creation of the policy revision. The new revision also did not incorporate their recommendations for third party verification of the existence or non-existence of “broad community support” for proposed projects. In May 2005, the World Bank Board of Directors approved OP4.10 without significant changes.

Alternatives and Possibilities

Seneca leader John Mohawk wrote of a philosophy of wealth that provides a counter to global market forces, and that underlies many Indigenous communities’ efforts to assert control over their own development. In his words:

We want to have a different kind of discussion; we want to talk about “subsistence”. Subsistence living has nothing to do with materialism. People who live a subsistence life don’t think of it as, ‘Oh, I got seven pounds of fish today; I’m therefore materially well off.’ They are materially well off, but they don’t see the world that way. They see themselves living in the world and in a relationship to the world that is not only that the world nurtures them, but that they have a reciprocal obligation to nurture it. They’re here to maintain its survival as a coherent thing. That’s what subsistence really is about. Subsistence isn’t an economic exchange. It’s a cultural, spiritual, social exchange that’s intended to go on for generations. In fact, it’s the most moral relationship with nature that humans have ever devised. It’s a way of dealing with that which is greater than we are in a respectful and coherent and sane manner.553

The ability of an Indigenous group to shape such a relationship with the rest of the world depends greatly on its ability to control what happens within its own territory. Debra Harry describes various efforts by indigenous groups to control outsiders’ access to and use of their lands. In the US, the Navajo and Cherokee nations, among other tribes, have established Institutional Review Boards that researchers need to clear before working on tribal lands.

553 John Mohawk, Subsistence and Materialism, in PARADIGM WARS 23. Other scholars have focused on what such a philosophy contrasts with. Indian economist Arunoday Saha has written eloquently of how the promotion of Western technologies is inexorably bound with: 1) the desire to control nature to serve human needs, 2) a reliance on reason to comprehend the world and solve problems, 3) an emphasis on individualism and improvement, and 4) with an acceptance of individual happiness (rather than group welfare) as the supreme good. His most-cited statement on the subject is Technological Innovation and Western Values, TECHNOLOGY AND SOCIETY, 20: 499-520 (1998).

Geographer Anthony Bebbington has noted that various Indigenous federations in Ecuador have consciously employed production-boosting Green Revolution technologies in order to stem out-migration of their youth, which is viewed as a bigger threat to group solidarity and identity than the introduction of new technologies.\footnote{The outmigration of young people seeking wage economy jobs, an increasingly transnational movement linked to global flows of capital and labor, is a disruptive social force in many indigenous communities. Duncan Earle and Jeanne Simonelli have noted, for example, that large-scale emigration from lowland Chiapas has threatened to undermine community solidarity in autonomous Zapatista regions. \textit{See especially UPRISING OF HOPE: SHARING THE ZAPATISTA JOURNEY TO ALTERNATIVE DEVELOPMENT} 193-94 (Alta Mira Press, 2005).} Bebbington argues that any dichotomy between “Indigenous” and “modern” forms of agriculture and technology mostly exists in the realm of rhetoric – in real life, most Indigenous peoples will employ those elements of new technologies that they find useful and appropriate.\footnote{Anthony Bebbington. \textit{Modernization from below: An Alternative Indigenous Development?}, in \textit{ECONOMIC GEOGRAPHY} 69(3): 274-292 (1993).}

Again, however, the issue becomes one of control. Many Indigenous societies have long been impacted by the actions of outsiders, and these actions have long been tied to transnational market forces; but globalization shifts the locus of control into ever more delocalized realms –
from local government to national government to international finance markets where little accountability is conceivable.\textsuperscript{557}

Several Indigenous people do not passively accept globalization’s impacts, however. For example, Mayan populations in southern Mexico and Central America have pushed their governments to scale back the Plan Puebla-Panama (a $10 billion regional infrastructure “megaproject” sponsored with loans from the Inter-American Development Bank, the Central American Bank for Economic Integration, and the World Bank) because they would be unable to control the imposition and impacts of highways, energy grids, dams, oil pipelines, and industrial zones on their lands.\textsuperscript{558} In Bolivia, World Bank loans (with conditions to privatize a water system) generated an ultimately successful resistance movement in Cochabamba, Bolivia in which Indigenous groups allied with other local farmers, labor groups, environmentalists, and human rights activists to end monopolistic control of the city’s water by the San Francisco-based Bechtel Corporation.\textsuperscript{559}

Many Indigenous organizations around the world are devising ways to meet the changing needs of their populations, adopting that which they consider appropriate (and rejecting that which does not) while actively defining their relationships with global consumer capitalism. The book \textit{Paradigm Wars}, published by the International Forum on Globalization, provides a partial listing (including contact information) of active Indigenous organizations in an appendix and is a good place for educators to direct their students.\textsuperscript{560} Many of these organizations integrate

---

\textsuperscript{557} Anthropologist Sidney Mintz’s \textit{SWEETNESS AND POWER} (Penguin Books, 1986), for example, demonstrates how increasing consumption of sugar in industrializing societies of Europe directly impacted the lives of Caribbean peoples during the colonial period.

\textsuperscript{558} See \textit{PARADIGM WARS} 148-49 for an overview of the Plan Puebla-Panama. The partial success of vehement Zapatista opposition to the Plan is outlined by Duncan Earle and Jeanne Simonelli, \textit{supra} note 555.

\textsuperscript{559} See Antonia Juhasz. \textit{Global Water Wars, in PARADIGM WARS} 90-91.

\textsuperscript{560} Another book by the International Forum on Globalization, \textit{ALTERNATIVES TO ECONOMIC GLOBALIZATION} (2004), provides further detail about what it terms “People’s Alternative Initiatives” –efforts around the world to build local economies responsive to local needs. \textit{See} especially pages 253-267. The most famous
specific political action with efforts to revitalize language and culture, pursuing locally controlled “development” – in contrast to the blunt and sometimes harmful instruments of international aid agencies and financial institutions.

Achievements in the larger context of international policy have also helped in local battles. Victoria Tauli-Corpuz has written that increasing recognition of human rights of collective groups, as opposed to individual rights, has been one of the most important advances for Indigenous peoples in the past two decades. New spaces for Indigenous rights advocacy include the UN Permanent Forum on Indigenous Issues, the establishment of which was an important step because for years indigenous peoples were frustrated at having to present their arguments in reductionist terms of human rights, the environment, or biodiversity. The triumphant culmination of Indigenous human rights advocacy is bound in the UN Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples passed by the UN General Assembly in 2007. And important victories in international courts, such as the decision in the Inter-American Court of Human Rights to hold the state of Nicaragua responsible for permitting a company to build roads

 efforts at alternative development are probably those of the Zapatistas autonomous regions in Lacandon jungle. Zapatista “solidarity economics” of partial disengagement from the market economy is well-described in Earle & Simonelli, supra note 555, at 179-210. To their credit, the authors rightly acknowledge (although they do not stress the point) that without Zapatista soldiers (both the initial attention from the armed takeover and the threat of disruption that could perturb the investor-friendly climate of Mexico), the new directions in autonomous development and government that they describe might not have been possible. 561 See United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples, http://www.un.org/esa/socdev/unpfii/en/declaration.html, also available at http://www.iwgia.org/sw248.asp (International Work Group for Indigenous Affairs); see also “Plain Language” version of the [Draft] Declaration, www.iwgia.org/sw1592.asp; Victoria Tauli-Corpuz, The Prospects Ahead, in PARADIGM WARS 183. See also page 16 of her essay Our Right to Remain Separate and Distinct in the same volume. There are a number of Nation-States who have reformed or articulated Indigenous respect in their national constitutions. See Bartolomé Clavero, Cultural Supremacy, Domestic Constitutions, and the Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples, http://www.derechosindigenas.org/wp-content/uploads/2008/06/americanconstitutions-declaration.pdf; S. JAMES ANAYA, INDIGENOUS PEOPLES IN INTERNATIONAL LAW (2nd ed 2004) (See citation p. 94, note 161). Cf. David Orr, Law of the Land, ORION 18, January/February 2004).
and log forests on Awas Tingni lands (enforcement of the decision was made a condition for a World Bank loan to Nicaragua), signal a movement towards Indigenous collective rights.\textsuperscript{562}

These pages thus far have focused on negative impacts, but some aspects of globalization can also work to the advantage of an Indigenous group. For example, the presence of NGOs or other outside entities may sometimes limit the ability of national governments, powerful companies, or local elites to violently repress Indigenous movements for social justice.\textsuperscript{563} Even the rules of the WTO may sometimes be useful to an indigenous organization in its local political battles.\textsuperscript{564} Secwepemc leader Arthur Manuel, for example, argues that Canadian refusal to recognize Indigenous rights and sovereignty in areas logged of softwood lumber constitutes an illegal export subsidy under the guidelines set out by the WTO.\textsuperscript{565} The U.S. unilaterally imposed high tariffs on Canadian softwood lumber imports, which it claimed where heavily subsidized by Canada – an “unfair trade practice” under WTO rules. The Canadian constitution recognizes and affirms Aboriginal Title to all lands that have not been the subject of treaties between Canada and Indian nations. Manuel focuses on British Columbia, where there have been no such treaties for almost all of the logged lands. He argues that the Canadian government thus acted illegally by giving free logging concessions on forest lands to corporations. Neither the government nor


\textsuperscript{563} Janet Lloyd, Atossa Soltani, and Kevin Koenig provide examples in Infrastructure Development in South American Amazon, in PARADIGM WARS 76-82. In another example, the Accompaniment Project of the Network in Solidarity with the People of Guatemala places volunteers side-by-side with indigenous rights activists who might otherwise be at higher risk of retaliation for their political activities. www.nisgua.org/G.A.P._text.htm

\textsuperscript{564} One can argue that even WTO rules which work against indigenous groups may not have teeth in all cases. Terri-Lynn Williams-Davidson notes that Article 46 of the Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties states that while rules such as those of the WTO normally trump domestic laws, they do not do so in the case of “fundamentally important” internal laws. She argues, specifically with regards to Canada, that fiduciary obligations to aboriginal interests are of such fundamental importance. See Williams-Davidson, supra note 538, at 103-04.

\textsuperscript{565} Arthur Manuel. Indigenous Brief to WTO: How the Denial of Aboriginal Title Serves an Illegal Export Subsidy, in PARADIGM WARS 172-178.
the companies have compensated Indian nations neither for the use of the resource nor for
damage to the lands, and he argues that these actions are thus an illegal subsidy for Canadian
softwood exports. He also states that the government actions violate the “prior informed
consent” requirement before any development is to take place on Indigenous peoples’ lands
(ILO, Convention on Biological Diversity Article 8j, and pending UN Draft Declaration on the
Rights of Indigenous Peoples). Manuel argues that this basic argument can be useful for
Indigenous people around the world who fight the extraction of timber, oil, minerals, fish,
freshwater, etc. from their lands. Manuel’s organization, the Indigenous Network on Economies
and Trade has at least received an audience (via acceptance of amicus curiae briefs in 2002) from
the WTO, which he says is “the first time ever that the WTO or any other trade bureaucracy
officially accepted substantive Indigenous submissions on a pending case, thus finally
recognizing our legal standing” (emphasis in original). Manuel sees this acceptance of the briefs
by the WTO as showing promise that Indigenous people can find some new opportunities in
globalization, as this otherwise “dangerous bureaucracy” provides a medium through which
Indigenous people can seek justice via the “hard” enforcement mechanisms (e.g. sanctions) of
trade law (as opposed to the harder-to-enforce “soft” mediums of human rights and
environmental law).

Given what sometimes seems like the inevitability of globalization, it is inspiring that
those people who value health, security, and community can sometimes refashion its
manifestations into tools of resistance and solidarity. In fact there is good reason for hope. The
resistance of many Indigenous people to the effects of globalization has arisen not from abstract
concerns, but from real struggles for control over and access to their land, knowledge, and
resources. It is from these local, real-life struggles that a movement of Indigenous peoples
around the world has grown. In part it is by their efforts that “globalization” is not accepted as a nearly-unquestioned “good” the way that “development” (or more recently, “sustainable development”) is in popular discourse.

For educators who want to include studying impacts on Indigenous peoples into their globalization curriculum, it is crucial not to lose sight of the issue-specific, pragmatic nature of Indigenous resistance movements. It’s necessary to differentiate between particular places and situations, tied to real local histories—it’s neither useful nor interesting to students to make blanket statements about how “Indigenous culture” has been affected by globalization. It is hoped that this curriculum provides a framework and resources with which to begin this task.

Conserve Communities/Solutions

When I first began writing this tome, I envisioned only a short introduction to the accompanying Syllabus. But somewhere along my journey, it began to metamorphosize into a chimera, a utopian or unrealized dream.

How is one to live a moral and compassionate existence when one is fully aware of the blood, the horror inherent in life, when one finds darkness not only in one’s culture but within oneself? If there is a stage at which an individual life becomes truly adult, it must be when one grasps the irony in its unfolding and accepts responsibility for a life lived in the midst of such paradox. One must live in the middle of contradiction, because if all contradiction were eliminated at once, life would collapse. There are simply no answers to some of the great pressing questions. You continue to live them out, making your life a worthy expression of leaning into light.567

We live in a world poised between the crude decimation of life and the wondrous eclipse of that heartache when we bite into a majestically purple, orange, yellow, red, black, blue and

---

566 PARADIGM WARS provides numerous examples of pan-indigenous movements to block WTO expansion at a 2003 Cancún summit, declare solidarity against the patenting of life forms, seek protection for small-scale agricultural producers, and lobby for recognition of the right for indigenous groups to annul projects on their lands to which they do not give free prior informed consent. See esp. pages 11, 50, 59-60, and 218-220.

567 BARRY LOPEZ, ARCTIC DREAMS (1986).
perfectly ripened peach, plum, nectarine, raspberry, blackberry, and, of course, blueberry. Our heartache erased, momentarily, by the exhilaration of sweetness and water.

My heart is moved by all I cannot save. So much has been destroyed I have cast my lot with those who, age after age, perversely, with no extraordinary power, reconstitute the world.568

Dancing on a razor’s edge between the agonies and the ecstasies, we are asked to find that fine intellectual and energetic arabesque among the horrors and an ascendency toward beauty.569 By which trajectory comes solace. Only the letter “s” intervenes between laughter and slaughter.

So the class kills you. It kills me. Then I navigate, then you navigate, from the addictive and repetitive narratives of what is wrong, away from those storms that could swallow our boats whole, toward the “narratives of imagination and correction.”

This is the story without apologies of what is going right on this planet, narratives of imagination and conviction, not defeatist accounts about the limits. Wrong is an addictive, repetitive story; Right is where the movement is. There is a rabbinical teaching that holds that if the world is ending and the Messiah arrives, you first plant a tree and then see if the story is true. Islam has a similar teaching that tells adherents that if they have a palm cutting in their hand on Judgment Day, plant the cutting. Inspiration is not garnered from the recitation of what is flawed; it resides, rather, in humanity’s willingness to restore, redress, reform, rebuild, recover, reimagine, and reconsider. “Consider” (con sidere) means “with the stars”; reconsider means to rejoin the movement and cycle of heaven and life. The emphasis here is on humanity’s intention, because humans are frail and imperfect. People are not always literate or educated. Most families in the world are impoverished and may suffer from chronic illnesses. The poor cannot always get the right foods for proper nutrition, and must struggle to feed

---

and educate their young. If citizens with such burdens can rise above their
quidtian difficulties and act with the clear intent to confront exploitation and
bring about restoration, then something powerful is afoot. And it is not just the
poor, but people of all races and classes everywhere in the world. ‘One day you
finally knew what you had to do, and began, though the voices around you kept
shouting their bad advice’ is Mary Oliver’s description of moving away from the
profane toward a deep sense of connectedness to the living world.

Although the six o’clock news is usually concerned with the death of strangers,
millions of people work on behalf of strangers. This altruism has religious, even
mythic origins and very practical eighteenth-century roots. Abolitionists were
the first group to create a national and global movement to defend the rights of
those they did not know. Until that time, no citizen group had ever filed a
grievance except as it related to itself. Conservative spokesmen ridiculed the
abolitionists then, just as conservatives taunt liberals, progressives, do-gooders,
and activists today by making those four terms pejoratives. Healing the wounds
of the earth and its people does not require saintliness or a political party, only
gumption and persistence. It is not a liberal or conservative activity; it is a
sacred act. It is a massive enterprise undertaken by ordinary citizens
everywhere, not by self-appointed governments or oligarchies.570

Must we inculcate an enlightened restraint on demand,571 or ameliorate the political and
economic strains between cultures by adopting a posture of minimum ownership.572 What is the
distinction between “eco-efficient” and “eco-effective”?573 Do we recognize that calls for
“sustainable development” both contribute to and detract from “a language which speaks to the
future’s shadow? ‘‘Sustainable’’ is the language of balance and limits; ‘development’ is the
language of the expectation of more.’’574

The pressing questions today are: “After Development, What? What concepts? What
symbols? What images?

In order to find an alternative language, one must return to the past—to discover the
history of those invented certitudes that are the mythological crystallization points around

---

570 PAUL HAWKEN, BLESSED UNREST 4 (Viking 2007). See also Paul Hawken, “How To Stop Our
movements as humanity’s immune response to political corruption, economic disease and ecological degradation.)
573 William McDonough and Michael Braungart, The Next Industrial Revolution, The Atlantic Monthly,
October 1998.
which modern experience is organized, certitudes like “need,” “growth,” “participation,” “development.”

** * * *

The ‘human condition’ once described a way of life bound by immutable necessities. Each culture cultivated commonly shared desires or projects of a symbolic nature. In the instance I just described, before transportation and refrigeration, or scientifically produced seed strains, great varieties of food, like blue corn, were grown, complex diets formalized, and seasons ritualized. “The Good” was defined within the “commons”---life bounded by accepted limits.

‘Development,’ on the other hand, is one of those modern terms which expresses rebellion against the “necessity” that ruled all societies up to the 18th century. The notion of “development” promises an escape from the realm of necessity by transforming the “commons” into “resources” for use in satisfying the boundless “wants” of the possessive individual.

‘Development’ combines a faith that technology will free us from the constraints which bound all past civilizations with the root certainty of the 20th century: evolution. As interpreted by optimistic politics, ‘evolution’ becomes ‘progress.’ The term ‘under-development,’ in fact, was first used by Harry Truman in 1949, when the colonialism shattered by World War II ‘revealed’ a world that was not on the track of industrial growth.

Parallel to the construction of this idea of industrial progress, another concept, which implied the assent of the ‘masses’ to development, came into vogue: participation. Since development reduces the constraints of necessity, people must, for their own good, transform their vague and sometimes unconscious desires into ‘needs,’ which then must be fulfilled.

‘Needs’ redefine ‘wants’ as ‘lacks’ to be satisfied by ‘resources.’ Since ‘wants’ are boundless, resources become ‘scarce’ because of the value ‘lack’ places upon them. This is the basis for the insatiable demand for more.

‘Needs’ are not ‘necessities.’ They are ‘wants’ that have been redefined as claims to commodities or services delivered by professionals from outside the vernacular skills of the community. The universal appearance of “needs” during the past 30 years thus reflects a redefinition of the human condition and what is meant by ‘the Good.’

We ask more questions than there are stars; some are reverential, existential, others practical or silly or dreamy. I have some, you have some, and they come by way of our soulkeepers, the Indigene, schoolyard bullies, wisewomen and wisemen, the wrong-headed and

---

575 Id.
the wisecrackers, boilerroom cokers, Acapulco surf-divers, beer brewers, apes, chimps, and frogs, cows, cats, and dogs, slugs, pugs, and thugs, snow, ice, and wind, and you get the point.

After several weeks in the course, we all have balanced calamity and nurture, studied the forensics of why we are here, in our trepidant ecological condition, at this moment of human existence on Planet Earth. Our journeys forward necessarily are individual, seeking like-minded realities. Who do I consult—who are my philosophical virtuosos?—to create my utopian version of the future of human life?

‘Tell me, what do your Golden Archives contain, more or less?’

‘A hundred volumes exactly. The Myths of Crete. The Myths of the Ancient World. The Brief History of the World in nine volumes. The Canon of Poetry in fifteen. Four books of ancient melodies: two of recent ones. The Book of Sums and Numbers. Twenty-eight Registers—of plants, birds, fishes, stars and so on. Thirteen Manuals—of surgery, dyeing, metallurgy, navigation, meteorology, apiculture and so on. Twelve dictionaries. Three Books of Maps. Five volumes of The Book of Precedents. Five volumes of The Book of Secrets, The Book of Death. And that’s all. It took a century or more for these records to be gathered, sorted, simplified and engraved on gold plates, but once this had been done the subsequent additions and emendations weren’t very numerous. The editors spent as much thought on discussing what didn’t need to be included, as on what did. They argued that it was better to record too little than too much.’

When I questioned See-a-Bird further, he told me that the archives gave no information whatever about philosophy, advanced mathematics, physics or chemistry, nor about the motivation of any machine more complicated than the waterwheel, pulley or carpenter’s lathe. Silver plates, he said, were used for records which, though believed to be durable, were still on probation. For example, every poet on the occasion of his ‘acceptance’ was given twenty small silver plates on which to record his life’s poems; it was assumed that no poet could write enough true poems in his lifetime to cover more than twenty. He was expected to keep a record on clay-boards of all he wrote and consult his friends, from time to time, as to which of them, if any, should be transferred to silver. He might take their advice or not, as he pleased, and everyone respected him if he ‘kept his plates bright’ until he was about to become an elder, when he could judge the value of his work more objectively. If he kept his plates bright to the end, this earned him posthumous praise, whether or not a poem worthy of engraving on either silver or gold was found among his clay-boards. See-a-Bird quoted the record of Solero: ‘the Goddess tormented him greatly and when he was killed by the fall of a poplar at the shrine of Mari the Silent, a pile of clay-
boards and slates were found on his cupboard-top. 'There are now forty plates in gold of Solero, who had kept his silver plates bright.'

‘Never to commit one’s poems to silver seems an easy way of getting a poetic reputation. In practice, does anyone ever use up his plates?’

‘The poet Robnet had used all his twenty within a year of receiving them.’

‘The Goddess must have tormented him pretty badly.’

‘She did. She also put into the minds of his poet-friends to present him with twenty-one more plates, three from each so that she could torment him further.’

‘He could surely have kept his poems on clay-boards like Solero?’

‘The Nymph Fand, whom he loved, wouldn’t let him do so.’

‘What happened then?’

‘He used all the new plates within six months; and then he took his life and became Fand’s servant.’

‘Say that again!’

‘When the Goddess torments a man beyond his power to suffer further he goes to her principal shrine, removes his name from her register, and expires. He’s re-born under a new name into the servants’ estate; unless, of course, as sometimes happens, he has expired completely.’

‘What did Fand do then?’

‘She took another young poet as her lover; and presently disappeared.’

‘You mean, that the jealous Robnet strangled her and disposed of her remains?’

‘But I had said the wrong thing again and had to make another apology. No: Fand, it seems, simply disappeared.\(^{576}\)

On the Island of Mallorca in the Balearics, in a small northwestern town called Deia, at the base of the Sierra Tramuntana, the houses are crafted of indigenous stone and

\(^{576}\) ROBERT GRAVES, SEVEN DAYS IN NEW CRETE (Quartet 1975).
topped in red tiles. There is a small hilltop cemetery in the village entered via an arched gateway of lime-washed cob and chunks of rock. Next to a wondrously radiant dark green jade plant lies the grave of Robert Graves. In the year 2000, I plucked a fat branch and nurtured it in moist kerchief until it came into soil several weeks later. It grows still today alongside admiration of the late author of *The White Goddess*. A short walk away from Graves’ rest, down the town’s escarpments, past the sweet smell of tangerines, is a majestic *cala* of cerulean blue. This memory is where I go when I read my newest collection of authors-provocateurs. I have scribed some of them here next to a compendium of titles, from which materials I compose the Syllabus. An extended compilation of my resources is found in the Appendices following the latest Course Syllabus.

---

BOOKS AND ARTICLES

- Abram, David
  *The Spell of the Sensuous*
  (Pantheon Books 1996)

- Ackerman, Frank & Heinzerling, Lisa
  *Priceless: On Knowing the Price of Everything and the Value of Nothing*
  (The New Press 2004)

- Barnes, Peter
  *Capitalism 3.0*
  (Quill/William Morrow 1997)

- Bass, Rick
  *The War of the Senses*
  ORION, September/October 2004

- Benyus, Janine
  *Biomimicry*
  Quill/William Morrow 1997

- Berry, Thomas
  *The Mystique of the Earth*
  CADUCEUS, Spring 2003

- Berry, Wendell
  *The Idea of a Local Economy*
  ORION, Winter 2001, p. 28

- Brown, Lester R.
  *Plan 2.0: Rescuing a Planet Under Stress And A Civilization In Trouble*
  (W. W. Norton & Co. 2006)

- Cokinos, Christopher
  *The Consolations of Extinction*
  ORION, May/June 2007, p. 44

- Declarations of Interdependence, Special Section, ORION, Winter 2002
  What the World Needs Now, Special Section, ORION, Winter 2002

- Eisler, Riane
  *The Real Wealth of Nations: Creating a Caring Economics*
  (Berrett-Koehler 2007)
• Hawken, Paul
  BLESSED UNREST: HOW THE LARGEST MOVEMENT IN THE WORLD CAME INTO BEING
  AND WHY NO ONE SAW IT COMING
  (Viking Press 2007)

• Hawken, Paul
  To Remake The World
  ORION 60, May/June 2000

• Illich, Ivan
  The Shadow Our Future Throws
  NPQ Special Issue 1999, p. 14

• International Forum on Globalization
  PARADIGM WARS: INDIGENOUS PEOPLES RESISTANCE TO ECONOMIC GLOBALIZATION
  (Sierra Club Books 2005)

• Jensen, Derrick
  Beyond Hope
  ORION, May/June 2006

• Korten, David
  Agenda For a New Economy: From Phantom Wealth to Real Wealth
  Berrett-Koehler 2009

• Kumar, Satish
  Following in Gandhi’s Footsteps
  LAPIS, Issue Nine

• Kurzweil, Ray
  THE SINGULARITY IS NEAR
  (Viking Press 2005)

• Mander, Jerry & Goldsmith, Edward
  THE CASE AGAINST THE GLOBAL ECONOMY
  (Sierra Club Books 1996)

• McDonough, William & Braungart, Michael
  CRADLE TO CRADLE: REMAKING THE WAY WE MAKE THINGS
  (North Point Press 2002)

• McDonough, William & Braungart, Michael
  The Next Industrial Revolution
  (THE ATLANTIC MONTHLY, October 1998)
• McKibben, Bill
  DEEP ECONOMY: THE WEALTH OF COMMUNITIES AND THE DURABLE FUTURE
  (Times Books 2007)

• Okot p’Bitek
  SONG OF LAWINO
  (Heinemann 1966)

• Orbach, Susie
  Bodies: Big Ideas/Small Books
  Macmillan 2009

• Orr, David
  Law of the Land
  ORION, January/February 2004

• Pollan, Michael
  IN DEFENSE OF FOOD – AN EATER’S MANIFESTO
  (Penguin Press 2008)

• Pollan, Michael
  THE OMNIVORE’S DILEMMA
  (Penguin Press 2006)

• Roszak, Theodore
  The Ecology of Wisdom
  Lapis, Issue Seven

• Sachs, Jeffrey
  COMMON WEALTH: ECONOMICS FOR A CROWDED PLANET
  (Penguin Press 2008)

• Sachs, Wolfgang
  The Virtue of Enoughness
  NPQ Special Issue 1999, p. 10

• Sale, Kirkpatrick
  There’s No Place Like Home

• Shepard, Paul
  NATURE AND MADNESS
  (U. Georgia Press 1982)
• Singer, P. W.
  Wired for War: The Robotics Revolution and Conflict in the 21st Century
  The Penguin Press 2009

• Stillgoe, John
  OUTSIDE LIES MAGIC: REGAINING HISTORY AND INSPIRATION IN EVERYDAY PLACES
  Walker and Co. 1998

• Stillgoe, John
  LANDSCAPE AND IMAGES
  University of Virginia Press 2005

• Terkel, Studs
  On Hope and Activism
  http://www.commondreams.org/views03/1111-09.htm

• Tutuola, Amos
  THE PALM-WINE DRINKARD
  (Grove Press 1984)

• Weisman, Alan
  THE WORLD WITHOUT US
  (St. Martin’s Press 2007)

• Wilson, Edward O.
  THE FUTURE OF LIFE
  (Alfred A. Knopf 2002)

• Wolkomir, Richard and Joyce
  Reading the Messages in Everyday Things
  SMITHSONIAN, April 2000, p. 75

• Zinn, Howard
  The Optimism of Uncertainty

In the Syllabus just ahead, I have annotated the works of these and several other
philosophical architects who are bending the light toward a recognition of a global ecology. I am
reluctant to usurp your imagination by reducing their large canvasses to small miniatures of
words. Here, in summation I am referential and remain cognizant of my role as a toolmaker, as a clearinghouse.

It, too, is daunting to collate and destill the vast literature, for example, on climate change and proposals for turnaround. Likewise, there exist numerous publications and organizations for socially responsible investing and microlending, to transformational economics.

Environmentalism is all around us. Love may not be everywhere, but green certainly is in our hair. From biomimicry to solar power initiatives, everyone seems to have

---


580 David Leonhardt, The Big Fix, NY TIMES Mag., February 1, 2009 at p. 22.


Militancy

_Only when the well runs dry do we learn the worth of water._

-- Benjamin Franklin

The word “militancy” is a provocation, especially within the current world atmosphere of fear.

By militancy I don’t mean blind rage or violence. The world has more than enough of both already. I’m talking about loving something so much that you are willing to organize your community and stop the forces that threaten it. Gandhi was a great militant. He tried to melt the hearts of his British opponents, but when most of their hearts didn’t melt, he organized a mass nonviolent resistance campaign that pushed them out of power whether they wanted to abdicate or not. Gandhi wasn’t willing to wait around until the British imperialists changed their minds about colonialism being a good thing.

I, too, do not mean to promote here the tactics of what has been poorly labeled “radical environmentalism,” for there are many non-violent manners of protest. Numerous


587 These eleven questions are explored by various commentators in the Special Section of ORION, supra note 585.


organizations promote “Culture Jamming” and “Reality Hacking,” and the following compendium references some of my favorites:

- The Meatrix, [www.themeatrix.com](http://www.themeatrix.com)
- Cows with Guns, [www.cowswithguns.com](http://www.cowswithguns.com)
- The Rukus Society, [www.rukus.org](http://www.rukus.org)
- The Onion (ONN), [www.theonion.com](http://www.theonion.com)
- Merry Pranksters of the New Economy: RT Mark, UTNE 110, November/December 2000
- Pranks, [www.pranks.com](http://www.pranks.com)
- The Bubble Project, [www.thebubbleproject.com](http://www.thebubbleproject.com)
- The Center for Tactical Magic, [www.tacticalmagic.org](http://www.tacticalmagic.org)
- Critical Art Ensemble, [www.critical-art.net](http://www.critical-art.net)
- McDonald’s Videogame, [www.mcvideogame.com](http://www.mcvideogame.com)
- Humor Feed, [www.humorfeed.com](http://www.humorfeed.com)
- Biotic Baking Brigade, [www.asis.com/~bbb](http://www.asis.com/~bbb), and, of course,
- Adbusters, [www.adbusters.org](http://www.adbusters.org)


591 There are many graphic activists. See, e.g., Beandrea Davis, Graphic Activist, UTNE 20,
What ultimately derives from these jammers is a translation of serious rebukes into gargantuan fun and pith. We are all ready for that, for to contain the agonies of inhumanities in one’s body without a smile in one’s heart is to court terrible sickness. My wife has said that what I must do is be joyful while holding hands with sorrow.

On Happiness

The joy of delusion, the pathologies of hope, the quest for happiness, the secrets of happiness, the futile pursuit of happiness, the science of happiness, authentic happiness, the importance of collective joy, the happiness gene, the search for happiness. Please, Zazen!

The class needs an antidote. I originally designed an academic, scholarly-like segment in


592 DANIEL GILBERT, STUMBLING ON HAPPINESS (2006).
593 Barbara Ehrenreich, Pathologies of Hope, HARPER’S MAGAZINE 9, February 2007.
595 STEPHEN POST AND JILL NEIMARK, WHY GOOD THINGS HAPPEN TO GOOD PEOPLE (2007).
positive psychology, complete with “satisfaction” and “optimism” workcharts. Then I recalled the Human Be-In, the Holy Man Jam in San Francisco, in Golden Gate Park in the Summer of Love. Baba Ram Das (Dr. Richard Alpert) and assorted Enlightened Beings sat cross-legged on the dais surrounded by a zillion seekers of enlightenment, many of whom had, admittedly, inhaled. After a seeming-decade of enlightened, swirling words, Alan Watts took his turn to speak. He stayed silent for a time, then intoned ever so slowly, “ha ha ho ho hee hee,” and he continued to so voice “ha ha ho ho hee hee” until the park had erupted in fits of riotous laughter.

Next to that memory, I discovered an article by Jeff Gill entitled, “Messages of Peace Are Blowin’ In The Wind.” Art teachers in Coconut Creek, Florida, he explained, had formed the community project “Pinwheels for Peace.” Middle school students planted windmill-like paper crafts—with a peace symbol center—by a fence at their school. The organization claims that over 1 million pinwheels were spinning for peace, in 2006, in more than 2400 locations around the world. Later that same day, I googled Prairie Home Companion and aired its annual “Joke Show.”

So, for me, what I and my students needed, I recognized, was to simply laugh. This forthcoming semester, as noted in the Syllabus, I will spend one week’s class—three hours—having a chuckle and reminding ourselves of the importance of side-splitting. We’ll be “FUNdamentalists,” “Optimysts,” practice “Fun Shui”, commit random acts of comedy, and undergo “absurdiveness training.” Please bring your very best laughter. “People of zee wurl, relax.”

603 See citations in note supra.
The Course Papers

It has been the temperament of my students, in these many semesters, to write on such following themes:

$ End subsidies for fossil fuels
$ Gas taxes
$ Micro Lending/Micro Credit: A Positive Example of Globalization and a Solution to Poverty
$ Renewable energies
$ Climate Change: Mitigation Processes of Indigenous Peoples
$ Next industrial revolution
$ Re-thinking schools
$ Natural capitalism
$ Ecology of commerce
$ The Historical Roots and Contemporary Manifestations of Corporate Sponsorship of American Education
$ Bodies, Corporate and Corporeal: Contemporary Cultural Anxieties and the Search for Corporate Accountability
$ Nanotechnology and the Future of Agriculture
$ The Timber Trade and Pest Infestation: An Example of the Environmental and Human Health and Cultural Dangers of Deregulated International Trade
$ The Preservation of Native Languages: Toward a Global Model
$ Processes of Change in the Global Diet: Effects on Human Health, Culture, and the Environment
$ The Conflicting Domestic and Foreign Policies of the United States Government Concerning Toxic Substances and Dangerous Labor Practices
$ Media Mergers and the First Amendment
$ Overpopulation in the United States: Why We Should Care and What We Need to Do About It
$ Armed Conflicts and Globalization: Creating Instability in Indigenous Societies of Guatemala and Colombia
$ The Adbusters Dilemma: Promoting Equal Access and Protecting Commercial Speech in the Wake of Conflicting First Amendment Jurisprudence
$ Life Saving Medicine and Pharmaceutical Profits
$ The Jetsons as Educational Programming? Just Ask the FCC! A Report on the FCC=s Children=s Television Act of 1996
$ The Price of Gold
$ A Plea for Corporate Social Responsibility
$ Shareholder Activism
$ Human Rights Litigation in Domestic Courts: A Practical Solution or a Diversion Away From Effective International Enforcement?
$ Globalization and Mental Health
$ Origins of Censorship in China and Its Manifestations in Contemporary Society Via Advertising and the Internet
$ The Effects of Globalization on American Indian Communities: Sexually Transmitted Diseases
The Importance of Saving An Endangered Species: The Increasing Extinction of Languages

Animal Rights: The Need for a New Ethics

The Pacific Islands and Globalization

The Debate Over Female Genital Mutilation: Policies and Practices and the Impact on Global Relations

The Commodification of Water: What Will Stop the Lexus From Stealing the Olive Tree’s Water?

Global Village or Gated Community? US Immigration and Globalization in the Twenty-First Century

Ecotourism: Creating Alternatives in the World’s Largest Industry

For Geography

Battle Against the English Tide: Quebec’s Language Laws

Seeking Control, Safety, and Choice: A Call for Consensual Consumption

Globalization and Oil in Nigeria: A Blessing and a Curse

Local Currencies and North American Indian Tribes

Transgenic Crops on a Global Scale: Saving Grace or Damnation?

The Congo Basin: Foreign Logging Companies Don’t Just Take Trees – They Drive the Bushmeat Business

A Right or a Riot? Where Does Protest Cross the Line?

Anorexia and Bulimia: Just Another Cultural Export

Skinny White Women: Globalization and the Exportation of an Unattainable Beauty Standard
Internationalizing and Globalizing the Risks of Western Science: Xenotransplantation

Veggie Libel: What Your Grocer Isn’t Telling You

The Case for the Cow: The Human Obligation to Respond to Animal Cruelty in United States Slaughterhouses

Writhing in Their Skins: Children and the Perils of Modern Food Consumption

Progress: The Evolution of its Meaning

Foreign Direct Liability: Holding Multi-National Corporations Responsible for Environmental Harms and Human Rights Abuses Abroad

Country of Origin Labeling of Agricultural Food Products as a Step to Achieve Food Sovereignty

The Human Right to Remove Proprietary Ownership of Medicines

The Consequences of International Aid

Grazing Laws

Pollution Credits and Permitting (As Opposed to Rethinking Consumption)

Sustainability as a Social Negotiation of Values

The Role of Corporations as De Facto Nation States in Abandoned Reaches of the World

Television in Schools

Disease, Demography, and Ecological Change

Can United States Court Decisions Be Challenged in Chapter 11 NAFTA Cases

Genetic Engineering as a Global Commons

Designing Children

Oil Extraction in Africa: Conflicts of Abundance

Eric Rakowski, Who Should Pay for Bad Genes, 90 CAL.L.REV. 1345 (2002); [McKibben]
Labeling of Organic and Genetically Modified Foods and Issues Surrounding the Codex Alimentarius

Corporate Sponsorship and Ownership of Research Generated on Campus

The Commercialization of Third World Health Care

Media Licensing

Whether Intellectual Property Laws Can Withstand Technological Devices And Whether Intellectual Property Can or Should Be Compensable At All

The Current Scope of the Foreign Corrupt Practices Act

Taxation of Reproductive Rights

International Human Slavery, Prostitution and the Trade in Human Organs

The Value of Diamonds

Frequency and Noise Pollution

Criminalization of Breast Feeding

Congressional Power to Limit Liability for Technological Harm

Liability for the Introduction of a Foreign Disease or Species

The Law of Robots

The Genetic Engineer=s and Nano-Technician=s Code of Ethics

Compensation for the Taking of Property vs. Responsibility to Perform Civic Good

Whether Regulations Are a Symptom of Design Failure

---

Set forth here is the Syllabus and Bibliography (amended through [1/10]). I recognize that I only have, in the course of one semester, enough time to skip stones across a lake, stressing in the sessions only a pebble’s bounce of information on each massive subject. But my overall goal is to give the class a platform from which to question assumptions, values, and authority, hopefully throughout the students’ lives. I am designing an online interactive version of this course that will to continue to supplement itself with the works of new visionaries. If you want to participate in this clearinghouse, kindly write to me at hershey@law.arizona.edu.

609 McDonough, supra note 72; Edward O. Wilson, CONSILIENCE: THE UNITY OF KNOWLEDGE, (Knopf 1998).
THE COURSE SYLLABUS

GLOBALIZATION SYLLABUS FALL 2010

Wednesdays

Week 1
8/25/2010

Orientation

• Introductions, Expectations, Grading and Classroom Participation
• Review of the Syllabus
• Steve Allen’s “Meeting of Minds”

From 1977 to 1981, Steve Allen, the originator of the Tonight Show, created a television variety chat show format that featured “guests who played important roles in the drama of history.” The show was scripted, yet allowed for spontaneous discussion among three characters at each episode. Guests included Plato, Socrates, Aristotle, Thomas Aquinas, Marie Antoinette, Thomas Paine, Cleopatra, Francis Bacon, Florence Nightingale, Thomas Jefferson, Attila the Hun, Elizabeth Barrett Browning, Voltaire, and Charles Darwin.

Students are expected to select a character of their own choice out of history and prepare, in conjunction with two other characters chosen by classmates, an hour-long discussion on Globalization and the Transformation of Culture from their individual’s unique historical perspective. These segments of “Meeting of Minds” are scheduled for presentations during the last weeks of the semester.

• Weekly Papers

To earn a final grade, students are required to submit 8 three-page commentaries upon and new critical research analyses stemming from the reading assignments in Weeks 2-6, 9-10, with the 8th paper tailored specifically to Globalization and the Special and Significant Impacts to Indigenous Peoples.

• Retention of Consumer Packaging and Garbage for Two Weeks

Students are expected to learn about their own personal consumptive habits by retaining all packaging and garbage they will accumulate over the first two weeks of the class. They will then photograph their own social history of trash – their “wealth” – and help build a classroom/classmate photoshop portrait of consumption.
Readings for Course

Written just below are the Articles, Required and Suggested Texts that have comprised many of the past semesters’ readings. New materials and those that comprise this semester’s requirements are marked by an in the margin adjacent to the reference.

The readings for this course contain copyrighted material the use of which has not always been specifically authorized by the copyright owner. I am making such material available in an effort to advance understanding of environmental, political, human rights, economic, democracy, scientific, and social justice issues, etc. I believe this constitutes a ‘fair use’ of any such copyrighted material as provided for in section 107 of the US Copyright Law. In accordance with Title 17 U.S.C. Section 107, the material is distributed without profit to those who have expressed an interest in receiving the included information for research and educational purposes. For more information go to: http://www.law.cornell.edu/uscode/17/107.shtml. If you wish to use copyrighted material for purposes of your own that go beyond ‘fair use’, you must obtain permission from the copyright owner. [Copyleft] [Creative Commons Legal Code ©©]

Required Readings:
2. Mander, Jerry & Goldsmith, Edward (Eds.), The Case Against the Global Economy, Sierra Club Books 1996 (or paperback).
4. Peter Barnes, Capitalism 3.0, Berret-Hoeler Publishers
5. Supplemental Materials

Recommended Readings:
- Brand, Stewart, Whole Earth Discipline, Viking Press 2009
- James Howard Kunstler The Long Emergency
- Ray Kurzweil, The Singularity is Near, Viking Press 2005
• David Korten, Agenda for a New Economy, Berrett-Koehler Publishing (2009)
• www.ted.com

• DVD: “The Ad and the Ego” (California Newsreal)

• Week 1 Reading Assignments


2. Ryan, John C., & Durning, Alan Thein, Stuff, The Secret Life of Everyday Things, NORTHWEST ENVIRONMENTAL WATCH 1997. An eye-opening book that follows the everyday consumption habits of a typical middle-class person in Seattle, Washington. The authors trace the astonishing expenditure of energy and natural resources in commonly used food and products, such as coffee, computers, cars, and French fries. While significantly increasing the reader’s awareness of his or her own daily consumption patterns, Ryan and Durning suggest ways to minimize the amount of energy and resources the typical North American consumes.

3. www.ecoliteratelaw.com

Week 2
9/1

• Discussion: Consumption, Advertising, Trash
• Discussion: Globalization & Culture
History, Place, Time, Religion, and their relationships to the environment and consumption/hidden consequences.

• Video Opportunities:
  - Human Footprint (National Geographic 2008)
  - Illicit: The Dark Trade (National Geographic 2008)
• **Week 2 Reading Assignments**


   This article unveils the disturbing ways in which U.S. tax policy subsidizes advertisements that are enormously successful in promoting greater consumption and encourages Americans to spend, consume and, consequentially, waste more. Hymel’s article shows how tax policy goes beyond the sphere of economics and into the realm of socio-cultural behavior, as it influences consumption and consumerism. She reveals the flaws and failures of current tax policy through the lenses of Judge Joseph Sneed’s seven persuasive tax policy purposes and details the social, psychological, and environmental impact of current American consumption levels.


   This article traces “trash trends” from 1800’s America to present day. Strasser begins by describing the pre-Industrial Era cultural propensity for recycling waste: worn clothing was mended or turned into rags, broken household items were fixed or sold to the “junk man” who used them in other repairs. Most Americans produced little trash before the twentieth century. With the rise of mass production and mass distribution, households were transformed from closed systems to open ones, using products from factories and leaving the packaging at the curb. By the 1920’s, the principle of fashion—obsolescence on the basis of style—was applied to material goods, and Americans began to throw things away not because they were useless, but because new ones looked better. Recycling became associated with poverty and backwardness. Strasser ends the article by discussing the resurgence of recycling in modern American society, beginning in the 1970’s. Sorting trash for recycling has become a moral act for some Americans, and recycling programs have been largely successful. This article also includes inserts about the advantages of recycling and organizations that provide resources for those with recycling initiative.


   The Gospel of Consumption tells us that consumers can be manipulated to think that there is no limit to consumption. The push in the late 1920’s was to define the customer’s needs to produce a society that was obsessed with the acquisition of material goods. Manufacturers decided to produce more than what the consumer needed. Kaplan describes how Kellogg realized the impact that the longer work hours had on employees and their inability to be efficient workers. Kaplan implies that the American society has become obsessed with the idea of working to consume. As a consequence, the relationships of many American families are strained.


   Is seeing believing? This article questions the concept of believing only what you can see. The author explores the marketing strategies of different companies to make its product more appealing to consumers. Over the years, many companies have marketed their brand to imply that natural ingredients were used in the making of its product. The article points out that although a cow or a wheat field was displayed on the packaging, it does not mean that the natural ingredients were used to make that product. The author suggests that consumers have begun to rely heavily upon the products’ packaging to describe the nutrients in the food and have associated the quality of the food being produced with a certain brand. The article includes research that has linked hyperactivity in adolescences with food and drink additives that has been found in snacks and juices that children are consuming.
http://www.vanityfair.com/culture/features/2007/05/greenguide200705

This article depicts the daily consumption of an average American from the time he/she wakes up to time they go to sleep. Alone, the United States’ gross domestic product equals those of several different countries. Americans are controlling the majority of resources which produces more money to consume more products. The author describes the use of coltan in the manufacturing of the 200 million plus cell phones registered in the United States and how the efforts to obtain this mineral are affecting the existence of the gorillas in their environment. Not to mention, the rain forests that are at stake because of the 110 pounds of sugar that American consume each year. The idea behind this article is to make consumers aware of what they are consuming, where the product is coming from and what it takes to make the product.

http://ngm.nationalgeographic.com/2008/01/high-tech-trash/carroll-text

The increasing use of electronic devices by Americans is providing waste that is affecting not only Americans but other parts of the world. *High Tech* explores the evils of e-waste and the unregulated form of exporting recyclables. Carroll describes how in 2005 Americans threw away between 1.5 and 1.9 million tons of computers, televisions, cell phones and many other electronic devices. Unfortunately, for countries like China, Ghana and many other parts of Asia and Western Africa, America’s e-waste is becoming a chop shop for memory chips, copper wire and drives. The author describes in Ghana, how tons of electronics are brought daily to be scavenged for parts. Once the electronics are dropped off, the televisions or computers are broken down to extract the copper wires to eventually be sold for scrap. At the same time the electronics are dissembled the levels of lead, neurotoxin and other deadly toxins are incredibly high. Once the valuable pieces are claimed, the electronics are thrown in inlets and eventually washed away to the ocean. The article explains how states and local governments are trying to regulate the exportation of recycling in an effort to prevent the harmful reactions to e-waste. However, because the federal government has yet to institute minimum requirements for recycling, there are still large quantities of e-waste that is being shipped to countries like China and Ghana.

http://www.harpers.org/archive/2006/12/0081312

Payatas and Pier 18 dump sites have become a way of life for many of the people outside of Manila in the Philippines. Author Matthew Power describes how the Payatas dump site became national news in 2000 when the overpowering 130 foot mountain of trash collapsed and killed hundreds of people who lived and worked at the Payatas dump site. The author examines the aftermath of the collapse and the everyday life of the Payatas and Pier 18 sites. Daily on an average 7,000 tons of the city’s garbage is dumped at one of these sites. In response to the increase of workers at the sites, local officials instituted an organic-garden training program. Once the student completed the program a portion of land was given to grow organic foods. Power explains how over 10,000 scavengers visit the site to scour for aluminum, wire, etc in exchange for money. In the end, thousands of people have become dependent on their findings at these dump sites. For many, scavenging has become a way of life.

8. Packaging, Collection of Articles:

http://ngm.nationalgeographic.com/2008/01-high-tech-trash/recycling-text
Zeller takes a look into the world of recycling. Is it worthwhile to recycle? According to the author, recycling has been proven to be better for the environment and conserves more natural resources than the traditional landfills and burning of waste. The most common recycled object in the United States is a car battery, where the disposing process is heavily regulated. On the other hand the article explains how Europeans are leading in the advancement of recyclable package materials. Denmark and Sweden are exceeding a 100 percent in the recycling of paper and glass packaging materials. Zeller also explains how states are requiring more companies to take part in the recycling business.

- Daniel Imhoff, *Thinking Outside of the Box*, [http://findarticles.com/p/articles/mi_m0GER/is_/ai_97116312?tag=artBody;col1](http://findarticles.com/p/articles/mi_m0GER/is_/ai_97116312?tag=artBody;col1)
  *Thinking Outside of the Box* is an article that describes different possible forms of packaging. According to Inhofe one third of the gross solid waste is packaging materials. The idea is to create a demand for the manufacturers to invent more recyclable packaging materials. The question of paper or plastic seems to be the unanswered question of the recycling world. Regardless of material there are consequences for any material that is used packaging. The answer becomes which of the two evils are more eco-friendly. Extended Producer Responsibility (EPR) laws have forced manufacturers to assume responsibility over recycling their own packaging, especially in relation to international trade. The author introduces the newest forms of packaging materials to include bioplastic, earth shells and edible packaging, ecobottle, molded fiber and no-label refillable bottles. The article concludes with ways consumers can help with recyclable packaging. For instance, buying products in bulk and consuming less.

- Sara Bloom, *How is Germany Dealing with its Packaging Waste?*, [http://findarticles.com/p/articles/mi_m0GER/is_/ai_97116313?tag=artBody;col1](http://findarticles.com/p/articles/mi_m0GER/is_/ai_97116313?tag=artBody;col1)
  Author Sara Bloom presents Germany’s form of recyclable packaging. The article explains how the Dual System Deutschland (DSD) has created a logo for manufacturers to use to identify that they have prepaid for recycling. The consumer can identify this logo and separate the packaging materials into their proper collection bins. With the increasing need for land in Germany, many of the country’s waste was being shipped to France. Bloom points out that although there was a decrease in packaging waste after the adoption of the Packaging Ordinance requiring consumers to pay twenty-five cents per can deposit, there has been a significant increase in packaging waste and it continues to grow in Germany.

  The adoption of the 1994 European Packaging and Packaging Waste Directive has provided a foundation for Europe to base its recycling systems. The article describes how some countries like Austria, Germany and Sweden are mandating manufacturers to assume the responsibility of recyclable packaging cost. On the other hand, countries like the United Kingdom and the Netherlands require the manufacturer to cover the cost and the local governments to supervise the collection of the recyclable packaging. Then there are countries like Belgium, Denmark, Finland, France, Ireland, Italy, Luxembourg and Spain where manufacturers and local governments share the responsibility of collecting and separating the cost of the recyclable packaging. These are just examples of how countries can be proactive in the recycling business.
• Better Naked than Packaged,  
  http://findarticles.com/p/articles/mi_m0GER/is_/ai_97116313

The German Association for the Protection of the Environment and Nature has enlisted a campaign to completely eliminate the excessive packaging instead of recycling. The article suggests that the “better naked than packaged” slogan is the solution to packaging problem. Awards are given to supermarkets with the least amount of packaging. Solutions to the packaging problem are engaging the consumer in the plight to reduce excessive packaging. The article describes how some stores allow the consumer to bring their own containers for meat and other stores do not package fruit, vegetables, cheese and similar products. The idea behind this campaign is to make the consumer aware of how the product is being packaged and what the consumer can do to eliminate the excessive packaging problem.

• Janine M. Benyus & Dayna Baumeister, Packaging from the Porcupine Fish (and other Wild Packagers),  
  http://findarticles.com/p/articles/mi_m0GER/is_/ai_97116313?tag=artBody;coll

This article brings forth the notion that packaging products can mimic some of the natural “packaging” of organisms and other wildlife creatures. The concept of substituting the traditional form of packaging with “expand and collapse” mechanisms, cellular matrixes, optimal packagings and color without paint provides a solution to many of the worlds recyclable packaging dilemmas. The article suggests that studying natural life and how seed cases can be used for air-tight packaging or how sea cucumber’s skin stiffens when needed can prevent materials from breaking. The article concludes with the idea manufacturers could study these organisms and produce a packaging material that is natural so that recyclable materials will no longer be needed.


Have we gained power and wealth for a piece of our soul? This is the essential question posed by Lasn and Grierson, who reveal the haunting statistics surrounding the “epidemic” of clinical depression in present-day America. The authors explore possible explanations for the fact that Americans are suffering unprecedented rates of depression: increasing social isolation, hyper-commercialized modern life, the electronic environment created by TV and the Internet, a consumer capitalist culture focused on consumption rather than human connectedness, the lack of spirituality in day-to-day life, and the postmodern crisis of meaning all factor into the authors’ analysis. The article ends by rejecting the current “pop a pill” treatments for depression and calling for individual examination of the big question, “What am I doing here?”


Chp. 2: David Korten, The Failure of Bretton Woods.

The Bretton Woods conference of 1944 created the World Bank, the International Monetary Fund, and the General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade (GATT). In this article, David Korten, president of the People-Centered Development Forum in New York, asserts that the Bretton Woods promise of a harmonious global economy has failed because of two erroneous assumptions: enhanced world trade benefits everyone, and economic growth would not be constrained by the limits of the planet. Korten discusses the ecological limits to growth that to have already been reached, and the shift in resource
ownership from the poor to the wealthy in the face of increasing scarcity. He argues that the global economy has translated into economic injustice, empowering the world’s wealthy at the expenses of other people, species and the ecosystem. Global corporate monopolies and elite domination of the global economy are also, in Korten’s view, contributors to the problems of globalization. Korten recommends economic localization and public discussion as the first steps toward remedying the failures of Bretton Woods.

- **Chp. 3: Helena Norberg-Hodge, The Pressure to Modernize and Globalize.**
  Before she became director of the International Society for Ecology and Culture, Helena Norberg-Hodge spent three decades as the first foreigner to live among the Ladakhis of the Himalayas. Located on the Tibetan Plateau, Ladakh was isolated from the forces of modernization until 1962, when the Indian Army linked it by road to the rest of India. Here, Norberg-Hodge testifies to the transformation of Ladakhi culture that resulted from exposure to consumerism, government bureaucracy and tourism. Ladakhi self-confidence declines, the youth reject their ancestors’ culture, traditional skills are no longer taught, local food is no longer produced, violence is born. Norberg-Hodge skillfully draws the connection between the loss of a local economy and the loss of a local community’s bonds of interdependence. Her anecdotal description of one culture’s disintegration in the face of globalization fuels her overarching theme: modern culture produces environmental and social problems, which inevitably lead to the breakdown of community and the undermining of personal identity.

- **Chp. 4: Marten Khor, Global Economy and the Third World.**
  Khor believes that the global economy has led to the degradation of the environment and the deterioration of human health in the Third World. He highlights a number of examples to support this thesis. Transnational companies have shifted production operations to the Third World, capitalizing on Third World countries’ relaxed industrial standards while exposing Third World people to toxic and hazardous materials. Transnational food companies have replaced traditional agricultural methods with industrial methods dependent upon pesticide and technology. Traditional fishing methods have been lost within the surge of modern trawling practices that destroy fish populations and habitats. Tropical forests have disappeared at the rate of millions of acres per year. All of these environmental and social hazards are part of what Khor classifies as the drain of resources from south to north on a global scale. Khor considers the greatest challenge of the world today to be the creation and establishment of a new economic and social order.

- **Chp. 5: Maude Barlow and Heather-Jane Robertson, Homogenization of Education.**
  With the creation of the Canada-U.S. Free Trade Agreement and NAFTA, Canadian culture is eroding under new and invasive reforms modeled after American individualism, entrepreneurship and competitiveness. Barlow and Robertson use the transformation of the Canadian educational system as a model for the American and transnational takeovers occurring in many aspects of Canadian life. The new free trade policies advanced by NAFTA require Canada to treat U.S. companies as if they were Canadian, allowing them to bid on public contracts, including those surrounding education. As a result, where Canada once treated education as a common heritage, education is now being increasingly privatized and corporate-sponsored. American fast-food chains will soon be able to provide cafeteria services in Canadian schools. American “for profit” educational services can mass market in Canada. University research, once valued for its public good, is now proprietary. Curriculums are negotiated with corporate sponsors. Across North America, political forces are pushing for an academic common market in North America, which Barlow and Robertson believe will lead to the disintegration of Canadian authority in education.
With the increasing globalization of Western media sources, traditional forms of entertainment and music in diverse communities across the globe are being replaced by cookie-cutter Western pop icons, television shows, and music stars. This replacement potentially degrades and even distinguishes traditional cultural experiences and values in favor of a homogenized, Western product. Because teachers, community leaders, and parents are finding it hard to compete with these new images and trends, Hollywood has become a prominent source of education and values among children and others in poorer countries.

The central thesis of this article is that multi-national and World Bank development of third world nations is merely one more instance of colonialist domination, masked in the guise of humanitarian agency and good will. The goal of this development is once again to extract valuable raw materials and exploit cheap labor sources which, in turn, will serve to maintain the standard of living the first world has become accustomed to. What we are witnessing today in the third world is essentially first world capitalism gone cannibalistic. Today’s method of colonialism is simply packaged in more politically acceptable paper.

Using the example of General Electric, Grieder demonstrates the ways in which corporate influence permeates throughout American political, legal, social, and educational systems. Of particular concern to Grieder is the fact that corporations are not democratically run, but rather represent the will and objectives of a few elite. Indeed, GE’s involvement in the various realms of American society are largely self-serving. For example, GE submitted amicus curiae briefs and “whispered” into the ear of the president’s legal counsel on several occasions when legislation negatively affecting corporations was at stake. GE was also substantially involved in orchestrating tax policy changes that reduced their own tax burden. In examining the case of GE, Grieder questions why although considered as a sort of American “citizen,” corporations like GE enjoy far more advantages and protections than the average citizen.

Wal-Mart, the largest American retailer, is seeping into small towns around the country, suffocating small, family-owned stores and communities. With its eyes glazed over by the possibility of infinitely greater profits, Wal-Mart aspires to become the first global retailer. Thanks in large part to the Uruguay Round of GATT rules, Wal-Mart will enjoy greater freedom in spreading its manufacturing or retail business abroad. Typically, retailers like Wal-Mart seek countries that show little concern for the environment, employee welfare, or fair labor wages. As Wal-Mart moves into more and more close-knit communities, it destroys neighborhood stores or markets by substituting local and middle-man stores with its mass-produced, cheaply made, and self-distributed goods. This chapter tells the story of Sam Walton, founder of Wal-Mart, and demonstrates his seemingly demonic drive to accumulate wealth and success at any price.

§ Chp. 13: *From Imperialism to Globalization by Way of Development*

In this chapter, Marglin discusses the cultural impact of western economics on communities outside of the west. Cultural change in the Third World is packaged with the spread of globalization. However, Marglin does not believe that cultural destruction is a necessary corollary of the spread of technologies that improve the quality of life. He believes that most people worldwide want access to these types of technologies and he does not dispute that. He instead focuses on how cultures can remain intact when these technologies are delivered. He believes that cultural intervention is limited and that the west should refrain from simply supplanting other cultures with a western version. Marglin uses the case of female genital alteration as an example. First, he suggests we recognize there are a variety of practices that vary in the amount of suffering caused and their impact on sexual sensitivity. Rather than lumping them together as either female circumcision or female genital mutilation, we should recognize the variance and determine which of the practices are outrageous. Then we should pinpoint the grounds of our opposition to those practices, and we should think of suitable solutions, rather than outright cultural intervention. For example, if our opposition stems from health risks associated with the procedures, we should advocate the use of antiseptics and anesthetics and, if need be, hospitalization. Using this and several other examples, Marglin argues that it is possible to continue spreading technology while minimizing the negative impact on non-western cultures.


Cultural globalization is inherent in economic globalization, but what does cultural globalization look like? In this article, Berger argues that cultural globalization is a complex phenomenon with at least four faces. The first, what Berger calls the “Davos” culture, is comprised of the elite businessmen that accompany global economic processes. This yuppie and distinctly Western culture occupies the boardroom and the political arena. The second is the “Faculty Club,” a culture of Western intelligentsia carried across geographic borders by foundations, academic networks and multinational agencies. The third face is the “McWorld” culture: the popular culture that embraces American music, fashion and fast food on a global scale. The fourth face of global culture is Evangelical Protestantism. This missionary-type force inculcates the Protestant ethic into new territories, bringing about radical changes in relationships, educational systems and traditional hierarchies. Berger notes that all four faces of global culture share two traits: they are all Western, and they are all dependent upon English. A nuanced understanding of cultural globalization must take into account the homogenizing forces of these four faces, and the resistances to them. Berger believes that understanding the multiplicity of cultural globalization is a necessary precursor to dialogue between contending civilizations. Like the Barber article listed below, this article is written in response to Samuel Huntington’s *Clash of Civilizations*.


http://www.wilsoncenter.org/index.cfm?fuseaction=wq.essay&essav_id=358325

*Globalization 3.0* refers to a shift in world power with China and India as forerunners where the Western world no longer controlled the rules for world trade. China’s pledged investments to Latin America in the sum of $100 billion for oil and a billion dollar fund to help develop Africa has made China a leading economic giant. Will poor countries be able to compete with the old world giants because of this transition in globalization?

Currently governments around the world are fighting five global wars: illegal international trade in drugs, arms, intellectual property, people and money. Naim argues that these global wars cannot be won unless governments rethink the ways they wage these wars. Rather than conceptualizing them as law enforcement problems we should view them as a new global trend. All of these problems have no geographical boundary, no traditional notions of state sovereignty; they pit governments against market forces and bureaucracies against networks. To effectively win this battle, Naim proposes that governments develop more flexible notions of sovereignty, strengthen existing multilateral institutions, devise new mechanisms and institutions and move from prohibition of certain trades to developing better regulations.


Jenkins argues that Christianity is gaining popularity as well as mutating in ways that Westerners do not see. As a result of this growth and mutation, conflicts within different sects of Christianity will ultimately leave the deepest mark in the twenty-first century. This article gives an in-depth historical analysis of Christianity beginning with the Reformation, Counter-Reformation and how different denominations have branched out in recent years. Jenkins points out that the success of highly supernatural churches – such as the Pentecostal Christians – should be seen as a direct by-product of urbanization. These churches gain support because of how they interpret the horrors of everyday urban life in supernatural terms. Furthermore, disease, exploitation, pollution, drugs, and violence also explain why people might be easily convinced that they are under siege from demonic forces. These extremist denominations are becoming evermore popular around the world, including countries in Africa where Muslims and Christians jostle for political influence. Jenkins fears that in these countries it will ultimately prove fatal if religion is used as a reason to fight or dies for one’s cause.


In numerous countries around the world that have pervasive poverty and a market-dominated minority, democracy and markets, which are goals that should ultimately be obtained, can create violent backlashes against a particular ethnic minority if swiftly implemented. Markets concentrate wealth in the hands of market-dominated minorities while democracy increases the political power of the impoverished majority. Chua states that in the eyes of the impoverished majority, the minority wields outrageously disproportionate economic power relative to the majority. Once given political power, the danger lies in widespread backlash, violence and rage against the market-dominated minority. As Chua explains, market-dominated minorities exist everywhere in the world, and a combination of democracy and markets have historically caused violent backlashes in the Philippines, Serbia, Rwanda (genocide), Indonesia, Israel and the United States (9/11).


[Abstract]

This article argues that the grand theory of globalization has collapsed in recent years and the world is currently experiencing a resurgence of nationalism as its replacement. Saul begins exploring the reasons for why globalization received such wide-spread initial support during the 1970s and what ultimately led to its demise in the late 1990s. The attraction of globalization was that, in theory, it offered a solution to almost all difficult economic and social problems including high inflation and unemployment. Unfortunately, the results did not meet the expectations of the economists. Not only did the power of the nation-state weaken, the gap between the rich and the poor grew bigger, the costs of public utilities increased for consumers, while CEO’s salaries increased to 1,000 times the pay of average workers. Moreover, corporate ineptitude triggered its ultimate decline. The resurgence of nationalism is evident in the fact that Malaysia refused to follow global rules during the Asian economic crisis in 1998 as well as the United States’ unilateral stance toward a possible war with Iraq. Saul believes that with the death of globalization comes the idea of choice, a choice of whether to retreat to negative nationalism or positive nationalism.


This article outlines how globalization has changed culture, international law and has levered a gradual consensus toward human rights. Friedman first argues that the globalization of trade is now an international business, which is dependent on the rise of global culture. As the global culture becomes more homogeneous, law will increasingly become more global as well. The use of English as the predominant language in international trade means that U.S. ways of thinking about and writing contracts are likely to influence other countries’ customs. Second, globalization has made global problems such as genocides in third-world countries and environmental destruction more personal. The notion of human rights makes it difficult for the rest of the world to be indifferent to wholesale slaughter. Ultimately, borders will mean less both culturally and economically and the global village will be nowhere – yet everywhere.


Technology may not necessarily be an ally to democracy. Technology tends to mirror, rather than transform, societies. Therefore, societies composed of weak citizens and flailing democracies will likely only reflect and perhaps, magnify, these political inadequacies as technology takes increasing prominence in their community. While the latest Internet advances are being touted as educational and cultural opportunities, the Internet is largely comprised of commercial entrepreneurship, benefiting companies rather than individuals. In addition, the speed at which the Internet passes knowledge may interfere with the deliberative and patient nature of representative democracy. The speed at which information is transferred also presents a danger in that it allows unedited, overly simplistic, or completely false information to be championed at random. Most alarming, the sheer volume of information we now ingest ignores our inability to process that information and use it wisely. We should not assume that technology enhances or promotes democracy. Indeed, technology has the potential to support democracy, so long as a ground-level community of citizens is able to subscribe to it.


Sen examines why the discourse on human rights has been characterized as the imposition of Western values on non-Western cultures, particularly Asian traditions. At the same time that Western values have not always championed freedom and equality, Asian traditions have not always eschewed
freedom and equality in favor of order and discipline. The oversimplified categorization of Western or non-Western societies as representative of one or two sole values is misguided. Thus, rather than divide societies, human rights can unite diverse traditions and cultures by focusing what is universally essential to valuing human life.


Falk examines world order and the prominence of the sovereign state amidst the mercurial nature of globalization. International peace and security efforts will most likely be replaced by traditional peace keeping methods involving unilateral action by dominant military states. The international sector will, in turn, continue to serve as a champion of human rights and developmental concerns. Regional power structures, such as the European Union, will continue to develop and strengthen while the nation state struggles against regional structures and attempts to re-emerge as a regulator amidst global market forces. World cities will either compete with or enhance states in their climb to the level of transnational actors. The uncertainty of the future world order leaves open opportunities for the sovereign nation state to either step up and increase its role in world markets and forces, or be swept along with the tide.


Marglin argues that the development of technology and production of the Western culture has rapidly spread to other societies. As a result, it has undermined indigenous cultures’ way of experiencing, seeing, understanding and living. This is a direct result of the Western culture’s economic and market-driven society. Marglin argues that there are five assumptions of modern Western culture that undermine the concept of community and culture which is perceived to be the “right” values and beliefs: individualism, self interest, the privileging of rationality, unlimited wants, and the rise of the moral and legal claims of the nation-state on the individual. A consequence of these assumptions is that people do things for efficiency and abandon other old, traditional and more community-oriented methods. Rather than relying on the community to achieve a particular goal (bar-raising) which fosters mutual interdependence, people rely on efficiency and economics (insurance) to achieve the same goals. However, relying on efficiency prevents mutual economic dependence, which fosters and builds personal relationships. To remedy this problem Marglin suggests that local communities should do two things: 1) decide which innovations in organization and technology are compatible with the core values the community wishes to preserve; 2) practitioners and theorists should be less arrogant in thinking that they are liberating people from ignorance, oppression of tradition and superstition.

References:


Week 3

9/8

- **Discussion**: Economics, Demographics, Markers of Progress

- **Video Opportunities**:  
  - "Who’s Counting" (Bullfrog Films)

**Readings for Week 3:**

1. **RIANE EISLER, THE REAL WEALTH OF NATIONS, Chapter 2, Economics Through a Wider Lens**
   
   This chapter describes more efficient, caring, and accurate forms of determining economic prosperity, using economic indicators which take into account our personal, social and environmental challenges. Eisler argues that a cross-disciplinary approach to economics, which takes into account the larger social system of which economics is just a part, will better serve our society. She describes the differences between domination politics, in which the government or large corporations control natural resources and the means of production, and partnership politics, which value caretaking functions and are less concerned with domination and more with receiving insight and input from all levels of necessary hierarchies. She notes that Western Capitalism systems and Soviet-style Communist systems are both domination systems, and have thus failed to significantly raise the value of life for the majority of their citizens or protect the environment. Instead of furthering these systems, Eisler argues for adopting a partnership system by embracing caring activities as necessary for our economic growth. She suggests adopting “Seven Steps Toward a Caring Economics,” including realizing how devaluing caregiving has negatively affected our economic policies, changing economic indicators to value caregiving, and educating all people about the importance of caregiving. She argues that only by adopting caring economic systems can we meet individual, organizational, social, and environmental needs.

2. **Chp. 17: Ted Halstead and Clifford Cobb, The Need for New Measurements of Progress**
   
   Halstead and Cobb, both economists, argue that the Gross Domestic Product (GDP) is inherently flawed because it measures progress solely by the volume of production and consumption. As a result, America’s societal well-being is declining while the GDP is on the rise. The authors point out a number of problems with the GDP measuring system: it does not account for the depletion of natural resources, it counts family breakdown and disease as economic boons, it takes no account of income distribution and it ignores the drawbacks of living on foreign assets. As an alternative, Halstead and Cobb have created the Genuine Progress Indicator (GPI), which adds a cost side to the GDP growth ledger. Among other things, the GPI evaluates resource depletion, pollution, long-term environmental damage, non-market transactions and income distribution. The GPI suggests that national well-being has steadily declined since the 1970’s, and that the costs of current economic activity are beginning to outweigh the benefits. The authors also apply the GPI to developing nations currently controlled by the GDP-based World Bank and the IMF. They conclude that the GDP fails to recognize the social and ecological costs of globalization.

In this article, Barnett and Cavanagh offer a condensed history of the changes in financial activity that produced the modern “casino economy.” A worldwide deregulation of global financial systems, coupled with radical changes in the scale and speed of financial communications technology, leaves us poised for a global economic collapse. The authors argue that globalization demands a deregulated financial services industry. The buying and selling of monetary products has become a business in itself, and investments have little to do with production or commerce. Barnett and Cavanagh paint a haunting portrait of a global investment network where trillions of dollars are exchanged at the touch of a keypad, far beyond the reach of government control. The authors warn that in this vast electronic network, entirely dependent upon computer technology, one breakdown in the global banking system (be it from fraud, a virus or a flash of lightning) could send the world into financial panic. If and when this economic catastrophe does occur, innocent workers and civilians will suffer the resulting injuries.


In this article, Meeker-Lowry surveys modern community efforts to create local currency. She begins by highlighting the ways in which conventional monetary systems, such as the federal dollar, malfunction in society. As a result of the problems presented by national currency, a number of groups have successfully created local currency systems. The author provides a number of inspiring examples of communities who trade and barter their skills and crafts with other community members. These groups create their own units of exchange and keep track of credits and debts through a central coordinator. Local businesses often join in, and the services available through the local currency system encompass any number of fields, including law, home repair, childcare, food, gardening—even language lessons. These programs allow communities to regain independence and “unplug” from the federal system. Resources stay within the community, emphasizing local sustainability. Unlike conventional money, which is based on scarcity, community currencies are designed to include everyone who wants to participate, and everyone’s time is valued. Meeker-Lowry offers refreshing insight into the cooperation and interconnectedness engendered within local currency communities.


- Preface
  
The premise of this book is that as economic development proceeds, community is lost. Marglin concedes that the state is one cause of diminishing communities. However, he also believes that markets, with economics as their disabler, are another cause of the demise of community. Marglin was impacted by a stay in India after graduate school in which he experienced human life that was based upon a sense of community. As a professor in India, Marglin realized that western economics was foreign to his young student. He began to think about the cultural specificity of economic theory. Marglin began to question how much a culture can change, or can “grow” based on a western model, without losing his identity. This book is an attempt to answer that question.

- Chp. 1: *Economics, The Market, and Community*
  
Marglin argues that a self-regulating market system bears a large portion of the responsibility for undermining community. Economics “celebrates the self-interested, calculating individual.” Marglin thinks that economics rests on foundations such as basic assumptions about the self-interested individual, rational calculation, unlimited wants, and the nation-state. On the other hand, markets have promoted economic growth, the problem is that economists do not balance the gains and losses created by markets.
Economics supports the market by providing a means to internalize externalities, suggests that the market’s imperfections do not matter because they are too small or can be overcome, and relies upon the assumption that economic agents rationally calculate their individual self-interest in continuing consumption, quite apart from any ties of community other than nation-state. Marglin illustrates this point through the lens of the North American Free Trade Agreement (NAFTA). Economists claim that NAFTA has benefited both sides of the U.S.-Mexico border: consumers in the U.S. can buy Mexican good, and Mexican consumers on the other side of the border can purchase imported Oscar Mayer sliced ham. Moreover, economists brag that NAFTA created jobs for Mexicans. However, NAFTA also destroyed jobs by outsourcing manufacturing jobs from small town U.S.A. to Mexico and by destroying the agricultural economy in Mexico. The result was the destruction of small manufacturing towns in the U.S. and the even more dramatic devastation of Mexican villages. Moreover, these results were predicted prior to the enactment of NAFTA. Such devastation was an actual deliberate strategy for what Marglin describes as “bringing the Mexican peasant into the twenty-first century—kicking and screaming if necessary.” Thus, while economics and the free market may be touted by some as possessing the ability to modernize or create progress, it does so with extremely high collateral damage: the loss of the community.


The reality of the state of our ecosystem is blurred by the illusionistic actions that are taken to fix our environment. To many, the problem with our environment is deemed fixable. What people don’t realize is the extent of the damage that is being done to natural resources by pollution and consumption. Sale points out the example of toxic waste dumps when toxins are still being produced; or the continued mass production of wheat while not considering the consequences of pesticides and soil erosion. The purpose of the article is to inform the readers that we are only hitting the surface of the environmental problems. The author wants the readers to educate others on how to lessen their footprint and become aware of the true state of our ecological system.

http://findarticles.com/p/articles/mi_hb6685/is_2-3_33/ai_n29361465?tag=content;coll1

Nathan Cardinal explains how British Columbia’s economic growth per capita is equated and how a significant number of factors are not included in the gross domestic product (GDP) calculation. According to this article, the GDP should not be the only indicator of a nation’s wealth. The example given is the Exxon oil spill which caused the nation’s GDP to rise by not measuring the disastrous effect the spill had on the environment other than to account positively for clean-up costs. The author suggests adopting the Genuine Progress Index (GPI).

http://www.harpers.org/archive/2008/06/0082042

Similar to Cardinal’s article, Jonathan Rowe describes how the gross domestic product (GDP) takes into account strictly expenditures.
7. Lourdes Beneria, [Author: Gender, Development and Globalization: Economics as if People Mattered], ADBUSTERS BIG IDEAS 2008
http://www.adbusters.org/magazine/75
The interview between Lourdes Beneria and Tom Green illustrates Beneria’s thoughts on the “science” behind economics. Beneria points out that economics is still a very biased field in favor of male gender and has refused to incorporate power relationships into its equations.

http://www.adbusters.org/magazine/75/Economic_Indoctrination.html
N. Gregory Mankiw is a leading professor at Harvard University. Under Mankiw’s teachings students learn that the market is the solution to all problems. If a problem continues, the market does not exist or it is imperfect. According to Mankiw, the theory of supply and demand can be applied to all issues. Raveaud suggests that Mankiw has given little reference to the gap between the rich and poor in the United States. Mankiw has also distorted economic theory by not presenting how the market has harmed our environment and eliminated the importance of societal relationships.

9. Herman Daly [Formerly: Senior Economist, Environmental Department World Bank, ADBUSTERS BIG IDEAS 2008.]
http://www.adbusters.org/magazine/75
Daly pushes the envelope by examining the concept of economics and its relationship to happiness. He describes how new research on happiness has proven not to be directly related to growth, which defies many economists’ theories. The article poses the question of what less growth would look like. However, less growth is a theory that the field of economy does not consider. The author wants future economists to question the theories of economy in the hopes of transforming the reality of free trade.

http://www.orionmagazine.org/index.php/articles/article/346
Rebecca Solnit entices the reader to slow down their lives and revert to a more sociable nature. The article examines our current society and has defined it as efficient, convenient, profitable and secure. The new trend to be efficient, convenient, profitable and secure drives the idea to consume.

http://www.orionmagazine.org/index.php/articles/article/267
This article explores how contemporary everyday work has changed over the years and is the source of environmental jeopardy. White portrays that our society is wrapped in the idea of consumption yet to the diminishment of fundamental goods. Instead of planting a garden and fishing for food, our society has lost the true meaning of work. The author recommends that a new culture needs to be formed.

Gallup and Sachs of the Harvard Institute for International Development (HIID) identify correlations between geographic location and relative poverty. Despite the benefits of modern development, 85 percent of the world consists of developing countries that are falling farther and farther behind the advanced countries in relative income levels. Two unmistakable geographical correlations exist: tropical countries are almost all poor and coastal economies enjoy higher incomes than landlocked counterparts. Further, geography is not the sole determinative factor; countries in favorable geographic
localities have failed to thrive under socialist economic and political systems. Comparatively, Northern Hemisphere, temperate zone, coastal, non-socialistic, and non-war torn countries have the highest incomes. Concluding that geography, alongside social and political and economic institutions, does in fact matter, four main policy implications are suggested. First, heightened scrutiny must be given to landlocked countries; second, policymakers should examine the likelihood and desirability of large-scale migrations from geographically disadvantaged regions; third, population policy must be reexamined; and fourth, a closer look must be taken at non-traditional forms of aid, such as for basic science on tropical agriculture and tropical public health.


Theodore Roszak, a professor of History at California State University, Hayward, concludes in this piece that he is not surprised at all that this time in our history when women are finally coming into their own is the world examining the messy complexities of nature and revisiting many of its problems with far more sensitivity and understanding. While he suggests that the future belongs to age, more importantly, female baby boomers are determined to find empowerment and fulfillment. This quest will translate to the rest of society, a society that has been characterized by a male dominated ethic. The implications will touch everything from our reliance on technology to the restoration of the environment.

Recommended


Humanity 2.0 describes a world where humans are nearly a thing of the past. The idea of transitional humans dominating our society will enhance the quality of life. Many transhuman advocates declare that disease will no longer be an issue and eternal death will be a thing of the past with the option of freezing heads or bodies to be “reanimated” in the future. Critics of transhumanists question the impact it will have on society. They are worried that our society has become dependent on cosmetic surgery and botox, and how transhumanism will affect the price of one’s life if its popularity continues to grow.


Natural resources are often not properly accounted for on national accounting reports, which is most detrimental to low-income countries that are usually most dependent on natural resources for employment, revenues, and foreign exchange earnings. This anomaly is based upon the fact that natural resources are considered to be so abundant that they have no marginal value or that natural resources are free gifts of nature so that there are no gifts of nature to be written off. Policymakers are thus apt to further the interests of the economy at the expense of the environment. Repetto suggests that the true definition of income must encompass the notion of sustainability. The author then exemplifies the problem with a case study of the devastation of Costa Rica’s natural environment, with the worst fate falling upon its forests. The results of improper accounting were brought to bear with the forests; considering that there was a declining rate of deforestation in recent years, asset depreciation has increased dramatically because the hardwoods being destroyed have become more valuable. Further unaccounted for were the resultant losses in wildlife habitat, tourist attractions, and the like, which have not been yet monetarily quantified. With similar accounting deficiencies being brought to bear in other low income countries, it is incumbent upon the U.N. Statistical Commission and the U.N. Statistical Office to devise an accounting system that accurately and effectively integrates economic and environmental values.
Week 4
9/15

• Discussion: Population, Food, Water & Health Security, Safety, Access

• Video Opportunities:
  - “The People Bomb” (CNN 1992)

Book: DIETER TELEMANS, TROUBLED WATERS (Exhibitions International/BAI 2007)

Readings for Week 4:


Engleman begins with the premise that, these days, more people mean less for each: less water, less land, more expensive food. He then asks whether a realistic reduction in population growth could actually help us to be more environmentally sustainable. The number of humans on the planet is not the only problem. The way we live and behave, our considerable consumption, is another important factor. The wealthiest, most industrialized nations, and not the most populated, have traditionally been most responsible for greenhouse gas emissions. However, slowing population growth would still cut down on carbon emissions. Engleman believes that both population and consumption are the problem, and together they expand humans’ environmental impact exponentially as time goes on. In the hot button world of “population control,” Engleman proposes a strategy endorsed by 179 nations at a United Nations conference in Cairo in 1994. This strategy involves improving reproductive health. Engleman argues that women do not want more children, but want to have more for the children that will reliably become healthy adults. Thus, if women could raise healthy children, they would, on their own, have fewer children. Moreover, women need to be given aces to contraceptives and education.

In his now famous piece, Harden describes the population problem as the sort belonging to the class of “no technical solution problems.” As our population grows exponentially, our resources must logically decrease. Harden characterizes the problem as one of the difficulties of defining what the maximum good is for each person when values are so different. This problem as a whole has been characterized as the tragedy of the commons, with which we are all now familiar. The troubles of the tragedy of the commons appear with the public lands, pollution, and even free parking. Yet, the U.N. and others still see the family as the natural and fundamental unit of society and are happy to leave decisions regarding the size of the family to the family itself. Harden thinks that it is a misstep to allow the control of breeding to be left to appeals to conscience, which has both long and short term disadvantages. The solution, as Harden sees it, is a set of mutually agreed upon coercion, some sort of social arrangement that produces responsibility. In this case, while the notion of the commons works fine with low population density, it fails, and consequently infringes upon individual’s personal liberties, as every new enclosure of the commons is made; thus, Harden argues we must relinquish our freedom to breed.

http://www.nytimes.com/2008/06/29/magazine/29Birth-t.html?pagewanted=1&_r=1&ref=magazine

Shorto examines the decline of birthrates in Europe and its effects on the European economy. The birthrates in Southern and Eastern Europe have declined to below 1.3 children per couple. Even in Italy, where there is a monetary incentive to reproduce, women are having fewer children. Contrary to what many people may believe, it is the stay at home mothers who are having fewer children compared to the working mothers. The growing concern is the lack of young workers contributing to the country’s pension funds.


Tax policy can function as an economic and social tool to influence behavior. The U.S. Congress, however, has failed to use this tool in addressing problems of overpopulation in this country. Instead, as Professor Mona Hymel argues, current tax policy exacerbates problems of overpopulation in three specific areas: reproductive rates, the strain on agricultural and natural resources, and the overconsumptive lifestyle of U.S. citizens. As it functions now, the U.S. tax system has a pronatalist bias, it fails to encourage sustainable farming practices and the conservation of resources, and it actually encourages overconsumption. This pattern can be altered, however, through proposals made by Professor Hymel such as environmental taxes, preferential treatment for practices such as organic farming, and the elimination of tax exclusions that encourage urban sprawl, to name a few. Since the United States sets the pace for the world on important social issues, Professor Hymel argues that it is imperative for the country to take the lead on addressing the catastrophic effects of overpopulation. Tax policy provides a viable place to start.

5. Mander:
becoming overpopulated as displaced farmers migrate away from farms that have been in their families for generations. Real choice and quality have all but vanished from the dinner table. Perhaps most frightening, the World Trade Organization has enabled multinational corporations to patent the genetic material for crops that farmers have been cultivating for hundreds of years. The authors thoroughly describe these predators to the world’s food supply, offering convincing support for the assertion that rejecting agribusiness in favor of local produce is a central element to relocalizing economy.

§

Chp. 36: Daniel Imhoff, Community Supported Agriculture: Farming with a Face on It.

In this article, Imhoff offers an uplifting description of Community Supported Agriculture (CSA), a business model that allows local farmers to produce organic produce for families who subscribe to the farm’s services. CSA is an appealing solution to the problems presented by current farming practices. As agribusiness continues to dominate the industry, the average food product travels over 1300 miles before it reaches the family dinner table, waxed, irradiated and packaged. 10 calories of energy are required to create just 1 calorie of food. On a CSA farm, community members pay a share of the farm’s operating expenses in the spring, and then receive fresh-picked organic produce once a week during the farming season (about 30 weeks of the year). The average CSA crop travels to a neighboring dinner table in a recyclable bag, and arrives there at a below market price. CSA farms bring communities together with workdays and educational programs, providing consumers with knowledge of how and by whom their food is grown. Imhoff’s article portrays Community Supported Agriculture as a simple and successful way to re-establish relationships between people and the planet.


Berry argues that although industrialism provides individuals with innumerable commodities, it is ultimately unsatisfying because it alienates individuals from their families, communities and the natural world. It is dependent upon environmental distinction. In order to be interconnected to the things around us, individuals should embrace a lifestyle of agrarianism. Agrarianism is about supporting the local economy and being loyal to a way of life that conserves and cherishes the land and natural resources within our local community. Berry also argues that agrarianism isn’t necessarily a “phase” in which human society must go through and then leave behind. Furthermore, agrarianism does not mean “turning back the clock,” because it’s about adapting to local economies and cultures. The biggest problem agrarianism faces is the WTO, which institutionalizes the industrial ability to turn every product in the world into a commodity, ultimately destroying the environment and our natural world.


Using India as an example, Shiva speaks out against the damaging effects of globalization on agricultural biodiversity. Farmers in India spent hundreds of years studying and cultivating many varieties of rice, only to have them patented by a Texas-based agribusiness. Shiva claims that the patenting of seed is absurd: it denies nature’s role in biodiversity and criminalizes farmers who engage in historic seed gathering traditions. Genetic engineering also destroys biodiversity, as corporate food producers ignore ecological systems and homogenize agricultural planning. Globalization equals food totalitarianism: agribusiness, supported by trade law, is slowly chipping away at our right to culturally appropriate food, our right to safe food and our right to a relationship with the harvest. Shiva believes that the only way to fight for biodiversity is to refuse to cooperate with unjust laws. She outlines several recent movements in favor of food democracy, and calls for solidarity between consumers and producers of ecological agriculture. Ultimately, change happens when we view species and plants not as property, but as kin.

When Nabhan realized that the food he ate more or less defined the way he lived his life, he set out on a fifteen-month long project: 4 out of every 5 meals he ate would come from the region in which he lived—the Sonoran Desert. This article is a journal of his experience. He plants squash inside a satellite dish, roasts mescal, eats road kill, networks with other local growers, and introduces his neighbors to the caper-like taste of roasted cholla buds. Along the way, he recalls family dinners, contemplates the meaning of “homemade taste,” appreciates a connection with traditional Native American culture, and learns that eating is “the most direct way we acknowledge or deny the sacredness of the earth.” His project culminates in a 230-mile walk across the Sonoran Desert, fostering a sense of community among would-be desert-eaters. Nabhan inspires his readers to re-connect with their own sense of place and to find sustenance there.


The essay, *A Fist in the Eye of God*, examines the ethical question of genetic engineering. The author describes the theory of evolution as the foundation of all natural life. All living things have different genetics, which produces diversity in our environment and our food. Many agriculture companies are investing in genetic engineering to support our industrialized economy. Food allergies and other harmful illness are directly linked to genetically engineered foods. Unfortunately, engineered seeds are contaminating more of our naturally produced food. According to some studies, the United States is subject to losing all its naturally grown corn because of the genetic engineered contamination.


http://ngm.nationalgeographic.com/2008/03/animal-minds/virginia-morell-text

Researchers are beginning to rethink their initial conclusion on animals’ cognitive ability. The article suggests that animals are more like humans than researchers have thought in the past because of their cognitive ability. Many species, other than great apes and other primates closely related to humans, have demonstrated the ability to learn new skills, solve problems, and make distinctions among various objects. Parrots, for example, have been taught to speak English words, to tell researchers what they want, and to distinguish between items based on color, shape and material. Crows have demonstrated an ability to make tools in order to accomplish a specific task. Such research suggests that cognition is an inherited trait that is possessed not only by mammals, but across various species with ancestral histories very different than our own.


The author explores the legislation within the Spanish Parliament’s Environmental Committee, which extends limited rights to chimpanzees, bonobos, gorillas and orangutans. The committee based its decision on the Great Ape Project. The Great Ape Project found that chimpanzees’ DNA make-up is anywhere between 95-98 percent the same as humans. The article explains that if the Parliament passes the legislation, it will be illegal to kill apes excluding self-defense. McNeil acknowledges that once these rights are given, the cultural practices that involve animals will be in question. The author brings up the issue of bullfighting in Spain and how the bull’s rights may be established as well.
This article explores the science of tampering with organisms. Scientists have long ignored the way organisms live and adapt in a natural state, assuming that genetic mutations are accidents. However, recent research has demonstrated that organisms actually genetically adapt to their surroundings. Holdrege and Talbott argue that if scientists are to continue experimenting with genetic modification of plants and animals, they need to focus on the organisms’ natural propensities, rather than just human utility. While it is impossible for organisms to live in isolation without affecting one another, we should only modify plants and animals in a responsible manner.

In a philosophical article, Nagel sets out to explain why we presently do not understand the relationship between the mind and the body. He states that consciousness is what makes it impossible for us to solve the mind-body problem. The fact that consciousness exists in different organisms means that there is a specific meaning of what it is like to be that organism, a way of being that only that organism understands. Nagel uses the experience of the bat to illustrate the point that, because we have a certain point of view, it is impossible to understand the consciousness of another living being. We could imagine what it is like to be a bat—but if we imagine ourselves with webbed hands and hanging upside-down, we do not understand the bat’s consciousness, we understand what it would be like for us to be a bat. We do not possess a language that allows us to describe the experience of the bat, but this does not mean that the bat does not have experiences just as rich as our own. Experience is therefore completely subjective, and it is impossible to understand what it is like for the experiencing organism, like the bat, except from that one point of view—the point of view of the bat. Thus, we cannot understand the true nature of the bat’s experiences from observing the bat’s physical operation. Nagel proposes a different method to close the gap between the subjective and the objective: we should pursue a more objective understanding of the mental by itself. We should develop a new method, independent from the imagination, to think about the subjective character of experience. This could be used for humans, say, to explain to someone who was born blind what it is like to see. In any event, Nagel believes that any physical theory of the mind cannot be put forth until there is a better understanding of the more general problem of the subjective and the objective.

As animal rights activism has gained momentum in Europe, many consumers are beginning to realize the transition that takes place in the process of converting meat from animals. Europe has increased its attention to animals and factory farms. More regulations have been implemented toward animals that are housed before being killed. According to the article, it is industrialization that is contributing to the inhumane suffering of animals in the meat process. Pollan highlights a visit to a good farm, where animals are living in a natural state and do not appear to suffer before being killed. The article encourages more good farms to fix the inhumane conditions under which animals are being kept and raised, and encourages more consumer awareness.


Dugan examines the conditions under which animals are being transported in order to be considered home reared. In many instances, horses, pigs, sheep and chickens are hauled days at a time to end up being killed once they arrive at their destination. During the transit, animals are dying from diseases, heat exhaustion, hunger and stress because of the minimum allowable standard of care. The article recommends that animals should be killed prior to their transit to eliminate the inhumane conditions during transport.


This article exposes readers to seven common myths of industrial agriculture. First, contrary to what most people think, the world is currently experiencing a food surplus, not a food shortage. The reason so many people in the world are still facing a food shortage is because global corporations favor growing luxury high profit foods rather than staple foods. Peasants are also forced off their land by agricultural corporations, unable to grow their own crops and forced to work at low-paying jobs. Second, food is not as clean and safe as one thinks. More pesticides are used on crops than ever before which leads to increased cancer risk. Preserved and prepackaged meals are also high in calories, sugar and fats. Third, there are huge environmental, health and social costs associated with industrial agriculture. Widespread use of pesticides and herbicides are harmful degraders of the environment, and some are assuredly carcinogenic. Fourth, bigger farms don’t necessarily produce better foods. Big farms often use more synthetic chemical pesticides, fertilizers and antibiotics per unit of production, which increase potential adverse health and environmental effects. Fifth, whereas people think they are being offered more choices, industrial agriculture is actually causing a loss of diversity of foods. Furthermore, foods sold in supermarkets often do not provide sufficient information on their labels. Sixth, contrary to what one thinks, intensive farming methods do not protect the environment, but rather chemical pesticides and fertilizers kill wildlife, decrease biodiversity, and increase pesticidal resistance. Lastly, biotech crops will only increase industrial agricultural problems by consolidating control of the world’s food supply in the hands of a few large corporations.


This article presents a case study of the effects of Western eating habits on the people of Micronesia. The author interviews indigenous people for whom death by heart disease and diabetes is increasingly common. The grocery shelves that once held fruit now hold sugar and salt-laden imports. Obesity is on the rise. Other countries in the South Pacific look much the same. These nutrition-related illnesses are only the latest development in the history of destruction of the South Pacific, added to a list that includes smallpox, influenza and STD’s. The people of the South Pacific are genetically ill-equipped to handle the high-fat and high-sugar formulations of Western diet, but economically ill-equipped to eat anything else. Shell brings home a powerful message: as Westernization infiltrates traditional cultures, it not only changes the economic systems and the transportation methods, it changes the way the people eat, drink and die.

Michael Ableman is a small farmer from California who has maintained one of the oldest organic farms for over twenty years. In the interview, Michael explains how consumers must go beyond organic and buy locally grown food to save the environment. Industries need to consider the benefits of growing and selling for a regional market. Once industries begin to think local, it will produce an eco-friendly market saving energy, water and fuel. The article illustrates how Michael is concerned that people have become detached from the manual work of farming. As a result, the safety and quality of food has declined. Michael argues that smaller farms are more productive than large industrial farms and provide more variety for consumers.

http://www.thesunmagazine.org/issues/365/lost_in_the_supermarket

*Lost in the Supermarket* describes Michael Pollan’s new book addressing the question of “what should I eat?” Pollan explores the evolution of how humans have determined what to eat and how industry has changed our consumption patterns. According to this article, most families do not eat together, which is a reflection of industry. From microwave dinners to energy bars, industry is making sure that consumption is individual and on-the-go. Industrialization has drastically influenced our food consumption, from the way we treat our animals to the amount of food we consume. Michael Pollan challenges consumers to become more food-savvy and understand where our food is coming from.

http://www.thesunmagazine.org/issues/365

This article explores how omnivores have manipulated their natural instincts for meat and vegetables. Pollan explains how omnivores have naturally been attracted to cuisines that solved the dilemma of what to eat. For example, combining raw fish with wasabi reduces the threats posed by uncooked fish. However, the food industry has increasingly shifted natural evolutions and inclinations.


Researchers predict that today’s children will be the first generation of Americans whose life expectancy will actually be shorter than that of their parents. The main reason is that children are growing up obese and diabetic, which is indirectly caused by the huge food surplus in the U.S. Ever since the 1970s when the U.S. faced a food shortage, subsequent administrations have subsidized farmers on a consistent basis to the point where the U.S. now produces so much food that food companies create “supersize” consumer products to increase their profits. Annual subsidies to farmers now amount to $19 billion and average Americans now consume 200 more calories [day?] than Americans did 25 years ago. This is disastrous for other countries as well, because it is driving out farmers in other countries such as India since it’s cheaper for people in those countries to buy American corn rather than their own. Pollan argues that the U.S. should resolve the problem of food overproduction by resorting to a policy created and used during the New Deal. Namely, the federal government should give the farmer an option of “nonrecourse plan” to use the corn as collateral for the full value of his crop. This way, if the market improved, the farmer can sell his crops and repay the government back, or if the market failed to improve the farmer could discharge his debt simply by handing his crop over to the government.
http://www.vanityfair.com/politics/features/2008/05/monsanto200805

Monsanto is a company with patents to genetically modified (GM) seeds, which allows farmers to save the steps of cleaning and replanting seeds each harvest. The idea behind the GM seed is that the farmer can use Monsanto’s own herbicide known as Roundup to kill weeds without drastically affecting the crops. On the other hand, farmers are required to purchase new seeds each year. Monsanto polices farmers to determine if they are reusing or sharing the seeds after the harvest. Numerous investigations and lawsuits have been launched in an effort to protect the company’s patent. Monsanto has dominated the agriculture industry since the 1980’s. The artificial hormone, BST, which is injected in cows to increase milk production, has negative side effects. As a result, some dairy farmers have begun to label their product as “BST free” to alert the consumer. In response to the labeling, Monsanto has increased its efforts, mainly through legislation, to make illegal the casting of products in this manner.


According to the article, farmers in Africa are beginning to flourish because the cost of land is low, the prices for crops are rising and the output is extremely high. In recent years, flowers have exceeded coffee as the leading export with vegetables and fruits not too far behind. However, critics are skeptical about the future of farmers because too many factors are involved. Farmers need to consider climate changes, the possibility of corrupt governments, and population as factors that might hinder the rise of sustained agricultural productivity.

http://www.vanityfair.com/politics/features/2007/05/bigwater200705

*The Rise of Big Water* illustrates how private companies are taking over the water supply of many countries and the negative effects that are resulting in the transfer. The example given by the author explains how government officials of Changzhou have polluted the city’s water by allowing industries to take over and flush waste into the city’s canals. Instead of the government addressing the pollution problem, the city opted to privatize the water supply. The problem with private water companies as the article points out is that the cost of water has risen, with the hope that consumers will conserve their water intake. However, it is the poorer cities that are being affected the most. The idea of allowing the market to determine the cost of water is leaving many people without water. Mann is concerned that countries are going into large sums of debt, instead of considering other possible solutions to resolve water pollution.

Recommended

In the midst of the genetically modified (GM) crop revolution European consumers and American industry are fighting, developing nations are losing. That is the premise of this pro-GM article, which begins by tracing the history of GM crops from their early developments in America in the 1980’s. Paarlberg glosses over the role of patents and pesticides in GM’s early successes in America. He then criticizes the “phobic” boycott of GM crops by European consumers, a widespread backlash that resulted in significant bans of GM crops in Europe.
Meanwhile, in America, some manufacturers have stopped buying GM ingredients in order to prevent a boycott of their products. It is unclear what the debate over GM foods will do to international trade agreements; whether restricting GM imports will be justified under a precautionary principle or whether countries seeking to limit them will have to prove with scientific certainty that such products are harmful. Paarlberg argues that the global snafu over GM crops hurts developing nations the most. He claims that the poverty and malnutrition in developing nations could be abated by GM foods, if they could get them. Farmers in Kenya could reduce crop loss due to pests by planting crops engineered to contain an insect-killing toxin, malnourished Asians could eat Vitamin A enriched rice, and higher yield the GM crops would reduce the need to clear new farm land in sub-Saharan Africa. Unfortunately, according to Paarlberg, the GM crop revolution will not reach the countries that need it until private companies develop crops for the tropics, developing nations recognize intellectual property rights for corporations patenting seeds, and public-sector support for agricultural development is renewed. Some readers might wonder whether Paarlberg has correctly identified the winners and losers in the GM battle.


The authors present a pro-globalization perspective on the crisis of food security and how to address it. The world will be less able to feed itself in the 21st century, a fact which necessarily leads to the conclusion, in the author’s view, that the world’s need for food is best addressed by free food trade, allowing surpluses to take care of deficits elsewhere. Certainly, expecting countries to be self-sustaining won’t work—developing nations demonstrate the pitfalls of a self-sufficiency approach to food. Attempts at self-sufficiency in the later half of this century have only lead to heavy government subsidies and limitations on the nutritional variety of agriculture. The authors define GATT and WTO as “mutually managed mercantilism based on compromises” and argue for WTO negotiation of food trade agreements. Genetically modified (GM) crops promise to be the vehicle for opening up the scope of global food trade. The GM issue involves agriculture, trade, environment and food security—it demands a global structure of rules. Runge and Senauer concur with Paarlberg’s claim that GM crops can solve the problems of developing nations. They argue that we can address food security best by liberalizing trade, forming a global organization to organize and assess environmental issues, and creating emergency food provisions for developing countries to cope with shifts in the global food market.


Intellectual property rights (IPR) are increasingly changing the face of agriculture markets. Tansey points out that IPRs are unevenly distributed and the rules for enforcement are causing major debates. Patenting of seed has sown much confusion and, because of uneven distribution, many small farmers and undeveloped countries are being excluded from the benefits. The article points out that patents have the potential to commercialize farming everywhere and will continue to put small local farmers out of business. The author suggests that a balance needs to exist to address the concerns of the public and the private entrepreneur.

Demand for water will soon surpass global supply, and governments are advocating for the commodification of water. Water scarcity has already produced social conflict around the world. The future of water lies in the hands of those leading the globalization regime: corporations and financial institutions motivated by the desire to remove all trade barriers and privatize all resources. Technology is being introduced which would allow water to be shipped around the world, bottled thousands of miles from its source, consumed thousands of miles from where it is bottled. Barlow argues that this water crisis, along with the commodification of water, will translate into social inequity, increased incidents of disease, an insecure food market and mass environmental destruction. On behalf of the International Forum on Globalization, Barlow insists that access to water is a basic human right. This report calls upon local communities to protect their water resources, and proposes ten principles to help protect water from future destruction.

---

**Week 5**

9/22

- **The Environment on the Precipice**

- **Video Opportunities:**
  - “*What A Way To Go: Life At The End Of Empires*”, www.whatawaytogomovie.com
  - “*Blue Vinyl*” (2007)
  - “*Manufactured Landscapes*” (Edward Burtynsky) (Zestgeist Films 2007)
  - “*Guns, Germs and Steel*” (NATIONAL GEOGRAPHIC 2005)
  - “*The Age of Stupid*” (2009)
  - “*2012*” (2009)

- **Exhibition:** David Maisel, “Black Maps”

- **Exhibition:** Sebastiao Salgado, “Genesis”

**Readings for Week 5:**

1. Mander:
   - Chp. 7: Edward Goldsmith, *Global Trade and the Environment*.

   The central premise of this article is that the global economy is directly at odds with the needs of our environment. Goldsmith outlines the ways in which economic growth in the name of globalization inevitably produces environmental destruction. Third world countries are transformed into consumer cultures, increasing global resource consumption levels. Globalization’s emphasis on export leads to the annihilation of indigenous cultures and the destruction of native lands. The increased transportation necessary to support export trade translates into more pollution and inroads into previously inaccessible land. In order to stay competitive in the global market, nations are reluctant to adopt any environmental regulation that could increase corporate costs. Deregulation aids in the steady destruction of the environment, as international organizations like the GATT view environmental laws as illegal barriers to trade. Goldsmith’s recitation of the statistics surrounding environmental destruction brings home his
message: “there can be no trade and no economic development on a dead planet.”


The authors of this chapter have spent over ten years working together to research issues of disease through the lens of globalization. Here, they provide an overview of the effects of globalization and environmental destruction on infectious disease. When Americans predicted twenty-five years ago that infectious disease had been virtually eliminated, they apparently did not predict globalization. After listing a haunting number of statistics about the rise of disease in the modern world, the authors follow a pathogen through the environmental pathways that enable it. The large-scale movement of people and goods throughout the world make it more likely that carriers of disease will reach areas where none previously existed. Because the IMF and World Bank have imposed cutbacks in sanitation and public health in many developing nations, once a carrier arrives, the disease is highly likely to spread. As environmental degradation reduces biodiversity, the colonization of disease is made easier. With increasingly unpredictable changes in climate (again, produced by environmental degradation) some areas are left more vulnerable to disease. Finally, as the gap between rich and poor grows, those marginalized by the development process are left more vulnerable to disease, and less likely to have health resources.


Goodland is the environmental adviser to the Environmental Department of the World Bank. His article is focused on increasing awareness of the environmental limits to the global economy. As he points out, Earth’s resources are approaching empty, and we must rethink our notions of growth in order to sustain our lives on this planet. Human biomass appropriation, climate change due to environmental destruction, rupture of the ozone shield, land degradation and diminishing biodiversity are all evidence of Goodland’s assertion that we have already reached our limit of consumption. While Goodland’s outlook on the probability of change in global policy is bleak, he does offer some basic recommendations for slowing down expansion of the global economy.


Morris deconstructs the ideologies of free trade and demonstrates that the rhetoric supporting the global economy is not living up to its promises. He identifies key postulates of free trade—the adoration of bigness, the need for global markets, and the law of comparative advantage—and then neatly tears them down. The promises of globalism appear empty when seen through Morris’ acrid critique. By juxtaposing the theory with the reality, Morris demonstrates that the doctrines of free trade and globalism are in fact approaching absurdity.


Sachs argues that there are two ways to conceptualize the task of global ecology. The first—that the depletion of Planet Earth has become so great it is time to shake off Western values and retire from the development race—has virtually no voice when compared to the second, dominant ideology. Around the globe, those in power understand global ecology as a matter of “sustainable development”—a technocratic effort to keep development afloat against the drift of plunder and pollution. The global economy means no society can achieve well-being independent of development. Development has come to mean continued growth at the maximum productive capacity of the planet. According to Sachs, it is
this unquestioned link between ecology and development that will prevent the Earth from recovering from its increasing devastation.

2. Lynn White, Jr., *The Historical Roots of our Ecological Crisis*, www.zbi.ee/~kalevi/lwhite.htm

Lynn White describes the history of science, technology and ecology in order to better understand our current views of the world and the roots of the modern ecological crisis. From the translation of Islamic texts into Latin, to the invention of a more efficient plow, to the victory of Christianity over pagan religions, White analyzes man’s ever-changing vision of his place in the world. What she finds is that as human beings began to see themselves as the center of the universe and began to develop technologies that allowed them to alter the world more efficiently, they developed an exploitative view toward nature that led to the development of today’s environmental problems. White sees the roots of the modern ecological crisis in the marriage of science and technology, in the medieval view that man could exploit nature, and the Christian view that humans are the center of the universe. White then presents an alternative Christian view, that of St. Francis of Assisi, who preached to the birds and fought against the belief that human beings ruled the earth. She urges us to reject the idea that nature exists solely to serve human beings and instead understand that all parts of nature are equally important.


Griffiths discusses how human beings are so gullible and easily tempted by the artificial. As a result, humans are losing contact with natural things that make the world a beautiful place. The younger generation of the Inuit can no longer hunt and instead rely on jobs and housing supplied by the government—because the government made them attend a white school and they forgot their native ways. As a result, when a man took his son to try to hunt, though he did not possess that skill, they never came back and their bodies were recovered days later. Griffiths discusses a news story about a young man who jumped from a parking garage after deliberating for several hours. A large crowd gathered, heartlessly daring him to jump, which he eventually did. They took pictures of his dead body and posted them on the Internet. The crowd had become so desensitized by television and the Internet that they failed to sympathize with, or even recognize, the young man’s pain and the possible ending to his life. In Guantanamo Bay, artificial language is used to label torture as “enhanced interrogation techniques.” The courthouse is artificially called “Camp Justice.” The notorious prison is artificially surrounded by open oceans on three sides. Through all these examples and more, Griffiths laments our descent into a world of the artificial and rejection of the pastoral.


White believes that behind capitalist corporations and the individuals who run them is a mentality that he refers to as the Barbaric Heart. While White credits the Barbaric Heart for what appears to be admirable (its strength, energy and willingness to take risks), he also believes that the Barbaric Heart is shallow and lacking. It is dangerous because it does not question its actions. It equates success and virtue with winning, which leaves an emptiness that is filled with consumption. Moreover, the Barbaric Heart does not realize the suicidal nature of its activities. White believes that the Barbaric Heart cannot be taught the nature of its ways, but instead must be displaced by thoughtfulness. He believes that we need to create a culture that is primarily satisfied by beauty and that we need to see ourselves as the universe, merely an animal among animals.

234

In this article, author Quammen presents evidence that Earth is heading towards another mass extinction, one that would rival those of the Permian or Cretaceous. Between the years 1600 and 1900, humanity had caused the extinction of about 75 known species, mostly mammals and birds; between 1900 and 1979, humans had extinguished about another 75 known species, a rate well above the rate of known losses during the Cretaceous extinction. What is most worrisome is the numbers of species extinctions that go unrecorded; some putting that number as high as 25,000 plant and animal species. Two of the most significant factors contributing to this problem include land conversion and human population growth, coupled with increasing poverty levels. Significant as well to the current mass extinction are invasive species, which have had the effect of the extinction of less competitive, less opportunistic native species. Some researchers suggest that humans are the consummate invasive species: we’re geographically widespread, we have a remarkable reproductive rate, and we’re incredibly good at co-opting and monopolizing resources. Thus, it will take a real significant change in the Earth’s ecosystem to affect humans; perhaps a bad thing as change is needed now.


http://www.orionmagazine.org/index.php/articles/article/268

Cokinos examines the evolution of nature and the extinction of species that persists today. The article exerts the author’s feelings about the extinction. He specifically examines the era since the Permian, when 95 percent of all living creatures that existed during that time have become extinct today. The idea of extinction does not end in the Permian Era. It continues throughout the twenty-first century. The article does not intend to convince the reader of the helplessness of extinction, but to invoke awareness of the environment. He concludes by recognizing that extinction is natural.


http://www.plentymag.com/magazine/all_creatures.php

In this article, Opar researches a team in San Diego that has created a frozen zoo. The frozen zoo stores samples from more than 7,000 animals from different species. Researchers at the zoo have multiplied animals that were on the verge of extinction to inhabit the wild again. Although extinction is considered a natural process, extinction rates have increased rapidly because of pollution and environmental destruction. This presents a testy topic for it champions a technological fix to human-caused degrading activity.


http://www.harpers.org/archive/2007/10/0081742

Toxic Inaction explores the extent of toxins that exist in commonly used products. Chemicals in products include stain repellents, flame-retardants and pesticides. These chemicals have proven to result in cancer, liver or thyroid imbalances. The author also explores the lack of United States’ government regulation regarding theses toxins. The United States Toxic Substances Control Act of 1976 gave the federal government the authority to follow chemicals used by industries and allowed the government to place restrictions on those that they found to be harmful. However, the chemicals already on the market were excluded from the requirements. This exclusion affected up to 95 percent of the chemicals in public use. The article compares the implications of the European policy to address toxins: REACH stands for
Registration, Evaluation and Authorisation of Chemicals. Under REACH, industry regulations are more strenuous compared to those in other developed countries. The idea behind REACH is to act as a preventative measure unlike the US policy. REACH requires industries to take more responsibility of the health of consumers.


Ehrenfeld argues that our high tech society as a whole has been ‘pretending’ when confronted with strong warning signals about the possible future plight of our ecosystem. For example, consider the science of genetic engineering. Touted as a miracle, scientists today are pretending that their technology works as claimed, is stable, and is safe, that the euphoria of 1960 is still scientifically justified, in spite of the dangers we have since learned of, including the possible creation of virulent pathogens and disease resistance among disease organisms. Another example comes at the hands of pollution control and risk management. We pretend that we know every effect of a pollutant, that we can accurately monitor releases, and we understand environmental thresholds. And the final example that Ehrenfeld provides is that of nuclear missile defense: he questions why the public pretends that this shield is possible, when it truly is not and never will be. He concludes by suggesting if we don’t wake up and stop pretending, our world will wither, our security will vanish, and all the pretending in the world will bring us no comfort.


In this short article, Davis argues that the capacity to forget, a fluidity of memory, is a frightening human trait. The complete extermination of the American passenger pigeon, the destruction of the buffalo, and the nearly complete deforestation of Haiti are the examples that Davis points to. He is shocked to realize how effortlessly we have removed ourselves from these ecological tragedies. These events were unmitigated ecological disasters that robbed us and the future of something unimaginably precious. This century will be remembered as the era in which men and women stood by and either passively endorsed or actively supported the massive destruction of the biodiversity of this planet. The most important challenge of our times, Davis argues, is to quell this flame of destruction and reinvent the poetry of diversity.


This article argues that the time is now ripe for an amendment to the Constitution guaranteeing the right to a healthy environment. The author argues that because the Declaration of Independence claims, “all men are created equal, that they are endowed by their Creator with certain inalienable rights, that among these are Life, Liberty and the Pursuit of Happiness,” then no generation has a right to take away the unalienable rights of future generations by destroying the environment. Although federal regulation such as the National Environmental Policy Act of 1969 (NEPA) and the Endangered Species Act of 1973 (ESA) have been passed, they have had no dramatic effect in protecting the environment because they have been watered down for other major economic interests. The author also believes that lawyers and judges should be more educated in environmental and ecological issues.


Some economists have found themselves immersed in an ethical challenge about current climate change. According to the World Health Organization, annual death rates from global warming have reached 150,000 since 2000. So why are we not reducing our consumption patterns? The article further identifies that the majority of economists are not considering the ethical question of what should be done about the climate change in the market of discounted rates. The author concludes that ethical questions should be addressed to determine the current sacrifices consumers need to make for our future well-being.

In this article, Scheffran looks at recent research on global warming and its societal effects. The author notes that environmental changes resulting from climate change will affect more than human living conditions; they may threaten the fabric of our society. Depending on the level of vulnerability to global warming, societies may or may not be able to cope with major environmental changes. A look at history points to some possibilities. For example, in “the year without a summer” of 1816, during the Little Ice Age, Europe erupted in social unrest and violence. And the environmental issues faced by 18th and 19th century Europeans do not begin to compare to the climate change we can expect in the future. Scheffran looks at such impending problems as the degradation of freshwater resources and environmental migration and discusses what their impact may be on the lives of those who have to face them.

http://www.orionmagazine.org/index.php/articles/article/170

This article proclaims that hope takes you away from the present and leads you to the future of the unknown. Beyond Hope suggests that instead of hoping that legislatures will make the right decision to save the environment, we should take action. When we give up on hope, we can begin to act to save the planet. The author concludes that losing hope in our environment does not mean that we are miserable and do not care. It means that you cherish and love the environment enough to take the state of affairs into your own hands and act.

http://worldchanging.com/extra/Worldchanging_WIE.pdf

*A Brighter Shade of Green* examines the evolution of environmentalism into the 21st century. The idea of going green has transcended into the idea of staying green or a brighter shade of green. Some traditional environmentalists are scared of the new tools used in fighting the war to save our planet. On the other hand, some modern environmentalists have embraced the use of technology to conserve and revolutionize the idea of conservation.

Recommended

http://www.sciam.com/sciammag/?contents=2006-09

http://www.wilsoncenter.org


In this article, Epstein argues that there are several less familiar effects that global warming could have on our society, namely the expansion of the incidence and distribution of many serious medical disorders. Heat waves, revised weather extremes, and the spread of infectious diseases are some of the more obvious possibilities, that will also tend of have a larger effect on the developing world. Perhaps one of the greatest concerns is a warmer global environment that favors the mosquito and all the diseases
relayed by this insect: malaria, dengue fever, yellow fever, and encephalitis, to name a few. Further, global warming will also likely elevate the incidence of waterborne diseases, especially with more extreme and frequent drought and flood events. To most effectively combat this problem, a multicomponent solution is in order: a comprehensive surveillance system to predict oncoming outbreaks, a climatological prediction system to tell when conditions become conducive to outbreaks, and a system to attack global warming itself.


*Climatic Fears*, by Richard Grove. This article explores the history of colonial environmentalism during the 1700-1800s based mainly on the fear of climate change. Due to massive deforestation on colonial islands which scientists linked to rainfall reduction, forest-reserve legislation during the 1700s began to appear throughout the British, French and Dutch empires. Specifically, the Forest Department established in India in 1864 saved many forests in that country whereas in China and Thailand (where no significant reserve system developed) the forests have now largely disappeared. Grove argues that similar policies of state land-use reservation could be presently adopted in the U.S. as well as in other countries. The underlying assumption is that private capital interests could not be trusted to safeguard and conserve resources on which environmental stability as well as longer-term economic well-being depended.

*The Environmentalist Paradox*, by Gary P. Sampson. Despite decades of success, the WTO and GATT have recently been met with much criticism, especially from NGOs. Much of the concern surrounds the notion that liberalized trade can be harmful to the environment, especially in developing countries. Yet, this must be balanced by the fact that economic growth can also generate additional resources that improve the environment. Further, removing market restrictions can mean an improved functioning of markets, and enhanced competition can mean that fewer scarce natural resources are required to produce the same level of output. Additionally, WTO rules are often criticized as unwanted intrusions into the domestic affairs of sovereign states despite the fact that member governments often consider WTO rules to be quite democratic. Sampson argues that this constant clash really isn’t within the purview of the WTO at all; in fact, it has specifically left room for other international treaties to establish environmental standards and compliance mechanisms. In a perfect world, global policies founded upon a coherent approach to trade, the environment, and other social and economic matters would be formulated. Yet, countries are unwilling to forgo national sovereignty and accept strong compliance mechanisms in treaties negotiated under the auspices of the UN. Therefore, the best we can hope for is continued support of the WTO and the recognition of its true place in global governance.

*Race to the Top*, by Carl Pope. In this article, Pope reminds us that environmentalists are not really looking for sweeping changes to come from the WTO, yet are most interested in seeing that the WTO does not worsen those problems or some how act against sustainability. The most environmental damage is caused by commodity production and those industries are, for the most part, export driven. Where the WTO fails is in impliedly allowing subsidies in the form of environmental degradation. Further environmental injustice occurs when countries are barred from limiting imports based on the way products were produced, even if the production methods directly damaged the global commons. At the forefront of these concerns are the oceans and their resources; no other commodity can be so easily exploited by just one rogue country. Trade restrictions, or in the very least the threat thereof, are integral parts of the trade equation even though trade economists often disapprove of them. Further complications arise when considering the three different commons; the seas, the atmosphere, and the genetic diversity of the biosphere are all vulnerable in different ways. Pope argues the solution will come from global environmental treaties and increased scrutiny of the WTO’s agenda. He believes that a rules-based trading system can be environmentally neutral or even protective.

In this article, Sauer describes how the monumental conservation efforts to protect the monarch butterfly decades ago is now being threatened by massive U.S. agribusiness (occupying 49% of all land in the U.S.) that characterizes milkweed and the monarch as infestations. The problem is just as severe in Mexico where GATT and NAFTA implementation brought incredibly rapid economic and social transformations, including the acquisition and industrialization of vast tracts of forest-, range-, and farmland by foreign corporations. Just as in the U.S., globalization affected the smaller Mexican farmer. This problem is striking developing countries across the world. As concessions are made to foster foreigners, the nation’s domestic agriculture collapses, dependency on more expensive imported food rises, and hundreds of thousands of farmers are displaced. All of this turns to economic collapse, and in a snowball effect, the devastation of natural systems is exemplified by the destruction on the monarch’s habitat that was originally protected with great efforts. U.S. consumerism, the force that drives the globalization of agriculture and international trade on this continent, is killing the monarch. Sauer concludes by suggesting that those in the first world have a responsibility to realize that their lifestyles and financial security are dependent upon and contribute to the devastation of tropical forests and the oppression of the forest’s peoples.

References:


“"The loss of human life resulting from environmental contaminants generally does not occur contemporaneously with the exposure to those contaminants. Some environmental problems produce harms with a latency period whereas others affect future generations. One of the most vexing questions raised by the cost-benefit analysis of environmental regulation is whether discounting, to reflect the passage of time between the exposure and the harm, is appropriate in these two scenarios. The valuations of human life used in regulatory analyses are from threats of instantaneous death in workplace settings. Discounting, to reflect that in the case of latent harms the years lost occur later in a person’s lifetime, is appropriate in these circumstances. Upward adjustments of the value of life need to be undertaken, however, to account for the dread and involuntary nature of environmental carcinogens as well as for higher income levels of the victims. By not performing these adjustments, the regulatory process may be undervaluing lives by as much as a factor of six. In contrast, in the case of harms to future generations, discounting is ethically unjustified. It is simply a means of privileging the interests of the current generation. Discounting raises analytically distinct issue in the cases of latent harms and harms to future generations. In the case of latent harms, one needs to make intra-personal, intertemporal comparisons of utility, whereas in the case of harms to future generations one needs to define a metric against which to compare the utilities of individuals living in different generations. Thus, the appropriateness of discounting should be resolved differently in the two contexts.”


In this Essay, Professor Matsuda argues that the narrow focus of tort law perpetuates very real, and remediable, social harms. Using tort causation doctrine as her starting point, Matsuda demonstrates how the tort system sacrifices human bodies to maintain the smooth flow of the economic system. Time after time, tragedies occur: school systems fail, first graders shoot each other, women live in constant fear of rape. Yet each tragedy is met with the same systematic response: those without resources, those least able to correct the harm, are considered the legal cause of the harm. The economic and corporate interests that created the structure in which these tragedies occurred are absolved of legal and moral responsibility.
Professor Matsuda proposes two changes to this system. First, when determining legal cause, we must expand tort liability in consideration of the ability of defendants to avoid, prevent, and redress social harm. Second, we must exchange our egocentric notion of responsibility for a communal and connected understanding of social responsibility. For instance, when I walk over a homeless man on my way to law school, I must recognize that it is not just a social failing that caused his plight; it is a personal failing on my part. Professor Matsuda argues that we exist in, and benefit from, a society that makes his position possible, and under current understandings of responsibility, even inevitable.


In all situations of choice, we face a question that Nussbaum calls “the obvious question”: What shall we do? But sometimes we also face, or should face, a different question, which she calls the “tragic question”: Is any of the alternatives open to us free from serious moral wrongdoing? Discussing cases of tragic conflict from literature, philosophy, and contemporary life, she argues that it is valuable to face the tragic question where it is pertinent because facing it helps us think how we might design a society where such unpalatable choices to not confront people, or confront them less often. Cost-benefit analysis helps us answer the obvious question; but it does not help us either pose or answer the tragic question, and it frequently obscures the presence of a tragic situation, by suggesting that the obvious question is the only pertinent question. Nussbaum applies these reflections to thinking about basic entitlements of citizens, such as might be embodied in constitutional guarantees.


In both state and federal politics, the ills associated with urban sprawl and the political opportunities these problems present are once again hot topics of discussion. Urban sprawl causes many direct and indirect societal and environmental harms. As part of this analysis of institutional complexity and federalism, this article looks at lessons from the history of environmental law to assess whether transformative political and legal reforms are likely to arise and remain effective in combating ills associated with urban sprawl.


In this essay, Keizer argues that quiet is the most assailable form of wealth. Conflicts between anti-noise campaigners and the modern loud, indignant societies contain an implicit cultural symbolism. Those who dismiss the noise issue as “merely aesthetic” are, of course, ignoring the well-documented medical and psychological effects of noise. They are also forgetting that, in the context of relationships, aesthetics can become ethics. Keizer also finds it very interesting that noise disputes are informed by class conflict; those with lower incomes are more likely to suffer from noise than the affluent.


Dowie discusses the nuclear renaissance and its effect on Indigenous populations through the lens of the Indigenous peoples of Canada. As existing nuclear resources dwindle and as attention focuses on the desire to produce alternative fuels, the nuclear industry is experiencing a resurgence. Because nuclear energy depends on uranium, uranium mining companies are jumping at the chance to capitalize on this trend. However, nuclear energy is not the carbon-free energy source that it is claimed to be. Mining and transporting uranium, building nuclear power plants, and even running the power plants require energy from fossil fuels. Moreover, uranium mining and transportation are extremely hazardous and a spill can contaminate ecosystems for thousands of years, as well as poison local drinking water and food supplies. And those most likely to be affected by such byproducts of nuclear energy are the world’s most poor and disenfranchised citizens. About 70% of the world’s uranium is located beneath Indigenous communities in Africa, Asia, Australia, North America and South America. Mining companies therefore attempt to
mine uranium from those sources, where the people are desperate for income and politically marginalized, and thus less likely to oppose or resist mining. As Dowie points out, uranium mining is becoming “a worldwide challenge to the sovereignty of Indigenous communities.”

---

**Week 6**

9/29

- The Environment and Technology
- Control of Innovation
- Biotechnology/Biocolonization and the Patenting of Life

**Readings for Week 6:**

1. Mander:


   “. . . biotechnology, robotics, global computer networks, global television, the production and dumping of toxic, and of industrial expansion. . . . export-oriented pesticide-intensive agriculture, and long distance commodity transport. All of these technologies and processes are intrinsic aspects of a globalized economy. Given the evidence [of the multiple harms caused by these technologies], however, we still hesitate to draw conclusions about the political drift of modern technologies. We cling to the idea that technologies are “neutral,” just as we like to think of science as “value free”; that it is only a matter of access. This chapter argues that the very idea that technology is neutral is not itself neutral, as it leads to passivity to technology’s onrush and unconsciousness about its role in the globalization process. Energy technologies, automobiles, television, and computers are examined further in this light.”


   Joy is the Chief Scientist at Sun Microsystems and has spent his life designing new computer technology. This article, which blends interviews with colleagues, Joy’s favorite philosophies of science, and a bit of soul-searching, reveals Joy’s self-doubt about the real contribution of technology as he explores the possibility that intelligent robots could dominate human life. This seemingly implausible suggestion becomes believable as Joy unveils a potentially hazardous combination of expanding technology and societal attitudes. Unintended consequences are a commonly accepted component of scientific development. Despite the unforeseen harms of past technology, scientists still fail to understand the consequences of their inventions while they are in the rapture of innovation. Society unquestioningly accepts revolutionary breakthroughs in technology. We are now only thirty years away from robots with human-level computing skills. Technology has advanced to the point that the replicating and evolving processes of the natural world are about to become realms of the human endeavor. Robots will, for the first time, have self-replicating capabilities and could be produced from readily available materials—meaning that humans, or even robots themselves, could unleash a robot species on the world. Joy draws from the events surrounding the creation and use of nuclear weaponry to illustrate the need for clear ethical constraints on technology. He recommends limiting our pursuit of some types of knowledge. Truth seeking clearly has negative consequences, and society must begin to differentiate between knowledge and right before we unleash something we cannot undo.

This article poses six questions designed to provide insight into the ways in which technology intrudes itself into culture. Postman recommends the questions be considered on two levels: one’s own relationship to technology, and society’s relationship to technology. (1) What is the problem to which this technology is a solution? Postman argues that technology should not be created if it is not solving a relevant problem. (2) Whose problem is it? The people who will benefit from the technology should be the people who pay for it. (3) What new problems will be created by solving an old one? We should think in an open-eyed way about the consequences of technology before we create it. (4) What people and institutions will most seriously be harmed? If the group supposedly benefiting from the technology is actually being harmed by it, that technology is not a good idea. (5) What changes in language are being enforced by new technologies, and what is being gained and lost by such changes? When we attach a word with a social meaning to a new technology, that technology often changes the meaning of the word and unthreads part of our social fabric. (6) What sorts of people and institutions acquire special economical and political power because of technological change? The transformation of technology into a product always realigns economic and political power.


The controlling force in the present-day is what Berry dubs “Economism,” a philosophy by which humans, the democratic system and the natural world are dominated by corporate economic powers. Berry surveys the expansive reach of Economism—first it controls people, then it controls the planet, then it controls the universe—and concludes that the fatal flaw in Economism is its belief that it must change the way Earth functions, making Earth subservient to corporate power. This belief represents an inversion of the natural order—Berry argues that humans must recognize their place in the universe’s system, rather than try and force the universe to conform to the Economism system. As Berry points out, humans—despite what they think—do not have the tools by which to control planetary functioning. He outlines three conditions that he believes are necessary in order to shed the ideology perpetuated by Economism: the universe is composed of subjects to be communed with, not exploited; the human is a subsystem of Earth; the planet will never again function as it has in the past. According to Berry, efforts to outsmart the Earth will only succeed in destroying human life.


In this article Ullman searches for the answer to the question, “What unique element, if any, separates us from machines?” Her quest first led her to question, “What is human?” Computer scientist Herbert Simon offers a circular idea to this question. He believes that human life is artificial, like a computer. Therefore in order to learn about the mind, one should study a computer. However, Ullman refuses to accept Simon’s theory, arguing that human thinking is more than just rational thought and rule-based, conscious thinking. Ullman also refuses to accept the theory taken by Alife researchers that human beings are merely accidents, part of the highly accidental set of entities that exist in order to be studied. Ullman postulates that in the end, it is emotion that separate humans from machines. She argues that in order to get at the heart of intelligence, one must look at the “irrational,” the opposite of “logical.” Not only are emotions critical to rational thinking, but she questions whether it could ever be simulated. Could an entity without a body, without sensory organs, that cannot die, that cannot fear, possibly be analogous to human beings? Ultimately, Ullman concludes that the “magical quality” in human beings that separates us from machines is the ability to recognize our own kind – the ability to recognize each
other from among all others. The task to simulate such a self-identifying sentient creature in her opinion is too complex and will ultimately fail.


Chet Raymo highlights the themes that author Robert Frenay portrays in the book *Pulse*. According to Raymo, *Pulse* introduces a new promise for the future-biotechnology or the “new biology.” The author of *Pulse* believes that a new civilization is emerging into our society. The idea presented is that agricultural and industrial “revolutions” are ending. The advances in technology have allowed biotechnology to rise to the forefront. Frenay reveals that the “new biology” will treat machines as organisms and humans will be responsible for its evolution. *Pulse* acknowledges the Americans’ mass consumption patterns will end human development. Frenay suggests sustainability through “new biology” will drive the future.


Singer discusses the increasingly prevalent role robots are playing in American warfare. By 2008, the number of robots being used by the United States military was projected to be as high as 12,000. These robots do tasks that humans would otherwise have to do, often preventing human casualties, but using them also raises difficult questions. One question is whether the U.S. will be more willing to go to war when soldiers can wage war by remote control, thousands of miles from the battlefield, and make it home in time to help their kids with homework. Another question is what the human role in war will be as robots become more intelligent and more autonomous. Singer cites the case of the U.S.S. *Vincennes* which was equipped with an Aegis radar system that was capable of identifying enemy missiles and planes and defending against them. The Aegis system mistook an Airbus civilian plane for an Iranian fighter plane. Although the humans on board the ship could have overridden the system, they trusted the computer and shot down the plane, killing all 290 passengers. If humans become obsolete in warfare, are robots capable of making the kinds of moral decisions that soldiers need to make? These questions serve as a reminder that although robots at war may seem like a good solution to the human cost of warfare, they also could lead to very serious problems.


Anderson compiles a sample of articles regarding the development of a new academic field known as Machine Morality, Machine Ethics, Friendly AI, Artificial Mortality, or Roboethics. This field deals with the moral questions posed when computerized systems develop to a point where they act in such varied circumstances that designers and engineers will be unable to predict how they will behave with new inputs. Once machines become this sophisticated, they will need to make moral decisions. However, questions arise as to whether machines can make moral decisions, whether humans want machines to make moral decisions, and what or whose morality such decisions should be based on. Wallach presents several articles on the subject. First, Wallach’s own article, *The Challenge of Moral Machines* discusses the basic issues created by evolving technology. In *Will Robots Need Their Own Ethics*, Steve Torrence questions whether we need to develop moral systems in robots and concludes that we must develop a special ethics for robots to use. James H. Moor, in *Four Kinds of Ethical Robots*, believes that we cannot avoid robot ethics and explains different ways that robots can be made ethical. In *Machines and Moral Reasoning*, Thomas M. Powers discusses how a robot could follow Kant’s moral imperative. Finally, in *How Machines Can Advance Ethics*, Susan Leigh Anderson and Michael
Anderson explain their experimentation with building ethical machines and hypothesize about their future research in the field.


Ehrenreich examines the effects of hope and describes in this article her battle with cancer. She illustrates that the idea of hope masked the reality of her disease. According to the author, ideas of having positive attitudes have changed the way American society copes with reality. The “cult of positivity” has even spread to a discipline of study within many psychology departments. The article highlights studies that suggest positive people have a greater likelihood of living longer lives. There are exceptions to the rule of positivity. Certain professions have to consider worst-case scenarios instead of the positive. The author suggests ignoring the idea of hope. Instead, take control of your life and take actions to improve your situation.


Hoagland describes the depletion of a natural world to which he had become accustomed. Not only are plants and animals disappearing from nature, but also the “human way of life” has changed. Humans no longer embrace nature as a means for living. The author pleads for a reversal of our consumption patterns because the rate of change in our environment is resulting in the extinction of all natural life. Hoagland notes that every human action has a reaction on nature, as when he put out food for a local family of foxes: soon the mice, to which he had become so accustomed, had disappeared. He argues that even as it becomes more trendy to embrace nature, humans choose to do so in an unnatural way. He describes a neighbor who, after cutting down natural flora and fauna, built a private lake which he filled with frogs. The neighbor later poisoned all of “his” frogs because they were too loud. Hoagland argues that we have reached a point where we can no longer continue to consume nature, because we have nearly destroyed it all while seldom replenishing what we have taken. He concludes that whether our society dies away will depend on whether we re-evaluate our lifestyles in order to make room for the survival of the earth.

Recommended


This is a useful and practical article describing the precise nature of nanotechnology and how it has already affected our lives – maybe without us even realizing it! The author connects nanotechnology to everyday consumer products and reveals how products containing nanoparticles exist everywhere. Products utilizing nanotechnology include sunscreen and cosmetics (titanium dioxide nanoparticles), scratch-resistant coatings on ophthalmic lenses (aluminum oxide nanoparticles), antimicrobial bandages (silver nanoparticles), rechargeable batteries (lithium titanate nanoparticles), tennis rackets (carbon nanotubes) and tennis balls (nanoclay particles). The article further describes corporate nano-plans and how nanotechnology affects food, agriculture, medicine, environment, and the military.

12. Mander:


Kimbrell is an activist lawyer who has successfully brought many of the era’s landmark legal actions against corporate excess in the area of biotechnology. In this article, he marches out the “parade
of horribles” that have occurred at the hands of the biotechnology industry since the Supreme Court approved the patenting of a life form in 1980. Animals are now genetically manipulated for research purposes. Human cells and genes have been patented. The meat we eat may contain genes from humans; the plants we eat may contain genes from fish. In Third World countries, kidneys, eyes, and skin are sold in a flourishing market for body parts. Scientists from North America and Europe are invading indigenous cultures and patenting their native plants while mapping out the genetic makeup of the people themselves. Kimbrell warns his readers that the destructive force of biotechnology will not stop unless a mass movement for biodemocracy rejects the patenting of life in all forms, forever.


Shiva and Holla-Bhar discuss the threats that patenting of native plants poses to indigenous people through the lens of the neem tree in India. For centuries, the neem tree provided multitudinous benefits to the people of India, so much that it was called the “blessed tree.” Gandhian movements in India prompted research into the neem tree that would encourage the manufacture of local Indian neem-based products. In the late 1970’s, however, the benefits of the neem tree came to the attention of a multinational chemical corporation, which promptly patented a form of neem extract. A number of corporations now hold patents on various derivatives of the neem tree, leaving the people of India in an uproar. From India’s standpoint, the multinational corporations were given the Indian people’s knowledge of the neem tree’s value for free, but now the people may be deprived of free use of the plant.


Heald’s essay examines the consideration of sui generis intellectual property rights for “long-term occupant communities.” Advocates for long-term occupant communities (LTOC) want to ensure the existence of these communities, preserve bio-diversity and the survival of traditional knowledge. Biopiracy is a result of large corporations going into LTOC, acquiring their knowledge and use of a particular plant, and not sharing their profits. Advocates of LTOC are requesting the implementation of new intellectual property rights that will protect the knowledge and resources of these communities. Heald declares that new intellectual property rights are not the answer to this epidemic. There are even more threatening occurrences. LTOC are encountering corrupt governments, loggers and the disappearance of the biodiversity. Heald advocates a relationship between several large corporations and LTOC to maintain biodiversity as well as help the communities preserve traditional knowledge.


This article outlines the global efforts to sustain local cultural biodiversity. Trade-Related Aspects of Intelegence Property Rights (TRIPS) under the auspices of the the World Trade Organization (WTO) must address, collectively, patent development and biodiversity. Industrialized corporations pirate the developing world’s genetic resources. International organizations are aware of the instability of the world’s biodiversity. Many countries and research institutions are collaborating to sustain and conserve traditional knowledge. The International Cooperative Biodiversity Groups (ICBG) is a collaboration of several organizations attempting to secure the intellectual property of the people of Aguara in Peru. The ICBG-Peru Project produced a “know-how license” to ensure the people of Aguaruna the payment of licensing fees through the disclosure of traditional plant knowledge. The project has also produced a patent application that acknowledges the people of Peru as the providers of the traditional plant
knowledge. The essay also explains other global measures taken to ensure the rights of the country that is providing the resources.


Austin argues that intellectual property law needs to be expanded to thoroughly protect indigenous folklore. He discusses the various treaties have been drafted attempting to protect such rights, focusing on the WAI 262 claim of the Maori of New Zealand. However, he cautions that various issues remain, including the definition of folklore, the scope of protection, determining the beneficiaries of protection, and defining any defenses or exceptions to the laws. Moreover, decolonization creates further complexities as various nations attempt to reconstitute the relationship between the government and indigenous peoples.

Reference:


“A number of parties are ‘squaring off’ over the question of who should share the benefits derived from the exploitation of genetic resources and biotechnology. One of the fault lines that divides disputants is between developed and developing countries; another is between local communities and the dominant socio-economic cultures of the countries within which they are situated. The globalization of intellectual property laws through international trade agreements such as TRIPs and NAFTA has contributed to developed countries’ reaping the lion’s share the benefits derived from the exploitation of genetic resources. In this article, Halwood analyzes the development, in international law, of means by which local communities and developing countries could increase their own control over others’ use of their biological resource-related innovations. Exactly how these norms should be implemented in domestic law, however, is far from clear. The author argues that one plausible means of implementation would be through policies to increase the participation of indigenous communities in resource management decision-making. Another possible means would be through the creation of national sui generis intellectual property laws to protect indigenous and local knowledge. At least in theory, vesting intellectual property rights in indigenous and local communities over their innovations would assist them to stop undesired use of their knowledge and/or compel compensation when it is used.”

OUTLINE OF MEETING OF MINDS PRESENTATION,
SOURCES & BIBLIOGRAPHY DUE (5%)


Just as the human genome was being completely deciphered, genomics corporations began patenting the individual genes by the hundreds with thousands more patent applications awaiting review. The future of health care, Regaldo argues, hangs in the balance. As this race to patent continues, no congressional vote or Supreme Court decision has ever directly addressed the question of whether human genes should be patentable at all. The basic logic proffered for allowing gene patenting is that genes captured and identified in the lab aren’t in their natural form, yet they have been copied, abbreviated,
spliced, or otherwise altered. However, there is no clear result to any of these patents; useful drugs (and hence profits) are not guaranteed; only basic scientific findings are now being patented. If that is the case, how far should the patent extend? Does any drug founded upon a particular patented gene belong to the owner of that patent? If patents continue to be allowable, should patent sharing be mandated in order to encourage the most research possible? Will market forces provide a solution? And what of public opinion? These are just some of the questions considered by Regaldo.


Despite decades of contemporaneous, albeit independent, development, genes and computers have finally crossed paths as advanced computers are used to decipher, download, manage, and exploit genes. This marriage is propelling us into the biotech century. Rifkin finds significant problems with the genetic engineering experiments that go beyond what nature intended, such as the recombining of the DNA of fireflies and tobacco plants resulting in plants that glow around the clock. Rifkin fears the answers to all of the unasked questions, most significantly, will the laboratory replace nature? Issues of control, piracy of the necessary genes from nature, genetic pollution, genetic discrimination, and commercial eugenics also all disturb Rifkin. In a society that is beginning to consider life as perfectible by engineering standards, the real casualty of all of this is a loss of empathy; how empathetic are we likely to be to any child growing up that does not conform to the standards our companies and engineers have set up? Rifkin, still a strong advocate of science, suggests a genetic rights movement, using this new science to better understand our relationship to nature, helping us to become a steward, partner, and caretaker of the natural world.


McKibben describes a dangerous world in which genetic engineering could potentially make it possible for people to enhance their children’s intelligence, height, looks and even athletic ability. The danger lies not only in a future in which all human beings may be genetically programmed to possess certain abilities but also in the fact that it will ultimately become a vicious, never-ending cycle. Those parents with a child of IQ 150 may be satisfied in the beginning but ultimately disappointed and unhappy because the next batch of children could be manipulated to have an IQ of 170. Furthermore, what if a child genetically programmed with a gene giving her artistic talent decides she wants to become an athlete instead? There are also problems regarding unanticipated dangers of genetic modification. What if the programming is unsuccessful and turns the child into a moody person, or causes him to be unable to read and write? Additionally, what if the parents of a child successfully programmed decide they picked the wrong package and wanted something else instead? McKibben argues that this world of genetic arms race could be stopped if everyone makes a conscious, political choice to say no to this kind of technology.


The law review article gives a legal as well as philosophical perspective on whether parents are legally liable to a child born with “bad genes,” i.e., a life not worth living, if they could have prevented its birth. It also explores the issue of who should bear the financial burden of paying for medical expenses as well as other social costs associated with a child born with bad genes. Rakowski argues that three parties could theoretically pay for accommodating the genetic disadvantages of someone with bad genes: the disadvantaged themselves, their parents, and the community generally. Rakowski gives elaborate analysis on this issue with arguments on both sides. He also asks whether a person must exist before his right can be violated. While he doesn’t have an answer to this question, he proposes that everyone has a
right not to have been brought into existence with a life not worth living. He also believes that because people generally want to avoid having a child whose lives are not worth living, states don’t necessarily have to coerce parents to do genetic testing for certain horrible diseases; they could simply provide subsidies for screening, contraception, abortion or other services that may help.

References:

  
  While humans have been genetically modifying plant and animal species for centuries, never before have we been able to cross-distant species creating transgenic organisms. These transgenic DNA transfers are used in agriculture to provide crop plants with resistance to pests or herbicides. While seemingly benign, the real problem is that there is simply no limit to what could be done if it were worth someone’s while to do it. There are five general issues that surround the debate over GMOs: threats to human health, possible disruption of natural environments, threats to agricultural production from a more rapid evolution of resistant pests, disruption of third-world agricultural economies, and principled objections to unnatural interventions. While no unequivocal conclusions have been drawn, Lewontin is concerned that what government regulation there is has been founded upon data supplied by parties whose prime concern is not the public good, but private interest. Yet, Lewontin correctly reminds us that this commercialization of agriculture has been happening for over a century now; the creation and adoption of genetically modified organisms are the latest steps in this long historical development of capital-intensive industrial agriculture.

  
  In early 2001, within a day of each other, both Celera Genomics’ commercial project and the publicly funded International Human Genome Sequence Consortium published their results of mapping nearly the entire human genome. Ironically enough, each project had supporters from the “opposing” side; in all, more than 500 authors were noted by the two publications. Lewontin then points out that now that we know the human genome sequence, we are absolutely no closer to understanding what it is to be human. We know how many genes there are, and where they exist on the “map”, but only really know how a small handful of them actually work. What now must be turned to in full force is the “proteome,” the complete set of all the proteins manufactured by an organism. Since there are supposedly far more proteins than there are genes, this will be a huge undertaking indeed. So far, the dream of gene therapies has come unfulfilled, but proteomics has arrived to bear the full burden.

  
  “Not since the ground-breaking work of Gregor Mendel, a mid-nineteenth century monk who founded the science of heredity, had genetic understanding made such a large leap. Perhaps it means something slightly broader but still not so broad as to encompass cloning, such as any form of sexual procreation (which would include ARTs such as IVF or artificial insemination) but not asexual procreation. Thus, if one accepts the family values argument as sufficient for justifying a ban on human cloning, the ineluctable conclusion is that a similar ban on the use of adoption or ARTs, such as IVF or artificial insemination, likewise would be legally justifiable. While such stigmatization may initially manifest itself in feeling sorry for such children, such children are likely in the end to become the object
of a form of contempt: the contempt that the (supposedly) spontaneous, natural, and unplanned would tend to feel toward the (supposedly) manufactured and allegedly artificial. Such a numerical limitation on the use of donor sperm, according to the ASRM, makes the risk of procreation amongst close blood relatives essentially nonexistent and also naturally reduces the risk of a loss of genetic diversity that might otherwise be caused by the repetitive use of a single individual's sperm.”


“Generally, satisfying the written description requirement does not present a significant obstacle for the patent applicant. According to the USPTO, the written description requirement will not be met unless it is made apparent to those skilled in the art or science that the inventor was in possession of the claimed invention at the time of filing the patent application. In *Graham v. John Deere Co.* the United States Supreme Court articulated the modern test for obviousness, composed of three requirements: (1) the courts must determine the scope and content of the prior art; (2) the courts must ascertain the differences between the prior art and the claimed invention; and (3) the courts must resolve the level of ordinary skill in the relevant art. Over the past two centuries, as United States patent law transformed from a central claiming system to the modern peripheral claiming system in use today, the purpose and function of the written description requirement has changed. The next step under the guidelines involves an evaluation as to whether the patent application meets the written description requirement. Under the European Biotechnology Directive, Recitals 22 through 24 embody a ‘written description’ requirement for comparison with United States patent law.


This Symposium inaugurated what is hoped to become a series of symposia dealing with the legal issues facing the biotechnology industry.

The Project begins with an article from Professor Raymond Coletta, one of the founding members of the Society for Evolutionary Analysis in Law and, as such, a proponent of the law and biology discipline. Professor Coletta's article focuses on the essential feature of biotechnology, which is that this technology entails altering the natural course of evolution in a radically accelerated time frame. This fact raises profound ethical questions which, in turn, pose fundamental challenges for the law. Professor Coletta's paper goes beyond the difficult issues, to suggest an even more staggering ethical and legal implication of biotechnology. Drawing upon the theory of evolution, he discusses how our species' sense of ethics, and our rules of law, might themselves be the product of biological evolution. If so, does biotechnology create the prospect that humans could reengineer their sense of right and wrong, and, in turn, mean that, instead of the law controlling genetic development, genetic development will control the law?

The next article is from Professor Kojo Yelpaala. In his article, Professor Yelpaala examines the intellectual property issues raised by biotechnology development. Biotechnology has set off a debate over the extent to which companies can claim exclusive intellectual property rights in biological research results. The economic importance of this debate became even more evident when not so long ago, the prices of biotechnology company stocks plummeted in reaction to statements by President Clinton and English Prime Minister Blair, which some interpreted as calling into question the ability of companies to exercise exclusive rights over the results of mapping the human genome. Professor Yelpaala further argues that deciding upon an appropriate intellectual property regime for biotechnology requires answering fundamental questions as to the purposes and nature of property.

The third article is from Professors Julie Davies and Larry Levine. Their article looks at the tort law issues raised by biotechnology. Much of tort law has developed in reaction (often a delayed reaction) to technological developments. For example, both common law tort doctrine and alternative statutory
compensation regimes have developed to deal with injuries to workers due to the new manufacturing technologies introduced in the industrial revolution, the deaths and injuries resulting from the advent of the automobile, and harms to consumers resulting from the mass production and distribution of potentially dangerous products. Additionally, Professors Davies and Levine consider the challenges posed to the existing tort system by biotechnologically created harms. They look at whether biotechnology poses issues of sufficient complexity and novelty to merit special legal treatment, such as an overall exemption from tort liability or a refusal to apply strict liability in the biotechnology context. Professors Davies and Levine discuss how injuries resulting from biotechnology may arise and try to anticipate how courts will deal with these cases.

Professor Franklin A. Gevurtz considers some of the business organization issues facing the biotechnology industry. From a business organization standpoint, what strikes one about the biotechnology industry is the sheer magnitude of the dollars involved, both in terms of funding research and development, and in terms of potential liability if things go awry. I shall look at a couple of the implications for business organization issues which these huge dollar sums entail.

The final article is by Judith Cregan, a recent graduate of the McGeorge School of Law, who worked in the biotechnology arena prior to attending law school. Ms. Cregan highlights some of the problems with the current regulatory regime for experimental gene therapy, and proposes several specific reforms in order to enable society to better realize the promise of gene therapy.


---

**Week 7**

10/6

• Atrocity Week

• **Video Opportunities:**
  - *War Dance* (2007)
  - *The Rape of Europa* (2008)
  - *At The Edge Of The World* (2009)

**Book:** ALESSANDRA MAURO (ED.), *MY BROTHER’S KEEPER: DOCUMENTARY PHOTOGRAPHERS AND HUMAN RIGHTS* (CONTRASTO 2007)

**Website:** Sebastiao Salgado, [www.terra.com.br/sebastiaosalgado/el/chooseproject.html](http://www.terra.com.br/sebastiaosalgado/el/chooseproject.html)
Readings for Week 7:

   

   Gettleman describes the violent rapes committed against women in the Congo. The article explains that in 2006, 27,000 sexual assaults against women were committed. Officials are claiming that the assailants are refugee militias, known as Hutu, who have fled from Rwanda and are hiding in the forests. According to the article, the assaulted women are finding no relief. Families and communities are rejecting the raped women as well. The article describes how a woman’s husband divorced her because he claimed she was “diseased” after the rape. The author explains that the United Nations Peacekeepers are stepping in to provide relief for these women. Even though peacekeepers are intervening, resources are still limited.


   This is an interview that takes place on the “Day to Day” talk show with the filmmaker, Lisa Jackson, in reference to her newest film, “Greatest Silence: Rape in the Congo.” In 2006-2007, Jackson documented the rape epidemic in the Congo. According to Jackson, 5 million people have died because of the war in Congo and ¼ million women have been raped. A United Nations debate has elevated rape to a security issue and addressed prevention instead of reaction. Jackson proposes that security patrols be imposed on routes where women are going to the market, gathering firewood, etc. She also addresses the involvement of UN peacekeepers, many of whom have taken part in the rape epidemic. According to Jackson, the government sends guilty peacekeepers back to their countries for punishment. Yet, the countries rarely punish these men.


   Last year a family of gorillas was brutally murdered in Virunga National Park. The park is located in the Democratic Republic of the Congo and is home to many natural resources, such as charcoal, as well as many rival armed soldiers trying to win the war with funds from charcoal production and sales. Charcoal is the main source of energy in Kivu. In the midst of this economic war, a Congolese organization, the Institute for the Conservation of Nature (ICCN), is trying to protect the wildlife of the Virunga National Park. Unfortunately, the exploitation of these natural resources continues to endanger the wildlife. The fight to save the park and the animals within has angered many of the guerilla armies. Jenkins suspects that the gorilla killings took place because one ranger was incorruptible.


   This is a book review of *The Mountain People* by Colin Turnbull. Turnbull is an anthropologist who studies the Ik, an indigenous group located in the mountain area of Uganda, Sudan and Kenya. According to the article, the book examines the Ik after the tribe was forced to settle on the eastern edge of a Ugandan National Park because the people were no longer allowed to hunt in the national site. The Ik’s new land lacks resources to feed the village and forces the people to steal cattle. Turnbull questions the “civilized” belief that humanity is essentially good.

http://www.harpers.org/archive/2007/10/0081740

Mealer illuminates his journey along the Congo River in a search for “peace.” The article describes this 3,000-mile river as once a bountiful source of beauty, then Belgium colonialization. The Congo gained its independence from Belgium in 1960. Throughout the article, Mealer struggles with his romanticized notion of how presidential elections bring peace and stability to the Congo. The conditions of the public barges shattered Mealer’s vision of the river. Boats are packed with disease and traders who make a living hustling everyday items to the ship’s visitors. In the end, Mealer suggests that the war in the Congo is not over. The people are still fighting poverty and hunger. Peace and revitalization of the river is far from existent.


*The Selfless Gene* addresses the question of nature versus nurture. Olivia Judson examines the way groups interact with each other because of its genetic composition and its communal attitude. The article describes how the evolutionary process explains generosity. Judson’s mentor, William Hamilton, defines generosity as altruism. However, the idea of a true altruist would become extinct because of its constant need to help others.

---

### Week 8 10/13

**Happiness Week**

**Readings for Week 8:**


*The Quest for Happiness* examines the different aspects of pursuing happiness. McMahon implies that the idea of happiness has historically ethical, philosophical and religious thought associated with the term. However, Aristotle excluded happiness from his list of emotions. According to the article, Aristotle viewed happiness as an activity to express the emotion of virtue. McMahon believed that Christianity shaped the idea of happiness. Thomas Jefferson transformed the term when he referenced the pursuit of happiness in the United States Declaration of Independence. McMahon considers happiness a western idea and concludes that modern history is the quest for happiness.


This article is an interview between Barbara Ehrenreich and Laura Barcella with Alternet. Barbara is promoting her new book *Dancing in the Streets*, which examines the evolution of “communal celebration” and societal resistance. *Dancing in the Streets* suggests that humans need to dance, sing and revel in a communal state. According to Ehrenreich, all cultures are alike in which they all have singing and dancing. Barbara believes that if societies reverted back to communal festivities humans would be a lot more joyful.
3. A Prairie Home Companion Joke Programs, American Public Media.

Note: This week, the students will bring into the classroom their recommendations for and stories of happiness.

**Week 9**  
10/20

- **The Internet and Access to Knowledge**
- **Creating the Corporate Utopia: Transnationalism, The World Trade Organization and the International Monetary Fund**

- **Video Opportunities:**
  - “Life and Debt” (DVD 2003)
  - “Bamako” (2006)
  - “China Blue” (Teddy Bear Films 2006)

**Readings for Week 9:**


   Copyrights have been increasingly gaining in importance: the copyright industry has grown almost three times as fast as the economy as a whole and in 1997, copyrighted material contributed more than $400 billion to the national economy. However, as intellectual property is being converted into electronic form, new problems are being created. The same digital technology that is making copyrights ever more valuable, threatens to make it next to worthless at the hands of piracy. Nothing is safe: the author chronicles the problems seen by the book, software, and music industries. Copyright is in fact a bargain between the public and the publishers and the proper distribution of information is the key. And what sort of information? To the author and several of his sources, the debate essential to democracy depends on the national supply of substantive facts, argument, and expression, not the per capita quota of zeroes and ones. This highlights the benefits of copyright: smoothing diversity’s path by giving creators special rights to exploit their work. So, a balance must be struck, especially to preserve certain fair uses that are currently widely engaged in.


   Barlow remarks that the riddle of digital property is that we strive to reproduce and distribute this information, how can we expect to protect it? The difficulty is that digital technology has detached information from the physical plane, where property law has always found a basis. Since the inception of this body of law, the real value was in the conveyance and not the thought conveyed; in other words, the bottle was protected, not the wine. As we move into the future, we will further remove the artists from the reward for the utility or pleasure others may find in their works. Barlow argues then that all legislation and litigation should be stayed until we have a much clearer picture of enterprise in Cyberspace and our knowledge of what it is exactly we are trying to protect. It is this latter point that Barlow then focuses on; he attempts to define information as three separate concepts: as an activity, a life
form, and a relationship. Based upon these, he attempts to decipher the best course of action for the future of this ever-changing body of law.

Current website for John Barlow:
http://w2.eff.org/Misc/Publications/John_Perry_Barlow/HTML/idea_economy_article.html

3. LAWRENCE LESSIG, CODE: AND OTHER LAWS OF CYBERSPACE (2000) (Selected Chapters)
   LAWRENCE LESSIG, REMIX: MAKING ART AND COMMERCE THRIVE IN THE HYBRID ECONOMY (2008) (Selected Chapters)
   LESSIG BLOG: http://www.lessig.org/blog

   Sunder believes that the traditional practice of viewing intellectual property solely through an economic lens is insufficient in a digital age. As technology becomes available to more people allowing them to “rip, mix and burn,” as basic food items are being patented, and as the economy becomes more and more knowledge-based, Sunder argues that intellectual property law needs to be viewed from a cultural lens as well. She examines what she calls IP3, which is the convergence of intellectual property, identity politics and the Internet Protocol in order to develop a system of intellectual property law that would allow for greater democratization.


   [Abstract]


   The Uncertainty of Digital Politics addresses the relationship between new technological communications and democracy. Barber lists several general concerns in reference to technology. They are: information technology is not globally universal; new communication technology is rapidly changing; there is a stigma attached to older technology; and new technology reflecting culture that makes it rather than altering it. Since new technology reinforces a consumers’ society through marketing and advertising, there is an increased pressure toward uniform democracy. However, because there is currently no single democracy, the development of one democracy may be damaging to others. The internet’s speed, which is its primary virtue, is also its greatest vice: it promotes unfiltered and unthinking venting that does not necessarily lead to well-conceived ideas and threatens to overload us with news, opinions, and theories. Moreover, the internet divides us as we each connect to the internet via a solitary interface. Concerns such as these lead Barber to question whether a democratic cyber-community is feasible. Barber concludes that whether or not this is possible depends on the quality of political institutions, rather than of our technology.

   http://www.harpers.org/archive/2007/02/0081386

   The article confronts the idea of documenting history and its context. Joy Garnett, an artist, replicated Susan Meiselas’ photograph of the Molotov Man. Meiselas argued that Garnett’s painting misrepresents the context of history. Garnett used a portion of Molotov Man in a series documented as the “Riot” as inspiration for her collection. However, the original photograph included a man holding a rifle
and throwing a Molotov bomb at the last Somoza National Guard garrison. Meiselas argued that the picture does not present a riot, but an act of liberalization of the Sandinistas from the Somoza reign. Since she published the picture of Molotov Man, many forms of the photograph have surfaced. Meiselas is concerned that the replicas of the photograph are out of context, and argued that artists must work harder to maintain the portrayed context of history.


Jonathan Lethem confronts the history of plagiarism and intellectual property rights. According to Lethem, the use of another’s intellectual property is nothing new. Bob Dylan used inspiration from old films, Shakespeare, and F. Scott Fitzgerald.


Robbins wants to evoke new life into American literature. He understands that literature imitates life, but suggests that writers should include humor and imagination into “naturalistic narratives.” The article challenges American writers to incorporate wisdom, playfulness and magic to their pieces of work.


The idea of virtual friendships has reached new heights with the popular MySpace and Facebook social websites. Rosen addresses the social concerns related to virtual networks. She suggests these social networking sites are creating or affirming social behaviors. The term “friends” is used to identify people who are in your social network. What is missing with the use of this term is the natural face-to-face interaction that develops a friendship. Adolescences are becoming socially handicap with the use of these virtual social networks. The need for status continues within the virtual world. Many people are in a race to identify as many “friends” as possible to determine their status. These relationships are socially handicapping many people because they are consumed with the activity online and not their community that surrounds them. Rosen concludes the article by stating that there are positive attributes to virtual networks like staying in touch with old friends and meeting new ones. However, whether the virtual relationships are satisfying has yet to be determined.


“The age of the internet has brought with it exciting, fresh ideas about the disintermediation of power and peer accountability. But who is responsible for the standards and functions of the network itself? Bill Thompson charts the history of internet governance, reflects on what has been lost as accountability passes from the hands of the geeks to those of the politicians and lawyers, and offers his proposal for redressing the democratic deficit.” Thompson foresees a forum of net governance where the masses are free to communicate and discuss without intermediaries. The forum will be founded upon a reputation system that weighs more heavily the opinions of those who have participated and provided good advice in the past. He feels that central governance must not be completely done away with, but suggests that the United Nations should provide necessary centralized guidance.

This “documentary” catalogues the future of media up to the year 2014. According to this fictional account of the future of mass media, papers become outdated as all news is online. Bloggers and social networkers are able to create their own news leading to a future where all citizens are awash in a mass of news, some of it credible but much of it not.

http://www.nytimes.com/2006/05/14/magazine/14publishing.html

The author describes the movement to create digital libraries. The movement aims to create universal libraries incorporating as many books as possible, along the lines of the great library in Alexandria. A digital library will be democratic as it will proved the masses with access to millions of books. However, it will be even more revolutionary because it will create a new means of sorting books by linking them based on subject matters. Readers will be able to click on a link in a footnote and immediately be taken to a different book. Each book will cease to exist independently and will instead be part of a larger whole.

14. Mander:

$\text{Chp. 26: Tony Clarke, Mechanisms of Corporate Rule.}$

In this article, Clarke highlights the tools by which multinational corporations have essentially taken control over the people and nations of the world. He begins by describing the “corporate state alliance,” a behind-closed-doors council made up of leading multinational corporations who work together to promote policies that serve their interests. This alliance has effectively overridden many of the powers and tools of national governments, and in place of those national governments, the WTO now serves as a global governing body for transnational corporate interests. Global systems have been usurped by transnational corporations and banks via global finance, global industrial production, global production distribution, resource control, banking, insurance, education, patenting of life forms and cultural cloning. Clarke ends the article by calling for a citizens’ manifesto, a social movement in which all people of the world demand control over their own economic, social and ecological future.

$\text{Chp. 27: Jerry Mander, The Rules of Corporate Behavior.}$

Mander dispels the notion that corporations are neutral structures whose harms to people and the environment are caused by the greed and heartlessness of the leaders within the corporation. Instead, corporations are compelled to operate by a set of rules, regardless of the personal feelings of those working within the corporation. It is these rules that produce the harmful effects of corporate-led global economy. The number one rule in a corporation is profit, followed by growth. Other rules shaping corporate actions include competition and aggression, amorality, hierarchy, quantification, linearity, segmentation, dehumanization, exploitation, ephemerality, mobility, opposition to nature, and homogenization. When weighed against these rules, concern for mankind and nature inevitably lose out, and any corporate employee who puts ecological and social concerns ahead of the corporate rules loses his job. Corporations are not people. Thus corporations cannot feel shame or remorse, and will never be motivated to change when faced with moral arguments against their actions.

Grossman and Adams take the reader back to a time when corporations did not rule the Earth. By describing the history of the corporation, the authors point out that states gave corporations the right to exist via state charters of incorporation. These charters require corporations to obey all laws, serve the common good and do no harm. Over time, corporate special interests began to invade the legislatures, and court decisions began to give corporations constitutional rights. Eventually, corporations grew in power, becoming the principal instrument of the concentration of economic power and wealth. Grossman and Adams advocate for taking back control of state charters of incorporation, thereby setting in motion organizing efforts to recharter new enterprises that do not have the vast privileges and immunities enjoyed by today’s corporations.

15. LAWRENCE MITCHELL, CORPORATE IRRESPONSIBILITY

Mitchell argues that, while American corporations are viewed by many with wonder due to their creation of material well being that allows many to live the American dream, while others view American corporations with horror. The horror stems from the fact that limited liability allows corporations to externalize their costs of production on others, that corporate layoffs treat workers as disposable and factory closings destroy entire communities, and that the disparity between the fabulously wealthy and the very poor continues to widen. Mitchell reminds the reader that not all nations want this to happen to them; that the acquisition of wealth is not their main priority. Right now American corporations strive to maximize short-term profits while limited liability encourages irresponsibility. Therefore, unless changes are made in cultural and business norms, exporting corporations will not help developing nations.


Klein believes that a conversation about reigning in multinational corporations necessarily includes mention of the role that the corporate brand plays in our sense of social meaning. As a rule, corporations know that they have to sell more than a product to beat out the competition—they have to sell meaning. This brand mania is changing the way we conceptualize politics (Benetton), community (Apple) and inspiration (Nike). It also separates the company from the product—the company creates the meaning, the product comes from wherever it is cheapest. Klein argues that brand imaging depends on free trade, but that the harmful effects of free trade on developing nations completely contradict the social meaning those products are imbued with. The author celebrates increasing incidents of protest against brand image and in favor of human rights.

Recommended:


This article examines whether corporations have specific social responsibilities besides maximizing profit. Currently, mainstream corporate law theorists believe that corporations owe responsibility only to their shareholders. In contrast to this view, the “irresponsible” position conceptualizes the corporation as a nexus of implicit and explicit contracts between shareholders, bondholders, managers, employees, suppliers, and customers. As a result, corporations ought to consider the implications of their actions on these other constituents as well. Unfortunately, Williams argues that current regulatory law and contract are unable to protect the interests of these constituents. Developing countries usually attract outsourcing. Because the standards of living in these countries are raised, regulatory standards remain low and companies exploit this lack of regulation for their financial benefit.
Furthermore, evidence also suggests that in order to compete for investment on the basis of low wages it is causing wages to remain low in many developing countries. The author also goes on to mention the impact of corporate governance on economic inequality and the effects of globalization on countries’ redistributive policies and concludes that taxation and redistribution fail to fully remedy the concerns of corporate social responsibility.


Ms. Ramirez argues that, although corporations are legal entities just as humans are and can commit crimes in the same way humans can, because corporations are soulless, they cannot truly be punished. She suggests replacing the worst human offenders on the board of directors with others in order to deter against criminal conduct. A different recourse could be “three strikes” type laws that would force a change in management or dissolve the corporation after three convictions. In this way, corporations would be given similar incentives to behave legally as are individuals while enjoying the benefits of legal entity status.

Reference:

- *Symposium ≠ Corporate Social Responsibility: Paradigm or Paradox?,* 84 CORNELL LAW REVIEW 1133-1355, July 1999.

This volume of the Cornell Law Review features articles by the scholars featured at a Cornell symposium on social responsibility. The articles include: *Commonalities and Prescriptions in the Vertical Dimension of Global Corporate Governance*, by Lawrence A. Cunningham; *Why They Give at the Office: Shareholder Welfare and Corporate Philanthropy in the Contractual Theory of the Corporation*, by Henry N. Butler and Fred McChesney; *Corporate Social Responsibility: Dangerous and Harmful, Though Maybe Not Irrelevant*, by Yoshira Miwa; *Social Responsibility of Corporations*, by Peter Nobel; *Fiduciary Duties as Residual Claims: Obligations to Nonshareholder Constituencies From a Theory of the Firm Perspective*, by Jonathan R. Macey; and *Transcript: Corporate Social Responsibility: Paradigm or Paradox?,* from the symposium.

- Ford Motor Company 2000 Corporate Citizenship report, [www.ford.com/serve...AndCulture&LEVEL3=buildingRelationships](http://www.ford.com/serve...AndCulture&LEVEL3=buildingRelationships)

“During the past year, we built and nurtured relationships with people inside and outside Ford with diverse perspectives on sustainability and corporate citizenship . . . This report shares our evolving vision of sustainable mobility and our plans for action on three strategic issues: creating business value, addressing climate change and protecting human rights. Included is a review of our environmental, economic and social issues and performance.” This report includes an overview of Ford’s renovation of the Rouge plant in Dearborn, Michigan. Sustainability architect William McDonough re-designed the plant to include a living roof, water conservation systems and solar power.

19. Mander:


When the Uruguay Round of the General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade was signed in 1994, not a single United States Congressman who signed it was willing to also sign an affidavit asserting that he had read the 500-page document. In other countries, some governments did not even translate the agreement into their own language prior to signing it. In this article, Nader and Wallach outline the details of the GATT agreement and explain the consequences of the uninformed votes that made it a
reality. The crux of their argument is that GATT, and the global laws it creates, has the power to effectively wipe out the democratic process, and with it local, state and national governments’ ability to protect the environment, health, labor and human rights. International rules, which protect corporate interests almost exclusively, can trump national governments’ rules. All elements of the negotiation, adoption and implementation of the free trade agreements exclude citizen participation. Countries have given up their control over corporate behavior. The result is a global, non-democratic political system in which people lose, nations lose, and corporations win.


When the WTO met in Seattle on November 30th, 1999, more than 700 organizations and more than 40,000 people protested in the streets. This diary by Paul Hawken recounts the protesting experience. Human rights activists, labor activists, indigenous people, steel workers and farmers faced off against the Seattle Police Department, the Secret Service and the FBI. Delegates to the WTO meeting were unable to get past protestors to reach the opening ceremonies. Protestors blocking key points of entry were clubbed, gassed and beaten. Police armed with military weaponry launched tear gas into the crowd. Black blocs broke the windows of multinational corporations but left local businesses untouched. The WTO meeting eventually ended in a stalemate. Hawken layers his anecdotal description of the protest with a critique of globalization. This article is a well-crafted portrayal of the two sides of the globalization debate at their most passionate moment.


Finnegan gives a lucid and comprehensive account of the effects of free trade and globalization on every corner of the globe and on every aspect of our lives. He demonstrates that the U.S. is a hypocritical country in terms of espousing the doctrine of free trade. While the U.S. shoves the free trade doctrine to every country in the world, it practices (when it pleases) protectionism. For example, when it’s in the U.S. interest to raise tariffs and give subsidies to its own farmers it does so willingly. When other countries do so, it’s condemned. This article also shows how free trade economics have destroyed many countries in Latin America, such as Argentina and Bolivia in recent years, as well as the role of the IMF and the World Bank. It also describes some free trade success stories, such as China and the Four Tigers of Asia. Even those countries however, have strict capital controls and China has gone slowly with privatization. Moreover, Finnegan points out that free trade and economic growth which most regard as an overall social good, is not always so. For instance, some growth is so unequal that it heightens social conflict and increases repression. Furthermore, there is growth so environmentally damaging that it takes away a society’s quality of life. The truth is, in many countries, a dominant ethnic minority is reaping almost all of the benefits of free trade while the poor and working class bear the burden and absorb all of the harms resulting from globalization.

**Recommended**


This article attempts to respond to some major criticisms of the IMF. First, critics say that the IMF loan programs impose harsh fiscal austerity on countries that have tight budgets. Second, IMF loans encourage those who finance the fund to invest recklessly. Third, IMF advice to countries suffering debt only aggravates economic conditions. Fourth, the fund pushes countries to open themselves up to destabilizing flows of foreign capital. Rogoff responds by asserting that the harsh fiscal austerity is not really true because the country that needed the money to begin with was already in an economic crisis. The fact that the IMF insists on being paid should not be seen as the IMF forcing the country to cut domestic programs. Second, Rogoff claims that creditors are in fact being paid, and not receiving subsidies from the Fund. Therefore, the moral hazard theory is not all true. Third, IMF advice doesn’t
necessarily aggravate economic conditions. The source of the problem is that these countries are not well regulated. In countries that have succeeded with IMF help, the reason is because their developed domestic financial markets were extremely well regulated. Fourth, the IMF should not encourage countries to just shut their doors. The fund provides a forum for exchange of ideas and eliminating it will not solve any fundamental problems.


This group of articles is a series of debates over whether NAFTA – nine years after its inception – has produced beneficial results in the U.S. and Mexico or if it created more problems than it resolved. Cavanagh and Anderson argue that NAFTA was a “Bad Idea that Failed” because although the amount of trade increased between the U.S. and Mexico during these nine years, it failed to reduce poverty or raise wages in Mexico. Furthermore, NAFTA also failed to improve broader social goals such as creating jobs or cleaning the environment. In fact, NAFTA makes it more difficult for countries to tackle environmental problems because of the provision in the agreement (Chapter 11) that allows foreign investors to sue governments directly over an act that might devalue their investment. On the other hand, Serra and Espinosa argue that NAFTA was a success because exports from Mexico to the U.S. have grown tremendously in the nine years. In fact, it doubled those of the rest of the Latin American countries. They also argue that because of inflation and a series of massive devaluations, real wages actually increased for Mexican workers. While Serra and Espinosa seem to admit to several facts asserted by Cavanagh and Anderson, such as the environment getting worse and Mexican corn growers being driven out of business by the low U.S. corn prices, they attribute these problems to lack of funding for government services and justify the corn problem by the fact that overall the benefits of NAFTA outweigh the harms caused.


Kennedy raises several issues regarding the free trade agreements to which the United States is a signatory. For example, what impact have free trade agreements, which focus on natural resource extraction, have on foreign environments? Do multinational corporations have a social responsibility to the peoples of other countries whose lives they can affect so powerfully? How can intellectual property rights be utilized to protect traditional knowledge? These and other questions serve as a reminder that free trade agreements are not only economic treaties, but have vast environmental and social impacts that need to be recognized.


The authors describe the way that globalization is chipping away at indigenous peoples’ traditional knowledge as well as destroying ecosystems were indigenous peoples used to live sustainably. In order to deal with the destruction of these ecosystems, pharmaceuticals are embarking on multimillion dollar campaigns to obtain as much traditional knowledge about plants as possible before this information has been completely eroded. The authors argue that current intellectual property law is ill-served to protect the rights of indigenous peoples. Lifelong patents allow corporations to become monopolies over pharmaceuticals. Because these corporations are driven by lucrative goals in favor of private rights, sovereign governments can be overwhelmed by transnational corporations and lose control of bioethics. The authors therefore call for revisions of the TRIPs Agreement to provide meaningful protection for biodiversity and traditional knowledge.

References:


The World Bank, IMF and WTO global alliance has delivered worldwide wreckage, but its greatest hardships have fallen on the world’s ever growing ranks of impoverished people. This issue of *The Ecologist Report* is dedicated entirely to articles suggesting various approaches to resolving the crisis of poverty. The first section of the publication focuses on the World Bank: its philosophies, its contributions to a destructive African oil project, its role in a plan to relocate Chinese farmers to Tibet, and an interview with its Governor. The second section focuses on the International Monetary Fund (IMF): the effects of its structural adjustment programs, its role in the famine in Ethiopia, its contributions to the financial crisis in Asia, and how it increases the poor’s burden of debt. This section on the IMF also includes an article by Joseph Stiglitz, former World Bank Chief Economist, in which he speaks out against IMF, and an article addressing whether IMF should be reformed or abolished. The third section focuses on the World Trade Organization (WTO): the constraints it places on the world’s poorest nations; its threat to Third World Farmers; what new WTO issues will mean to the South; how it hurts banana farmers, babies and AIDS victims; and the issues surrounding Southern access to Northern markets. This section includes an interview with WTO Director-General Mike Moore, an article questioning the wisdom of reforming the WTO, and the NGO’s manifesto for change. The final section of *The Ecologist Report* is dedicated to solutions and campaigns for reform. It includes an article in favor of localization, and a piece on how to get involved. As a whole, this issue presents a very thorough overview of the arguments against globalization.


“The Free Trade Area of the Americas (FTAA), currently being negotiated by 34 countries of the Americas and Caribbean, is intended by its architects to be the most far-reaching trade agreement in history . . . it goes far beyond NAFTA in its scope and power [and] would . . . create a new trade powerhouse with sweeping authority over every aspect of life in Canada, the Americas and the Caribbean. [FTAA] will give unequalled new rights to the transnational corporations of the hemisphere to compete for and even challenge every publicly funded service of governments, including health care, education, social services, culture and environmental protection. The proposed FTAA also contains new provisions on competition policy, government procurements, market access and dispute settlement that, together with the inclusion of services and investment, could remove the ability of all the governments of the Americas and the Caribbean to create or maintain local or national laws, standards and regulations to protect the health, safety and well-being of their citizens and the environment they share. Once again . . . this free trade agreement will contain no safeguards in the body of the text to protect workers, human rights, social services or health and environmental standards . . . However, the stakes for the people of the Americas and the Caribbean have never been higher; it appears a confrontation is inevitable.”


The focus of this issue of *The Economist* is on promoting globalization as the best possible future for the world economy. The editorial defends globalization as a moral cause. Three major articles are devoted to the globalization topic. One article explores the problems presented by protests against the WTO, specifically because they are growing increasingly successful. Another article addresses how new
technology will affect the world economy by making it more efficient and boosting its growth. The third
article argues that while high oil prices will reduce growth and lift inflation, forecasts of the exact size of
the impact should be treated with care. This issue of The Economist offers an interesting counter-

---

**Week 10**

10/27

- **Bioregionalism and Conserving Communities**

**Readings for Week 10:**

1. Mander:
   - § Chp. 34: Wendell Berry, *Conserving Communities.*
     Berry takes a personal look at the effects of globalization on his family trade—farming. That microcosmic glance then expands ever outward as the author addresses the macrocosmic harms of globalization and free trade on community. For local farmers, globalization means agribusiness, which means the complete loss of farming culture. For all communities, a postagricultural world means a postdemocratic, postreligious and postnatural world. Berry argues that a new political scheme is beginning to take form: a two party system comprised of the global economy vs. the local community. Speaking out in favor of the local community system, Berry offers a recommended set of rules—question innovation, include local nature in the community, supply local needs first, and so on. He also offers some common sense steps for bringing local communities back to power. The article offers compelling arguments for sustaining life on earth through rejection of the global economy system.

   - § Chp. 37: David Morris, *Communities: Building Authority, Responsibility, and Capacity.*
     David Morris works for the Institute for Local Self-Reliance. In this article, he outlines the ways in which American society has lost its sense of community, and makes some practical recommendations for getting it back. By emphasizing local authority, local responsibility and local capacity, Morris argues, communities can actually become more economically efficient and socially productive. Morris recommends we reduce our sense of scale. Small-scale projects, as proven by studies of schools, banks and manufacturing facilities, are actually more efficient, democratic and environmentally benign. He advocates we get rid of our reliance on private cars and trucks. Private transportation systems require wasteful subsidy by the government, as well as demand nearly one third of city land. Morris also recommends focusing on local sources of energy. When we use the energy sources available in our community—sun, wind, water—we minimize the need to import non-renewable resources. Finally, trade agreements should emphasize local responsibility by setting minimum, not maximum, environmental and social standards. By moving away from a global standard that is so often under-protective, communities will be better able to protect their local farms and businesses.

     Sale, a well-known author and contributing editor of The Nation, advocates for bioregionalism as an alternative to globalization. Bioregionalism is a paradigm for human existence based on the premise that we should be “dwellers in the land,” understanding the limits of resources around us and living in harmony with the unique ecologies of distinct regions of land. Sale argues that there are three key concepts to bioregionalism: know the land, learn the lore, and realize the potential. Bioregional boundaries are multi-layered. Ecoregions are the widest, defined by natural plants and soils. Within ecoregions are georegions, defined by physiographic features such as rivers and mountain ranges. Within
georegions are morphoregions, defined by distinct life forms on the surface and the land forms that gave rise to those clusters of life. Communities exist within morphoregions, such that the community identity is intricately bound to the features of the environment surrounding it. Bioregionalism depends on a very different notion of scale than globalization. Communities are designed to be self-sufficient and self-perpetuating. Economies are likewise self-contained, rather than global. Sale argues that bioregionalism, with its focus on decentralization and sustainability, is a far healthier alternative for the people and the planet.

2. Marglin, Stephen, *The Dismal Science*
   § Ch. 4: Individualism
   Marglin begins this chapter with the (perhaps) obvious point that “[i]ndividualism is one way of being in the world rather than the only way.” He makes this point because individualism is such a central aspect of both economics and the ideology of modernity that it is easy to lose sight of such an obvious statement. According to Marglin, the market requires the self-interested individual to function well. This is because mainstream economics has always focused on how efficiently economic institutions deliver goods. For some, efficient economic systems serve to maximize the “slice of the pie” for society as a whole. For libertarians, the goal is to maximize one’s own slice. However, in mainstream economics, individualism plays a pivotal role in society; by self-serving actions, individuals promote efficient production and distribution when mediated by the market. Four other assumptions are necessary to show how individuals serve the market: given preferences, universal agency, radical subjectivism, and self-interest. However, Marglin shows how each of these fundamental assumptions are full of holes—a problem which questions the ability for economics, or the market, to determine what is best for society. Rather than having a given set of preferences, humans experience changing preferences. Because changing preferences is a social process, one that requires social interactions, it leads away from individualism. Individuals also lack complete agency; rather, agency is a function of relationships with other members of society. Individual preferences may be overridden by group standards. Humans feel a moral duty to act for the benefit of others, as opposed to always feeling self-interested. These holistic assumptions co-exist with individualist assumptions in modern societies. The problem is that, in the modern West, individualism and holism are out of balance—holism has “gone underground.” In order to economics to suggest a way that will really benefit society as a whole, it needs to take into account holist assumptions as well.

   “We have an environmental crisis because we have consented to an economy in which by eating, drinking, working, resting, traveling and enjoying ourselves we are destroying the god-given world.” Berry criticizes globalization, claiming that it allows corporations to dominate the world market, buying cheap and selling high; destroy land-using economies; infiltrate political systems and promote a series of misaligned assumptions about what is important to the world’s people. As an alternative, Berry argues in favor of the local economy concept. The idea of a local economy rests on the principles of neighborhood and subsistence: people within a community protecting what they have in common, exporting only their surplus and rejecting imports that threaten local production or the rights of people and the environment elsewhere. By utilizing local economy systems, people can regain control over their communities, governments and resources.

The authors profile John Stilgoe, Professor of History of Landscape Development at Harvard University. Stilgoe is an expert on urban and rural landscapes, reading them for revelations into the changes in human lifestyle and economy over the past several hundred years. He studies potholes, clothing, the configuration of parking spaces and other everyday, ordinary things. From these observations he can explain the migration of industry from North to South to abroad, why professors don’t need elbow patches on their tweed jackets, and the reasoning behind housing regulations that required car garages to be built of concrete. Stilgoe claims that period studies are valuable tools for future planning, as well as windows into our vanishing past.


Roszak, is the author of *The Longevity Revolution and the True Wealth of Nations*, a comprehensive study of the cultural and ecological implications of longevity. In this article, Roszak embraces the increasing longevity of humans as a new age of discovery. He speaks out against the political argument that America cannot afford the aging Baby Boomer generation. According to Roszak, the number of healthy, secure senior citizens in a country should be an indicator of its economic success. As people age, their values change and they become more focused on introspection, home and family, while less focused on consumerism. The fact that the wisdom of the elders is regarded as a cost to society, rather than a gain, reveals a flaw in the ideologies of industrial economy.


Sachs takes issue with the Worldwatch Institute’s State of the World report, which addresses the problem of increasing demand and dwindling resource supply by advocating for efficient resource management. According to Sachs, by making production central to the economic worldview, Worldwatch ignores the possibility that societies can function on an intermediate level of consumption. Sach argues that there are certain things in life that cannot be viewed as resources, but that should nonetheless have a place in our worldview of value. Similarly, societies should not be conceptualized only by their production, such that well-being is equal to well-having. Humans are not driven solely by concerns for efficiency, and a system that measures the world by efficiency, resources and management undercuts social values, such as culture, community and connectedness, that are necessary to prevent resource depletion.

References:


Illich explains that the notion that humans are destroying themselves has gone from being viewed as radical extremism to common knowledge. He argues that the current problems of our society must be viewed from their historical beginnings: the lack of clean water in urban centers springs from the reduction of native crops and destruction of farming communities. By understanding this, we can see how things society views as “needs” are really derived from “wants,” from the never ending goal to develop. On the bright side, he sees how resourceful individuals with no other options have managed to survive in the bleakest environment, such as citizens of the “City of the Dead,” the poor living in the cemeteries of Cairo. Illich concludes that “life” can only be separated from “death of nature” by creating a self-regulating lifestyle where an ecological man protects life and defends against the depletion of natural resources.

   http://www.digitalnpq.org/archive/2004_fall/26_touraine.html

Touraine has defined himself as being neo-modern. Neo-modern extends from the term post-modern. The idea behind neo-modernism is that people can live in a world where the environment and “cultural initiatives” are equal. Touraine suggests that ecological movements will change the modern society and ecology relationship. He agrees that man must release his Industrial Revolution era belief that he can dominate and control nature. However, he disagrees that ecology requires man to surrender himself to domination by nature; rather, man should continue to take charge of his own actions. As a neo-modernist, Touraine believes that man can continue to create culture, but must seek an equilibrium between this cultural initiative and the environment. To do so, human rights must provide a check for reason, and ecology must provide a check for industrial development. Humans will be the center in the sense that they will create their own senses of self, but they will not take center stage in the cosmos. Touraine believes that it is our choice to allow the West to prosper by creating a balance between remaining modern and becoming ecological.


When environmental decline first hit the radar screens of industrial developers, they devised a new system known as eco-efficiency that was intended to lessen the impact of industry on the environment. According to McDonough and Braungart, eco-efficiency cannot result in long-term success because it works within the system that caused the environmental problems in the first place. Instead, the authors advocate for a reshaping of human industry, a plan of action known as The Next Industrial Revolution. This new approach to industry starts with manufacturing products designed for reuse and recycling. When consumers are done with a product, the manufacturer takes the product back, breaks it down and puts it back into the system. As an example, McDonough and Braungart describe their compostable upholstery fabric, manufactured from nontoxic chemicals using a process that does not pollute the air or water. When the carpet wears out, the manufacturer takes it back and reuses the materials. McDonough and Braungart also explain how The Next Industrial Revolution can change agriculture, shoes and architecture. With focus on equity, economy and ecology, these leaders of The Next Industrial Revolution promise that a better, safer system is on the horizon.


   http://www.vanityfair.com/culture/features/2008/05/mcdonough200805

   The article profiles the work of William McDonough, an architect and co-founder of the Cradle to Cradle movement. Cradle to Cradle anticipates that, in order to maintain our way of life, humans must learn to design and build sustainably. Thus, all organic products must return to the earth to feed its “biological metabolism,” while everything else must be recycled as “nutrients” for our “technical metabolism.” McDonough, who has reportedly worked with such companies as Google, WalMart, and Whole Foods, as well as the city of San Francisco and several Chinese municipalities, believes that “[i]f we understand that design leads to the manifestation of human intention, and if what we make with our hands is to be sacred and honor the earth that gives us life, then the things we make must not only rise from the ground but return to it, soil to soil, water to water, so everything that is received from the earth can be freely given back without causing harm to any living system.” Therefore, good design does not reduce waste, but eliminates the entire concept of waste. According to McDonough, by utilizing sustainable design, we can undo the damage caused by the Industrial Revolution and create a sustainable future.
11. Declaration of Interdependence

Prior to September 11, 2001, the United States had completely lost touch with global issues, and had become focused on internal affairs. It had become the naysayer at the UN when it came to such matters as the environment and human rights. Throughout most of the world, environmentalism is a luxury that few can afford to embrace. This is not the case in the US, where an environmental awakening first took place in the 1960s. This awakening was also spreading throughout the industrialized world, as people recognized that industrialization had produced dire consequences. Environmentalism alarmed the governments of these nations, as economic growth depended on land use and the destruction of natural resources. Thus, the UN became a forum for organizing environmentalists and scientists throughout the developed world in an attempt to develop smarter means of growth. At the same time, an international civil society was developing in the post-WWII era, including NGOs, and the development of transnational corporations transformed civil society into an unprecedented transnational force. Unfortunately, isolationism and consumerism in the US has prevented our civil society from becoming a self-conscious political force. However, September 11 provided us with a striking example of how intertwined our fate is with the rest of the world. Civil society should be utilized to make environmentalism and human rights central issues, because if we do not deal with these issues now, our children and grandchildren will have to do it for us.


13. The Earth Charter

According to www.earthcharterinaction.org, “[t]he Earth Charter is a declaration of fundamental ethical principles for building a just, sustainable and peaceful global society in the 21st century. It seeks to inspire in all people a new sense of global interdependence and shared responsibility for the well-being of the whole human family, the greater community of life, and future generations. It is a vision of hope and a call to action.” The charter acknowledges that such goals as the eradication of poverty, sustainable living, equitable economic development, and human rights are interconnected. The charter thus provides an inclusive and integrated framework for achieving these goals. The charter began as a United Nations initiative, but was carried out by an international civil society initiative. The charter encourages us to work internationally and seek a common ground in order to accomplish shared objectives.


Thomas Berry is “geologian” whose lifework consists of promoting a new relationship between humans and the earth. The article is an interview between Caroline Webb and Thomas Berry in reference to his vision for an “Earth Democracy.” Berry believes that human destruction of the earth is directly related to the theory of law. He advocates for a human world that exists equally with the natural world. According to Berry, a hierarchical system should not exist that allows humans to dominate the environment. He believes that a proper relationship should exist between human technology and natural technology. He argues that it is impossible to have health humans on a sick planet: to have healthy humans, the earth must be healed first. The United States Constitution, according to Berry, serves to protect only human things at the expense of the planet. By giving humans property rights, the Constitution enshrines our appetite to devour everything around us, rather than to preserve it. However, destroying the Earth will inevitably prevent us from having a healthy human economy. Thus, Berry argues that humans must understand the natural order, first, and then find our place in it second, rather than trying to fit the natural order into a human world. This environmental structure must also extend to the legal realm, and laws must be fit into the context of the Earth as a whole in order for humans to survive.

http://www.orionmagazine.org/index.php/articles/article/13

Written nearly immediately preceding the 2004 presidential election, Bass writes of his memories of the previous four years under the Bush administration. He mourns the period when we briefly stood together after September 11th, before the war in Iraq ripped the United States further away from the respect of the world. However, Bass also points out that Americans were at war before September 11th: minorities and homosexuals lost rights; the environment was attacked and protections were stripped away; the battle between seniors for affordable prescriptions and pharmaceutical companies for profits; wars of insensitivity and simply not paying attention. However, Bass felt Americans could rise to the fight, stating “Bravery is how you might respond when under relentless or horrific attack: When you hold your ground and fight back. Courage, I think, is different, and harder to attain: To fight when you might not have to; when no one would know the difference.” Bass calls on Americans to exercise courage so we leave our children and grandchildren with inspiration, rather than destruction.


Terkel, who was then over 90 and had lived through the Great Depression, World War II, and the Civil Rights movement, explains that hope remains even in the most desperate of times. His book, *Hope Dies Last*, took its title from a Spanish saying relied upon by farmworkers in the days before Cesar Chavez: “La esperanza muere última.” When we have lost everything else, hope will be the one thing that remains, and to lose hope means to lose everything. However, more than hope is required to make the world a better place. Terkel argues that we must act, that activists truly contribute to the world, even if they cannot make it perfect. Terkel then compiled brief biographies of activists he believed had made an impact: Elaine Jones, director of the NAACP Legal Defense Fund; Eliseo Medina, former organizer for Cesar Chavez and executive vice president of the Service Employees International Union (SEIU); Usama Alshaibi, sound engineer at the Chicago Historical Society, independent filmmaker, and newly sworn-in U.S. citizen who immigrated from Iraq where he was born the son of a Palestinian mother and an Iraqi father. This article provides inspiration to continue hoping and begin acting to make such hopes a reality.


Korten argues that capitalism has hampered democracy, the market, and human rights. He analogizes the current state of capitalism to a disease. He thinks that the market is not itself a problem but that capitalism “is to a healthy market economy what cancer is to a healthy body.” In order to cure this “cancer,” Korten states that we must eliminate limited liability corporations and create a post-corporate world. Some of the actions Korten suggests are ending the legal fiction that corporations are people, excluding corporations form politics, implementing campaign finance reform, and regulating international corporations. Korten admits that eliminating the prominence of corporations from our society will be difficult but feels that human rights and democracy cannot co-exist with capitalism. In the end, Korten argues that political and spiritual awareness is the “best immunological defense against invasion by the capitalist cancer.”


http://www.orionmagazine.org/index.php/articles/article/170

Jensen, an environmentalist, has lost most hope in saving the planet. He thinks, however, that this is a good thing. Jensen believes that false hopes keep humans chained to a system that is destroying the environment. False hope leads us to believe that the system will change, that companies will stop polluting, and that a new president or piece of legislation will make everything okay. This leads to inaction, and inaction hinders progress. Hope takes us away from the present and makes us powerless: it leaves us longing for a future condition over which we have no agency. On the other hand, if we realize
that we do have some type of agency, we no longer need to hope; we can work and change and better the world around us. If we allow ourselves to feel desperation at the same time we love our environment, we can realize how dire our situation truly is and we can do something about it.


Alice Walker is a writer and activist, whose current book is *We Are the Ones We Have Been Waiting for*. The article is an interview with David Swick addressing her concerns in the new book. Walker believes that perfection lies within imperfection and the world is constantly teaching us things. Walker relies on her spirituality and yoga to alleviate her stress in life. She believes that *We Are the Ones We Have Been Waiting for* is a book that considers our current economic and political state. The book allows the reader to step back and meditate about the current political situation of our country.


Sharp provides a collection of nonviolent action, divided into various categories. Formal statements include public speeches and petitions, among others. Group representations may involve picketing or group lobbying. Boycotts of various groups fall into categories involving actions taken by workers, middlemen, and managers. Symbolic public acts refers to demonstrations such as displaying flags or symbolic colors, destroying one’s own property, and public prayer or worship. Altogether, Sharp has compiled 198 different kinds of nonviolent action, which can form the basis for activism that is both nonviolent and effective.


Week 11
11/3

• Meeting of the Minds Presentations

Week 12
11/10

• Meeting of the Minds Presentations

Week 13
11/17

• Meeting of the Minds Presentations

268
Week 14
11/24

- Thanksgiving Holiday – no classes

---

Week 15
12/1

- Meeting of the Minds Presentations
  - Concluding Assessments
The Future

I would like to present a number of other subjects, namely:

$ The Arms Race in Space
$ Robots in War
$ The Legal Ramifications of Extending Life
$ The Global Economic Issues of the Drug War
$ Gender Issues Involving Birth Control and Infanticide
$ The Complex Socio-Economic Inquiries Surrounding Immigration and Migration
$ Languages and Their Looming Extinction
$ The Power and Pervasiveness of Oil
$ The Remaking of Cities
$ A Global Language
$ Slow Cities
$ Slow Food
$ Jury Nullification in Ecological/Environmental Protest Trials
$ And Then Some

For my own extended reading and, perhaps, for you as well, I have earmarked âThe Alphabet Versus The Goddess® (where surgeon Leonard Schlain explores the conflict between word and image, proposing that alphabetic literacy reconfigured the human brain to usher in the reign of patriarchy and misogyny); Jonathan Glover’s Humanity: A Moral History of The Twentieth Century; @ From Dawn to Decadence: Five Hundred Years of Western Cultural Life,® by Jacques Barzun; “Power, Politics, and Culture: Interviews with Edward Said;” Jeremy

The Course Bibliography, which by no means intends to be complete and is always looking for suggestions of interdisciplinary titles to add, is appended to this article along with a collection of websites and magazine name references. A partial list of organizations from which I have drawn sustenance is also included. Your recommendations to additional sources are appreciated.
A former member of the class mused that he was being taught, systematically, how the human race is destroying itself, and that we were presiding over the watch. I admit the course is not as delectable as chocolate soufflé, that it has a very tart edge. As it is an elective, it attracts generally students tending to egalitarian convictions. The class hopefully satisfies yearnings to speak about the actual world around students while they are in law school and to make sense of their futures in it. You don’t have to memorize tax codes, the rules of courtroom procedure, or rules of evidence. All you have to do is feel engaged in the quality of life for those around you.

A person was walking along a beach where hundreds of starfish had washed upon the shore. Every so often she would stoop down, pick up one of the starfish and place it back into the tide of the ocean. This ritual was being watched by a man sitting on a sandy bluff that overlooked the shoreline. After a small number of the echinoderms had been returned to the sea, the perched observer came down from the dune, approached the starfish rescuer, and exclaimed, “What are you doing? With so many starfish, everywhere around us, you can’t possibly make a difference?” The walking woman thought for a moment and replied: “It makes a difference to that starfish.”

In any dark time, there is a tendency to veer toward fainting over how much is wrong or unamended in the world. Do not focus on that. There is a tendency too to fall into being weakened by perseverating on what is outside your reach, by what cannot yet be. Do not focus there. That is spending the wind, without raising the sails. ***

One of the most calming and powerful actions you can do to intervene in a stormy world is to stand up and show your soul. Soul on deck shines like gold in dark times. ***
There will always be times when you feel discouraged, but I do not keep a chair for it; I will not entertain it.

* * *

WHEN A GREAT SHIP IS IN HARBOR AND MOORED, IT IS SAFE, THERE CAN BE NO DOUBT. BUT THAT IS NOT WHAT GREAT SHIPS ARE BUILT FOR.

-- Clarissa Pinkola Estes
GLOBALIZATION & TRANSFORMATION OF CULTURE

Professor Robert Alan Hershey

01/10 BIBLIOGRAPHY

Books

Ableman, Michael
   From the Good Earth: A Celebration of Growing Food Around the World
   Harry N. Abrams 1993

Ableman, Michael
   On Good Land: The Autobiography of An Urban Farm
   Chronicle Books 1998

Abram, David
   Spell of the Sensuous
   Pantheon Books 1996

Abundene, Patricia
   Megatrends 2010: The Rise of Conscious Capitalism
   Hampton Roads Publishing Company 2005

Ackerman, Frank and Heinzerling, Lisa
   Priceless: On Knowing the Price of Everything and the Value of Nothing
   The New Press 2004

Adams, Brooks
   Law of Civilization and Decay
   MacMillan, 1896

Adams, James
   The Next World War: Computers are the Weapons and the Front Line is Everywhere
   Hutchinson 1998

Ahamed, Liaquat
   Lords of Finance: The Bankers Who Broke The World
   The Penguin Press 2009

Akerlof, George A. and Shiller, Robert J.
   Animal Spirits: How Human Psychology Drives the Economy and Why It Matters
   For Global Capitalism
   Princeton University Press 2009
Akpan, Rev. Uwem
   Say You’re One Of Them
   Little, Brown & Co. 2008

Albrow, Martin
   The Global Age: State and Society Beyond Modernity
   Stanford University Press 1996

Alder, Ken
   The Measure of All Things
   The Free Press 2002

Alexander, Christopher
   The Nature of Order, An Essay on the Art of Building and the Nature of the Universe,
      Vol. 1, The Phenomenon of Life
   The Center for Governmental Structure 2002

Ali, Tarig
   The Clash of Fundamentalisms: Crusades, Jihads, & Modernity
   Verso 2002

Allen, Steve
   Meeting of Minds

Alvarez, Sonia E. ed.
   Cultures of Politics, Politics of Cultures
   Westview Press 1998

Ambrose, Stephen E.
   Nothing Like It In the World: The Men Who Built the Transcontinental Railroad, 1863-1869
   Simon and Schuster 2000

Anaya, James
   Indigenous Peoples in International Law
   Oxford University Press 1996

Anderson, Walter Truett
   The Future of the Self: Inventing the Post Modern Person
   Tarcher/Putnam 1997

Andrews, Lori B.
   The Clone Age: Adventures in the New World of Reproductive Technology
   Henry Holt & Co. 1999
Angell, Marcia
The Truth About The Drug Companies: How They Deceive Us and What To Do About It
Random House 2004

Anyi, Wang
The Song of Everlasting Sorrow: A Novel of Shanghai
Translated by Michael Berry and Susan Chang Egan
Columbia U. Press 2008

Appleyard, Bryan
Brave New Worlds, Staying Human in the Genetic Future
Viking 1998

Armstrong, Karen
The Battle for God
Knopf 2000

Ashenburg, Katherine
The Dirt on Clean: An Unsanitized History
Farrar, Straus & Giroux 2007

Atkins, Pepter & Bowler Ian
Food in Society: Economy, Culture, Geography
Arnold 2001

Arthus-Bertrand, Yann
Earth From Above
Harry N. Abrams 2002

Bagdikian, Ben Haig
The Media Monopoly
Beacon Press 1983 (revised through 2000)

Bailey, Ronald
Liberation Biology: The Scientific and Moral Case for the Biotech Revolution
Prometheus Books 2005

Bain, David Howard
Empire Express: Building the First Transcontinental Railroad
Viking 2000

Bakan, Joel
The Corporation: The Pathological Pursuit of Profit and Power
Free Press 2004
Baker, Nicholson
   Human Smoke: The Beginnings of World War II, The End of Civilization
   Simon & Schuster 2008

Baker, Stephen
   The Numerati
   Houghton Mifflin Company 2008

Barber, Benjamin R.
   Consumed: How Markets Corrupt Children, Infantilize Adults, and Swallow Citizens Whole
   W. W. Norton & Company 2007

Barber, Benjamin R.
   Jihad vs. McWorld
   Ballantine Books 1995

Barcott, Bruce
   The Last Flight of the Scarlet Macaw: One Woman’s Fight to Save the World’s Most Beautiful Bird
   Random House 2008

Barlett, Peggy F., ed.
   Urban Peace: Reconnecting with the Natural World (Urban and Industrial Environments)
   MIT Press 2006

Barlow, Maude & Clarke, Tony
   Blue Gold: The Fight to Stop the Corporate Theft of the World’s Water
   The New Press 2002

Barnard, Bryn
   Dangerous Planet: Natural Disasters That Changed History
   Crown Publishers 2003

Barndt, Deborah
   Women Working the NAFTA Food Chain
   Second Story Press 1999

Barnes, Peter
   Capitalism 3.0: A Guide to Reclaiming the Commons
   Berrett-Koehler 2006

Barnet, Richard & Muller, Ronald E.
   Global Reach: The Power of the Multinational Corporation
   Simon & Schuster 1974
Barrie Axford
   The Global System: Economics, Politics, and Culture
   Polity Press 1995

Barzon Jacques
   From Dawn to Decadence: 500 Years of Western Cultural Life
   Harper Collins 2000

Bateson, Gregory
   Steps to an Ecology of Mind
   U. Chicago Press 1972

Baudrillard, Jean
   Illusion of the End
   Stanford University Press 1995

Baudrillard, Jean
   America
   Verso 1989

Baudrillard, Jean
   The Consumer Society: Myths and Structures
   Sage Publications Ltd 1998

Baumol, William J., Litan, Robert E. & Schramm, Carl J.
   Good Capitalism, Bad Capitalism and the Economics of Growth and Prosperity
   Yale U. Press 2007

Becker, Robert O. & Selden, Gary
   The Body Electric
   Wm. Morrow & Co. 1985

Benjamin, Walter
   Theses on the Philosophy of History
   Illuminations 1968.

Bentley, Peter J.
   Digital Biology: How Nature is Transforming Our Technology and Our Lives
   Simon & Schuster 2002

Benyus, Janine M.
   Biomimicry
   Quill/William Morrow 1997
Berlin, Isaiah
The Roots of Romanticism
Princeton University Press 1999

Berman, Morris
The Twilight of American Culture
W.W. Norton & Co. 2000

Berman, Paul
Terror and Liberalism
W.W. Norton & Co. 2003

Bernheimer, Richard
Wild Men in the Middle Ages: A Study in Art, Sentiment, and Demonology
Cambridge University Press 1952

Bernstern, Peter L.
The Power of Gold
John Wiley & Sons 2000

Berry, Thomas
The Dream of the Earth
Sierra Club Books; 2nd edition 2006

Berry, Wendell
Jayber Crow
Counterpoint 2001

Berry, Wendell
The Meat You Eat: How Corporate Farming Has Endangered America’s Food Supply
St. Martin's Press 2004

Berry, Wendell
The Unsettling of America: Culture & Agriculture
Sierra Club Books 1996

Bertens, Hans
The Idea of the Postmodern
Routledge 1995

Bethell, Tom
The Noblest Triumph: Property and Prosperity Through the Ages
St. Martin’s Press/Palgrave/MacMillan 1998
Beynon, John and David Dunkerley, eds.
The Venturesome Economy: How Innovation Sustains Prosperity in a More Connected World
Princeton University Press 2008

Bhabha, Homi K.
The Location of Culture
Routledge 1994

Bhide, Amar
The Venturesome Economy: How Innovation Sustains Prosperity in a More Connected World
Princeton University Press 2008

Bickerton, Derek
Bastard Tongues: A Trailblazing Linguist Finds Clues to our Common Humanity in the World’s Lowliest Languages
Hill & Wang 2008

Bigelow, Bill & Peterson, Bob (Eds.)
Rethinking Globalization: Teaching for Justice in an Unjust World
Rethinking Schools Press 2003

Birkerts, Sven
Readings
Graywolf Press 1999

Birnbaum, Norman
After Progress: American Social Reform and European Socialism in the 20th Century
Oxford University Press 2001

Blaise, Clark
Time Lord: Sir Sanford Fleming and the Creation of Standard Time
Pantheon Books 2002

Blinder, Alan
Central Banking in Theory and Practice
MIT Press 1998

Blustein, Paul
The Chastening: Inside the Financial Crisis that Rocked the Global Financial System and Humbled the IMF
Public Affairs 2001

Bobbitt, Philip
Terror and Consent: The Wars for the Twenty-First Century
Alfred A. Knopf 2008

282
Bobrick, Benson  
Wide As The Waters: The Story of the English Bible and the Revolution it Inspired  
Simon & Schuster 2001

Bodley, John H.  
The Power of Scale  
M.E. Sharpe 2002

Bogle, John C.  
The Battle for the Soul of Capitalism  
Yale University Press 2006

Bonanno, Alessandro  
From Columbus to ConAgra: The Globalization of Agriculture and Food  
Univ. Press of Kansas 1994

Botton, Alain de  
Status Anxiety  
Pantheon Books 2004

Bourdieu, Pierre  
Distinction: A Social Critique of the Judgment of Taste  
Harvard U. Press

Bové, Jose, Dufour Francois  
The World is Not For Sale: Farmers Against Junk Food  
Verso 2001

Bowe, John  
“Nobodies”: Modern American Slave Labor and the Dark Side of the New Global Economy  
Random House 2007

Bowers, C.A.  
Education, Cultural Myths, and the Ecological Crisis: Toward Deep Changes  
State Univ. of N.Y. Press 1993

Bradsher, Keith  
High and Mighty: SUVs – the World’s Most Dangerous Vehicles and How They Got That Way  
Public Affairs 2002

Brands, H.W.  
What America Owes the World  
Cambridge University Press 1998
Bronson, Po  
The Nudist on the Late Shift  
Random House 1999

Brooks, Rodney A.  
Flesh and Machines: How Robots Will Change Us  
Pantheon Books 2002

Brown, John Seely & Duguid, Paul  
The Social Life of Information  

Brown, Lester  
Plan B 2.0: Rescuing a Planet Under Stress and a Civilization in Trouble  
W. W. Norton & Co. 2006

Brown, Lester  
Outgrowing the Earth  
Earth Scan U.K. 2005

Brown, Phil  
Toxic Exposures: Contested Illnesses and the Environmental Movement  
Columbia U. Press 2007

Brubaker, Pamela K.  
Globalization: At What Price  
Pilgrim Press 2001

Bruinius, Harry  
Better for All the World: The Secret History of Forced Sterilization and America’s Quest for Racial Purity  
Alfred A. Knopf 2006

Buchanan, Allen, Brock, Dan, Daniels, Norman & Wikler, Dan  
From Chance to Choice: Genetics and Justice  
Cambridge Univ. Press 2000

Buck, Susan  
The Global Commons  
Island Press 1998

Bueno de Mesquita, Bruce  
The Predictioneer’s Game: Using the Logic of Brazen Self-Interest to See and Shape the Future  
Random House 2009
Burger, Julian
   Report from the Frontier
   From Cultural Survival 1987

Burleigh, Michael
   The Third Reich: A New History
   Hill & Wang 2000

Burtless, Gary; Lawrence, Robert Z.; Litan, Robert E.; and Shapiro, Robert J., Eds.
   Globaphobia: Confronting Fears About Open Trade
   Brookings, 1998

Burr, Chandler
   The Emperor of Scent: A Story of Perfume, Obsession, and the Last Mystery of the Senses
   Random House 2003

Buruma, Ian
   The Missionary and the Libertine: Love and War in East and West
   Vintage Books/Random House 2000

Busch, Lawrence
   The Eclipse of Morality: Science, State, and Market
   Aldine de Grayter 2000

Cahn, Naomi
   Test Tube Families: Why the Fertility Market Needs Regulation
   NYU Press 2009

Calthorpe, Peter and Fulton, William
   The Regional City: Planning for the End of Sprawl
   Island Press 2001

Campbell, Greg
   Blood Diamonds
   Westview Press 2002

Canetti, Elias
   Crowds and Power
   Farrar, Straus and Giroux 1984

Cannadine, David
   Ornamentalism: How the British Saw Their Empire
   Oxford University Press 2001
Carney, Judith A.  
Black Rice: The African Origins of Rice Cultivation in the Americas  
Harvard University Press 2002

Capra, Fritjof  
Web of Life  
Anchor 1997

Castronova, Edward  
Synthetic World: The Business and Culture of Online Games  
U. Chicago Press 2005

Cavanagh, John; Wysham, Daphe; & Arruda, Marcos  
Beyond Bretton Woods: Alternatives to the Global Economic Order  
Pluto Press 1994

Chace, James  
Acheson: The Secretary of State Who Created The American World  
Simon & Schuster 1998

Chang, Leslie T.  
Factory Girls: From Village to City in a Changing China  
Spiegel & Grau 2008

Chaplin, Heather & Ruby, Aaron  
Smartbomb: The Quest for Art, Entertainment and Big Bucks in the Videogame Revolution  
Algonquin Books of Chapel Hill 2005

Chapman, Peter  
Bananas: How the United Fruit Company Shaped the World  
Canongate 2008

Chatwin, Bruce  
The Songlines  
Viking Penguin 1987

Christianson, Gale E.  
Greenhouse: The 200 Year Story of Global Warming  
Walker & Co. 1999

Chua, Amy  
Day of Empire: How Hyperpowers Rise to Global Dominance – And Why They Fall  
Doubleday 2007
Chua, Amy
    World on Fire: How Exporting Free Market Democracy Breeds Ethnic Hatred and
    Global Instability
    Doubleday 2003

Clarke, Peter
    Keynes: The Rise, Fall, and Return of the 20th Century’s Most Influential Economist
    Bloomberg Press 2009

Cline, William R.
    Global Warming and Agriculture: End-of-Century Estimates by Country
    The Peterson Institute for International Economics 2007

Cohen, Lizabeth
    A Consumer’s Republic: The Politics of Mass Consumption in Postwar America
    Alfred A. Knopf 2003

Collier, Paul
    The Bottom Billion: Why the Poorest Countries are Failing and What Can Be Done
    About It
    Oxford University Press 2007

Collins, Robert M.
    The Politics of Economic Growth in Postwar America
    Oxford University Press 2000

Conaway, James
    Vanishing America: In Pursuit of Our Elusive Landscapes
    Counterpoint Press 2007

Connelly, Matthew
    Fatal Misconception: The Struggle to Control World Population
    Harvard U. Press 2008

Conley, Dalton
    Elsewhere, U.S.A.
    Pantheon Books 2009

Conroy, Michael E.
    Branded: How the ‘Certification Revolution’ is Transforming Global Corporations
    New Society Publishers 2007

Crichton, Michael
    Next
    Harper Collins 2006
Critser, Greg
Fat Land: How Americans Became the Fattest People in the World
Houghton Mifflin Co. 2003

Cross, Gary
An All-Consuming Century: Why Commercialism Won in Modern America
Columbia University Press 2000

Croteau, David & Hoynes, William
Media/Society: Industries, Images, and Audiences
Pine Forge Press 2002

Curtin, Philip D.
Cross-Cultural Trade in World History
Cambridge University Press 1984

Cushman, Philip
Constructing the Self, Constructing America: A Cultural History of Psychotherapy
Addison-Wesley Pub. 1995

Damasio, Antonio R.
Descartes’ Error: Emotion, Reason and the Human Brain
G. P. Putnam 1994

Das, Gurcharan
India Unbound
Knopf 2001

Dash, Julie
Daughters of the Dust
Dutton Book 1997

Davenport-Hines, Richard
The Pursuit of Oblivion: A Global History of Narcotics
W.W. Norton & Company 2002

Davidson, Eric A.
You Can’t Eat GNP
Perseus Books 2001

Davidson, Jenny
Heredity (Novel)
Soft Skull Press 2003
Davis, David Brion
   Human Bondage: The Rise and Fall of Slavery in the New World
   Oxford University Press 2006

Davis, Erik
   TechGnosis: Myth, Magic and Mysticism in the Age of Information
   Three Rivers Press 1998

Davis, Linda H.
   Badge of Courage, The Life of Stephen Crane
   Houghton Mifflin 1998

Davis, Wade
   One River: Explorations and Discoveries in the Amazon Rain Forest
   Simon & Schuster 1996

DeGraaf, John, Wann, David, and Naylor, Thomas
   Affluenza
   Berrett-Koehler Pub. 2001

Deloria, Jr., Vine
   The Metaphysics of Modern Existence
   Harper & Row 1979

Demos, John
   The Enemy Within: 2,000 Years of Witch Hunting in the Western World
   Viking 2008

DePalma, Anthony
   Here: A Biography of the New American Continent
   Public Affairs 2001

Dershowitz, Alan M.
   The Genesis of Justice
   Warner Books 2000

deSoto, Hernando
   The Mystery of Capital
   Bantam Press 2000

Diamond, Jared
   Collapse: How Societies Choose to Fail or Succeed
   Viking 2005
Diamond, Jared
Guns, Germs, and Steel: The Fates of Human Societies
W.W. Norton & Co. 1999

Dillon, Patrick
Gin: The Much-Lamented Death of Madam Geneva
Justin, Charles & Co. 2003

Dirlik, Arif
Whither History? Encounters with Historicism, Postmodernism, Postcolonialism
Elsevier Science Ltd 2001

Domhoff, G. William
The Power Elite and the State: How Policy is Made in America
A. de Gruyter 1990

Doherty, Brian
Radicals for Capitalism: A Freewheeling History of the Modern American Libertarian Movement
Public Affairs 2007

Dowden, Richard
Africa: Altered States, Ordinary Miracles
Public Affairs 2009

Doz, Yves L., Santos, Jose, and Williamson, Peter J.
From Global to Meta-National

Dreher, Rod
Crunchy Cons: How Birkenstock Burkeans, Gun-Loving Organic Gardeners, Evangelical Free-Range Farmers, Hip Homeschooling Mamas, Right-Wing Nature Lovers and Their Diverse Tribe of Countercultural Constructives Plan to Save America (Or At Least the Republican Party)
Crown Forum 2006

Drinnon, Richard
Facing West, The Metaphysics of Indian Hating and Empire Building
University of Oklahoma Press 1980

D'Souza, Dinesh
The Virtue of Prosperity: Finding Values in an Age of Techno-Affluence
The Free Press 2000
Dupuis, E. Melanie
Nature’s Perfect Food: How Milk Became America’s Drink
New York University Press 2002

Durning, Alan Thein
The Car and the City
Northwest Environmental Watch 1996

Durning, Alan Thein & Ryan, John C.
Stuff: The Secret Life of Everyday Things
Northwest Environmental Watch 1997

Easterbrook, Gregg
The Progress Paradox: How Life Gets Better While People Feel Worse
Random House 2004

Easterly, William
The White man’s Burden: Why the West’s Efforts to Aid the Rest Have Done So Much Ill and So Little Good
The Penguin Press 2006

Eatwell, John & Taylor, Lance
Global Finance at Risk: The Case for International Regulation
The New Press 2000

Egan, Dave & Howell, Evelyn A.
Island Press 2001

Ehrenreich, Barbara
Bright-Sided: How the Relentless Promotion of Positive Thinking Has Undermined America
Metropolitan Books 2009

Ehrenreich, Barbara
Dancing in the Streets: A History of Collective Joy
Henry Holt & Co. 2006

Ehrlich, Paul
The Population Bomb
Ballantine Books 1968

Ehrlich, Paul & Anne H.
One With Nineveh
Island Press 2004
Eichengreen, Barry
The European Economy Since 1945: Coordinated Capitalism and Beyond
Princeton University Press 2007

Eichenwald, Kurt
The Informant
Broadway Books 2000

Elias, Amy J.
Sublime Desire: History and Post-1960s Fiction (Parallax: Re-Visions of Culture and Society)
Johns Hopkins University Press 2001

Ellis, Richard
The Empty Ocean: Plundering in the World’s Marine Life
Island Press 2003

Elshtain, Jean Bethke
Who Are We? Critical Reflections and Hopeful Possibilities
William B. Eerdmans Publishing 2000

Emerson, Ralph Waldo
Complete Writings
Wm. H. Wise & Co. 1929

Epstein, Richard A.
Principles for a Free Society: Reconciling Individual Liberty with the Common Good
Perseus Books 1998

Erickson, Kim
Drop Dead Gorgeous: Protecting Yourself From The Hidden Dangers of Cosmetics
McGraw Hill 2002

Ettlinger, Steve
Twinkie, Deconstructed
Hudson Street Press 2007

Etzioni, Amitai
From Empire to Community: A New Approach to International Relations
Palgrave MacMillan 2004

Evans, Gareth
The Responsibility to Protect: Ending Mass Atrocity Crimes Once And For All
Brookings Institution Press 2008
Ewen, Stuart
PR!: A Social History of Spin
Basic Books 1996

Faludi, Susan
The Terror Dream: Fear and Fantasy in Post-9/11 America
Metropolitan Books 2007

Farmer, Paul
Pathologies of Power
University of California Press 2003

Farrell, James J.
One Nation Under Goods: Malls and the Seduction of American Shopping
Smithsonian 2003

Faust, Drew Gilpin
The Republic of Suffering: Death and the American Civil War
Alfred A. Knopf 2008

Faux, Jeff
The Global Class War: How America’s Bipartisan Elite Lost Our Future - And What It Will Take To Win It Back
John Wiley & Sons 2006

Featherstone, Mike
Consumer Culture and Postmodernism
Sage 1991

Fenby, Jonathan
France on the Brink
Arcade Publishers 1999

Ferguson, Niall
Empire: The Rise and Demise of the British World Order and the Lessons for Global Power
Basic Books 2003

Ferguson, Niall
Basic Books 2001

Ferguson, Niall
The War of the World: Twentieth-Century Conflict and the Descent of the West
The Penguin Press 2006
Ferguson, Niall  
   The Ascent of Money: A Financial History of the World  
   The Penguin Press 2008

Fernández-Armesto, Felipe  
   Near A Thousand Tables: A History of Food  
   The Free Press 2002

Fernández-Armesto, Felipe  
   Civilizations: Culture, Ambition and the Transformation of Nature  
   The Free Press 2001

Fisher, Helen  
   The First Sex: The Natural Talents of Women and How They Are Changing the World  
   Random House 1999

Flannery, Tim  
   The Weather Makers: How Man is Changing the Climate and What It Means for Life on Earth  
   Atlantic Monthly Press 2006

Flannery, Tim  
   The Eternal Frontier: An Ecological History of North America and Its Peoples  
   Atlantic Monthly Press 2001

Foer, Jonathan Saffran  
   Eating Animals  
   Little, Brown & Company 2009

Fogel, Robert William  
   The Fourth Great Awakening & The Future of Egalitarianism  
   University of Chicago Press 2000

Folbre, Nancy  
   The Invisible Heart: Economics and Family Values  
   The New Press 2001

Foley, Conor  
   The Thin Blue Line: How Humanitarianism Went to War  
   Verso 2008

Foucault, Michele  
   The Order of Things: An Archaeology of the Human Sciences  
   Pantheon 1970
Foucault, Michel
Power/Knowledge: Selected Interviews and Other Writings, 1972-1977
Harvester Press 1980

Fradkin, Philip L.
Wallace Stegner and the American West
Alfred A. Knopf 2008

Frank, Robert H.
The Economic Naturalist
Basic Books 2007

Frank, Robert H.
Luxury Fever: Money and Happiness in an Era of Excess
The Free Press 1999

Frank, Thomas
One Market Under God
Doubleday 2000

Frantz, Douglas & Collins, Catherine
Celebration, U.S.A.: Living in Disney’s Brave New Town
Henry Holt & Co/Owl Books 2000

Fraser, Antonia
Marie Antoinette: The Journey
Nan A. Talese/Doubleday 2001

Fraser, Nancy
Justice Interruptus: Critical Reflections on the “Postsocialist” Condition
Routledge 1997

Freeman, Charles
The Closing of the Western Mind: The Rise of Faith and the Fall of Reason
Alfred A. Kropf 2004

Freese, Barbara
Coal: A Human History
Perseus Publishing 2003

Freire, Paulo
Pedagogy of the Oppressed
Continuum, 1993 (New Rev. 20th Anniversary Ed.)
Frenay, Robert
   Pulse: The Coming Age of System and Machines Inspired by Living Things
   Farrar, Straus & Giroux 2006

French, Howard
   A Continent for the Taking
   Alfred A. Knopf 2004

Frieden, Jeffry A.
   Global Capitalism: Its Fall and Rise in the Twentieth Century
   W. W. Norton & Co. 2006

Friedlander, Saul
   The Years of Extinction: Nazi Germany and the Jews, 1939-1945
   Harper Collins 2007

Friedman, Benjamin M.
   The Moral Consequences of Economic Growth
   Alfred A. Knopf 2005

Friedman, Thomas L.
   The Lexus and the Olive Tree
   Farrar, Straus & Giroux 1999

Friedman, Thomas L.
   The World is Flat: A Brief History of the Twenty-First Century
   Farrar, Straus & Giroux 2005

Friedman, Thomas L.
   Hot, Flat, and Crowded: Why We Need a Green Revolution—and How It Can Renew America
   Farrar, Straus & Giroux 2008

Fukuyama, Francis
   Our Posthuman Future: Consequences of the Biotechnology Revolution
   Farrar, Straus & Giroux 2002

Fukuyama, Francis
   The Great Disruption: Human Nature and the Reconstitution of Social Order
   Free Press 1999

Furet, Francois
   The Passing of an Illusion: The Idea of Communism in the Twentieth Century
   University of Chicago Press 1999
Fussell, Betty
Raising Steaks: The Life and Times of American Beef
Harcourt 2008

Gabaccia, Donna R.
We Are What We Eat: Ethnic Food and the Making of Americans
Harvard Univ. Press 1998

Galeano, Eduardo
Upside Down: A Primer for the Looking-Glass World
Metropolitan Books/ Henry Holt & Co. 2000

Gamwell, Lynn
Exploring the Invisible: Art, Science and the Spiritual
Princeton U. Press 2002

Gantner, John D.
The Hypomaniac Edge: The Link Between (a Little) Craziness and (a Lot of) Success in America
Simon & Schuster 2005

Gardner, Howard
Intelligence Reframed
Basic Books 1999

Garrett, Laurie
The Coming Plague: Newly Emerging Diseases in a World Out of Balance
Farrar, Straus, & Giroux 1994

Garrett, Laurie
Betrayal of Trust: The Collapse of Global Public Health
Hyperion 2000

Garten, Jeffrey E.
The Mind of the CEO
Basic Books 2001

Gartner, John D.
The Hypomaniac Edge: The Link Between (a Little) Craziness and (a lot of) Success in America
Simon & Schuster 2005

Gately, Iain
Tobacco: The Story of How Tobacco Seduced the World
Grove Press 2002
Gavaghan, Colin
   Defending the Genetic Supermarket
   Routledge-Cavendesh 2007

Gay, Peter
   Modernism: The Lure of Heresy from Baudelaire to Beckett and Beyond
   W. W. Norton & Company 2007

Geertz, Clifford
   Available Light: Anthropological Reflections on Philosophical Topics
   Princeton University Press 2000

George, Robert P. and Tollefsen, Christopher
   Embryo: A Defense of Human Life
   Doubleday 2008

Gessen, Masha
   Blood Matters: From Inherited Illness to Designer Babies, How the World and I Found
   Ourselves in the Future of the Gene
   Harcourt 2008

Gibbon, Edward
   The Decline and Fall of the Roman Empire
   Hurst 1845

Gibson, William
   Pattern Recognition
   G. P. Putnam’s Sons 2003

Giddens, Anthony
   Runaway World: How Globalization is Reshaping Our Lives
   Routledge Press 2000

Gilbert, Daniel
   Stumbling on Happiness
   Alfred A. Knopf 2006

Gilmour, David
   The Long Recessional: The Imperial Life of Rudyard Kipling
   Farrar, Straus & Giroux 2002

Glassner, Barry
   The Gospel of Food: Everything You Think You Know About Food is Wrong
   Ecco/Harper Collins 2007

298
Glennon, Robert
Unquenchable: America’s Water Crisis And What To Do About It
Island Press 2009

Glennon, Robert
Water Follies: Groundwater Pumping and the Fate of America’s Fresh Waters
Island Press 2002

Glenny, Misha
McMafia: A Journey Through the Global Criminal Underworld
Alfred A. Knopf 2008

Glover, Jonathan
Humanity: A Moral History of the Twentieth Century
Yale University Press 2000

Goldhagen, Daniel Jonah
Worse Than War: Genocide, Eliminationism, and the Ongoing Assault on Humanity
Public Affairs 2009

Goldsmith, Edward et al.
Imperiled Planet: Restoring Our Endangered Ecosystems
MIT Press 1990

Goldthwaite, Richard A.
Wealth and the Demand for Art in Italy, 1300-1600
John Hopkins University Press 1993

Gonzalez, Juan
Harvest of Empire: A History of Latinos in America
Viking 2000

Goodall, Jane
Harvest for Hope: A Guide to Mindful Eating
Warner Books 2005

Goodall, Jeff
Big Coal: The Dirty Secret Behind America’s Energy Future
Houghton Mifflin 2006

Goodstein, David
Out of Gas: The End of the Age of Oil
W.W. Norton & Co. 2004
Goodwin, Jason  
Greenback: The Almighty Dollar and the Invention of America  
Henry Holt/John Macrae 2002

Goodwin, Jason  
Lords of the Horizons: A History of the Ottoman Empire  
Henry Holt & Co./Macrae/Owl Books 1999

Gottlieb, Anthony  
The Dream of Reason: A History of Western Philosophy from the Greeks to the Renaissance  
W.W. Norton & Co. 2000

Graham, Jorie  
Sea Change: Poems  
Ecco/Harper Collins 2008

Gratzer, Walter  
Terrors of the Table: The Curious History of Nutrition  
Oxford University Press 2005

Gray, Chris Hables, Editor  
The Cyborg Handbook  
Routledge 1995

Gregory, Derik, Ron Martin, and Graham Smith, eds.  
Human Geography: Society, Space and Social Science  
Palgrave Macmillan 1994

Greider, William  
Who Will Tell The People? The Betrayal of American Democracy  
Simon & Schuster 1992

Greider, William  
One World, Ready or Not: The Manic Logic of Global Capitalism  
Simon & Schuster 1997

Greider, William  
The Soul of Capitalism: Opening Paths to a Moral Economy  
Simon & Schuster 2003

Hailes, Julia  
The New Green Consumer Guide  
Simon & Schuster 2007

300
Hammond, Allen
Which World? Scenarios for the 21st Century
Island Press 1998

Haraway, Donna
Simians, Cyborgs, and Women: The Reinvention of Nature
Free Association 1991

Harding, Stephan
Animate Earth: Science, Intuition and Gaia
Green Books, UK 2006

Hardt, Michael & Negri, Antonio
Empire
Harvard University Press 2000

Harford, Tim
The Undercover Economist
Oxford University Press 2007

Harrison, Lawrence E. and Huntington, Samuel P. (eds.)
Culture Matters: How Values Shape Human Progress
Basic Books 2000

Harvey, David
Spaces of Hope
University of California Press 2000

Harvey, David
Justice, Nature, and the Geography of Difference
Blackwell Publishers 1996

Harvey, David
The Condition of Postmodernity: An Inquiry into the Origins of Cultural Change
Blackwell 1989

Hastings, Max
Retribution: The Battle for Japan, 1944-45
Alfred A. Knopf 2008

Hauser, Marc D.
Moral Minds: How Nature Designed Our Universal Sense of Right and Wrong
Ecco/Harper Collins 2006
Hawken, Paul
Blessed Unrest
Penguin Group 2007

Hawken, Paul
Nature’s Operating Instructions: The True Biotechnologies
Sierra Club Books 2004

Hawken, Paul
The Ecology of Commerce
Harper Business 1993

Hawken, Paul, Lovins, Amory, & Lovins, Hunter
Natural Capitalism
Little Brown 2000

Hayles, Katherine M.
How We Became Posthuman: Virtual Bodies in Cybernetics, Literature, and Informatics
U. Chicago Press 1999

Healy, Kieran
Last Best Gifts: Altruism and the Market for Human Blood and Organs
U. Chicago Press 2007

Hedges, Chris
War Is A Force That Gives Us Meaning
Public Affairs 2002

Henderson, Hazel
Creating Alternative Futures: The End of Economics
G.P. Putnam’s Sons 1980

Henderson, Hazel
Building a Win-Win World: Life Beyond Global Economic Warfare
Berrett-Koehler Publishers 1996

Henderson, Helen Kreider, with Hansen, Ellen, eds.
Gender and Agricultural Development
University of Arizona Press 1995

Henriques, Diana B.
The White Sharks of Wall Street
Scribner 2000
Herbert, Frank
  Dune
  1965

Herman, Arthur
  The Idea of Decline in Western History
  The Free Press 1997

Herne, Brian
  White Hunters: The Golden Age of African Safaris
  John Macrae/Holt/Owl Books 1999

Hertsgaard, Mark
  Earth Odyssey: Around the World in Search of Our Environmental Future
  Broadway Books 1998

Hesse, Hermann
  The Glass Bead Game (Magister Ludi)
  Rinehart & Winston 1969

Himanen, Pekka
  The Hacker Ethic: and the Spirit of the Information Age
  Random House 2001

Hine, Thomas
  I Want That! How We All Became Shoppers
  Harper Collins Pubs. 2002

Hiney, Ton
  On the Missionary Trail: A Journey Through Polynesia, Asia, and Africa with the
  London Missionary Society
  Atlantic Monthly Press 2000

Hochschild, Adam
  King Leopold’s Ghost
  Houghton Mifflin Co. 1998

Hodgson, Godfrey
  The Myth of American Exceptionalism
  Yale University Press 2009

Hoffman, David E.
  Oligarchs: Wealth and Power in the New Russia
  Public Affairs 2002
Homer-Dixon, Thomas  
The Upside of Down: Catastrophe, Creativity, and the Renewal of Civilization  
Island Press 2007

Hoogvelt, Ankie M.M.  
Globalization and the Post-colonial World: The New Political Economy of Development  
Macmillan 1997

Horwitz, Tony  
A Voyage Long and Strange: Rediscovering the New World  
Henry Holt & Company 2008

Huffington, Arianna  
How to Overthrow the Government  
Harper Collins 2000

Hughes, Lindsey  
Russia in the Age of Peter the Great  
Yale University Press 1998

Hughes, Thomas P.  
Rescuing Prometheus  
Pantheon Books 1998

Humphreys, Stephen  
Between Memory and Desire: The Middle East in a Troubled Age  
University of California Press 1999

Hunt, Lynn  
Inventing Human Rights: A History  
W. W. Norton & Company 2007

Huntington, Samuel P.  
The Clash of Civilizations and the Remaking of World Order  
Simon & Schuster 1996

Huxtable, Ada Louise  
The Unreal America: Architecture and Illusion  
New Press 1997

Ierley, Merritt  
The Comforts of Home: The American House and the Evolution of Modern Convenience  
Clarkson Potter 1999
Igo, Sarah E.

Imhoff, Daniel
   Paper or Plastic: Searching for Solutions to an Overpackaged World
   Sierra Club Books 2005

Imhoff, Daniel
   Farming with the Wild: Enhancing Biodiversity on Farms and Ranches
   Watershed Media, Sierra Club Books 2003

Irvine, William B.
   On Desire: Why We Want What We Want
   Oxford University Press 2005

Issenberg, Sasha
   The Sushi Economy: Globalization and the Making of a Modern Delicacy
   Gotham 2008

Iyer, Pico
   The Global Soul
   Knopf 2000

Jacobs, Jane
   The Nature of Economies
   The Modern Library 2000

Jacobs, Jane
   Systems of Survival: A Dialogue on the Moral Foundations of Commerce and Politics
   Random House 1992

Jacobson, Michael F., and Mazur, Laurie Ann
   Marketing Madness
   Westview Press 1995

James, Laurence
   Raj: The Making and Unmaking of British India
   Little, Brown & Co. 1997

Jencks, Charles
   What is Post-Modernism?
   Academy Press 1996
Jenkins, Palden
Healing the Hurts of Nations: The Human Side of Globalization
Gothic Image Publications 2003

Jenkins, Philip
The Next Christendom: The Coming of Global Christianity
Oxford University Press 2002

Jensen, Derrick
The Culture of Make-Believe
Chelsea Green, USA 2004

Johnson, David Cay
Free Lunch: How the Wealthiest Americans Enrich Themselves at Government Expense
(And Stick You With The Bill)
Portfolio Hardcover 2007

Kagan, Jerome
Three Seductive Ideas
Harvard University Press 1998

Kagan, Robert
The Return of History and the End of Dreams
Alfred A. Knopf 2008

Kammen, Michael
American Culture, American Tastes: Social Change and the 20th Century
Knopf 1999

Kaplan, Robert D.
The Coming Anarchy: Shattering the Dreams of the Post Cold War
Random House 2000

Karlinger, Joshua
The Corporate Planet: Ecology and Politics in the Age of Globalization
Sierra Club Press 1997

Karsh, Efraim & Karsh, Inari
Empires of the Sand: The Struggle for Mastery in the Middle East, 1789-1923
Harvard U. Press 1999

Kass, Leon R.
Life, Liberty and the Defense of Dignity: The Challenge for Bioethics
Encounter Books 2002
Kate, Kerry ten & Laird, Sarah A.
   The Commercial Use of Biodiversity
   Earthscan 1999

Kaufman, Michael T.
   Soros: The Life and Times of a Messianic Billionaire
   Knopf 2002

Khanna, Parag
   The Second World: Empires and Influence in the New Global Order
   Random House 2008

Kimbrell, Andrew, Ed.
   Fatal Harvest: The Tragedy of Industrial Agriculture
   Island Press 2002

Kirk, Andrew G.
   Counterculture Green: The Whole Earth Catalogue and American Environmentalism
   U. Kansas Press 2007

Kitcher, Philip
   Science, Truth, and Democracy
   Oxford University Press 2001

Klein, Naomi
   The Shock Doctrine: The Rise of Disaster Capitalism
   Metropolitan Books 2007

Klutz, Editors
   The Encyclopedia of Immaturity
   Klutz 2007

Knupp, Fred and Horn, Miriam
   Earth: The Sequel, The Race to Reinvent Energy and Stop Global Warming
   W. W. Norton & Co. (2008)

Kolbert, Elizabeth
   Field Notes from a Catastrophe: Men, Nature and Climate Change
   Bloomsbury 2006

Kolko, Joyce
   Restructuring the World Economy
   Pantheon Books 1988
Kolsbun, Ken with Sweeney, Mike
   Peace: The Biography of a Symbol
   National Geographic 2008

Korten, David C.
   Agenda for a New Economy: From Phantom Wealth to Real Wealth
   Berrett-Koehler 2009

Korten, David C.
   The Great Turning: From Empire to Earth Community
   Berrett-Koehler 2006

Korten, David C.
   When Corporations Rule The World
   Berrett-Koehler/Kumarian Press 1995

Kotkin, Joel
   Tribes: How Race, Religion & Identity Determine Success in the New Global Economy
   Random House 1993

Krech, III, Shepard
   The Ecological Indian B Myth and History
   W.W. Norton & Co. 1999

Kristof, Nicholas D., and WuDunn, Sheryl
   Thunder From the East: Portrait of a Rising Asia
   Knopf 2000

Knopp, Fred and Horn, Miriam
   Earth: The Sequel, The Race to Reinvent Energy and Stop Global Warming
   W. W. Norton & Co. (2008)

Krugman, Paul
   The Return of Depression Economics
   N.W. Norton & Co. 1999

Krugman, Paul
   The Accidental Theorist
   W.W. Norton & Co. 1998

Kunstler, James Howard
   World Made By Hand
   Atlantic Monthly 2008
Kunstler, James Howard
   The Long Emergency: Surviving the Converging Catastrophes of the Twenty-First Century
   Atlantic Monthly Press 2005

Kunstler, James Howard
   Geography of Nowhere: The Rise and Decline of America’s Man-Made Landscape
   Simon & Schuster 1993

Kunstler, James Howard
   Home From Nowhere: Remaking Our Everyday World for the 21st Century
   Simon & Schuster 1996

Kurlansky, Mark
   Salt: A World History
   Walker & Co. 2002

Kuttner, Robert
   Everything For Sale: The Virtues and Limits of Markets
   Knopf 1997

Lacy, Sarah
   Once You’re Lucky, Twice You’re Good: The Rebirth of Silicon Valley
   Gotham Books 2008

LaFeber, Walter
   Michael Jordan and the New Global Capitalism
   W.W. Norton & Co. 1999

Laidlaw, Stuart
   Secret Ingredients: The Brave New World of Industrial Farming
   McClelland & Stewart 2003

Lakoff, George, and Johnson, Mark
   Philosophy in the Flesh
   Basic Books 1999

Lambrecht, Bill
   Dinner at the New Gene Cafe
   Thomas Dunne Books 2001

Landes, David S.
   The Wealth and Poverty of Nations
   W. W. Norton & Co. 1999
Lane, Robert Edwards
The Loss of Happiness in Market Democracies
Yale Univ. Press 2000

Lappe, Marc & Britt Bailey
Against the Grain: Biotechnology and the Corporate Takeover of Your Food
Common Courage Press 1998

Lappé, Francis Moore and Anna
Hope’s Edge: The Next Diet for a Small Planet
Tarcher/Putnam 2002

Lasn, Kalle
Culture Jam
William Morrow 1999

Laszlo, Pierre
Citrus: A History
U. Chicago Press 2007

Lawrence, Felicity
Not On The Label

Leach, William
Land of Desire: Merchants, Power and the Rise of A New American Culture
Pantheon Books 1993

Lears, Jackson
Rebirth of a Nation: The Making of Modern America, 1877-1920
Harper Collins 2009

Lears, Jackson
Fables of Abundance: A Cultural History of Advertising in America
Basic Books 1994

Lears, T. J. Jackson
No Place for Grace: Antimodernism and the Transformation of American Culture
Pantheon Books 1981

Leeder, Elaine
The Family in Global Perspective: A Gendered Journey
Lessig, Lawrence
  Code: And Other Laws of Cyberspace
  Basic Books 2000

Lessig, Lawrence
  Remix: Making Art and Commerce Thrive in the Hybrid Economy
  The Penguin Press 2008

Levenson, Barry M.
  Habeas Codfish: Reflections on Food and the Law
  Univ. Wisconsin Press 2001

Levine, Lawrence W.
  The Opening of the American Mind
  Beacon Press 1996

Levy, Adrian and Scott-Clark, Cathy
  The Stone of Heaven: Unearthing the Secret History of Imperial Green Jade
  Little, Brown & Co. 2002

Levy, David
  Love and Sex with Robots: The Evolution of Human-Robot Relationships
  Harper Collins 2007

Lewis, J. Patrick & Wormell, Christopher (Illus.)
  Swan Song: Poems of Extinction
  Creative Education 2003

Lewis, Michael (Ed.)
  Panic: The Story of Modern Financial Insanity
  W. W. Norton & Co. 2008

Lieber, James A.
  Rats in the Grain: The Dirty Tricks and Trials of Archer Daniels Midland
  Four Walls Eight Windows 2000

Limerick, Patricia Nelson
  The Legacy of Conquest
  W.W. Norton & Co. 1987

Lindsey, Brink
  The Age of Abundance: How Prosperity Transformed America’s Politics and Culture
  Collins 2007
Lopez, Barry, Editor
The Future of Nature: Writing on Human Ecology From *Orion* Magazine
Milkweed Edition 2007

Lopez, Barry and Guartney, Debra, Editors
Home Ground: Language for an American Landscape
Trinity Univ. Press 2007

Lopez, Barry
Resistance
Alfred A. Knopf 2004

Lovenheim, Peter
Portrait of a Burger as a Young Calf
Harmony Books 2002

Lovins, Amory; Von Weizsacker, Ernst; and Lovins, Hunter L.
Factor Four: Doubling Wealth, Halving Resource Use: The New Report to the Club of Rome
Earthscan Publication 1997

Luce, Edward
In Spite of the Gods: The Strange Rise of Modern India
Doubleday 2007

Luttwak, Edward
Turbo Capitalism: Winners and Losers in the Global Economy
Harper Collins 2000

Lynas, Mark
High Tide: The Truth About our Climate Crisis
Picador 2004

Lyon, David
Postmodernity
Univ Of Minnesota Press (2nd ed.) 1999

Maalouf, Amin
In the Name of Identity: Violence and the Need to Belong
Arcade Publishing 2001

Machiavelli, Niccoló
The Prince
MacLeod, Alistair
   Island: The Complete Stories
   W.W. Norton & Co. 2001

Macy, Joanna
   Widening Circles: A Memoir
   New Catalyst Books 2007

Macy, Joanna
   World As Lover, World As Self – Courage for Global Justice and Ecological Renewal
   Parallax Press 2007

Malcomson, Scott L.
   One Drop of Blood: The American Misadventure of Race
   Farrar, Straus & Giroux 2000

Mander, Jerry & Goldsmith, Edward (eds.)
   The Case Against the Global Economy
   Sierra Club Books 1996

Mander, Jerry
   Four Arguments for the Elimination of Television
   Quill 1977, 1978

Mann, Charles C.
   1491: New Revelations of the Americas Before Columbus
   Alfred A. Knopf 2005

Mansfield, Howard
   The Same Ax, Twice: Restoration and Renewal in the Throwaway Age
   University Press of New England 2000

Marchand, Roland
   Creating the Corporate Soul: The Rise of Public Relations and Corporate Imagery in
   American Big Business
   University of California Press 1998

Marglin, Stephen A.
   The Dismal Science: How Thinking Like an Economist Undermines Community
   Harvard University Press 2008

Marmot, Michael
   The Status Syndrome: How Social Standing Affects Our Health and Longevity
   Henry Holt & Company 2004
Martin, Judith
Miss Manners’ Guide For the Turn-of-the-Millennium
Simon & Schuster 1990

Marx, Karl
Capital: A Critique of Political Economy
International Publishers 1867

Marx, Karl
The German Ideology
International Publishers 1845

Marx, Leo
The Machine in the Garden: Technology and the Pastoral Idea in America
1964
Oxford Univ. Press Ed. 1999

Matthiessen, Peter
The Birds of Heaven: Travels with Cranes
Northpoint Press 2001

Matthiessen, Peter
Tigers in the Snow
Northpoint Press 2000

Matthiessen, Peter
Snow Leopard
Viking Press 1978

Mauro, Alessandra, Editor
My Brother’s Keeper: Documentary Photographers and Human Rights
Contrasto 2007

Maybury-Lewis, David
Indigenous Peoples, Ethnic Minorities, and the State
Allyn & Bacon, Cultural Survival Studies in Ethnicity and Change 1997

Mayer, Ann Elizabeth
Islam and Human Rights: Tradition and Politics
Westview Press 1999

Mazower, Mark
Dark Continent: Europe’s Twentieth Century
Knopf 1999
McChesney, Robert W.
   The Problem of the Media: U.S. Communication Politics in the 21st Century
   Monthly Review Press 2004

McChesney, Robert W.
   Rich Media, Poor Democracy: Communication Politics in Dubious Times
   U. Illinois Press 1999

McCrum, Robert, Cran, William G., & MacNeil, Robert
   The Story of English
   BBC Publications 1986

McDonough, William & Braungart, Michael
   Cradle to Cradle: Remaking the Way We Make Things
   North Point Press 2002

McGrath, Alister
   In The Beginning: The Story of the King James Bible and How It Changed a Nation, a
   Language, and a Culture
   Doubleday 2001

   Enough: Staying Human in an Engineered Age
   Henry Holt 2003

McKibben, Bill
   Enough: Genetic Engineering and the End of Human Nature
   Bloomsbury 2003

McKibben, Bill
   Deep Economy: The Wealth of Communities and the Durable Future
   Times Books/Henry Holt & Co. 2007

McMichael, Philip
   The Global Restructuring of Agro-Food Systems
   Cornell Univ. Press 1994

McNeill, J.R.
   Something New Under the Sun: An Environmental History of the Twentieth Century
   World
   W.W. Norton & Co. 2000

McWhoter, John
   Doing Our Own Thing: The Degradation of Language and Music and Why We Should, Like, Care
   Gotham Books 2003
Meadows, Donella H.
   The Limits to Growth: A Report for the Club of Rome’s Project on the Predicament of Mankind
   Universe Books 1972

Meek, Ronald L.
   Social Science and the Ignoble Savage
   Cambridge University Press 1976

Menzel, Peter
   Material World: A Global Family Portrait
   Sierra Club Books 1994

Merchant, Carolyn
   The Death of Nature: Women, Ecology, and the Scientific Revolution
   Harper & Row 1980

Meyers, Norman, with Kent, Jennifer
   Perverse Subsidies
   International Institute for Sustainable Development 1998

Micklethwait, John and Wooldridge, Adrian
   God is Back: How the Global Revival of Faith is Changing the World
   The Penguin Press 2009

Micklethwait, John and Wooldridge, Adrian
   A Future Perfect: The Essentials of Globalization
   Crown Business 2000

Miller, Marc L. and Fabian, Robert N., Editors
   Harmful Invasive Species: Legal Responses
   ELI 2004

Milton, Giles
   Nathaniel’s Nutmeg
   Farrar, Straus & Giroux 1999

Mohammadi, Ali
   International Communication and Globalization
   Sage Publications 1997

Mokhiber, Russell & Weissman, Robert
   Corporate Predators: The Hunt for Mega-Profits and the Attack on Democracy
   Common Courage Press 2003
Molyneaux, Paul  
Swimming in Circles: Agriculture and the End of World Oceans  
Thunder’s Mouth Press 2007

Morgan, Richard K.  
Market Forces  
Ballantine Books 2005

Morris, Charles R.  
Money, Greed, and Risk: Why Financial Crises and Crashes Happen  
Times Books 1999

Mowlana, Hamid  
Global Communication in Transition  
Sage Publications 1996

Moynihan, Ray and Cassels, Alan  
Selling Sickness: How the World’s Biggest Pharmaceutical Companies Are Turning Us All Into Patients  
Nation Books (1st edition) 2006

Mundy, Liza  
Everything Conceivable: How Assisted Reproduction is Changing Men, Women, and the World  
Alfred A. Knopf 2007

MySpace Community, with Taudte, Jeca  
MySpace/Ourplanet: Change is Possible  
The Bowden Press/Harper Collins 2008

Nace, Ted  
Gangs of America: The Rise of Corporate Power and the Disabling of Democracy  
Barrett-Koehler Pub. 2003

Naim, Moises  
Illicit: How Smugglers, Traffickers and Copycats are Hijacking the Global Economy  
Doubleday 2005

Nancy, Jean-Luc  
The Creation of the World or Globalization  
SUNY Press 2002

Neuhaus, Richard John  
American Babylon: Notes of a Christian Exile  
Basic Books 2009
Newton, Julianne Lutz  
Aldo Leopold’s Odyssey  
Island Press 2006

Nichols, John  
The Milagro Beanfield War  
Ballantine Books 1996

Nisbett, Richard E.  
The Geography of Thought: How Asian and Westerners Think Differently … and Why  
The Free Press 2003

Nixon, Rob  
Dreambirds: The Strange History of the Ostrich in Fashion, Food, and Fortune  
Picador USA 2000

Noble, David F.  
The Religion of Technology  
Knopf 1997

Noble, David  
Forces of Production: A Social History of Industrial Automation  
Knopf 1984

Nordhaus, Ted and Shellenberger, Michael  
Breakthrough: From the Death of Environmentalism to the Politics of Possibility  
Houghton Mifflin 2007

Northwest Environmental Watch  
Varied texts

Novello, Dan  
The Lazlo Letters: The Amazing, Real-Life Actual Correspondence of Lazlo Toth, American!  

Nunberg, Geoffrey  
The Way We Talk Now: Commentaries on Language and Culture From NPR’s “Fresh Air”  
Houghton Mifflin 2001

Nussbaum, Martha C.  
Upheavals of Thought: The Intelligence of Emotions  
Cambridge University Press 2001
Ohmae, Kenichi
The End of the Nation State, The Rise of Regional Economies
The Free Press 1995

Ohmann, Richard
Selling Culture: Magazines, Markets, and Class at the Turn of the Century
Verso 1996

Oliver, Mary
New and Selected Poems
Beacon Press 2005

Oliver, Mary
Why I Wake Up Early
Beacon Press 2004

Oliver, Mary
Owls and Other Fantasies
Beacon Press 2003

O’Meara, Patrick, Mehlinger, Howard D., & Krain, Matthew
Globalization and the Challenges of the New Century: A Reader
Indiana University Press 2000

Orbach, Susie
Bodies: Big Ideas/Small Books
Macmillan 2009

Orr, David W.
Nature of Design: Ecology, Culture and the Human Intention
Oxford University Press 2004

Orr, David W.
The Last Refuge: Patriotism, Politics and the Environment in an Age of Terror
Island Press 2004

Orr, David W.
Ecological Literacy: Education and the Transition to a Postmodern World
(SUNY Series in Constructive Postmodern Thought)
SUNY Press 1992

Paehlke, Robert C.
Democracy’s Dilemma: Environment, Social Equity and The Global Economy
MIT Press 2003
Pagden, Anthony
  The Fall of the Natural Man: The American Indian and the Origins of Contemporary Ethnology
  Cambridge University Press 1982

Pagden, Anthony
  Worlds at War: The 2,500-Year Struggle Between East and West
  Random House 2008

Paine, Jeffery
  Father India
  Harper Collins 1998

Palast, Greg
  The Best Democracy Money Can Buy
  Pluto Press 2002

Park, David
  The Truth Commissioner
  Bloomsbury 2008

Parker-Pope, Tara
  Cigarettes: Anatomy of An Industry From Seed to Smoke
  The New Press 2001

Paterson, Matthew
  Automobile Politics: Ecology and Cultural Political Economy
  Cambridge U. Press 2007

Pattinson, Shaun D.
  Influencing Traits Before Birth
  Ashgate Pub. 2002

Paul, Pamela
  Parenting Inc.: How We Are Sold on $800 Strollers, Fetal Education, Baby Sign Language, Sleeping Coaches, Toddler Couture, and Diaper Wipe Warmers – And What It Means For Our Children
  Times Books/Henry Holt & Company 2008

Peden, Margaret Sayers & Munoz Molina, Antonio
  Sepharad
  Harcourt 2003
Pendergrast, Mark
   Uncommon Grounds: The History of Coffee and How it Transformed Our World
   Basic Books 2000

Perkins, John
   The Secret History of the American Empire: Economic Hit Men, Jackals, and the Truth
   About Global Corruption
   Dutton 2007

Pernick, Ron & Wilder, Clint
   The Clean Tech Revolution: The Next Big Growth and Investment Opportunity
   Harper Collins 2007

Perry, Richard J.
   ... From Time Immemorial: Indigenous Peoples and the State
   University of Texas Press 1996

Peters, Rebecca Todd
   In Search of the Good Life: The Ethics of Globalization
   Princeton Press 2006

Peterson, Dale
   Eating Apes
   Univ. Calif. Press 2003

Peterson, Matthew
   Automobile Politics: Ecology and Cultural Political Economy
   Cambridge Univ. Press 2007

Peterson, Peter G.
   Gray Dawn: How the Coming Age Wave Will Transform America -- and the World
   Times Books 1999

Pierson, Melissa Holbrook
   The Place You Love is Gone: Progress Hits Home
   W. W. Norton & Company 2006

Pigou, Arthur C.
   The Economics of Welfare
   AMS Press 1978 (original pub: Macmillan 1932)

Pinker, Steven
   The Blank Slate: The Modern Denial of Human Nature
   Viking 2002
Pipes, Richard  
Property and Freedom  
Knopf 1999  

Plomer, Aurora  
The Law and Ethics of Medical Research: International Bioethics and Human Rights  
Routledge-Cavendish 2005  

POCLAD  
Defying Corporations, Defining Democracy  
Apex Press 2001  

Porritt, Jonathan  
Capitalism As If The World Matters  
Earthscan, U.K. 2005  

Porritt, Jonathan  
Playing Safe: Science and the Environment  
Thames & Hudson 2000  

Porter, Roy  
Flesh in the Age of Reason  
W.W. Norton 2004  

Posey, Darrell A., and Dutfield, Graham  
Beyond Intellectual Property Rights: Toward Traditional Resource Rights for Indigenous Peoples and Local Communities  
International Development Research Centre, Canada 1996  

Postel, Sandra  
Last Oasis: Facing Water Scarcity  
W. W. Norton & Company 1992  

Postman, Neil  
Amusing Ourselves to Death: Public Disclosure in the Age of Show Business  
Viking 1985  

Powers, Richard  
Gain  
Farrar, Strauss, Giroux 1998  

President’s Council on Bioethics  
Beyond Therapy: Biotechnology and the Pursuit of Happiness  
Regan Books 2003  

322
Price, Jennifer  
Flight Maps: Adventures With Nature in Modern America  
Basic Books 1999

Princen, Thomas, Maniates, Michael and Conca, Ken, Editors  
Confronting Consumption  
MIT Press 2002

Pringle, Peter  
Food, Inc.: Mendel to Monsanto -- The Promises and Perils of Biotech Harvest  
Simon & Shuster 2003

Purdy, Jedediah  
Being American: Liberty, Commerce, and Violence in an American World  
Alfred A. Knopf 2003

Quammen, David  
Monster of God: The Man-Eating Predator in the Jungles of History and the Mind  
W. W. Norton & Company 2008

Quammen, David  
The Song of Dodo: Island Biogeography in an Age of Extinctions  
Scribner 1996

Ramo, Joshua Cooper  
The Age of the Unthinkable: Why The New World Disorder Constantly Surprises Us And What We Can Do About It  
Little, Brown & Company 2009

Rampton, Sheldon & Stauber, John  
Trust Us, We’re Experts  
Tarcher/Putnam 2001

Reader, John  
Potato: A History of the Propitious Esculent  
Yale University Press 2009

Rees, Martin  
Our Final Hour: A Scientist’s Warning: How Terror, and Environmental Disaster Threaten Humanity’s Future in This Century – on Earth and Beyond  
Basic Books 2003

Reich, Robert B.  
Supercapitalism: The Transformation of Business, Democracy, and Everyday Life  
Alfred A. Knopf 2007
Reich, Robert B.
    The Future of Success
    Knopf 2000

Reid, T.R.
    Confucius Lives Next Door: What Living in the East Teaches Us About Living in the West
    Random House 1999

Reiser, Marc
    Cadillac Desert: The American West and Its Disappearing Water
    Penguin Books 1993

Repcheck, Jack
    Copernicus’ Secret: How the Scientific Revolution Began
    Simon & Schuster 2008

Rieff, David
    A Bed For The Night: Humanitarianism in Crisis
    Simon & Schuster 2002

Rifkin, Jeremy
    Age of Access
    Tarcher/Putnam 2000

Rifkin, Jeremy
    Biosphere Politics

Rifkin, Jeremy
    Times Wars
    Henry Holt & Co. 1987

Rifkin, Jeremy
    Entropy
    Viking Press 1980

Riley, Mary
    Indigenous Intellectual Property Rights: Legal Obstacles and Innovative Solutions
    Alta Mira Press 2004

Rimas, Andrew and Fraser, Evan D. G.
    Beef: The Untold Story of How Milk, Meat and Muscle Shaped the World
    William Morrow/Harper Collins 2008
Ritz, Dean, ed.
Defying Corporations, Defining Democracy
Apex Press 2001

Ritzer, George
The McDonaldization of Society (Rev. Ed.)
Pine Forge Press 2004

Ritzer, George
The Globalization of Nothing
Pine Forge Press 2004

Ritzer, George
McDonaldization: The Reader
Pine Forge Press 2002

Roberts, Paul
The End of Food
Houghton Mifflin Company 2008

Robbins, John
Dict For A New America
Stillpoint 1987

Robinson, Sir Ken
The Element
Viking Books 2009

Rocco, Fiammetta
The Miraculous Fever-Tree: Malaria and the Quest for a Cure that Changed the World
Harper Collins 2003

Roche, Daniel
France in the Enlightenment
Harvard University Press 1998

Roddick, Anita
Take It Personally: How to Make Conscious Choices to Change the World
Harper Collins 2001

Rogers, Heather
Gone Tomorrow: The Hidden Life of Garbage
New Press 2005
Rojek, Chris  
Leisure and Culture  
Macmillan 2000

Rojek, Chris  
The Politics of Jean-Francois Lyotard: Justice and Political Theory  
Routledge (1st edition) 1998

Romm, Joseph  
Hell and High Water: Global Warming – The Solution and the Politics – And What We Should Do  
Harper Collins 2007

Rong, Jiang  
Wolf Totem  
The Penguin Press 2008

Rosen, Jonathan  
The Talmud and the Internet: A Journey Between Worlds  
Farrar, Straus, & Giroux 2000

Rosenblatt, Roger  
Consuming Desires  
Shearwater/Island Press 1999

Ross, Andrew  
The Celebration Chronicles  
Ballantine Books 1999

Rosseau, Jean Jacques  
The Social Contract  
Dutton 1955 ([www.books.google.com](http://www.books.google.com))

Roszak, Theodore  
The Voice of the Earth  
Phanes Press 2002

Rothchild, David (Ed.)  
Protecting What’s Ours: Indigenous Peoples and Biodiversity  
South and Meso American Indian Rights Centre 1997

Rothman, Sheila M. & Rothman, David J.  
The Pursuit of Perfection: The Promise and Perils of Medical Enhancement  
Pantheon Books 2004
Rothschild, David de, Editor
   Earth Matters
   DK Publishing 2008

Rotker, Susana (ed.)
   The Memoirs of Fray Servando Teresa de Mier
   Oxford University Press 1999

Roy, Arundhati
   Power Politics
   South End Press 2001

Royte, Elizabeth
   Bottlemania: How Water Went On Sale and Why We Bought It
   Bloomsbury 2008

Royte, Elizabeth
   Garbage Land: On the Secret Trail of Trash
   Back Bay/Little Brown 2006

Ryan, John C. & Durning, Alan Thein
   Stuff, The Secret Lives of Everyday Things
   Northwest Environment Watch 1997

Sachs, Jeffrey
   Common Wealth: Economics for a Crowded Planet
   The Penguin Press 2008

Saffron, Inga
   Caviar
   Broadway Books 2002

Sagoff, Mark
   The Economy of the Earth
   Cambridge U. Press 1988

Sahlins, Marshall
   Stone Age Economics
   Aldine-Atherton 1972

Sahlins, Marshall David
   Evolution and Culture
   University of Michigan Press 1960
Said, Edward  
Culture and Imperialism  
Random House/Vintage Books 1993

Said, Edward  
Interviews: Power, Politics, and Culture  
Pantheon Books 2001

Said, Edward  
Orientalism  
Vintage Books 1979

Sale, Kirkpatrick  
The Conquest of Paradise  
Knopf 1990

Sale, Kirkpatrick  
After Eden: The Evolution of Human Domination  
Duke University Press 2006

Sandel, Michael J.  
Justice: What’s the Right Thing To Do?  
Farrar, Straus & Giroux 2009

Sanford, Bruce  
Don’t Shoot the Messenger: How Our Growing Hatred of the Media Threatens Free Speech for All of Us  
Free Press 1999

Santoro, Michael A.  
Profits and Principals: Global Capitalism and Human Rights in China  
Cornell U. Press 2000

Santos, Boaventura de Sousa  
Toward a New Common Sense: Law, Science, & Politics in the Paradigmatic Transition  
Routledge 1995

Saul, John Ralston  
On Equilibrium: Six Qualities of the New Humanism  
Thunder’s Mouth Press 2004

Schaeffer, Robert K.  
Understanding Globalization: The Social Consequences of Political, Economic and Environmental Change  
Roman Littlefield 2004
Sheehan, James J.
Where Have All The Soldiers Gone? The Transformation of Modern Europe
Houghton Mifflin Co. 2008

Shepard, Paul
Nature and Madness
U. Georgia Press 1982

Shiva, Vandana
Earth Democracy
South End Press 2005

Shiva, Vandana
Water Wars: Pollution, Profits, and Privatization
South End Press 2002

Shiva, Vandana
Stolen Harvest: The Hijacking of the Global Food Supply
South End Press 1999

Shiva, Vandana
Biopiracy: The Plunder of Nature and Knowledge
South End Press 1997

Shlain, Leonard
The Alphabet Vs. the Goddess: The Conflict Between Word and Image
Viking/Penguin 1998

Shorrock, Tim
Spies for Hire: The Secret World of Intelligence Outsourcing
Simon & Schuster 2008

Shorto, Russell
Descartes’ Bones: A Skeletal History of the Conflict Between Faith and Reason
Doubleday 2008

Shulevitz, Uri
How I Learned Geography
Farrar, Straus & Giroux 2008

Sides, Hampton
Blood and Thunder: An Epic of the American West
Doubleday 2006
Silko, Leslie Marmon
   Almanac of the Dead: A Novel
   Simon & Schuster 1991

Silver, Lee M.
   Challenging Nature: The Clash of Science and Spirituality at the New Frontiers of Life
   Nature 2006

Simic, Charles
   That Little Something: Poems
   Harcourt 2008

Singer, Peter
   One World: The Ethics of Globalisation
   Yale U. Press 2004

Singer, Peter
   Writings on an Ethical Life
   Ecco Press/Harper Collins 2000

Singer, P. W.
   Wired for War: The Robotics Revolution and Conflict in the 21st Century
   The Penguin Press 2009

Skidelsky, Robert
   Keynes: The Return of the Master
   Public Affairs 2009

Slotkin, Richard
   Regeneration Through Violence
   Harper Perennial 1973

Soja, Edward W.
   Postmodern Geographies: The Reassertion of Space in Critical Social Theory
   Verso 1989

Solnit, Rebecca
   River of Shadows: Eadweard and Maybridge and the Technological Wild West
   Viking 2003

Sparrow, Bartholomew
   Uncertain Guardians: The News Media as a Political Institution
   Johns Hopkins U. Press 1999
Speth, James Gustave  
Red Sky at Morning: America and the Crisis of the Global Environment  
Yale University Press 2004

Spivak, Gayatri  
Can the Subaltern Speak?  
University of Illinois Press, 1988

Spretnak, Charlene  
The Resurgence of the Real  
Addison-Wesley 1997

Stanislaw, Joseph and Yergin, Daniel  
Simon & Schuster 1998

Stannard, David E.  
American Holocaust  
Oxford University Press 1992

Starr, Paul  
The Creation of the Media: Political Origins of Modern Communications  
Basic Books 2004

St. Clair, William  
The Door of No Return: The History of Cave Coast Castle and the Atlantic Slave Trade  
Blue Bridge 2007

Standage, Tom  
An Edible History of Humanity  
Walker & Company 2009

Stavenhagen, Rodolfo  
Ethnic Conflict and the Nation-State  
St. Martin’s Press 1996

Stavenhagen, Rodolfo  
The Ethnic Question: Conflicts, Development and Human Rights  
United Nations University Press 1990

Steffen, Alex (Ed.)  
Abrams 2008
Stegner, Page
   The Selected Letters of Wallace Stegner
   Shoemaker & Hoard 2007

Sterling, Bruce
   Holy Fire
   Spectra 1997

Stevens, William K.
   The Change in the Weather: People, Weather, and the Science of Climate
   Delacorte Press 1999

Stiglitz, Joseph E.
   Globalization and Its Discontents
   WW Norton & Co. 2002

Stiglitz, Joseph E. & Charlton, Andrew
   Fair Trade for All: How Trade Can Promote Development
   Oxford University Press 2006

Strasser, Susan
   Waste and Want: A Social History of Trash
   Henry Holt & Co/Metropolitan/Owl Books. 1999

Strasser, Susan
   Never Done: A History of American Housework
   Pantheon Books 1982

Striffler, Steve
   In the Shadows of State and Capital: The United Fruit Company, Popular Struggle, and
   Agrarian Restructuring in Ecuador, 1900-1995
   Duke University Press 2002

Stille, Alexander
   The Future of the Past
   Farrar, Straus & Giroux 2002

Stuart, Tristram
   The Bloodless Revolution: A Cultural History of Vegetarianism From 1600 to Modern
   Times
   W. W. Norton & Company 2007

Subcomandante, Marcos
   Our Word Is Our Weapon
   Seven Stories Press 2001
Sullivan, Bob
  Gotcha Capitalism: How Hidden Fees Rip You Off Every Day and What You Can Do About It
  Ballantine Books 2007

Sunstein, Cass
  Republic.com
  Princeton Univ. Press 2001

Swanson, Peter
  Water: The Drop of Life
  Northword Press 2001

Szasz, Andrew
  Shopping Our Way to Safety: Have We Changed from Protecting the Environment to Protecting Ourselves
  U. Minn. 2007

Takaki, Ronald
  A Larger Memory
  Little, Brown & Co.

Tannahil, Reay
  Food in History
  Stein and Day 1973

Taylor, Alan
  American Colonies 1400-1800
  Viking 2001

Telemans, Dieter
  Troubled Waters
  Exhibitions International/BAI 2007

Tenner, Edward
  Our Own Devices: How Technology Remakes Humanity
  Vintage Books 2004

Terkel, Studs
  Hope Dies Last
  Granta Books, UK 2004

Thaler, Richard H. & Sunstein, Cass R.
  Nudge: Improving Decisions About Health, Wealth and Happiness
  Yale University Press 2008
Thomas, Dana  
    Deluxe: How Luxury Lost Its Luster  
    The Penguin Press 2007

Thomas, Hugh  
    The Slave Trade: The Story of the Atlantic Slave Trade: 1440-1870  
    Simon & Schuster 1997

Thompson, Dorothy, Ed.  
    The Essential E.P. Thompson  
    The New Press 2001

Thurow, Lester C.  
    Building Wealth: The New Rules for Individuals, Companies, and Nations in a Knowledge-Based Economy  
    Harper Collins 1999

Thurtle, Phillip  
    Data Made Flesh: Embodying Information  
    Routledge 2004

Tierney, Patrick  
    Darkness in El Dorado: How Scientists and Journalists Devastated the Amazon  
    W. W. Norton & Co. 2000

Toffler, Alvin & Toffler, Heidi  
    Revolutionary Wealth  
    Alfred A. Knopf 2006

Tokar, Brian  
    Redesigning Life?: The Worldwide Challenge to Genetic Engineering  
    McGill-Queen’s U. Press 2001

Tolstoy, Leo  
    Anna Karenina  
    Random House 1939

Tomlinson, John  
    Globalization and Culture  
    University of Chicago Press 1999

Tonello, Michael  
    Bringing Home the Birkin: My Life in Hot Pursuit of the World’s Most Coveted Handbag  
    William Morrow/Harper Collins 2008

335
Trachtenberg, Alan
   The Incorporation of America: Culture and Society in the Gilded Age
   Hill & Wang 1982

Tudge, Colin
   The Tree: A Natural History of What Trees Are, How They Live, and Why They Matter
   Crown Publishers 2006

Turchi, Peter
   San Antonio Press 2004

Turnbull, Colin
   The Mountain People
   Touchstone 1987

Vanderbilt, Tom
   Traffic: Why We Drive The Way We Do (And What It Says About Us)
   Alfred A. Knopf 2008

Vargas Llosa, Mario
   The Feast of the Goat
   Farrar, Straus & Giroux 2001

Vasquez, Ian, Ed.
   Global Fortune: The Stumble and Rise of World Capitalism
   Cato Institute 2000

Veblen, Thorsten
   The Theory of the Leisure Class
   Penguin Books 1899 (republished 2001)

Verdery, Katherine
   The Political Lives of Dead Bodies: Reburial and Postsocialist Change
   Columbia U. Press 1999

Victoria, Franciscus de (in) Williams, Jr., Robert A.
   The American in Western Legal Thought: The Discourses of Conquest 96-108

Viroli, Maurizio
   Niccolo’s Smile: A Biography of Machiavelli
   Farrar, Straus & Giroux 2000
Volkov, Solomon
The Magical Chorus: A History of Russian Culture from Tolstoy to Solzhenitsyn
Translated by Antonia W. Bovis
Alfred A. Knopf 2008

Vonnegut, Kurt
Armageddon in Retrospect: And Other New and Unpublished Writings on War and Peace
G. P. Putnams’s Sons 2008

Waley-Cohen, Joanna
The Sextants of Beijing: Global Currents in Chinese History
W.W. Norton & Co. 1999

Wallach, Lori & Sforza, Michele
Whose Trade Organization? Corporate Globalization and the Erosion of Democracy
Public Citizen 2001

Wallerstein, Immanuel
The Age of Transition: Trajectory of the World System 1945-2025
Zed Books 1996

Walters, Mark Jerome
Six Modern Plagues and How We Are Causing Them
Shearwater Books 2003

Walters, Reece
Eco Crime and Genetically Modified Food
Rutledge-Cavendesh 2007

Ward, Diana Raines
Water Wars: Drought, Flood, Folly, and the Politics of Thirst
Riverhead 2003

Ward, Peter D.
Under a Green Sky: Global Warming, the Mass Extinctions of the Past, And What They Can Tell Us About Our Future
Harper Collins 2007

Warner, Jessica
Craze: Gin and Debauchery In An Age of Reason
Four Walls Eight Windows 2003

Warsh, David
Knowledge and the Wealth of Nations: A Story of Economic Discovery
W. W. Norton & Company 2006
Waters, Malcolm
    Globalization
    Routledge 1995

Weatherford, J. McIver
    Savages and Civilization: Who Will Survive
    Crown Publishers 1994

Weber, Lauren
    In Cheap We Trust: The Story of a Misunderstood American Virtue
    Little, Brown & Company 2009

Weber, Max
    The Protestant Ethic and the Spirit of Capitalism
    Unwin Hyman 1930

Weibe, Robert
    The Search for Order: 1877-1920
    Hill and Wang 1967

Weiner, Eric
    The Geographic of Bliss: One Grump’s Search for the Happiest Places in the World
    Twelve 2007

Weisman, Alan
    The World Without Us
    St. Martin’s Press 2007

Weinstein, Donald; Bridwell Library
    Girolamo Savonarola: Piety, Prophecy, and Politics in Renaissance Florence
    Bridwell Library (Dallas, TX) 1994

Welch, Evelyn
    Shopping in the Renaissance: Consumer Cultures in Italy, 1400-1600
    Yale University Press 2005

Wells, H. G.
    Anticipations of the Reaction of Mechanical and Scientific Progress Upon Human Life and Thought
    Harper & Brothers 1902

Weston, David
    In the Dust of Kilimanjaro
    Island Press 1997
Wheatcroft, Andrew
The Enemy at the Gate: Habsburgs, Ottomans and the Battle for Europe
Basic Books 2009

Whybrow, Peter C.
American Mania: When More Is Not Enough
W. W. Norton & Company 2005

Williams, Raymond
The Country and the City
Oxford University Press 1973

Williams, Robert A., Jr.
The Savage as the Wolf: Indigenous Peoples Rights in the Western Imperial Imagination
U. Minnesota Press (forthcoming)

Williams, Robert A., Jr.
Like a Loaded Weapon
U. Minnesota Press 2005

Williams, Robert A., Jr.
The American Indian in Western Legal Thought: The Discourses of Conquest
Oxford University Press 1990

Williams, Wendy and Whitcomb, Robert
Cape Wind: Money, Celebrity, Class, Politics and the Battle for Our Energy Future on Nantucket Sound
Public Affairs 2007

Williamson, John and Chris Milner, eds.
The World Economy
Harvester Wheatsheaf 1991

Whitman, Marina v. N.
New World, New Rules: The Changing Role of the American Corporation
Harvard Business School Press 1999

Wills, Garry
Papal Sin: Structures of Deceipt
Doubleday 2000

Wilson, Edward O.
The Creation: An Appeal to Save Life on Earth
W. W. Norton & Company 2006
Wilson, Edward O.
   The Future of Life
   Knopf 2002

Wilson, Edward O.
   Consilience, The Unity of Knowledge
   Knopf 1998

Witte, Jr., John, and van der Vyver, Johan D., eds.
   Religious Human Rights in Global Perspective: Legal Perspectives
   M. Nijhoff Publishers 1996

Wolf, Eric R.
   Europe and the People Without History
   University of California Press 1982

Wolf, Eric R.
   Envisioning Power: Ideologies of Dominance and Crisis
   University of California Press 1999

Wolfé, Alan
   Moral Freedom: The Impossible Idea That Defines the Way We Live Now
   W.W. Norton & Co. 2001

Worldwatch Papers
   Varied texts
   World Watch Institute

Wright, Ronald
   A Short History of Progress
   House of Anansi Press 2004

Wuerthner, George & Matteson, Mollie Yoneko
   Welfare Ranching: The Subsidized Destruction of the American West
   Foundation for Deep Ecology 2002

Yehoshua, A.B.
   A Journey to the End of the Millenium
   Doubleday 1999

Yoerg, Sonja I.
   Clever As A Fox: Animal Intelligence and What It Can Teach Us About Ourselves
   Bloomsbury 2001
Young, Michael W.
    Malinowski’s Kiriwina: Fieldwork Photography 1915-1918
    University of Chicago Press 1998

Zakaria, Fareed
    The Post-American World
    W. W. Norton & Company 2008

Zakaria, Fareed
    The Future of Freedom
    Illiberal Democracy at Home and Abroad
    W.W. Norton & Co. 2003

Zbarsky, Ilya & Hutchinson, Samuel
    Lenin’s Embalmers
    Harvill Press 1999

Zunz, Olivier
    Why the American Century
    University of Chicago Press 1998

Zunz, Oliver
    Making America Corporate, 1870-1920
    University of Chicago Press 1990
WEBSITES

1. www.adb.org [Asian Development Bank (ADB)]: A general description of the Asian Development Bank and the programs it initiates, oversees, and funds, such as immunization programs, water programs, hunger and nutrition campaigns, regional cooperation agreements, gender and development programs, etc. The site includes statistics and data conclusions of the ADB, as well as reports detailing conclusions made and strategies proposed for various programs.

2. www.aed.org [Academy for Educational Development] Founded in 1961, AED is an independent, nonprofit organization committed to solving critical social problems in the U.S. and the world through education, social marketing, research, training, policy analysis and innovative program design and management. Areas of focus include health, education, youth development, and the environment. The website contains a description of each of the main five AED programs groups and includes information on the projects and initiatives undertaken by each program. The site also includes annual AED reports, summarizing the problems and solutions they have undertaken over the relevant year.

3. www.africaaction.org [Africa Action]: Africa Action is an organization that works for political, economic and social justice in Africa. Africa Action provides information and analysis and attempts to mobilize the public to change the policies and policy-making process of U.S. and multinational institutions toward Africa. The website includes information on Africa Action’s programs and provides copies of reports that have been published on a variety of topics, including debt relief, global health fund updates, and the African Union. The site also contains links to other African Information and action resources.

4. www.alonovo.com [socially responsible shopping]

5. www.alternet.org

6. http://www.apec.org [Asia-Pacific Economic Cooperation]: The Asia-Pacific Economic Cooperation (APEC) is composed of 21 member economies of cultural diversity and varying levels of economic development. Since its formation in 1989, APEC has expanded to become the primary vehicle for promoting trade liberalization and economic cooperation in the Asia Pacific Region. APEC works toward “open regionalism”, using regional trade and investment liberalization to strengthen the multilateral trading system and expand the global economy. This website provides information about APEC’s goals, its member states, and their collective action plans.

7. www.archive.org: The Internet Archive

8. www.asknature.org [Biomimicry Design Portal]

9. www.ban.org

11.  http://bioneers.org

12.  http://www.bukopharma.de/english: This a the English version of a German website called Buko Pharma Kampange. The purpose of the site is to monitor and discuss the marketing practices of the pharmaceutical industry in developing countries and in Europe. The website offers information on why the pharmaceutical industry might be causing more harm than good in the developing world and what can be done about it. Although it is more limited than the German sight, it still offers some decent articles on the subject.

13.  www.bullfrogfilms.com: BullFrog Films is a leading source of independent environmental educational films. This site lists all of their films and you can order any of the films from the website. The site also has information about upcoming feature films and their subject matter.


15.  www.buzzflash.com: Access everything from the latest news articles from your favorite independent sources to senate roll call votes on this website. This is an incredibly comprehensive database for news information and announcements. You can access sources by periodical, columnist, and even look at a pretty thorough database of political cartoons. This site is excellent place to go to catch up on current events using sources from outside the mainstream.

16.  www.cdproject.net [Carbon disclosure project]

17.  www.cid.harvard.edu [Center for International Development at Harvard University] Created under a joint effort of the Kennedy School of Government and Harvard Institute for International Development, CID is Harvard’s cross-disciplinary center for research on sustainable international development. Includes downloadable policy papers, special reports, working paper series, research papers, and datasets. Invaluable links to development organizations, including development banks, non-profit development organizations, government development agencies, research centers, relief agencies and more. Includes information on events and seminars, such as the International Conference on Globalization of Research and Development, and includes downloadable conference papers and documents.

18.  www.citizen.org: This is the website for Public Citizen, a national, nonprofit consumer advocacy organization founded by Ralph Nader. Public Citizen’s goal is to represent consumer interests in Congress, the executive branch and in the courts. The site offers information about upcoming consumer legislation and issues. The safety and affordability of prescription drugs is just one example of the issues you will find on this website.

19.  www.cleanairwatch.org

20.  www.climateprogress.org
21. www.commondreams.org: Common Dreams is a progressive news wire that offers links to current sources on globalization issues. Updates and statements from many activist around the world are offered on this site. This is an excellent resource for research and to find more information regarding specific topics of interest. A great place to find out more about important figures in globalization.

22. www.commondreams.org/community.htm [America’s Progressive Community...over 120 groups linked]

23. http://commercialalert.org: Commercial alert is a nonprofit organization whose mission is to keep the “commercial culture within its proper sphere, and to prevent it from exploiting children and subverting the higher values of family, community, environmental integrity and democracy.” Offers suggestions on what companies to boycott or write letters to in order to influence their free trade policy. The site also offers mission statements for the organization in specific areas (i.e. government, health) that can be reviewed before you decide to join the organization.


25. www.corpwatch.org: The purpose of this website is to help inform and mobilize activists to work against corporate led globalization. The purpose of the site is to organize and build grassroot movements to work for human rights, labor rights, and environmental justice around the world. The site offers educational information along with information on how and when to get involved. Corpwatch’s website is at the forefront of its fight against corporate globalization.


27. www.cspinet.org [Center Science Public Interest]


29. www.cthings.com

30. www.cursor.org

31. www.dinegreen.com: The website for the Green Restaurant Association is all about dining in healthy, organic restaurants. This site has a map of ecologically sound dining establishments and offers tips on how to operate an environmentally friendly restaurant. This is a great site for those who love to travel but have a hard time finding places to meet their dietary restrictions when on the road. Now you can order Dinegreen’s first publication to learn more about ecological impacts of energy, recycling, candles, organic food, recycled products, chlorine-bleached paper, genetically-modified foods, cleaning chemicals, and more.

32. www.droppingknowledge.org
www.earth-policy.org [Earth Policy Institute]

www.earthtrack.net [Subsidies]

www.eastwestcenter.org

www.edf.org [Environmental Defense Fund]

www.eff.com: The site for the Electronic Frontier Foundation is dedicated to protecting free speech in new technologic formats. The EFF was founded to protect free speech on the Internet and its website includes links to pending legislation, as well as upcoming events for activists interested in this subject. Also posted are articles and speeches regarding corporate activity with respect to free speech on the Internet. You can subscribe to an action center to get current updates and the latest news.

www.elsevier.com


www.ewg.org: Website for the Environmental Working Group, an organization whose mission is to give out information regarding cutting edge technology in the environmental world. This is a great site for people interested in finding environmental friendly products and services. You can also learn more about technologies that can be used on a widespread scale to help the environment. They have reports from different scholars and agencies on topics like pesticides, drinking water and farm subsidies. You can arm yourself with statistical data from this site.

www.fair.org: Website for Fairness and Accuracy in Reporting, a national media watchdog that criticizes media bias and censorship. The focus of the website is expose soft journalism and encourage hard-hitting, accurate reporting. Website offers a Women’s Desk and Racism Watch Desk to analyze the effects of sexism and racism in the media and to combat the marginalization of minority groups in the news. You can sign up for an action alert with the organization or access alternative news sources.

http://faculty.plattsburgh.edu/richard.robbins/legacy [Global Problems and the Culture of Capitalism]: This website contains an incredibly rich number of resources related to globalism and capitalism. The Online Global Reader contains a number of articles and exercises that explore the implications of globalization and the spread of capitalism. The site also contains links to a number of articles and exercises, divided along various themes-corporations, the consumer, labor, the nation-state, population, hunger, the environment, indigenous peoples and ethnic conflict, and health.
45. **www.foresight.org**: Website for the Foresight Institute. The Institute’s mission is to help new emerging technologies come together with humanity to improve living conditions. Foresight focuses on nanotechnology, the possible ability to build materials and products with atomic precision. The Institute uses the website, not only to inform, but to also improve public and private dialogue on the issue. The site offers articles to help inform people about nanotechnology and its possible applications.

46. **www.fromthewilderness.com**

47. **www.gene-watch.org**

48. **www.globalideasbank.org**: This is a really fun website. It allows surfers to post new and inventive ideas on how to solve some of the world’s problems. There is an annual award to the best idea. Global Ideas Bank is an interactive organization with the goal of using the ideas of everyday people in order to help prevent and repair some of the destruction of globalization.

49. **www.wfs.org/fsurv.htm** [Future Survey]

50. **www.globalforestwatch.org**: This site provides information on logging, mining, and other development activities within and around the world’s forest as, or before, it happens. One of the truly great features of this website is the availability of maps that chart the decline of forest acreage around the world. It also offers links to publications and other information sources about the status of the world’s forest and the impact of development. The maps are particularly helpful in showing the enormity of this problem.

51. **www.globalonenessproject.org**

52. **www.globalpublicpolicy.net**: This website is part of a U.N. initiative to examine the difficulties of globalization, the challenges they create and the possible impact Global Public Policy Networks might have on them. This is a good site to learn more about Public Policy and how nations share that type of information. It is also a good site to look for proposed governmental solutions to the problems of globalization from an academic and real world perspective.

53. **www.greenmoneyjournal.com**

54. **www.grist.org** [Environmental News and Commentary]

55. **www.health-track.org (www.healthyamericans.org)**: This is the website for Trust for America’s Health, an organization whose goal is to protect public health from environmental health threats. You can look up your state’s health statistics and for publications on health risks in your area. You can also discover disease clusters in your state. This is a good site for information linking environmental factors to health issues.

56. **www.hrw.org**: This is the website for Human Rights Watch, an organization whose goal is to investigate and expose human rights violations, protect human rights, and help the world
hold human rights violators responsible. You can access information by country or by topic and track the progress of the international criminal court. You can also get information about ongoing campaigns against human rights violation and sign up for a newsletter informing you about the organization’s progress and what you can do to help human rights.

57. www.idealbite.com

58. www.ifg.org: The International Forum on Globalization website is the product of sixty leading activists, scholars, economists, researchers and writers, representing 60 organizations in 25 different countries around the world. The IFG is a think tank focused on dealing with globalization and educating the public about the consequences of economic free trade. The site offers information about IFG’s activities as well as educational material on the World Bank and other globalization actors.

59. www.inthesetimes.com

60. www.isria.com

61. www.janes.com: Website for Jane’s Information Group, which consists of publishers of periodicals further the public’s knowledge of global defense, aerospace, and transportation. This site allows access to information about air, naval and land technological defense advancements. This site will help you learn more about the products of warfare and how they are promoted. This site has information about many types of military products and statistics. For example you can access a crime center database to learn more about products and tactics used by police forces in different nations.

62. www.longnow.org: The Long Now Foundation was established in 1996 in an effort to promote measuring time on a slower and better level. The purpose of this slowed time line is to promote better thinking. How? By fostering projects that develop over a longer time, the Foundation hopes that it will help creators and inventors to consider the impact and consequences of their proposed development in the long run. There is a time chart on the website that shows the future projects of the Long Now Foundation and helps reveal their perspective on time.

63. www.mcdonough.com: William McDonough is a world renowned architect who designs efficient, environmentally sound structures and products. You can learn more about Mr. McDonough through this site and about his design philosophy. You can also look access some of his speeches and learn more about his design firm. This a comprehensive site for those looking for information on the “New Industrial Revolution.” There are numerous articles to read about Mr. McDonough’s work and progress.

64. www.mcdonough.com/cradle_to_cradle.htm

65. www.mclaughlin.com: The McLaughlin Group is a daily news show dedicated to in depth reporting on national and world stories. The news hour is famous for its comprehensive story telling and for its great commentaries. This site offers a chance to find out the station
and time where the News Hour is aired in your area. You can also review old news reports and comment on the stories covered and the panelists on the show. If you are a fan of the News Hour this site will add to your enjoyment of the show and your understanding of the stories covered.

66. www.mcspotlight.org: This is an interesting website in its global activism since it focuses, mainly, on one perpetrator. This site is dedicated to exposing the activities and wrongdoings of McDonalds around the globe. As the website points out, McDonald’s spend $2 billion dollars a year on expansion and advertising. The site offers a counterbalance to the pop culture icon. You can access reports, news bulletins and contribute to a debate room.

67. www.multinationalmonitor.org

68. www.newdream.org: This site is designed to offer educational information and information on available resources for consumers looking to have less impact on the planet. The site is designed to help both individual and institutional consumers find the best possible products for a healthy lifestyle and planet. The site offers a link to post your ideas and a link to suggestions for personal actions you can take to start living a healthy life and protect the environment. Great site if you want to let AOL know how you feel about junk mail.

69. www.nofreelunch.org: No Free Lunch is an organization made up of health care providers who want to get the pharmaceutical industry out of guiding medical care. The purpose of the site is to inform both the public and other medical care professionals about the tactics used by the pharmaceutical companies to influence patient treatment. You can access evidence that pharmaceutical promotion does in fact influence physician behavior and the ways in which this is counter productive to good patient care. If you know someone in the health care industry or would like to discuss this problem with your own physician, this is a great site to get information.

70. www.novica.com

71. www.nrdc.org: National Resource Defense Council is a non-profit organization dedicated to protecting natural resources and creating a healthy environment for all living things. You can learn more about nuclear waste, clean air, global warming, and other environmental issues. You can access environmental articles and look at the NRDC’s environmental fact of the day.

72. www.nybooks.com: The New York Book Review site offers reviews of books, articles, poems, etc., that covers a wide gamut of topics, from politics to the environment. You can search their archives for a review of a particular book of interest or browse their current postings for books you might want to read. You can also access other literary web pages and how to find the materials you are interested in.

73. www.oneworld.net [One World] A consolidation of various One World organizations from around the globe, One World was established to promote human rights and sustainable development. This website includes link to specific county One World sites. It also contains
editor’s letters and informational topics, such as ethical consumerism, fair trade, immigration, climate change, biodiversity, genetic engineering, land rights, and population. Each informational guide includes a background of the issue and useful links that provide current updates involving the issue from around the world. The site also contains publications, essays, and debates from a selection of think tanks that explore the latest topics in international human rights and sustainable development.

74. www.orionsociety.org: If you like the periodical publication Orion you should check out the Orion Organization’s website. You can review the current issue of the magazine and order it online. You can also learn more about the Orion Society and its dedication to grassroots organization and activism. If you want tips on how to organize activities in your community this is a wonderful site. There is a list of member organizations you can contact for help or information. You can also check out the Orion Organization’s other publication, Afeild Orion.

75. www.paywatch.org: Recent events have made this webpage all the more interesting and relevant. This site lists the top paid CEOs in the country and their salaries. It also has suggestions about what you can do about runaway corporate salaries. Executive Paywatch is run by the AFL-CIO. You can learn more about corporate affairs including how their stock is doing in relation to how their executives are doing. This site has an action center and even a games link. This site is a great source for information on how corporations are really run.

76. www.thepoint.com

77. www.projectcensored.org

78. www.pbs.org: This site is pretty self explanatory. You can get program listings as well as times and channels from the public broadcasting site. This is a great source for educational materials and the really good news is you can make a donation all year long just by going online. You can also learn more about PBS and why it is so important.

79. www.questia.com [on-line Library of Books and Journals]

80. www.rachel.org: This is the homepage for the Environmental Research Foundation, an organization whose main goal is to help people find information related to their fight for environmental justice at the grassroots level. The hope is that this struggle will help democracy around the world. The site is dedicated to fostering grass-roots action by informing citizens. This site can even be accessed in Spanish. The site has a great list of related organizations as well as other, more specific websites that might be useful to community activists.

81. www.rafi.org: The homepage for the Rural Advancement Foundation International (now the ETC Group – Action group on erosion, technology an concentration) is designed to help in the development of socially responsible development in technologies and to the conservation of sustainable development in agricultural biodiversity to the benefits of rural and indigenous groups. You can access publications in each of the sub-issues of the group, erosion,
technology, and concentration. This site also offers resources in Spanish. The site also has a really great political cartoon link.

82. [www.rethink-dispatches.com](http://www.rethink-dispatches.com)

83. [www.rff.org](http://www.rff.org) [Resources for the Future]

84. [www.righttowater.ca](http://www.righttowater.ca)

85. [www.rprogress.org](http://www.rprogress.org): Redefining Progress is yet another progressive non-profit agency working for sustainable development in different public sectors. The purpose of the organization and their site is to create public policy procedures and suggestions that create policies and tools that encourage accurate market prices, protect resources, and push for a sustainable economic system. Like the other pages, you can access articles. This site is a great place to start looking and thinking about solutions to some of the problems in globalization.

86. [www.sightline.com](http://www.sightline.com): The Sightline Institute (formerly the Northwest Environmental Watch) is dedicated to observing the environmental status of a particular region and passing along that information to the public. You can get information about sustainable communities and how your own region stacks up. This site has proposed solutions like Green Taxes and information on how to get involved in creating environmentally sound communities. It is a great web page for activists who desire working at the community level.

87. [www.slowfood.com](http://www.slowfood.com): The Slow Food movement was founded in Italy as a reaction to the increased pace of life due to global economics and the influx of “American” style eating and restaurants. At the center of the movement is the idea that communities should slow down and consider what, how, and when they are eating. You can find slow food restaurants around the world on this site and access information about events organized by the organization. If you like to eat this is a website definitely worth visiting. It has a great link on what the organization calls taste education, which is sensory training for your mouth.

88. [www.social-ecology.org](http://www.social-ecology.org) [Institute of Social Ecology]

89. [www.socialstudies.com](http://www.socialstudies.com): Although this site is primarily designed for teachers it is a neat place to search for materials on a variety of social issues. You can purchase many great books and other tools at this site or find out what is new in the world of social studies. This is an all encompassing site for the social studies buff and a site you should recommend to anyone you know in education.

90. [www.ssireview.org](http://www.ssireview.org) [Stanford Social Innovation Review]

91. [www.technation.com](http://www.technation.com)

92. [www.techsoup.org](http://www.techsoup.org)
93. www.ted.com

94. www.terrain.org

95. www.terralingua.org: Terralingua is an organization that works on an international scale to help preserve cultural and biological diversity. The organization focuses on preserving the diverse languages of the world and also investigates the connection between biological and cultural diversity. You can learn more about the many languages of the planet and about ongoing projects sponsored by the organization. There is also a list of Terralingua's partners around the world and the work they are focusing on.

96. www.testtube-families.blogspot.com

97. www.thecampaign.org: This is the website for the national movement to have genetically engineered foods labeled. The site offers information on the drawbacks of genetically engineered food and the importance of getting it labeled. The site also helps you contact Congress to urge them to support measures against genetically engineered food and labeling laws. You can also find out about activities the organization is supporting in your state. This is a great site for information about the food you buy everyday in the grocery store.

98. www.themeatrix.com

99. www.thenation.com: The Nation is a progressive weekly magazine that focuses on U.S. politics. The magazine and its website are a great source for alternative opinions on major current events. You can access articles, email the magazine, and order the publication to be delivered to your home. Some of the world’s most prolific writers, theologians, academics and policy makers submit articles to this magazine.

100. www.tmcm.com [Too Much Coffee Man]

101. www.tompaine.com: Tom Paine is another progressive political magazine that goes outside the mainstream to cover stories in an in depth and less biased manner. The publication tried to focus on stories that the major media outlets overlooked or missed or were just too afraid to cover. Along with The Nation’s website, you can become very well informed on different issues of the day. You can also make submissions to the magazine through this website.

102. www.truemajority.com

103. www.un.org: [United Nations] Under the Economic and Social Development heading, there is information about the Population and Aging World Assembly, World Summit on Sustainable Development, and the United Nations Environmental Protection Agency, including the convention and treaties of UNEP. This site also includes a number of interesting press releases on globalization.
104. www.unesco.org: The United Nations Educational, Scientific, and Cultural webpage offers a variety of resources in many different languages. You can learn more about this branch of the U.N, read its mission statement, and look at proposed programs. This is a good site for links to the webpages of other international organizations as well as the United Nations Homepage. This is a great source of information about the United Nations and provides useful resources to figuring out what exactly the U.N. is supposed to be doing. The site also provides some ideas about how to use the U.N. in a more efficient manner.

105. www.unesco.org/shs/most [Most Clearing House-Management of Social Transformations]


107. www.verdant.net: This website is dedicated to helping people overcome consumerism. This is a must visit website for every North American. The site offers an interesting mix of resource materials as well as informative suggestions on how to get rid of consumerism in your personal life. For example, learn how to grow most of your own food and what companies have some of the most egregious behavior. This is a site that attacks one of the most prominent prongs of globalization head on.

108. http://www2.etown.edu/vl/intldev.html [Virtual Library on International Development]: An incredible collection of links and resources related to tissues in international development, including development and development aid, economy and finance, environment, human rights, international relations, social, cultural, and socio-economic themes. Included within these topics are categories such as migration, urbanization, health, education, poverty, sustainable development, climate change, desertification, and water.

109. www.wcfia.harvard.edu: The Weatherhead Center for International Affairs at Harvard University is a foundation set up to support academic research on international, transnational, and comparative topics. It also supports research into policy analysis and the study of countries and regions besides the United States. The site allows you to access past research topics and findings. You can also discover more about ongoing research and projects that the Center is involved with. The Center has several fields of inquiry relevant to issues of globalization. This is a great site for academic research information.

110. www.whocontrolstheworld.com

111. www.wie.org

112. www.wiserearth.com

113. www.worldbank.org [World Bank]: Provides a general description of the world bank. Includes downloadable data, statistics, and reports that discuss poverty, health care, infrastructure solutions, natural resource use, and other topics. Also includes country-specific information on development.
114. www.worldchanging.com

115. www.wri.org [World Resources Institute]: A global think tank that combines research with practical solutions to protecting the earth and improve people’s lives. Contains a number of well-written and insightful articles on a variety of environmental topics, including biodiversity, governance and institutions, business and economics, climate change and energy, agriculture and food, population and human well-being, and resource and material use. Under the Earth Trends section, the site contains data and country-specific information for each environmental topic.


117. www.wto.org [World Trade Organization]: General information about the WTO, including statistical data on world trade, annual reports and studies, and background papers on topics that the WTO addresses, such as agriculture, e-commerce, intellectual property, trade and environment, and trade and development. Includes legal texts of the WTO agreements and dispute settlements. Also includes interesting downloadable Position Papers submitted by NGOs on a variety of topics, such as “WTO and Multilateral Trade”, “Trade and Environment’s New Agenda”, “Developing Countries and the Multilateral Trading System”, and “Sustainable Development – The spiritual Dimension.” There are also a number of downloadable WTO Working Papers that detail the results of staff research on a variety of topics.

118. www.zaadz.com
WEBSITES FOR TECHNOLOGY AND THE INTERNET

Legal/Regulatory Aspects of Digital Technology

1. **Berkman Center for Internet and Society**, a research program attached to the Harvard Law School, is committed "to explor[ing] and understand[ing] cyberspace, its development, dynamics, norms, standards, and [the] need or lack thereof for laws and sanctions." Its scholars and fellows address a wide range of Internet-related issues, including governance, privacy, intellectual property, antitrust, content control, and electronic commerce. And true to its open-source principles, according to the site, "we build, use, and freely share an open software platform for free online lectures and discussions." [http://cyber.law.harvard.edu/](http://cyber.law.harvard.edu/)

2. **Information Law Institute**, The Information Law Institute at New York University School of Law provides an academic center for studying the effects of contemporary choices concerning the legal rules affecting the production, manipulation, storage, and dissemination of, and access to, information in the digitally networked society. [http://www.law.nyu.edu/centers/ili/index.htm](http://www.law.nyu.edu/centers/ili/index.htm)

3. **Computer Professionals for Social Responsibility**, a "public-interest alliance of computer scientists and others concerned about the impact of computer technology on society," has served as the conscience of the high-tech sector for nearly 20 years. Originally concerned with computer use by the military, CPSR has expanded its brief over the years to include a wide range of areas in which digital technology affects society (most notably privacy and computers in the workplace). With the rise of interest in the "National Information Infrastructure" spurred by the Clinton/Gore administration, CPSR began to address public-interest Internet issues, and the Seattle chapter launched the Seattle Community Network in 1994. [http://www.cpsr.org](http://www.cpsr.org)

4. **Electronic Frontier Foundation** was established in 1990 "to protect our fundamental rights regardless of technology; to educate the press, policymakers and the general public about civil liberties issues related to technology; and to act as a defender of those liberties." Issues under consideration by EFF include privacy and encryption; government and activism; intellectual property and fair use; Net culture and online community; censorship and free expression; spamming, cybersquatting, and other abuses; and the information infrastructure. [http://www.eff.org/](http://www.eff.org/)

5. **Information Society Project at Yale Law School**: “The Information Society Project at Yale Law School is an intellectual center addressing the implications of the Internet and new information technologies for law and society, guided by the values of democracy, human development, and social justice.” [http://www.isp.law.yale.edu](http://www.isp.law.yale.edu)

6. **OpenNet Initiative (ONI)** The ONI mission is to investigate and challenge state filtration and surveillance practices. Our approach applies methodological rigor to the study of filtration and surveillance blending empirical case studies with sophisticated
means for technical verification. Our aim is to generate a credible picture of these practices at a national, regional and corporate level, and to excavate their impact on state sovereignty, security, human rights, international law, and global governance.

http://www.opennet.net/
**Internet Governance and Infrastructure**

1. **World Summit on the Information Society**, a project of the International Telecommunication Union (ITU, the agency of the United Nations that is responsible for the regulation, standardization and development of telecommunications worldwide).  
   [http://www.itu.int/wsis/](http://www.itu.int/wsis/)

   [http://www.gseis.ucla.edu/iclp/decade.html](http://www.gseis.ucla.edu/iclp/decade.html)

3. **The Internet Engineering Task Force.** The Internet Engineering Task Force is a large open international community of network designers, operators, vendors, and researchers concerned with the evolution of the Internet architecture and the smooth operation of the Internet.  
   [http://www.ietf.org](http://www.ietf.org)

4. **The Internet Society (ISOC)** is a professional membership society with more than 100 organization and over 20,000 individual members in over 180 countries. It provides leadership in addressing issues that confront the future of the Internet, and is the organization home for the groups responsible for Internet infrastructure standards, including the Internet Engineering Task Force (IETF) and the Internet Architecture Board (IAB).  
   [http://www.isoc.org](http://www.isoc.org)

5. **The Coalition for Networked Information (CNI)** is an organization dedicated to supporting the transformative promise of networked information technology for the advancement of scholarly communication and the enrichment of intellectual productivity.  

6. **The Internet Corporation for Assigned Names and Numbers (ICANN)** is an internationally organized, non-profit corporation that has responsibility for Internet Protocol (IP) address space allocation, protocol identifier assignment, generic (gTLD) and country code (ccTLD) Top-Level Domain name system management, and root server system management functions. As a private-public partnership, ICANN is dedicated to preserving the operational stability of the Internet; to promoting competition; to achieving broad representation of global Internet communities; and to developing policy appropriate to its mission through bottom-up, consensus-based processes.  
   [http://www.icann.org](http://www.icann.org)

7. **Internet Governance Project:** This is an interdisciplinary consortium of scholars with experience in Internet governance. The website has articles on a variety of issues and debates regarding Internet governance.  
   [http://www.internetgovernance.org](http://www.internetgovernance.org)

8. **F2C: Freedom to Connect:**  
   [http://www.freedom-to-connect.net](http://www.freedom-to-connect.net)
9. Save the Internet
http://www.savetheinternet.com

10. Working Group on Internet Governance
http://www.wgig.org
Copyright / Copyfight

1. **Creative Commons** “We use private rights to create public goods: creative works set free for certain uses. Like the free software and open-source movements, our ends are cooperative and community-minded, but our means are voluntary and libertarian. We work to offer creators a best-of-both-worlds way to protect their works while encouraging certain uses of them — to declare "some rights reserved." Thus, a single goal unites Creative Commons' current and future projects: to build a layer of reasonable, flexible copyright in the face of increasingly restrictive default rules.” [http://creativecommons.org](http://creativecommons.org)

2. **Electronic Frontier Foundation (EFF)**. From the Internet to the iPod, technologies are transforming our society and empowering us as speakers, citizens, creators, and consumers. When our freedoms in the networked world come under attack, the Electronic Frontier Foundation (EFF) is the first line of defense. EFF broke new ground when it was founded in 1990 — well before the Internet was on most people's radar — and continues to confront cutting-edge issues defending free speech, privacy, innovation, and consumer rights today. From the beginning, EFF has championed the public interest in every critical battle affecting digital rights. [http://www.eff.org/about/](http://www.eff.org/about/)

3. **Corante** is a trusted, unbiased source on technology, business, law, science, and culture that’s authored by leading commentators and thinkers in their respective fields. Corante also produces premium conferences and publications that help decision-makers better understand their industries and the world around them. [http://www.corante.com/](http://www.corante.com/)

4. **Freedom to Tinker**. A blog, focused on issues related to legal regulation of technology, and especially on legal attempts to restrict the right of technologists and citizens to tinker with technological devices. [http://www.freedom-to-tinker.com/](http://www.freedom-to-tinker.com/)

5. **Public Knowledge** is a group of lawyers, technologists, lobbyists, academics, volunteers and activists dedicated to fortifying and defending a vibrant information commons. Our first priority is to stop any bad legislation from passing—laws we think would slow technology innovation, pick market winners, shrink the public domain, or prevent fair use. We work to assure the future remains open, and that democratic principles and cultural values—openness, access and the capacity to create and compete—are given new embodiment in the digital age. [http://www.publicknowledge.org/about](http://www.publicknowledge.org/about)

6. **Free Culture Movement**. The mission of the Free Culture movement is to build a bottom-up, participatory structure to society and culture, rather than a top-down, closed, proprietary structure. Through the democratizing power of digital technology and the Internet, we can place the tools of creation and distribution, communication and collaboration, teaching and learning into the hands of the common person -- and with a truly active, connected, informed citizenry, injustice and oppression will slowly but surely vanish from the earth. We believe that culture should be a two-way affair, about participation, not merely consumption. We will not be content to sit passively at the end of a one-way media tube. We refuse to accept a future of digital feudalism where we do not actually own the products we buy, but we are merely granted limited uses of them as
long as we pay the rent. We must halt and reverse the recent radical expansion of intellectual property rights, which threaten to reach the point where they trump any and all other rights of the individual and society. [http://www.freeculture.org/](http://www.freeculture.org/)

7. **Copyright Criminals**: This is a Sampling Sport (10 min Work in Progress) [http://www.copyrightcriminals.com/](http://www.copyrightcriminals.com/)

**Politics/Digital Democracy**

1. **OpenDemocracy.net** is pioneering a new type of independent media based on exchange and participation. Our readers and writers span all continents. We cover the key questions of our time with contributions from renowned authors and marginalised voices. We publish clarifying debates which help people make up their own minds. We use the web to build and map intelligent discussions, which we accumulate and expand daily. OpenDemocracy stands for human rights and democracy. We support these concepts as an opening, rather than with closed definition. [http://www.opendemocracy.net](http://www.opendemocracy.net)

2. **The Center for Responsive Politics** is a non-partisan, non-profit research group based in Washington, D.C. that tracks money in politics, and its effect on elections and public policy. The Center conducts computer-based research on campaign finance issues for the news media, academics, activists, and the public at large. The Center’s work is aimed at creating a more educated voter, an involved citizenry, and a more responsive government. [http://www.opensecrets.org/about/index.asp](http://www.opensecrets.org/about/index.asp)


4. **Center for Digital Government** The Center for Digital Government is a national research and advisory institute on information technology policies and best practices in state and local government. [http://www.centerdigitalgov.com](http://www.centerdigitalgov.com)

5. **The Center for Democracy and Technology** (CDT) is a 501 (c) (3) non-profit public policy organization dedicated to promoting the democratic potential of today's open, decentralized global Internet. Our mission is to conceptualize, develop, and implement public policies to preserve and enhance free expression, privacy, open access, and other democratic values in the new and increasingly integrated communications medium. CDT promotes its own policy positions in the United States and globally through public policy advocacy, online grassroots organizing with the Internet user community and public education campaigns, and litigation, as well as through the development of technology standards and online information resources. [http://www.cdt.org/](http://www.cdt.org/)

6. **The Center for Internet and Society at Stanford Law School**: “The CIS brings together scholars, academics, legislators, students, programmers, security researchers, and scientists to study the interaction of new technologies and the law and to examine how the synergy between the two can either promote or harm public goods like free speech, privacy, public commons, diversity, and scientific inquiry. The CIS strives as
well to improve both technology and law, encouraging decision-makers to design both as a means to further democratic values.”
http://www.cyberlaw.stanford.edu

7. **The DeWitt Wallace Center for Media and Democracy** supports a policy of a democratic free media throughout the world.
http://www.pubpol.duke.edu/centers/dewitt/about.html

8. **MediaChannel** is a media issues supersite, featuring criticism, breaking news, and investigative reporting from hundreds of organizations worldwide, focused on issues pertaining to Digital Democracy. As the media watch the world, we watch the media.
http://www.mediacchannel.org/atissue/cyber/

9. **The Progress and Freedom Foundation** The Progress & Freedom Foundation was founded in 1993 to study the digital revolution and its implications for public policy. A news site rather than an interactive site. Offers updates on US government policy on the Internet, as well as papers regarding computer technology (e.g. discussion papers on whether or not Microsoft is a monopolist). Pro-market approach. http://www.pff.org/

10. **International Institute for Democracy and Electoral Assistance (IDEA)** Created in 1995, the International Institute for Democracy and Electoral Assistance (IDEA), an intergovernmental organization with member states from all continents, has a mandate to support sustainable democracy worldwide. IDEA operates at an interface between those who analyze and monitor trends in democracy and those who engage directly in political reform or act in support of democracy at home and abroad. IDEA works with both new and long-established democracies, helping to develop and strengthen the institutions and culture of democracy. It operates at international, regional and national level, working in partnership with a range of institutions. http://www.idea.int/index.cfm

10. **The Technology Liberation Front** [Pro Industry, Anti-regulation perspective]
http://www.techliberation.com

**Culture Jamming Websites**

1. **Adbusters** are a global network of artists, activists, writers, pranksters, students, educators and entrepreneurs who want to advance the new social activist movement of the information age. Our aim is to topple existing power structures and forge a major shift in the way we will live in the 21st century. To this end, Adbusters Media Foundation publishes Adbusters magazine, operates this website and offers its creative services through PowerShift, our advocacy advertising agency. http://www.adbusters.org/

2. **The Billboard Liberation Front.** Encouraging the masses to use any means possible to commandeer the existing media and to alter it to their own design.
http://www.billboardliberation.com/
3. **The Yes Men** are a group of culture jamming activists who practice what they call "identity correction". They pretend to be powerful people and organizations and then use their newfound authority to espouse what they think those groups really believe. The Yes Men's most famous prank is placing a "corrected" WTO website at gatt.org (GATT is the treaty that led to the WTO). The fake site began to receive real emails from confused visitors, including invitations to address various elite groups on behalf of the WTO, which they obligingly took up. Showing up in newly-purchased suits, The Yes Men gave speeches encouraging corporations to buy votes directly from citizens, arguing that the US Civil War was a waste of money because Third World countries now willingly supply equivalent slaves, and claiming that people should listen to the WTO, not the facts, because the WTO had a lot of experts. Their experiences were documented in the film The Yes Men, distributed by United Artists, as well as the book The Yes Men: The True Story of the End of the World Trade. [http://www.theyesmen.org/](http://www.theyesmen.org/)

4. **RTMark** is an activist art collective that subverts the "Corporate Shield" protecting US corporations. RTMark is itself a registered corporation, which brings together activists who plan projects with donors who fund them. For their first prank, in the 1990s, they swapped the electronics of talking Barbie and GI Joe toys and then returned them to the store. They then issued a message as the "Barbie Liberation Organization." [http://www.rtmark.com/](http://www.rtmark.com/)

5. **Media.org**. Culture jamming has a long history. From Abbie Hoffman to Adbusters, this honorable occupation helps change the world for the better. Jamming is not yipping about yourself or playing fetch for some corporate master. Hacks are jams. Building a site to fill a void in your community is a jam. Jamming is helping to change the world around you. We here at media.org like to do our small part. [http://jam.media.org/](http://jam.media.org/)

6. **Google Bombing**. From wikipedia: “. . . the entire notion of "Google bombs" might be better described as "link bombing," given that these campaigns can certainly have an effect on other search engines, as well. All major search engines make use of link analysis and thus can be impacted. So, a search for "miserable failure" on June 1, 2005 brought up the official George W. Bush biography number one on Google, Yahoo and MSN and number two on Ask Jeeves. On June 2, 2005, Yooter reported that George Bush is now ranked first for the keyword 'failure' as well as 'miserable failure' in both Google and Yahoo. Other large political figures have been targeted for Google bombs . . . "Google bombing" was added to the New Oxford American Dictionary in May 2005. [http://www.en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Google_bomb](http://www.en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Google_bomb)

7. **Audio Collages of Political Speeches**. Politics is the practice of doublespeak. Fortunately, through the magic of creativity and relatively cheap digital audio editing tools, the speech of political creatures can finally be unspun, and the truth laid bare. These are galleries of translations of popular politicians as made by audio collage artists from around the planet. They are (as far as we know) works in the public domain and may be freely shared and used as fodder for further translation projects. [http://www.diymedia.net/collage/truth.htm](http://www.diymedia.net/collage/truth.htm)
8. **Podcasting. Courtesy of WFMU’s Blog:** “Podcasting allows you to time-shift listening to radio shows you can’t usually catch, and gives you access to all sorts of amateur programmers who are going online with a wide variety of good, bad, and ugly programming. While lots of mainstream radio content is either unavailable as a podcast or requires you to give up some money to do so, there’s plenty of choices when it comes to subscribing to free podcasts. Too many really.”
http://www.masternewmedia.org/news/2005/05/20/where_to_submit_your_podcasts.htm and http://www.podcast.com

Alternative Media

1. **Alternative Press Center** "is a non-profit collective dedicated to providing access to and increasing public awareness of the alternative press." Its site maintains both an extensive Online Directory of alternative press publications (everything from *Abafazi*, the Simmons College Journal of Women of African Descent, to Z Magazine, a political monthly) and Alternative Viewpoints on the Internet, links to more than 425 independent online resources. For more than a quarter of a century, the Alternative Press Index has been recognized as a leading guide to the alternative press in the United States and around the world. http://www.altpress.org/

2. **Alternet**, a project of the Independent Media Institute, "provides a mix of news, opinion and investigative journalism on subjects ranging from the environment, the drug war, technology and cultural trends to policy debate, sexual politics and health issues." Most impressive is the site’s fully searchable article database of more than 7,000 stories from over 200 sources. Updated daily with the latest stories of note from alternative outlets across the country (with a means of easily e-mailing an article to friends and colleagues), Alternet also hosts an active forum in which users actively discuss news and events. http://www.alternet.org/

3. **Independent Media Center** "is a network of collectively run media outlets for the creation of radical, accurate, and passionate tellings of the truth." Best known for its efforts to provide grassroots coverage of the World Trade Organization protests in Seattle in late 2000, a decentralized network of Indy Media centers now includes some 30 affiliates worldwide and another 28 across the US. Searchable in nine languages across multiple media (photos, videos, audio, and print), the IMC site also offers extensive opportunities for users to publish their own multimedia material, as well as opportunities to discuss current events and issues. http://www.indymedia.org/en/index.shtml

4. **MediaChannel** "is concerned with the political, cultural and social impacts of the media, large and small," in an effort "… to provide information and diverse perspectives and inspire debate, collaboration, action and citizen engagement." Resources on the site include special reports, action toolkits for journalists and teachers, forums for discussion, an indexed directory of hundreds of affiliated groups, and a searchable database of online media issues. Updated daily, the site offers links to breaking stories and opinion from news outlets in the US and abroad. http://www.mediachannel.org/
5. **Znet**, billing itself as "a community of people committed to social change," presents a dizzying array of resources and links, drawing on *Z Magazine* and organized around several themes: Crises and Struggles ("a series of ‘subsites’ devoted to ongoing hotspots and movements"), Watch Sites (everything from animal rights watch and anarchy watch to queer watch and race watch), Activism, and Parecon (participatory economics). Regular updates provide links to news and commentary from leading members of the alternative press corps. [http://www.zmag.org/weluser.htm](http://www.zmag.org/weluser.htm)

6. **Invisible America** [http://www.invisibleamerica.com](http://www.invisibleamerica.com)

**Digital Divide**

1. **Investor Group Against the Digital Divide**: This organization connects academics and IT executives in order to close the digital divide, starting with Indonesia. [http://www.digitaldivide.org/dd/igadd.html](http://www.digitaldivide.org/dd/igadd.html)

2. **The Digital Divide Network**, produced by the Benton Foundation, examines "the causes and effects of the divide from four distinct angles: technology access, literacy and learning, content, and economic development." The site features a number of success stories and "best practice" strategies, along with a full complement of useful Web links. [http://www.digitaldivide.net/](http://www.digitaldivide.net/)

3. **SeniorNet**, approaching the digital divide issues from a different perspective, "provides adults 50+ access to and education about computer technology and the Internet to enhance their lives and enable them to share their knowledge and wisdom." In addition to a Web site that is full of tips and advice for those new to computers, SeniorNet also plays host to an online community, with active discussion forums and chat rooms, as well as overseeing more than 200 Learning Centers across the country where seniors can receive hands-on computer training. [http://www.seniornet.org/php/default.php](http://www.seniornet.org/php/default.php)

4. **The Web Accessibility Initiative** serves as a useful reminder that millions of Americans have other barriers to overcome. A project of the World Wide Web Consortium, WAI is committed to leading the Web to its full potential by "promoting a high degree of usability for people with disabilities." In coordination with organizations around the world, the project "pursues accessibility of the Web through five primary areas of work: technology, guidelines, tools, education and outreach, and research and development." Especially as new incarnations of the Web (via interactive TV, for example) become nominally more "user-friendly," the work of WAI will become all the more important in ensuring that no one is needlessly left behind. [http://www.w3.org/WAI/](http://www.w3.org/WAI/)

**Global Projects**

1. **Global Voices Online** is a non-profit global citizens’ media project, sponsored by and launched from the Berkman Center for Internet and Society at the Harvard Law School.
Global Voices is your guide to the most interesting conversations, information, and ideas appearing around the world on various forms of participatory media such as blogs, podcasts, photo sharing sites, and videoblogs. Each day they link to 5-10 of the most interesting blog posts from their regions in the “daily roundups” section. A larger group of contributing bloggers is posting daily features in the left-hand Weblog section, shedding light on what blogging communities in their countries have been talking about recently.  http://www.globalvoicesonline.org/

2. **CIVICUS** "is an international alliance dedicated to strengthening citizen action and civil society throughout the world," with a vision of creating a "worldwide community of informed, inspired, committed citizens engaged in confronting the challenges facing humanity." Targeting specific areas for citizen action (building democracy, promoting gender equality, fostering justice, promoting social inclusion, and fighting poverty) CIVICUS offers an Internet toolkit designed to assist its 522 member organizations to increase their online effectiveness. CIVICUS also offers an online Civil Society Index Survey, a diagnostic tool designed to assess the health of civil society in a particular nation by measuring the relative levels cooperative behavior, public-interest activities, voluntarism, freedom of speech and assembly, and similar civil society staples. http://www.civicus.org

3. **OneWorld.net**, with 11 different national editions of its news and information site (including a version for the United States) "is an internet community of 978 organizations leading the way for human rights and sustainable development worldwide." Drawing on the resources of its member organizations, OneWorld offers news and analysis, special reports, campaigns (covering such issues as climate change, debt repayment, and the digital divide), and selective online shopping opportunities ("Putting the ‘ethical’ back into e-commerce"). Impressive overall, OneWorld has an agenda for its US site that is as idealistic as it is ambitious, seeking "to enhance the knowledge of U.S. citizens about international affairs/development. OneWorld US hopes to stimulate discussion and debate about international affairs and policy alternatives in the United States and encourage action leading to greater peace, justice, and equality at the global level." http://www.oneworld.net/

4. **The Global Media Project at The Watson Institute for International Studies**: “The goal of the Global Media Project is to see what lies behind and beyond the screen, to study the expanding role of media in war and peace, and to produce new documentary media for human rights, cultural understanding, sustainable development, and global security. It does so by bringing under one roof academic researchers, policy practitioners, and media producers, who together can provide critical analytical tools for international media makers, as well as create challenging global-interest media.” http://www.watsoninstitute.org/globalmedia

6. Blog Critics Magazine: [“An interactive community in which writers and readers from around the globe talk about stories, issues and products.”]
http://www.blogcritics.org
Bloody Everything – The Thinker
1. Lawrence Lessig at Stanford Law School. Lawrence Lessig is a Professor of Law at Stanford Law School and founder of the school's Center for Internet and Society. He has won numerous awards, including the Free Software Foundation's Freedom Award, and was named one of Scientific American's Top 50 Visionaries, for arguing "against interpretations of copyright that could stifle innovation and discourse online." Professor Lessig is the author of Free Culture (2004), The Future of Ideas (2001) and Code and Other Laws of Cyberspace (1999). He chairs the Creative Commons project, and serves on the board of the Free Software Foundation, the Electronic Frontier Foundation, the Public Library of Science, and Public Knowledge. Professor Lessig teaches and writes in the areas of constitutional law, contracts, and the law of cyberspace.
http://www.lessig.org

Big Media Meets Its Match – Utne Reader
1. A Media Reformer’s Handbook [Additional Books, Websites and Blogs]
INDUSTRY WEBSITES

Agri America (http://agri-americamarketing.com)
American Solar Energy Society (www.ases.org)
Beef USA (www.beef.org)
Biotechnology Industry Organization (www.bio.org)
Chevron Texaco (www.chevrontexaco.com)
Competitive Enterprise Institute (www.cei.org)
Container Recycling Institute (www.container-recycling.org)
Corante [Tech News Filtered Daily] (www.corante.com)
Council for Biotechnology Information (www.whybiotech.com)
Exxon Mobil (www.exxommobil.com)
Fair Trade Federation (www.fairtradefederation.com)
Gazprom (www.gazprom.ru)
Global Arcade (www.globalarcade.org)
Global Business Network (www.gbn.com)
International Council on Nanotechnology (http://icon.rice.edu)
Levi’s (www.levistrauss.com)
National Cattlemen’s Beef Association (www.beefusa.org)
Net impact (http://www.netimpact.org)
New Resource Bank (www.newresourcebank.com)
Shell (www.shell.com)
SoL Forum on Business Innovation for Sustainability (www.solonline.org)
Solectron (www.solectron.com)
Soy Growers (www.soygrows.com)
Sustainable Development International Corporation (www.smartoffice.com)
TechNet (www.technet.org)
Unilever (www.unilever.com)
VIDEO/MEDIA

[Planet Green – The Discovery Channel] 24 hour all environmental cable
Sundance Channel [Green Programming]
A Crude Awakening: The Oil Crash
Affluenza
Atomic Cafè
Bamako
Black Gold (www.blackgoldmovie.com)
Blue Vinyl (Bullfrog)
Build Green (Bullfrog)
Bullfrog Films (www.bullfrogfilms.com)
Burden of Dreams (Werner Herzog)
China Blue
Close to Eden
CNN People Bomb
Dersu Uzala
Discovery Network (Planet Green) (www.planetgreen.discovery.com)
Earth Cinema Circle (www.eccfilms.com)
Escape From Afluenza
Farming the Seas (Bullfrog)
Fast Runner
Fitzcarraldo (Herzog)
Flow (www.flowthefilm.com)
Food, Inc.
Frankensteer (Bullfrog)
Fritz Lang’s Metropolis
Herdsmen of the Sun (Werner Herzog)
In the Hands of the Raven
Kundun
Life (Bullfrog)
Life and Debt
Life Running Out of Control (Bullfrog)
Manufactured Landscapes (2007) [Zeitgeist Films]
Men With Guns
Network
One Week (Buster Keaton) (1920)
Our Political Environment: Environmental Policy, Corporate Ethics, and Global Warming: A video interview with Peter Matthiessen (October 2004)
www.oriononline.org/pages/00/curwis/index_curwis.html
Recycled Life (2006)
Sundance Channel: The Green (www.sundancechannel.com/thegreen)
The Future of Food (www.thefutureoffood.com)
The Garden
The Lorax
The Real Dirt on Farmer John
The World (Shijie)
The Yes Men Fix the World
Thomas Berry’s The Great Story
Toxic Bust (Bullfrog)
Utne: A media Reformer’s Handbook (July-Aug ’07)
What a Way to Go: Life at the End of Empire
Where Green Ants Dream (Werner Herzog)
www.homelands.org/worlds/specials.html [Worlds of Difference]
www.insightmedia.com
http://www.lannan.org [Readings and Conversations Series]
www.linktv.org
www.npr.org
www.pangeaday.org
EDUCATION

Aprovecho Research Center (www.aprovecho.net)
Bainbridge Graduate Institute (www.bgiedu.org)
BIJA Vidyapeeth School of the Seed India/Int’l College for Sustainable Living
California Institute of Integral Studies (www.ciis.edu)
Earth Institute at Columbia University (www.earth.columbia.edu)
Earth Island Journal’s Environmental Education Directory
Earth University (www.earth-usa.org)
Ecoverity (www.ecoversity.org)
Education for Sustainability (www.gcrio.org/edu/pcsdtoc.html)
Education for Sustainability Western Network (www.efswest.org)
Environmental Change Institute (www.eci.ox.ac.uk)
Global Development and Environmental Institute at Tufts University (www.ase.tufts.edu/gdae)
Globalization Research Network
Goddard College (www.goodard.edu)
Institute for the Study of Planet Earth (www.ispe.arizona.edu)
Islandwood (www.islandwood.org)
Oberlin College (www.oberlin.edu)
Occidental Arts & Ecology Center (www.oaec.org)
Pacific Institute for Climate Solutions (www.pics.uvic.ca)
Presidio School of Management (http://www.presidiomba.org)
Regenerative Design Institute (www.regenerative design.org)
Renewable Appropriate Energy Laboratory (http://rael.berkeley.edu)
Rocky Mountain Institute (www.rmi.org)
Santa Fe Institute (www.santafe.edu)
Schumacher College (www.schumachercollege.org.uk)
Sustainable Communities Network – Resources and Organizations that Promote Sustainability Education (www.sustainable.org/living/education.html)
Sustainable Table (www.sustainabletable.org)
The Globalism Institute
The Ponderosa Project (http://www2.nau.edu/~ponder-p)
MAGAZINES

Adbusters (http://www.adbusters.org)
Américas (http://www.oas.org/americas)
Atlantic Monthly (http://www.theatlantic.com)
Bulletin of the Atomic Scientists (http://www.thebulletin.org)
The Compendumn Newsletter (www.ecoprojects.org)
Cultural Survival Quality (http://www.culturalsurvival.org)
Development in Practice (http://www.developmentinpractice.org)
Dissent (http://www.dissentmagazine.org)
E (http://www.emagazine.com)
Earth Island Journal (www.earthisland.org)
Earthwatch (http://www.earthwatch.org)
Ecological Home Ideas (www.ecologicalhomeideas.com)
Econ Journal Watch (www.econjournalwatch.org)
The Ecologist (http://www.theecologist.org)
The Economist (http://www.economist.com)
Ethnos (http://www.tandf.co.uk/journals)
Foreign Affairs (http://www.foreignaffairs.org)
Foreign Policy (http://www.foreignpolicy.com)
Gene Watch (www.gene-watch.org) [Council for responsible Genetics]
Global Environmental Politics Quarterly (http://www.mitpressjournals.org/loi/glep)
Green Money Journal (www.greenmoney.com)
Harper’s Magazine (http://www.harpers.org)
Harvard International Review (http://hir.harvard.edu)
The Hedgehog Review (www.hedgehogreview.com)
In Context: A Quarterly of Humane Sustainable Culture (http://www.context.org)
Intelligence Report (www.splcenter.org) [Southern Poverty Law Center]
Journal of Industrial Ecology (www.yale.edu/jie)
Lapis (http://www.lapismagazine.org)
The Nation (www.thenation.com)
National Geographic (http://www.nationalgeographic.com)
Native Americas (http://www.nativepeoples.com)
New Internationalist (http://www.newint.org)
New Solutions (www.communitysolution.org)
New York Review of Books (http://www.nybooks.com)
New Yorker (http://www.newyorker.com)
NPQ (New Perspectives Quarterly) (http://www.digitalnpq.org/home.html)
Orion & Orion Afield (http://www.orionsociety.org)
Parabola (http://www.parabola.org)
ACADEMIC PRESSES

Altamira Press (http://www.altamirapress.com)
Ashgate Publishing (www.ashgate.com)
CAB International (http://www.cabi.org/home.asp)
Cambridge University Press (http://www.cambridge.org)
Carolina Academic Press (www.caplan.com)
Chelsea Green (http://www.chelseagreen.com)
Dream Change (www.dreamchange.org)
Edward Elgar Publishing (www.e-elgar.com)
Island Press Environmental Sourcebook (www.islandpress.org)
Kumarian Press (www.kpbooks.com)
MIT Press (www.mitpress.mit.edu)
New Society Publishers (www.newsociety.com)
Pine Forge Press (www.pineforge.com)
Population Reference Bureau (www.prb.org)
Rethinking Schools (www.rethinkingschools.org)
Roman & Littlefield Publishers (http://www.rlpgbooks.com)
Routledge-Cavendish (http://www.routledgelaw.com)
Sage Publications (www.sagepub.com)
Teaching for Change (www.teachingforchange.org)
University of California Press (www.ucpress.edu)
Adbusters Media Foundation (www.adbusters.org)
1243 W. Seventh Ave., Vancouver, BC V6H 1B7, Canada

Alliance for Climate Protection (www.wecansolveit.org)

Alliance for Wild Ethics (www.wildethics.org)

American Agricultural Movement (www.aaminc.org)
24800 Sage Creek Rd., Scenic, SD 57780

American Anthropological Association (www.aaanet.org)

Animal Copyright Foundation (http://www.animalcopyright.org)

Ashes and Snow (www.ashesandsnow.org)

Aspen Institute (www.aspeninstitute.org)

Bank Information Center (www.bicusa.org)
733 15th St NW, Ste. 1126, Washington, DC 20005

Basel Action Network (www.ban.org)

Biomimicry Institute (http://www.biomimicryinstitute.org)

Bioneers (www.bioneers.org)
Collective Heritage Institute, 901 W San Mateo Rd., Ste L, Santa Fe, NM 87505

Border Ecology Project (BEP)
PO Drawer CP, Bisbee, AZ 85603

The Bubble Project (www.thebubbleproject.com)

California Institute for Integral Studies (www.ciis.edu)
1453 Mission St., San Francisco, CA 94103

Campaign for a Commercial-Free Childhood (www.commercialfreechildhood.org)

Canadian Centre for Policy Alternatives (www.policyalternatives.ca)
75 Albert St., Ottawa, Ontario K1P 5E7, Canada
Carbon Disclosure Project (www.cdproject.net)
Carbon Fund (www.carbonfund.org)
Center for Alternative Technology (www.cat.org.uk)
Center for Biological Diversity (www.biologicaldiversity.org)
Center for Cognitive Liberty (http://www.cognitiveliberty.org)
Center for Conservation Biology
Center for Ecoliteracy (Fritjof Capra) (www.ecoliteracy.org)
   2522 San Pablo Ave., Berkeley, CA 94702
Center for Food Safety (www.centerforfoodsafty.org)
Center for Global Development (www.cgdev.org)
Center for Health, Environment & Justice (www.chej.org) (formerly Citizen’s Clearinghouse for Hazardous Wastes) PO Box 6806, Falls Church, VA 22040
Center for Human Ecology (www.che.ac.uk)
Center for International Environmental Law (CIEL) (www.ciel.org)
   1367 Connecticut Ave. NW, Ste 300, Washington, DC 20036
Center for Investigative Reporting (ww.muckraker.org)
   131 Steuart St., Ste. 600, San Francisco, CA 94105-1238
Center for Responsible Nanotechnology (www.crnano.org)
Center for Sustainable Environments (www.environment.nau.edu)
Center for Tactical Magic (www.tacticalmagic.org)
Center for Study of Responsive Law (www.csrl.org)
   PO Box 19367, Washington, DC 20036
Citizens Environmental Laboratory (formerly National Toxics Campaign)
   Jobs & Environment Campaign, 160 2nd St., Cambridge, MA 02142-1502
Commercial Alert (www.commercialalert.org)
Communitree (www.communitree.net)

Community Environmental Legal Defense Fund (www.celdf.org)

Computer Professions for Social Responsibility (www.cpsr.org)
   PO Box 717, Palo Alto, CA 94302-0717

Consumer Project on Technology (www.cpptech.org)

Correlates of War (www.correlatesofwar.org)

Cordillera Women’s Education and Resource Center [no website]
   P.O. Box 7691, GARCOM Baguio City 752, DAPO 1300 Domestic Road, Pasay City, Philippines

Council on Economic Priorities (www.ic.org)

Council for Responsible Genetics (www.gene-watch.org)
   5 Upland Rd, Ste 3, Cambridge, MA 02140

The Council of Canadians (www.canadians.org)
   502-151 Slater St, Ottawa, Ontario K1P 5H3, Canada

The Cousteau Society (www.cousteausociety.org)
   Calypso Log and Dolphin Log, 870 Greenbrier Circle, Ste 402, Chesapeake, VA 23320

Critical Art Ensemble (CAE) (http://www.critical-art.net)

Cultural Survival (www.cs.org)
   Cultural Survival Quarterly, 215 Prospect St., Cambridge, MA 02139

Culture Change (www.culturechange.org)

Data Center (www.datacenter.org)
   Corporate Responsibility Monitor, 1904 Franklin St., Ste 900, Oakland, CA 94612

Daybreak Magazine: American Indian World Views
   P.O. Box 315, Williamsville, NY 14231-0315

Democracy: A journal of Ideas

The Development Group for Alternative Policies (www.developmentgap.org)
   927 15th St. NW, 4th Fl., Washington, DC 20005
E.F. Schumacher Society (www.schumachersociety.org)
140 Jug End Rd, Great Barrington, MA 01230

Earth First! Journal (www.earthfirstjournal.org)
Earth First! The Radical Environmental Journal, PO Box 3023, Tucson AZ 85702

Earth Island Institute (www.earthisland.org)
Earth Island Journal, 300 Broadway, Ste. 28, San Francisco, CA 94133

Earth Justice (www.earthjustice.org)

Earthwatch Institute (www.earthwatch.org)

Earthworm: The Environmental Journal (formerly Buzzworm: The Environmental Journal)
2305 Canyon Blvd., Ste. 206, Boulder, CO 80302

Ecumenical Coalition for Economic Justice (www.socialjustice.org.nz)

Electronic Frontier Foundation (www.eff.com)

Elmwood Institute (www.electrictao.net)
Elmwood Newsletter and Global File, 2522 San Pablo Ave, Berkeley, CA 94702

Environmental Change Institute (www.eci.ox.ac.uk)

Environmental Defense Fund (www.edf.org)

Environmental Investigation Agency (www.eia-international.org)

Environmental Working Group (www.ewg.org)

Equipo Pueblo (www.equipopueblo.org.mx)
Francisco Field Jurado 51, Colonia Independencia, 03630 México, D.F., México

Fairness and Accuracy in Reporting (FAIR) (www.fair.org)
112 W. 27th St., New York, NY 10001

Fair Trade Foundation (www.fairtrade.org)

Fair trade Labeling Organizations International

Fifth Estate (www.fifthestate.org)
4632 Second Ave., Detroit, MI 48201

FINCA (www.villagebanking.org)

377
FOCUS on the Global South (www.focusweb.org)  
c/o CUSRI, Chulalongkorn University, Prachuabmoh Building, Bangkok, Thailand

Food Democracy Now (www.fooddemocracynow.org)

Food First/Institute for Food and Development Policy (www.foodfirst.org)  
398 60th St., Oakland, CA 94618

Food and Water Watch (www.foodandwaterwatch.org)

Forest Ethics (www.forestethics.org)

Foundation for Deep Ecology (www.deepecology.org)

1660 L St NW, Ste 216, Washington, DC 20036

Friends of the Earth (www.foe.org)  
U.S.: 1025 Vermont Ave. NW, Washington, DC 20005  
International: PO Box 19199, 1000 gd Amsterdam, The Netherlands (www.foei.org)

Friends of the River (www.friendsoftheriver.org)  
915 20th St, Sacramento, CA 95814

Garrison Institute (www.garrisoninstitute.org)

Global Exchange (www.globalexchange.org)  
2017 Mission St., Suite 303, San Francisco, CA 94110

Global Forest Watch (www.globalforestwatch.org)  
World Resources Institute, 10 G St NW, Washington, DC 20002

Global Oneness Project (www.globaloneness.org)

Global Public Policy Project (www.globalpublicpolicy.net)

Global Witness (www.globalwitness.org)

Global 100 (www.global100.org) [100 most sustainable corporations]

Green Biz (www.greenbiz.org)

Green Chimneys (www.greenchimneys.org)
Green Committees of Correspondence (www.global.greens.org.au)
GPO Box 1108, Canberra City, ACT 2601, Australia

Green Letter
P.O. Box 14141, San Francisco, CA 94114

Greenopia (www.greenopia.com)

Green Party (www.greenpartyus.org)
P.O. Box 57065, Washington, DC 20037

Greenpeace (www.greenpeace.org)
Greenpeace, 1436 U St. NW, Washington, DC 20009

Green Shield (www.greenshieldcertified.org)

Guernica (http://www.guernicamag.com)

The Humane Society of the United States (www.hsus.org)
2100 L St NW, Washington, DC 20037

Humanitas Journal (www.nhinet.org/hum.htm)[check]
214 Massachusetts Ave NE, Ste 303, Washington, DC 20002

Independent Media Center (www.indymedia.org)

Indian Law Resource Center (www.indianlaw.org)
601 E. St. SE, Washington, DC 20003
or 602 N Ewing St., Helena, MT 59601

Indigenous Environmental Network (www.ienearth.org)

Institute for Agriculture and Trade Policy (IATP) (www.iatp.org)
1313 5th St. SE, Ste 303, PO Box 80066, Minneapolis, MN 55408

Institut d’Etude sur la Globalisation Economique
42 rue de Sorbier, 75020 Paris, France

Institute for Ethics and Emerging Technologies (www.ieet.org)

Institute for Local Self-Reliance (www.ilsr.org)
2425 18th St. NW, Washington, DC 20009

Institute of Native Knowledge (http://instituteofnativeknowledge.org)
PO Box 261, Arcata, CA 95521

379
Institute of Noetic Sciences (www.noetic.org)

   733 15th St NW, Ste. 1020, Washington, DC 20005

Institute for Reverential Ecology (www.reverentialecology.org)

Institute for the Study of Planet Earth (www.ispe.arizona.edu)

Institute of Science in Society (www.i-sis.org.uk)

International Center for Technology Assessment (www.icta.org)
   666 Pennsylvania Ave SE, Ste. 302, Washington, DC 20003

The International Forum on Globalization (www.ifg.org)
   The Thoreau Center for Sustainability, 1009 General Kennedy Ave. #2, San Francisco, CA 94129 (several publications with extended bibliographies and websites)

International Indian Treaty Council (www.treatycouncil.org)
   Treaty Council News, 2390 Mission St., Ste 301, San Francisco, CA 94110


International Labor Rights Education and Research Fund (ILRERF) (www.laborrights.org)
   733 15th St NW, Ste 920, Washington, DC 20005

International Rivers Network (www.irn.org)
   World Rivers Review, 1847 Berkeley Way, Berkeley, CA 94703

International Society for Ecology and Culture (ISEC) (www.isec.org.uk)
   US: P.O. Box 9475, Berkeley, CA 94709
   UK: Foxhole Dartington, Devon TQ9 6EB, United Kingdom

Ithaca HOURS (www.ithacahours.org)
   P.O. Box 6731, Ithaca, NY 14851

Jacques Ellul Society

Jane Goodall Institute (www.janegoodall.org)

Journal of Industrial Ecology (www.yale.edu/jie)

KIVA (www.kiva.org)
The Land Institute (www.landinstitute.org)  
2440 E. Water Well Rd., Salina, KS 67401

Lannan Foundaton (www.lannan.org)

LETS (Local Exchange Trading System) (www.gmlets.u-net.com)  
Landsman Community Services, Ltd.  
1600 Embleton Crescent, Courtenay, BC V9N 6N8, Canada

Long Now Foundation (www.longnow.org)

Media Channel (http://www.mediachannel.org)

Media Venture Collective (www.mediaventure.org)

Mexican Action Network for Free Trade (RMALC) (www.rmalc.org.mx)  
Explanada 705, México D.F., 11000, México

Minority Rights Group Reports (www.minorityrights.org)  
Minority Rights Group Int’l, 379 Brixton Rd, London SW9 7DE, United Kingdom

Mohawk Nation (www.ratical.org/AkwesasneNs.html)  
Akwesasne Notes, A Journal for Natural and Native Peoples  
P.O. Box 366, Rooseveltown, NY 13683

Mother Jones (www.motherjones.com)  
The Foundation for National Progress  
731 Market St., 6th Floor, San Francisco, CA 94103

The Nation (www.thenation.com)  
33 Irving Pl., New York, NY 10003

The National Abortion and Reproductive Rights Action League (www.naral.org)  
1156 15th St., Ste 700, Washington, DC 20005

National Audubon Society (http://www.audubon.org/)  
Audubon, 700 Broadway, New York, NY 10003

National Coalition Against the Misuse of Pesticides (www.beyondpesticides.org)  
701 E St. SE #200, Washington, DC 20003

The National Family Farm Coalition (http://www.nffc.net/)  
110 Maryland Ave. NE, Ste 307, Washington, DC 20002

Natural Capital Institute (www.naturalcapital.org)
Natural Resources Defense Council (www.nrdc.org)
40 W. 20th St., New York, NY 10011

New College of California (www.newcollege.edu)
766 Valencia St., San Francisco, CA 94110

New Dimensions Radio (www.newdimensions.org)

New Internationalist (www.newint.org)

New York Open Center (www.opencenter.org)
83 Spring St., New York, NY 10012

The New Yorker (www.newyorker.com)
4 Times Square, New York, NY 10036-6592

North American Congress on Latin America (NACLA) (www.nacla.org)
475 Riverside Dr., Ste 454, New York, NY 10115

Oceanic Society (www.oceanic-society.org)
Fort Mason Center, San Francisco, CA 94123

Open Architecture Network (www.openarchitecturenetwork.org)

Open Societies Institute (http://www.soros.org)

Organic Consumers Association (www.organicconsumers.org)

Oxfam (www.oxfam.org.uk) / (www.oxfamamerica.org)

Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development (www.oecdwash.org)

Pacific Institute for Studies in Development, Environment, and Security (www.pacinst.org)

Pangea Day (www.pangeaday.org)

Pele Defense Fund (www.earthjustice.org/about_us/clients_coalitions/pele_defense_fund.html)

The People Centered Development Forum (PCDForum) (http://www.pcdf.org)
c/o IPSA, 2100 L St NW, Washington, DC 20037

Pesticide Action Network (PAN)
North America (www.panna.org): 49 Powell St., Ste 500, San Francisco, CA 94102
International (www.pan-international.org)
Database (www.pesticideinfo.org)
Pew Commission on Industrial Farm Animal Production (www.ncifap.org/issues/environment/)

Pew Internet and American Life Project (www.pewinternet.org)

Planet Drum Foundation (http://www.planetdrum.org/)
Raise the Stakes, The Planet Drum Review, Box 31251, San Francisco, CA 94131

Planned Parenthood Federation of America (www.plannedparenthood.org)
810 Seventh Ave., New York, NY 10019

Plenty Magazine (www.plentymag.com)

Polaris Institute (www.polarisinstitute.org)
312 Cooper St., Ottawa, Ontario K2P 0G7, Canada

Population Action International (www.populationaction.org)

Population Connection (formerly Zero Population Growth) (www.populationconnection.org)
ZPG Reporter, 1400 16th St. NW, Ste 320, Washington, DC 20036

Post Carbon Institute (www.postcarbon.org)

Privacy Journal (www.privacyjournal.net)
P.O. Box 28577, Providence, RI 02908

PROBE International (www.probeinternational.org)
225 Brunswick Ave., Toronto, Ontario, M5S 2M6 Canada

Processed World (www.processedworld.com)
41 Sutter St., #1829, San Francisco, CA 94104

Program on Corporations, Law, and Democracy (POCLAD) (www.poclad.org)
P.O. Box 246, S. Yarmouth, MA 02664-0246

Project on Emerging Nanotechnologies (www.nanotechproject.org)

Prometheus Institute for Sustainable Development (www.prometheus.org)

Public Citizen (www.citizen.org)
Global Trade Watch, 1600 20th St NW, Washington, DC 20009

Public Media Center (www.publicmediacenter.org)
466 Green St., San Francisco, CA 94133

Push Institute (www.pushthefuture.org)
Rainforest Action Network (www.ran.org)
221 Pine St., Ste 500, San Francisco, CA 94104

Reclaim the Commons (www.starhawk.org/activism/activism-writings/reclaim_commons.html)

Reclaim the Democracy (www.reclaiedmocracy.org)

Resurgence

Rethinking Schools (http://www.rethinkingschools.org)

Redefining Progress (www.rprogress.org)
1904 Franklin St., 6th Fl., Oakland, CA 94612

Research Foundation for Science, Technology and Ecology (http://www.navdanya.org/index.htm)
A-60 Hauz Khas, 110 016 New Delhi, India

Rights and Resources Initiative (www.rightsandresources.org)

Rocky Mountain Institute (www.rmi.org)
1739 Snowmass Creek Rd., Snowmass, CO 81654-9199

The Rukus Society (http://www.ruckus.org)

Schumacher College (www.schumachercollege.org.uk)

Science and Environmental Health Network (www.sehn.org)

Sea Shepherd Conservation Society (www.seashepherd.org)
22774 Pacific Coast Highway, Malibu, CA 90265


The Seventh Generation Fund (www.7genfund.org)
P.O. Box 4569, Arcata, CA 95518

Sierra Club (www.sierraclub.org)
Sierra, 85 Second St., 2nd Fl., San Francisco, CA 94105-3441

Slow Food (www.slowfood.com)

Society for Risk Analysis – Europe (www.sraeurope.org)
The South and Meso-American Indian Rights Center (http://saiic.nativeweb.org)
P.O. Box 7829, Oakland, CA 94601

Southeast Regional Economic Justice Network (SREJN) (www.rejn.org)
P.O. Box 240, Durham, NC 27702

Southwest Network for Environmental and Economic Justice (SNEEJ) (www.sneej.org)
P.O. Box 7399, Albuquerque, NM 87194

Student Environmental Action Coalition (SEAC) (www.seac.org)
P.O. Box 31909, Philadelphia, PA 19104-0609

Sustainable Agriculture, Food and Environmental Alliance (SAFE)
94 White Lion St., London N1 9 PF, United Kingdom

Take Back Your Time (www.timeday.org)

Tällberg Foundation (www.tallbergfoundation.org)

TED [Technology, Entertainment, Design] (www.ted.com)

Terralingua (www.terralingua.org)

Terrapin Bright Green (www.terrapinbrightgreen.com)

Texas Center for Policy Studies (www.texascenter.org)
44 East Avenue, Ste 306, Austin, TX 78701

Third World Network (TWN) (www.twnside.org.sg)
228 Macalister Road, Penang, Malaysia

Trans Fair USA

The Transnational Institute (www.tni.org)
Paulus Potterstraat 20, 1071 DA Amsterdam, The Netherlands

Transparency International

The Trumpeter: Journal of Ecosophy (http://trumpeter.athabascau.ca)
Athabasca University, 1 University Dr., Athabasca AB T9S 3A3, Canada

TOES USA - The Other Economic Summit (http://www.toes-usa.org)
777 UN Plaza, Ste 3C, New York, NY 10017

Unesco (World Heritage Center) (www.unesco.org/en/69)
Union of Concerned Scientists (www.ucsusa.org)
  2 Brattle Square, Cambridge, MA 02238

United for Peace (www.unitedforpeace.org)

Unrepresented Nations and Peoples Organization (www.unpo.org)
  Eisenhowerlaan 136, NL-2517 KN The Hague, The Netherlands
  US: Americas Coordination Office, 444 N. Capitol St., Ste 846, Washington, DC 20001

Utne Reader (http://www.utne.com/)
  1624 Harmon Place #330, Minneapolis, MN 55403

Vast Sky (www.vastsky.org)

Whole Earth Review (http://www.wholeearth.com/index.php)
  1408 Mission Ave., San Rafael, CA 94901

Wilson Center (www.wilsoncenter.org) [Foresight and Governance Project]

Worldwatch Institute (www.worldwatch.org)
  1776 Massachusetts Ave. NW, Washington, DC 20036-1904

World Wildlife (www.worldwildlife.org) & (www.panda.org)

World Resources Institute (http://www.wri.org)

Wrenching Debate Gazette
  Richard Grossman, Publisher, 1801 Connecticut Ave. NW, 2nd Fl, Washington, DC 20009

Wuppertal Institute for Climate, Environment, Energy (www.wupperinst.org)
  PO Box 10 04 80, 42004 Wuppertal, Germany

Yann Arthus-Bertrand (www.yannarthusbertrand.org)

Yes Men (http://www.theyesmen.org)

Zero Population Growth (www.zpg.org) [now called Population Connection, see above]
  ZPG Reporter, 1440 16th St NW, Washington, DC 20036